Dolnośląska Szkoła Wyższa

Wydział Nauk Pedagogicznych

University of Innsbruck

Faculty of Teacher Education and School Research

JOSEFINE WAGNER

**Struggling for Educational Justice in Disabling Societies:
A Multi-sited School-based Ethnography of Inclusive
Policies and Practices in Poland, Austria, and Germany**

Dissertation written

under the supervision of

Prof. DSW dr hab. Hana Cervinkova

Univ.-Prof. Mag. Dr. Michael Schratz

Dr. Juliet D. Golden

Wrocław 2018

Acknowledgments

presentations whenever I needed your help and all the voluntary work you have done for the EDiTE community.

During my secondment period at the Institute for Teacher Education and School Research at the University of Innsbruck, Austria, I had the privilege of working intensively with my co-supervisor Michael Schratz, whose support on my entire path has been unwavering. I am deeply grateful for his guidance, his vision for EDiTE and his trust in my work. Thank you for opening so many opportunities for me to understand and explore my research, for always being approachable and working in my best interest. I am also grateful for the kindness and support I received from Shaima Muhammad, Maiko-Katrin Stürz, Christian Krahler, Johanna Schwarz and Markus Ammann. In particular, I want to thank Lisa Pfahl (and her family), who was an extraordinary mentor to me in the short time we spent together in Innsbruck. I am deeply grateful for giving me generously from her scarce free time. Without her insights into the Austrian education scene, our critical exchanges, and our dinners, I would have had a hard time finding my way around. I also want to thank Andrea Raggl for helping me to better understand ethnographic field research in schools and the writing process in and outside of class.

I am deeply grateful to all the schools that opened their doors to me and trusted me to do ethical, worthwhile research in their classrooms. I am sorry I cannot thank the school representatives under their name in order to protect the identity of my research sites. I am deeply grateful to you all. Amid the busy life in schools, I was able to connect to faculty members who went the extra mile, unpaid and often unrewarded, to help me understand what it was like to stand in their shoes. I am grateful to all the students whose lessons I was allowed to share. I am especially humbled and grateful to those whose stories illuminate their difficult and painful lives in school, their parents and, once again, their teachers, who agreed to be depicted in sometimes overwhelming situations. This dissertation would be nothing without your stories.

I am indebted to all the external experts I was allowed to ask a million questions and who did their best to illuminate my research with their answers: Piotr Chladzynski, Maria Czerepaniak-Walczak, Magda Lejzerowicz, Aneta Slowik, Agnieszka Kossowska, Volker Schönwiese, Lisa Pfahl, Ronald Astl, Ingrid Handle, Mario Dobe, Hans A. Pandt and Detlef Pech. Also thank you very much to Irit Dekel whose words of encouragement and critical reflections helped me to enter my German research study.

I am also deeply thankful for the amazing work of the English-language editor Diane Nottle for copyediting every chapter of this dissertation. I want to thank Liv Sindler for providing me with excellent transcriptions, and to express gratitude to Lukasz Rogozinski, my Polish teacher and friend, who helped me navigate the Polish research field not only linguistically but also culturally. Thank you for bringing the many nuances of communication to my attention.

First and foremost, I want to thank three incredible women without whose support and academic excellence I would not have been able to complete or even begin my work.

Thank you, Ula Klobuszewska. You are an incredible professional with a big heart. Your presence in the project and our lives was irreplaceable. You had a solution to every problem, I admire the grace with which you carry out complex projects that others would break under. Your calm, intelligence and intuition have provided the backbone for our work. Thank you also for the generosity with which you shared your free time with me - for the many hugs, bike rides, coffees and laughs. Thank you for never failing to find a way to make everything work out in the end.

Thank you, Juliet D. Golden. You have been such an extraordinary inspiration for my work and helped me think through the multiple layers of human rights education. Thank you for allowing me to get to know you through our journeys across Central Europe during which I learned from you the intricate historical and political context in which my research is set. You are an extraordinary teacher and scholar who sets the bar very high, but has an amazing ability to guide others to an understanding. Thank you for valuing my thoughts, offering constructive critique and always pushing my work forward. Your work in Holocaust research and education directly inspired my dissertation and will most likely determine the further direction of my research. Your support has been endless, your warmth, your kindness, your generosity, and your intelligence have left me humbled and speechless at times. Thank you.

Thank you, Hana Cervinkova. Your impact has shaped me for life. You saw my strengths and believed in my ideas before they became clear and comprehensible to me. You never missed a moment to promote me, to shine a light on me, to cheer me on and challenge my abilities for the best possible outcome. Your trust in my work made me believe I could complete this dissertation in less than three years. Thanks to your tireless support, your feedback at all stages of this process and the many times you exposed me to the excellent scholarship of your colleagues and friends, I was able to reach this goal. Your kindness and the deeply ethical commitment with which you set out on all your journeys have been the bar I have tried to reach. Words of thanks are not enough to express my gratitude for being your doctoral student. In personal and in professional life, you are a fierce advocate of what is right and just in this world. With this dissertation, I hope I provide one example that speaks to your commitment.

I also want to express gratitude to my teacher educator, Herr Kühne who was a wonderful mentor to me. He encouraged me to look for pedagogical answers to all the many challenges I faced during teacher training. Thanks to him, I started digging into the concept of inclusive pedagogy.

I am thankful to my family and friends whose love has carried me through this extraordinary time. I am grateful to Dr. Sabine Kirchner and her family, who spurred me to embark on this endeavor, Daniela Zapff and Tanja Werle, Bene and Teddy Stipp; Mina Brunzlow, Maja Scheffel-Purrmann, and Myoung-Le Seo, Anne Nützler, Carolin Lafleur and Christian Hildebrandt. Anjaneai Srivastava, thank you for amazing food and all your support. My loving American family opened up a world of inspiration and possibility to me: Tricia and Kipp Armstrong and their three beautiful children, Cassidy, Magnolia and Levi. I am thankful to have been blessed with a strong and supportive family and with the times to see everyone grow and age. Thank you so much to my grandparents, aunts, uncles and cousins.

1. Introduction

"This child was getting special treatment, was learning under observation by doctors, by teachers and psychologists, and I thought that this situation was the best for the child. However, in June the mother came to me and asked whether we could allow her child back into my class."

– Teacher at a primary school in Poland

"I would like to put all teachers into a seminar in which they learn that integration or inclusion works only if we do it together. As long as the primary school says I teach only primary school curriculum and you teach special school curriculum – these are your children and these are mine – there will be no inclusion."

– Special pedagogue at a primary school in Austria

"Our children live in two worlds, and if we here at school are not able to give them the opportunity to be a part of this society ... If that does not happen in school, when does it ever?"

– Teacher at a primary school in Germany

In this dissertation I present a multi-sited, school-based ethnographic study (Marcus, 1995) that illuminates how school cultures in Poland, Austria and Germany grapple with the implementation of inclusive policy and practices. Drawing from the brief interview excerpts above, this dissertation touches, for example, on the perspectives of parents who want their children with special needs to be educated in mainstream public schools. It brings to light the perspective of special educators who struggle to navigate general education with teacher colleagues who practice inclusion in the classroom and segregation in the staff room. It explores how teachers and pedagogues try to find ways of bridging the gap between the disabled and abled, foreign and familiar, protected and vulnerable students of their school. All these accounts from the field touch on the question of how to overcome structures and practices in education that focus on what divides children – i.e., their mother tongues, their cognitive or motor-physical abilities, their beliefs, their countries of origin, their parents' occupations – instead of focusing on how to build a community. In this dissertation, I draw on inclusive education as a deeply ethical concept that promotes schools as strongholds against discrimination by granting participation to all students (Booth, 2005). I follow the following definition of inclusiveness by Anthony Booth and Mel Ainscow, authors of the Index for Inclusion:

> *An inclusive approach to diversity involves understanding and opposing the profound destructive dangers in equating difference or strangeness with inferiority. When this*

happens and becomes deeply embedded in a culture, it can lead to profound discrimination or even genocide.[1]

Booth and Ainscow draw on the legacy of the Holocaust, the mass extermination of Jews, the disabled and the Roma, homosexuals and the socially "deviant," by Nazi Germany, which is engrained in the soil and social fabric of Europe. The European Union was founded on the critical consideration of this legacy and binds its members into a peaceful alliance with a shared legal and ethical framework committed to social justice and economic prosperity. According to Tony Judt, the historian of European history, the European identity is defined by the recognition of these past atrocities on which accession into the Union hinges:

> *But the reason crimes like these now carry such a political charge – and the reason "Europe" has invested itself with the responsibility to make sure that attention is paid to them and to define 'Europeans' as people who* do *pay attention to them – is because they are partial instances (in this case before and after the fact respectively) of the crime: the attempt by one group of Europeans to exterminate every member of another group of Europeans, here on European soil, within still living memory.*[2]

Against this backdrop, I explore how the commitment to recognizing and valuing diversity in schools takes shape in Poland, Austria and Germany, three countries deeply affected by the Holocaust. I pay attention to the formative years of *Sonderpädagogik* (special pedagogy) under Nazism, and how its terminologies and practices, which once served to justify mass sterilization and the murder of children and adults with disabilities, continue to affect the education of students with special educational needs and disabilities.[3] As a discipline with a long tradition, special pedagogy continues to hold a firm grip on the disabled body and successfully upholds segregated special-school facilities that are *de facto* illegal under the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (UN-CRPD) and the right to free, quality primary and secondary education for all students (Art. 24.2b). Committed to achieving social cohesion, the European Union urges its member countries to implement inclusive education:

> *(16) Ensuring effective equal access to quality inclusive education for all learners, including those of migrant origins, those from disadvantaged socioeconomic backgrounds, those with special needs and those with disabilities – in line with the*

---

[1] Booth, Anthony, and Ainscow, Mel (2011): *Index for Inclusion: Developing Learning and Participation in Schools*. Third edition. Centre for Studies on Inclusive Education, p. 23.

[2] Judt, Tony (2010): *Postwar: A History of Europe Since 1945*. London: Vintage Books, p. 804.

[3] Hänsel, 2005; Moser, 2012; Pfahl, 2011; Ellger-Rüttgardt, 2004

Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities [UN-CRPD] – is indispensable for achieving more cohesive societies. [...][4]

Drawing on the UN-CRPD, the EU envisions inclusive education as a broad agenda that also answers the challenges of multiculturalism and migration, socioeconomic inequalities and the experience of disability. As becomes clear through the voices of local educators at the beginning of this introduction and the international push through UN-CRPD and EU legislation, the concept of inclusion must be researched from a deeply contextualized perspective as well as a global one (Carney, 2008). The concept of inclusive education takes shape in practice and may be explored only through a research paradigm that has the tools to investigate what happens close to the ground, within classrooms, schools and neighborhoods; that takes into view the historical and local knowledge that weighs in on the research sites; and that illuminates how "actions and meanings relate to large-scale patterns of social action and structure."[5] To answer the research questions of how schooling cultures are affected by the implementation of inclusive education, and how schools grapple and respond to the call for acknowledging human diversity and creating inclusive settings for learning and teaching, I rely on the methodology of educational ethnography (Spindler, 2000; Erickson, 1986, 1982).

Through participant observations in schools and extensive interviews, I explore how the paradigm of inclusive education affects the local settings it enters. Over the last three years, I consecutively conducted school-based ethnographic research in primary schools in Poland, Austria and Germany. As a participant observer, I spent at least 100 hours in each of the three research fields. Altogether, I interviewed 18 faculty members, including teachers, pedagogues, special pedagogues, and principals or vice-principals at my research sites. To better contextualize my very personal observations, I conducted policy analyses and 12 interviews with experts from academia and school administrators in the different country contexts.

With this dissertation, I hope to contribute to qualitative research in education that emphasizes empirical data, generated through extensive classroom and school observation and involvement in the field with faculty members and students. I narrate the everyday problems in European classrooms within a detailed account of the structures and conditions in which

---

[4] Council Recommendation of May 22, 2018, on promoting common values, inclusive education, and the European dimension of teaching (2018/C 194/01). In: *Official Journal of the European Union* (June 7, 2018), p. C 195/3.
[5] Eisenhart, Margaret (2001): Changing Conceptions of Culture and Ethnographic Methodology: Recent Thematic Shifts and Their Implications for Research on Teaching. In: Richardson (Ed.): *Handbook of Research on Teaching*, 4th Edition. Washington, D.C.: American Educational Research Association, pp. 209-225, p. 209.

they occur. In this way, I juxtapose the three studies to allow insights into the specifics and the commonalities of the struggles schools face within the European context and beyond. Furthermore, I hope my research will stand as a strong argument in favor of inclusive structures, cultures, and practices in education that go by the ethos that "everything in the forest is the forest."[6] I strive to illuminate the weaknesses of the traditional Central European education systems biased toward native speakers, the able-bodied, heteronormative, financially secure families, thereby jeopardizing democratic principles and the promise of social mobility through education. Finally, I seek to inform teacher education and student learning on the grounds of inclusive pedagogy as an alternative framework to that of special pedagogy.

In the first chapter following this introduction, I situate the paradigm of inclusive education within the theoretical perspective of critical pedagogy in critique of the epistemological foundations of special pedagogy. In doing so, I also map out the ontological debate on the nature of disability, which creates tensions of mismatch between the definition of disability and the corresponding notion of inclusion. I introduce Thea R. Abu El-Haj's concept of relational differences (2006) to examine how traditional education systems clash with the concept of inclusion. This is because some differences – especially Muslim migrant identities, poverty, cultural capital, etc. – play out to significant disadvantage while others go unnoticed. Finally, I emphasize an intersectional, socio-cultural understanding of disability that focuses on breaking down barriers to participation in education rather than merely on students' individual shortcomings and impairments (Oliver, 1999; Varenne and McDermott, 1995). From this perspective, I then derive key principles of inclusive education as a principled approach to education that builds on abolishing the orientation toward deficit, stresses the understanding of relational differences and promotes social learning.

Next, as a "Stranger in Three Fields," I focus on setting out the foundations for my multi-sited, cross-cultural ethnographic research. To support my approach to classroom research, I draw on the works of George Marcus and Frederick Erickson, as well as George and Louise Spindler, Sari K. Biklen and Robert Bogdan, Ellen Brantlinger and colleagues, and others. In the three chapters that follow, I present the country studies that build on a thorough policy analysis, followed by a window into practice, which I present through

---

[6] Abu El-Haj, Thea R. (Nov. 16, 2018): Council on Anthropology and Education (CAE): Past President's Distinguished Lecture, American Anthropological Association 2018, San Jose, Calif.

vignettes of "rhetorical, analytic and evidentiary" function.[7] In a concluding discussion, I return to my research questions and offer recommendations for policy and practice, especially in consideration of the EDiTE framework - Transformative Teacher learning for Better Student Learning within an Emerging European Context.

2. Inclusive Education: A Paradigm for Educational Justice

My doctoral work is rooted in the epistemological position inherent in critical pedagogy that "the best knowledge is done by engagement with relations."[8] I study the impact of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons With Disabilities on primary schools in Poland, Austria, and Germany, never with regard to schools as neutral entities, but as sites of justice and injustice (Lingard and Mills, 2007) where discrimination against some pupils and the privileging of others take place (Freire, 1970; Giroux, 1992; Apple, 2012, 2016). In particular, I draw from the notion of school culture (McLaren, 2015; Czerepaniak-Walczak, 2015; Ainscow, 2001) as "a set of ideas, opinions, policies, and practices that in an open and hidden way affect the development of individuals as well as social changes, both at school and in its closer and further environment."[9] Hence, I treat schools as political grounds where micro-level manifestations point to large-scale changes.

In addition, I turn to Michel Foucault's approach to power in the way I attribute importance to concepts, beliefs, and practices I encounter in the field. Foucault recommends that power relations be investigated through "forms of resistance and attempts made to dissociate these relations."[10] Drawing on Foucault's work *The Subject and Power* (1982), the objective of my work is "to attack not so much 'such or such' an institution of power, or group, or elite, or class but rather a technique, a form of power."[11] I understand that classroom artifacts, schedules, subjects, informal conversations among teachers, chatter among students, leisure spaces inside and outside schools, and designated places of teaching and learning constitute and express power and discipline. I pay attention to the "dividing practices" through which each school culture that I researched within the three country contexts of my dissertation tells me the story of the good and the bad child, the disabled, the wrong and the

---

[7] Erickson, Frederick (1986): Qualitative Methods in Research on Teaching. In: Wittrock, Merlin (Ed.): *Handbook of Research on Teaching*, Third edition, New York: MacMillan, pp. 119- 161, p. 150.
[8] Apple, Michael W. (2016): Power, policy and the realities of curriculum and teaching, CEPS Ljubljana, accessed from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YcPv0Pk7Uqs&t=646s, on Nov. 1, 2018, minutes 08:20-08:27.
Apple, Michael W. (2017): The Struggle for Democracy in Critical Education, accessed from http://dx.doi.org/10.23925/1809-3876.2017v15i4p894-926, on Nov. 1, 2018, p. 900.
[9] Walczak, Maria (2015): School's Culture: About its complexity and multidimensionality. In: *Pedagogika Spoleczna* (Social Pedagogy), 3:57, pp. 77-87, p. 77.
[10] Foucualt, Michel (1982): The Subject and Power. In: *Critical Inquiry*, 8:4, pp. 777-795, p. 780.
[11] Ibid., p. 781.

gifted.[12] I arrive at specific descriptions that give a face and a name to the "high risk students" (*Education in Germany*, 2018), the "student likely to experience triple-fold discrimination" (*2012 National Education Report Austria*) and "the great losers of the German education system" (*Boston Consulting Group Report*, 2009) that national monitoring reports lament and educational policies fail to target.

My research is strongly informed by the theoretical works of scholars of disability studies and critical race theory in education (Everelles, 2000; Connor, Ferri and Annamma, 2016). Following Kimberlé Crenshaw (1991), and Subini Ancy Annamma (2018), I intersectionally grasp constructs of disability, special educational need, deviation, and school failure of students along the lines of race, class, gender, migration background, cultural practices or religion. The ontological wars (Campbell, 2001) on the nature of disability as a medical, social, or cultural category help me illuminate the contentiousness of the concept of inclusion (Ferry and Conner, 2007). In this ontological debate, I explore works on inclusive education rooted in the imperative of fostering social and educational justice and providing an alternative educational framework to the deficit-orientation found in special pedagogical discourse (Liasidou, 2012, 2015; Lawrence-Brown and Sapon-Sevin, 2014; Abu El-Haj, 2006, 2015). Encouraged by the Marxist tradition, I explore historical understanding (Gottesman, 2010; Anderson, 1989) and local knowledge (Erickson, 1986; Schultz, 2008) for continuities and ruptures of special pedagogical practices, on the one hand, and grass-roots developments for educational inclusion, on the other.

2.1 Epistemological Considerations: Schools as Sites of Justice and Injustice

My multi-sited, school-based ethnography explores inclusive policies and practices in primary schools in Poland, Austria and Germany. Each country study is divided into two sections. The first part is a policy analysis that sets the wider educational and socio-political context for the second part, in which I present ethnographic field notes from my school and classroom observations as a window into educational practice. Committed to the anthropological standpoint, I understand that "the world is never directly 'knowable,' and cannot empirically present itself."[13] Therefore, drawing on Willis and Trondman, "theory must be useful theory in relation to ethnographic evidence and the 'scientific energy' derived from the effective formulation of problems, rather than theory for itself."[14] Hence, I explicate

---

[12] Ibid., p. 777 ff.

[13] Willis, Paul (1977): *Learning to Labor: How Working Class Kids Get Working Class Jobs*. New York: Columbia University Press, p. 194.

[14] Willis, Paul, and Trondman, Mats (2002): Manifesto for Ethnography. In: *Cultural Studies Critical Methodologies*, 2:3, pp. 394-402, p. 396.

the epistemological foundations of my dissertation's interpretative framework as useful lenses through which I explore my data and describe in detail the reality that I encountered.

Inspired by the critical pedagogical framework, my research in each of the three primary schools is concluded with the question: "The Szkola Podstawowa/ Volksschule/ Grundschule – A School for Whom?" As I probed the concept of inclusion that each school enacted, I enquired about who was welcomed in these schools, whose languages were present and whose abilities were awarded. Building on Michael Apple's outline of questions of a critical pedagogue, a number of sub-questions guided my ethnographic research:

> *Whose knowledge is taught? Whose knowledge isn't? Why? And why not? Who benefits from that? What is the relationship between education and larger social and ideological projects? Who wins and who loses?*[15]

Hence, I collected data on whose knowledge was valued, included and displayed in classroom talk, activities and school spaces, and whose was not? I asked who benefited from the available special pedagogical support and who did not. I asked who were the winners and who were the losers of teachers' and pedagogues' educational efforts in the respective sites. I searched for the relationship between students' school failures and larger historical, local and ideological projects, policies and pedagogies. I aimed to describe practices of inclusion into and exclusion from mainstream education, as well as to depict the knowledges that circulated to justify the expulsion of a "student who was bad from the beginning" (Polish context, Chapter 4). As Apple points out, oppression and exclusion are articulated through "structural as well as post-structural forms."[16] . If I retained a strictly structural perspective, Freire's call for gaining consciousness of the social order within which one is positioned closes a conversation about dissecting power relations. As Isaac Gottesmann points out, "What Giroux made clear in 1979 remains true 30 years later – one cannot rely on Freire for structural understanding."[17] In that sense, the social order argument relieves teachers and pedagogues of their agency and responsibility for their actions within schools. As I draw on Foucault's notion of power relations, I try to negotiate between this tension of agency and structure. I acknowledge, on the one hand, that teachers and pedagogues hold authority over actions and practices, although I recognize that schools are fields of actions limited and pre-structured

---

[15] Apple, Michael W. (2016): Power, policy and the realities of curriculum and teaching, CEPS Ljubljana, accessed from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YcPv0Pk7Uqs&t=646s, on Nov. 1, 2018, minutes 05:29-5:50.

[16] Apple, Michael W. (2016): Power, policy and the realities of curriculum and teaching, CEPS Ljubljana, accessed from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YcPv0Pk7Uqs&t=646s on Nov. 1, 2018, minutes 05:40-5:50.

[17] Gottesmann, Isaac (2010): Sitting in the Waiting Room: Paolo Freire and the Critical Turn in the Field of Education. In: *Educational Studies*, 46:4, pp. 376-399, p.393.

through national, state and regional legislation, set within certain traditions and cultures of education. As Foucault writes:

> *... a power relationship can only be articulated on the basis of two elements which are each indispensable if it is really to be a power relationship: that "the other" (the one over whom power is exercised) be thoroughly recognized and maintained to the very end as a person who acts; and that, faced with a relationship of power, a whole field of responses, reactions, results, and possible inventions may open up.*[18]

Hence, in my research I appropriate Foucault in the sense that I consider schools to be sites that open up a field of responses, reactions, results and possible interventions within which teachers and pedagogues act. Building on Foucault, "power is exercised only over free subjects … By this we mean individual or collective subjects who are faced with a field of possibilities in which several ways of behaving, several reactions and diverse comportments, may be realized."[19] For example, in my Austrian study, I asked why teachers considered a girl's Kurdish background, and not her hearing impairment as the reason for her failure in school. It is then that I critique teachers' attitudes and practices as informed by local knowledge around the "ghetto neighborhood of the school" and the tradition of the special pedagogical discipline in which it is the individual and not the conditions for learning that are diagnosed. Dennis Beach points out that education ethnographers seem inclined toward the dichotomy of agency versus structure, thereby running the risk of doing "research [that] may, in a way, be almost 'programmatically' looking for examples that can be described in terms of an underpinning theory and pre-existing theory."[20] Where I do see the possibility of this weakness occurring in my data analysis, I aim to weaken the effect of "programmatically" analyzing my data through the multi-sitedness of my research design. The ontological instability of the concept of disability pushes me to listen to the meaning of inclusion produced in the fields of my three country contexts.

Furthermore, I strongly empathize with Apple's understanding of education through two concepts: repositioning and relational analysis (2017). Apple argues for an analysis of the epistemological foundations of education presented in schools, as well as a methodological imperative in terms of education as a performance of critique. The first set of understanding builds on repositioning, which means walking in the shoes of the dispossessed and working against the "ideological and institutional processes and practices that reproduce oppressive

---

[18] Foucault, Michel (1982): The Subject and Power. In: *Critical Inquiry*, 8:4, pp. 777-795, p. 789.
[19] Ibid., p. 790.
[20] Beach, Dennis (2011): On Structure and Agency in Ethnographies of Education: examples from this special issue and more generally. In: *European Educational Research Journal*, 10: 4, pp. 572-582, p. 574.

conditions."[21] Sensitive to the fact that repositioning is never truly possible, I tended to thoroughly observe the deficit notions expressed about students and their families to understand how students' place and their right to mainstream education was negotiated, questioned and sometimes dismissed. Larger political shortcomings in education became visible through their impact on the individual lives of pupils I encountered at my research sites. The second concept of understanding education rests on the recognition that education is a political and an ethical act. Apple considers education relationally in that it is essentially woven into the "unequal relations of power in the larger society" as well as into the "relations of exploitation, dominance, and subordination."[22] Hence, education has the purpose of bringing about citizens who can articulate critique. Along with critique, however, comes the language of hope and possibility, which I consider important. Based on Marxist critique, critical pedagogy is a socialist pedagogy, as Peter McLaren states, but "one that does not seek a predetermined form or a blueprint of socialist society."[23] I consider critical pedagogy not dogmatically but as a source of inspiration for my work in that it seeks a language of hope, possibility (Giroux, 1992) and deep commitment to ethical education (Apple, 2002, 2017). As critical pedagogy seeks to "challenge dominant power relations that are reproduced in schools, the media, and elsewhere,"[24] McLaren imagines a moment of transformation through education. He argues: "We can achieve a pedagogy of transformation if we turn our teaching into an outrageous practice and a practice of outrage. If we can invent our pedagogies anew such that they are based on recovering dangerous memories from society's structural unconscious, from the Eurocentric archives of dead reason […]."[25] In my policy analyses that precedes each account from the field, I try to "recover dangerous memories from society's structural unconscious" to illuminate how present-day conditions have come into existence. Shining a light on *Ausländerpädagogik*, foreigner's pedagogy, on the tradition of special pedagogy with its formative years during the time of National Socialism (in Germany and Austria), as well as on a market-oriented obsession with performance born of traumatic historical experiences (Poland), I stress that present-day realities are not irrevocable. McLaren argues for a practice of resistance and transformation, thereby reminding democracy to live up

---

[21] Apple, Michael W. (2017): The Struggle for Democracy in Critical Education, accessed from http://dx.doi.org/10.23925/1809-3876.2017v15i4p894-926, on Nov. 1, 2018, p. 900.

[22] Ibid.

[23] McLaren, Peter (2015): *Life in Schools: An Introduction to Critical Pedagogy in the Foundations of Education*, 6th Edition. Boulder: Paradigm Publishers, p. 244.

[24] Apple, Michael W. (2017): The Struggle for Democracy in Critical Education, accessed from http://dx.doi.org/10.23925/1809-3876.2017v15i4p894-926, on Nov. 1, 2018, p. 899.

[25] McLaren, Peter (2015): *Life in Schools: An Introduction to Critical Pedagogy in the Foundations of Education*, 6th Edition. Boulder: Paradigm Publishers, p. 252.

to its promise by making transformation possible.[26] Speaking of "inheriting education" in the Austrian context or "educational gaps that are too large to be closed" in the German context endangers the promise of democracy.

Finally, I draw from critical pedagogy with regard to curriculum design that should connect "new skills with the everyday experiences of the students and their lives,"[27] as Apple highlights. This key principle has far-reaching implications for heterogeneous schools and societies. It requests negotiation of "epistemological spaces,"[28] as performed by Norma Gonzalez and her colleagues by exploring the "funds of knowledge" that Mexican-American students and their families offer amid dire circumstances (Gonzalez et al., 1995). Readjusting teaching and learning in diverse classrooms requires abolishing the deficit perspective on migrant children and allowing for ways to teach and educate them through the knowledges that they bring to the classroom (Salazar Perez and Saavedra, 2017). In my German study, I illuminate this key principle with observations on how religious knowledge is included in everyday practices of an almost all-Muslim school community by engaging students and building their confidence.

2.2. Ontological Wars[29] Over Disability

The competing notions of disability as 1) an innate condition, 2) interplay of social conditions that act upon impairments, or 3) an altogether culturally produced phenomenon is what the legal scholar Fiona A.K. Campbell describes as the ontological wars over disability (2001, 2007). She speaks of the "disability fictions (read: definitions) rendered viable by law"[30] that have extensive consequences for the understanding of disability in wider society as well as in education. Drawing on Michael Oliver, key author of the social model of disability, Campbell criticizes legal texts as consistently conceptualizing "the personal tragedy theory of disability […] ontologically intolerable, *inherently* negative."[31] The ontological debates over disability are represented in the pedagogical approaches that are also competing for applicability in schools: special pedagogy versus approaches to inclusive learning. The special pedagogical paradigm is historically inclined toward the deficit orientation expressed through

---

[26] McLaren, Peter (2015): *Life in Schools: An Introduction to Critical Pedagogy in the Foundations of Education*, 6th Edition. Boulder: Paradigm Publishers, p. 253.
[27] Apple, Michael (2017): The Struggle for Democracy in Critical Education, accessed from http://dx.doi.org/10.23925/1809-3876.2017v15i4p894-926, on Nov. 1, 2018, p. 898.
[28] Nganga, Lydiah, and Kambutu, John (2013): Michael Apple: A Modern-Day Critical Pedagogue. In: Kirylo, James D. (Ed.): *A Critical Pedagogy of Resistance: 34 Pedagogues we need to know.* Rotterdam: Sense Publishers, pp. 1-5, p. 2.
[29] Taken from: Campbell, Fiona A.K. (2001): Inciting Legal Fictions: 'Disability's' Date With Ontology and the Ableist Body of the Law. In: *Griffith Law Review*, 10:1, pp. 42-62.
[30] Ibid., p. 44.
[31] Ibid., p. 43.

the medical/individual/biological model of disability. As a discipline of long tradition, it holds authority over the disabled student even in inclusive settings. As Andreas Hinz points out, "a similarity of inclusion and disability studies is the gradual dispossession of both approaches through special pedagogy: inclusion is becoming more and more a special pedagogical feature."[32] It is important to understand that inclusive pedagogy was not conceptualized as part of a special pedagogical spectrum in which inclusion describes another step in the evolution of treating disability in education. I will demonstrate that inclusive pedagogy builds on a genesis that radically differs from that of special pedagogy. However, as Brantlinger concludes in her critical review of the ideology of special education scholars, inclusive education does remain highly contentious despite being a rather simple concept (1997). I argue that the contentious character of inclusion stems from the exclusivity to which it is tied in theoretical accounts and in practice. The deficit perspective on students, the special educational needs statuses and special schools continue to operate under the inclusive turn in education, thereby entirely undermining the concept and its mission (Wocken, 2018; Connor and Ferri, 2007). As Lani Florian points out, "the starting point for inclusive pedagogy is an acknowledgement of the contested nature of inclusive education and the consequent variability in practice."[33] As long as inclusive pedagogy is not informed by a framework that reduces barriers to participating in mainstream education experienced on the grounds of multiple forms of differences, the concept of inclusion does not pose an alternative to the special pedagogical tradition in education.

2.2.1 The Medical Model and the Special Pedagogical Tradition

To understand the dominance of the special pedagogical tradition in the education systems of Central Europe, a historical perspective helps illuminate the discipline's origins, as well as its impact on managing disability today. In the German-speaking world, starting in the late 19th and early 20th centuries, special pedagogy advanced as *Heilpädagogik*, healing pedagogy, from a splinter branch of the teaching profession to an academic discipline once it became allied with medical and psychological discourse, practices and epistemological framework (Moser, 2012; Hänsel, 2005; Pfahl, 2011). Vera Moser highlights the first professorship for *Heilpädagogik*, taken up by Heinrich Hanselmann at the University of

---

[32] Hinz, Andreas (2008): Inklusive Pädagogik und Disability Studies – Gemeinsamkeiten und Spannungsfelder. Überlegungen in neun Thesen. (Inclusive Pedagogy and Disability Studies – Similarities and Fields of Tension. Considerations in nine theses). Vortrag im Rahmen der Ringvorlesung im Zentrum für Disability Studies der Universität Hamburg im Sommersemester 2008 (Presentation within the frame of circle lectures at the center for Disability Studies at the University of Hamburg, summer semester 2008).
[33] Florian, Lani (2015): Inclusive Pedagogy: A transformative approach to individual differences, but can it help reduce educational inequalities? In: *Scottish Educational Review*, 47:1, pp. 5-14, p. 6.

Zürich in 1931, as the beginning of the establishment of special pedagogy.[34] Hanselmann, who had also received an honorary doctorate from the medical faculty in 1956,[35] developed a definition of the lowest common denominator for all disabilities, which he called "weakness of the soul" and regarded as the connecting element of "imbecility, deaf-mutism, blindness, neglect and idiocy."[36] This definition enshrined the deficit model inherent in the disability construct through which special pedagogy established itself as an academic discipline.[37] Moser explains the establishment of special education through four strands. She argues that special pedagogy generated its professional identity through the construction of a common denominator for all appearances of disability, the political engagement and lobbying of help-school teachers, care work in close cooperation with charity organizations, and focus on practice.[38] Sieglind Ellger-Rüttgard, on the other hand, traces special pedagogy in the German context in a rather detailed way along the individual branches of special schools and their achievements in educating the deaf, the blind, etc. She stresses that mainstream schools strongly relied on special pedagogical institutions as a way to manage deviance. Special schools were "indispensable" if mainstream education wanted to function on the basis of homogeneous classes and performance-based education.[39] In this way, Ellger-Rüttgard holds general education co-responsible for the establishment of the special school system. Dagmar Hänsel, in her historiographic research, draws attention to special pedagogy in the time of National Socialism. She highlights that teachers at special schools contributed overproportionally to the discourse on race hygiene.[40] Help-school pedagogy was founded on medical-psychological knowledge and argumentation through which pupils were defined as "innately idiotic" because of inherited imbecility.[41] Hänsel argues, help-school reasoning was compatible with the race-hygiene paradigm of the National Socialists. She emphasizes that during the National Socialist time, help-school pedagogy advanced to *völkisch*, nationalist, special pedagogy, shifting from the category of "innate imbecility" to a broader concept of

---

[34] Moser, Vera (2012): Gründungsmythen der Heilpädagogik (Founding myths of healing pedagogy). In: *Zeitschrift für Pädagogik* (Journal for pedagogy), 58:2, pp. 262-274, p. 262.

[35] Ibid., p. 271.

[36] Ibid., p. 265.

[37] Ibid., p. 272.

[38] Ibid., p. 271.

[39] Ellger-Rüttgardt, Sieglind (2004): Sonderpädagogik – ein blinder Fleck der allgemeinen Pädagogik? Eine Replik auf den Aufsatz von Dagmar Hänsel (Special pedagogy – a blind spot of general pedagogy? A response to the essay by Dagmer Hänsel). In: *Zeitschrift für Pädagogik* (Journal for Pedagogy), 50: 3, pp. 416-429, p. 421.

[40] Hänsel, Dagmar (2012): Quellen zur NS-Zeit in der Geschichte der Sonderpädagogik (Sources of the National Socialist time in the history of special pedagogy). In: *Zeitschrift für Pädagogik* (Journal for pedagogy), 58:2, pp. 242-261, p. 244.

[41] Ibid.

disability.[42] Contrary to Ellger-Rüttgardt, Hänsel emphasizes, "initially help school children were free to attend mainstream education but help pedagogy developed the legitimization for segregating help school students into special facilities which special schools gladly turned into practice."[43]

In the 1970s, just a few decades after World War II, the terms "special pedagogy" and "healing pedagogy" were still used synonymously, expanding the sphere of the discipline through professionalization and institutionalization in Germany and across Europe (Pfahl, 2007; Waldschmidt, 2005; Tomlinson, 2017). Lisa Pfahl's analysis of historical documents shows that in the process of professionalization, diagnostics played a significant role to establish modern, postwar special pedagogy. The medical examinations of the former help-school students advanced to systematic diagnostics based on medical, psychological and pedagogical aspects that allowed for the recognition, classification and comparison of high-incident disabilities, such as learning disability.[44] The "scientification of diagnostic measures,"[45] as Pfahl puts it, served special pedagogy to legitimize special schools and segregated education. In turn, special pedagogy relied on the construct of the "socially, morally and medically conspicuous student" as its sphere of intervention.[46] In conclusion, Pfahl highlights, special pedagogy considers deviation and deficit as a student's individual attributes. She emphasizes that the discipline disregards other reasons for missing educational goals and sets schools as normative institutions that contribute to the production and evaluation of learning outcomes and learning disabilities.[47] The medical model of disability as an individual condition was also dominant in the American school contexts that were ethnographic sites for Thea Abu El-Haj's research, leading her to claim that "medical discourse of disability … had a tenacious grip on educational thinking and practices."[48] The British education scholar Sally Tomlinson similarly stresses the global character of the eugenics discourses on education interlinked with the medical and individual understanding of disability:

---

[42] Ibid.

[43] Hänsel, Dagmar (2003): Die Sonderschule ein blinder Fleck in der Schulsystemdforschung (The special school – a blind spot in school system research). In: *Zeitschrift für Pädagogik* (Journal for pedagogy), 48:4, pp. 591-609, p. 597.

[44] Pfahl, Lisa (2011): *Techniken der Behinderung. Der deutsche Lernbehinderungsdiskurs, die Sonderschule und ihre Auswirkungen auf Bildungsbiographien* (Techniques of disability. The German learning-disabled discourse, the special school and its effects on education biographies). Bielefeld: transcript, p. 94 ff.

[45] Ibid., p. 95.

[46] Ibid., p. 91.

[47] Ibid., p. 96.

[48] Abu El-Haj, Thea Renda (2006): *Elusive Justice: Wrestling with difference and educational equity in everyday practice*. New York: Routledge, p. 95.

From the mid nineteenth century, the long-term justification for the treatment of those designated as defective has had a profound effect on education systems globally. Rationalizations for the treatment of those regarded as low attainers, under-achievers, special or "not normal" was provided by eugenics. Views of genetic inherited difference, combined with psychometric theories of measurable intelligence, contributed to the denigration of these groups. It is a difficult task to turn a century-old set of beliefs around and ask why it became so important to rank children and adults by their mental worth and use biological determinism to treat people unequally.[49]

2.2.2 Understanding Disability: From the Social to the Cultural to the Intersectional

Inspired by the disability rights movement, disability studies were influential in the development of the social model of disability in the academic sphere. Disability rights activists pushed the discipline forward as they questioned the sole authority over disabled bodies of institutions and individuals that did not share the experience of disability. Michael Oliver substantially theorized the social model of disability, which he considered a paradigm shift in understanding disability. He states:

In this process of transition, the move away from an individualized, medical view of disability does not imply that there is no role for medicine in the world to which we are moving. Clearly part of the experience of disability will always remain an individual one. But in order to develop more appropriate societal responses to disability, it is important that we all understand – politicians, policy makers, professionals, the public and disabled people alike – that this is a partial and a limited view. Our complex and difficult task is to understand that this process is one of transition from one world view of disability to another. This process is what Kuhn (1961) would call a "paradigm shift."[50]

What needs to be highlighted from this quotation is that Oliver acknowledges that the experience of disability can be deeply bodily, and that the social model of disability in education does not imply that special pedagogical knowledge and practices become altogether obsolete. The Universal Design for Learning (CAST; Burgsthaler, 2015) is a very good example of how knowledge on the challenges or impairments of some students inform learning strategies and environmental changes that benefit all members of the school community.[51] However, the paradigm shift lies within battling the equation of disability or special educational needs with the notion of deficiency and deficit. Furthermore, it battles the categorization and classification of students based on their performances in class measured

---

[49] Tomlinson, Sally (2017): *A Sociology of Special and Inclusive Education: Exploring the manufacture of inability*. London: Routledge, p. 65.
[50] Oliver, Michael (1996): *Understanding Disability: From Theory to Practice*. New York: St. Martin's Press, p. 128.
[51] Burgsthaler, Sheryl (2015): Universal Design of Instruction (UDI): Definition, Principles, Guidelines and Examples. In: *DO-IT*, pp. 1-4.

against an able-bodied norm. Instead, the paradigm shift implies, it is social perceptions, structures and conventions that turn impairments into features that dis-able individuals. However, the social model lacks political edge. It remains positivistic to some extent in the way it limits itself to the understanding of impairment rooted in medical terms. At the forefront of this critique, Shelley Tremain must be mentioned; she questions the social model on the grounds of its conceptualization of impairment as a "historical artefact of the regime of 'bio-power.'"[52] According to Tremain, scholarship in disability studies has failed to question the notion of impairment critically and instead aligned itself with "what Foucault calls a 'juridico-discursive' notion of power."[53] Hence, the debate on the nature of impairment again focuses attention on the individual, perpetuating the stronghold of the medical model over disability.

Nonetheless, Tremain's critique stands on the shoulders of the fearless, emancipatory works of activist scholars with disabilities who need to be acknowledged in building the paradigm shift away from the medical model. Colin Barnes, for example, highlights the self-reflexive writings of twelve men and women living with impairments in a care institution as an early inspiration for the social model reasoning. The accounts were edited and published as the book *Stigma* in 1966 by Paul Hunt, himself a resident of a care institution. The Union of the Physically Impaired Against Segregation (UPIAS), the "most influential organization in the history of social model thinking,"[54] was strongly influential in building an understanding of disability that rejects the medical gaze. In the 1970s, UPIAS stated:

> *Disability is something that is imposed on top of our impairments by the way we are unnecessarily isolated and excluded from society. Disabled people are therefore an oppressed group. … It is a consequence of our isolation and segregation in every area of social life, such as education, work, mobility, housing, etc.*[55]

In 1981, the activist group Disabled Peoples' International (DIP) formed as the "world's first successful, cross-disability endeavour to convert the talk about full and equal participation into action."[56] With the slogan "Nothing about us without us,"[57] DIP has been demanding representation with regard to any type of organization or body that sought to produce

---

[52] Tremain, Shelley (2001): On the Government of Disability. In: *Social Theory and Practice*, 27:4, pp. 617-636, p. 618.
[53] Ibid., p. 620.
[54] Barnes, Colin (2012): The Social Model of Disability: Valuable or Irrelevant? In: Watson, N., Roulstone, A, and Thomas, C. (Eds.): *The Routledge Handbook of Disability Studies*, pp. 12-29, p. 14.
[55] UPIAS (1976): Fundamental Principles of Disability. London: Union of the Physically Impaired against Segregation. Retrieved from http://disability-studies.leeds.ac.uk, on August 14, 2018, p. 4.
[56] Disabled Peoples' International (2012), accessed from http://www.disabledpeoplesinternational.org/, on Dec. 7, 2018.
[57] Barnes, Colin (2012): The Social Model of Disability: Valuable or Irrelevant? In: Watson, N., Roulstone, A, and Thomas, C. (Eds.): *The Routledge Handbook of Disability Studies*, pp. 12-29, p. 19.

knowledge, policy or interventions on behalf of people with disabilities for over nearly 40 years. To Varenne and McDermott, disabilities are nothing but culturally fabricated phenomena. If everyone were blind, a seeing person would be the exception rather than the norm. Understanding disability as a cultural construction changes the angle from which disability is observed. It places cultural conditions at the center of critical examination and allows for a critique of power structures, the hegemony of discourses on ability, heteronormativity and whiteness as normalized features against which the Other is constructed. Cultural institutions such as schools become places of critical examination as diagnosis and labelling construct and enforce disability. Within this framework, Justin Powell reads schooling as "a process of continuously becoming disabled" because of categorization into different types of special educational needs status or segregated schooling. He stresses that education systems produce barriers to participation in education, including lower expectations, exclusion, and stigmatization of students with special educational needs status or those who attend special schools. By analyzing the historical phases of educating students with disabilities in Germany and the United States, Powell highlights the overrepresentation in both school systems of male students, ethnic minorities and students from lower socio-economic backgrounds in special educational measures.[58] As a cross-cultural phenomenon, various researchers attribute the overrepresentation of minorities in special pedagogical interventions to the sorting mechanism that special pedagogy enforces (Connor, Ferri, Annamma, 2016; Tomlinson, 2017; Pfahl and Powell, 2011).

Building on the socio/cultural model of disability, the intersectional approach draws attention to overlapping identity markers such as race, class, ability and gender n which structures exercise dominance and oppression. *Mapping the Margins,* Kimberlé Crenshaw's milestone work on the concept of intersectionality (1991), paved the way for understanding disadvantage from the perspective of those who experienced oppression on the grounds of racism and misogyny. Crenshaw theorized intersectionality based on the many encounters of black women in the U.S with institutions of power, such as law enforcement. Essentially, her analytical framework of intersectionality addresses "… how structures make certain identities the consequence of and the vehicle for vulnerability."[59] In search of these structures,

---

[58] Powell, Justin J. W. (2007): Behinderung in der Schule, behindert durch Schule? (Disability in school, disabled through school?). In: Waldschmidt, Anne (Ed.): *Disability Studies, Kultursoziologie und Soziologie der Behinderung* (Disability Studies, Cultural Sociology and Sociology of Disability). Bielefeld: Transcript, pp. 321-343, p. 321 ff. Ibid., p. 327.
[59] Crenshaw, Kimberlé (2016): Kimberlé Crenshaw on Intersectionality. Women of the World Festival. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-DW4HLgYPlA&t=10s, on Nov. 28, 2018, minutes 07:03-07:09.

Crenshaw recommends asking, "What are the policies? What are the institutional structures that play a role in contributing to the exclusion of some people and not others?"[60] Similarly, the legal scholar Martha Minow contests the notion of difference as naturalized, decontextualized features and stresses: "We *make* distinctions; we don't just find them."[61] Therefore, Minow argues, "The lines used to divide people must be scrutinized and rescrutinized to incorporate the perspectives of those who have not in the past been consulted."[62] Drawing on Charles Mills, Thea R. Abu El-Haj stresses the historicity of the demarcation lines that establish differences and consequently grant full personhood to some and sub-personhood to others. She highlights: "Identity is not a variable. It has weight and it continuously fashions and refashions in particular contexts over time."[63] Abu El-Haj's emphasis on difference as embedded in student identities and shaped through history, space and politics resonates deeply with what I observed in my ethnographic fieldwork.

She urges education scholars to pay attention not to the individual fates of the ones who fail but to the conditions of schooling: "We must interrogate our discourses about difference. How does schooling make certain differences significant and not others?"[64] I find this a very powerful objective that turns away from the quest of the one who is guilty of failure and why. Instead, the context moves into view in which the foregrounding of some differences and the backgrounding of others takes place. I seek to underpin the concept of inclusive pedagogy through an intersectional understanding of disability and this historical, spatial, and political understanding of differences that Abu El-Haj calls "a relational view of differences."[65] I contend that the enactment of inclusive education at all three of my research sites is based on a very narrow and exclusionary concept of disability. For example, special-needs support in mainstream education, and hence in settings that claim to be inclusive, is regulated in all of the primary schools through special educational needs status. An intersectional and political analysis of differences shows, then, that resources are granted only to children who can "demonstrate their own disability"[66] within the given special pedagogical frame of one to

---

[60] Ibid., minutes 07:16-07:27.

[61] Minow, Martha (1990): On Neutrality, Equality, & Tolerance: New Forms of a Decade of Distinction. In: *Change: The Magazine of Higher Learning*, 22:1, pp. 17-25, p. 18.

[62] Ibid., p. 20.

[63] Abu El-Haj, Thea R. (Nov. 16, 2018): Council on Anthropology and Education (CAE): Past President's Distinguished Lecture, American Anthropological Association 2018, San Jose, Calif.

[64] Abu El-Haj, Thea R. (Nov. 16, 2018): Council on Anthropology and Education (CAE): Past President's Distinguished Lecture, American Anthropological Association 2018, San Jose, Calif.

[65] Abu El-Haj, Thea R. (2006): *Elusive Justice: Wrestling with Difference and Educational Equity in Everyday Practice*. New York: Routledge, p. 100.

[66] "It is not the legality of the proof, its conformity to the law, that makes it a proof: it is its demonstrability. The demonstrability of evidence makes it admissible." Foucault, Michel (2016): *Abnormal: Lectures at the Collège de France 1974-1975*. London: Verso, p. 8.

eight statuses (in Germany); to children whose parents have the cultural, linguistic and material capital to mobilize resources on behalf of their children (in Germany and Austria); and to children whose teachers are not too overworked and burned out to notice that their students might be in need of extra support (in Poland, Austria, Germany). In my Austrian study, only three students received special pedagogical support in the school of over 200 children. In Poland, one student out of the entire grade level was considered too disabled for inclusive learning, and in Germany, the idea of a special pedagogical needs status in mainstream education had been mostly abandoned as a useless intervention in an all-migrant school. Different differences mattered in different contexts.

2.3 A Framework of Inclusive Education

The framework of inclusive education that I introduce here draws on the accomplishments of scholars from the fields I have already discussed above: critical pedagogy, disability studies, critical race theory, and inclusive as well as special pedagogy. However, to outline the pillars of inclusive education, I do not draw only on the literature that explicitly labels itself as contributory to the inclusive paradigm. I seek to illuminate and contextualize each schooling culture in a cross-cultural conversation on the production of differences and attempts at inclusion through webs of significance (Geertz, 1973). Therefore I place more emphasis on intercultural learning in my German study, more emphasis on local knowledge and neighborhood stigma in my Austrian study, and more emphasis on homogenizing tendencies that cater to performance drill at the cost of social learning in my Polish study.

From the literature I consulted, I summarize four overarching themes that I see as informative of inclusive pedagogy. These are not necessarily new themes, but I condensed and enriched them through the experiences I gathered from my fieldwork. First, building on Anthony Booth and Mel Ainscow's work, I consider **inclusion as a principled approach to education**. Here, I grasp inclusive education as a deeply ethical endeavor and consider aspects of school cultures that adhere to the commitment to respond to the needs of all students. Second, drawing on the "funds of knowledge" concept championed by Norma Gonzalez, Luis Moll et al. in the 1990s, I discuss the theme of **tackling and eventually abolishing the deficit-orientation** that holds a tight grip over students with particular identity markers. The framework of DisCrit, disability studies and critical race theory in education by Beth A. Ferri, David J. Connor and Subini A. Annamma, is especially helpful in understanding the detrimental effects that *Ausländerpädagogik* (foreigners' pedagogy) and *Sonderpädagogik* (special pedagogy) have had on migrant students, constituting the largest

population in segregated schooling facilities in Germany and Austria. The DisCrit literature also helps illuminate how an attempt at including a student with severe emotional challenges is sabotaged by the deficit-orientation prevalent in the Polish education system. Third, inclusion needs to be particularly sensitive to the **production of differences with regard to history, space and politics.** In the German and the Austrian contexts, literature on the impact of housing politics -- i.e., tipping-point theory, neighborhood stigma and urban educational settings -- illuminate the production of local myths and the perpetuation of disadvantage through "chosen segregation" in a multicultural school in Austria and an all-Muslim migrant school in Germany. Finally, I emphasize **social learning** in inclusive education. In the Polish context, for example, dramatic historical and political changes have affected the educational landscape to this day. Performance drill instead of social learning foregrounds the differences students with severe emotional challenges show as their behavior interferes with meeting the learning objectives of the whole class, while the brutal behavior of classmates who punish this student is pushed into the background.

2.3.1 Inclusion as a Principled Approach to Education

An inclusive school culture recognizes, welcomes and values diversity of its students, teachers, pedagogues and all other members of the school community (Hinz, 2008; Booth and Ainscow, 2011). Therefore, a "single-issue approach to inclusion"[67] that is responsive only to the matters of the disability community does not serve the purpose and the mission of inclusive education. Anthony Booth emphasizes: "There is a fear that the opening up of discussion about inclusion too broadly will detract from the advocacy of the interests of disabled people."[68] However, Booth points out that " 'disabled' only describes one aspect of a person's identity and one set of discriminatory pressures." As the DisCrit framework, theorized by Connor, Ferri, and Annamma, impressively summarizes: "The forces of racism and ableism circulate interdependently, often in neutralized and invisible ways, to uphold notions of normalcy."[69] To ensure that education for all means *for all*, Booth highlights that "we have to recognize that excluding and discriminating realities differ within different

---

[67] Booth, Anthony (2005): Keeping the Future Alive: Putting Inclusive Values into Education and Society? Paper presented at North – South Dialogue Conference, Delhi, accessed from https://www.eenet.org.uk/resources/docs/future_alive.doc, on Nov. 28, 2018.

[68] Ibid.

[69] Connor, David J., Ferri, Beth A., Annamma, Subini A. (2016):Dis/Ability Critical Race Studies (DisCrit): Theorizinh at the Intersections of Race and Dis/Ability. In: Connor, David J., Ferri, Beth A., Annamma, Subini A. (Eds.): *DisCrit: Disability Studies and Critical Race Theory in Education.* New York: Teachers College Press, pp. 9-32, p. 19.

contexts."[70] In *The Index for Inclusion* (2011), Anthony Booth and Mel Ainscow's comprehensive guide for schools to question and probe their own cultures of inclusion and exclusion, the authors clearly state: "An inclusive approach to diversity involves understanding and opposing the profound destructive dangers in equating difference or strangeness with inferiority. When this happens and becomes deeply embedded in a culture, it can lead to profound discrimination or even genocide."[71] Referring to Diana Lawrence-Brown, author and editor of *Condition Critical: Key Principles for Equitable and Inclusive Education* (2014): "Teaching from a critical pedagogy standpoint includes multiple perspectives such as multicultural education, disability studies, and critical pragmatism."[72]

Thea R. Abu El-Haj's *relational view of differences* provides a concept that brings these notions together. This view calls for understanding the conditions under which some differences matter more than others. I see this perspective essential to informing inclusive pedagogy. Abu El-Haj states:

> *Viewing difference in relational terms offers us a way to cut through the two tendencies for dealing with difference: ignoring it or locating it in particular bodies (that are then interpreted as being deficient). Building truly inclusive classrooms demands a careful examination of normative classroom practices that stigmatize and exclude some children. Shifting our scrutiny from the child to the invisible norms and assumptions of the classrooms suggests ways to build inclusive practices that account for the wide variability in human learning, thereby creating integrated classrooms that offer all students meaningful access to learning.*[73]

Hence, inclusive pedagogy is sensitive and reflects the fact that differences are socially constructed along many markers of identity, nonetheless "recognizing the material and psychological impacts of being labeled as raced or dis/abled."[74] Inclusive pedagogy probes the relational view of differences to understand how classroom practices, cultures and discourses construct notions of deficiency and highlight some differences more strongly than others. Inclusive pedagogy pays close attention to the context in which schooling takes place

---

[70] Booth, Anthony (2005): Keeping the Future Alive: Putting Inclusive Values into Education and Society? Paper presented at North – South Dialogue Conference, Delhi, accessed from https://www.eenet.org.uk/resources/docs/future_alive.doc, on Nov. 28, 2018.

[71] Booth, Anthony, and Ainscow, Mel (2011): *Index for Inclusion: Developing Learning and Participation in Schools*. Bristol: Centre for Studies on Inclusive Education, 3rd Edition, p. 23.

[72] Lawrence-Brown, Diana (2014): Critical Pedagogies, Inclusive Schooling and Social Justice. In: Lawrence-Brown-Diana, and Sapon-Sevin, Mara (Eds.): *Condition Critical: Key Principles for Equitable and Inclusive Education*. New York: Teachers College Press, pp. 1-16, p. 2.

[73] Abu El-Haj, Thea Renda (2006): *Elusive Justice: Wrestling with difference and educational equity in everyday practices*. New York: Routledge, p. 100.

[74] Connor, David J., Ferri, Beth A., Annamma, Subini A. (2016):Dis/Ability Critical Race Studies (DisCrit): Theorizinh at the Intersections of Race and Dis/Ability. In: Connor, David J., Ferri, Beth A., Annamma, Subini A. (Eds.): *DisCrit: Disability Studies and Critical Race Theory in Education*. New York: Teachers College Press, pp. 9-32, p. 19.

to understand how local knowledge, history and politics are interwoven in the practices, discourses and artifacts that constitute a given school culture. Finally, drawing on the historiographic analysis of special pedagogy presented in 2.2, I position inclusive pedagogy as an alternative to the special pedagogical framework and its epistemological assumptions of deficit, correction, and normalcy. I argue strongly against the infiltration of inclusive education through terminology, diagnostics and truths of special pedagogy. I reject the notion of inclusive education as subservient to special pedagogy, and I consider segregated schooling a drastic violation of the principles of inclusive education. No setting in which the separation of some students is tolerated may be labeled inclusive.

2.3.2 Tackling/Abolishing Deficit-Orientation

The language and practice of hope, possibility and ethics may be found in the foundational work *Funds of Knowledge for Teaching in Latino Households* (1995) by Norma Gonzalez and Luis Moll and their teacher researchers Martha Floyd Tenery, Anna Rivera, Patricia Rendon, Raquel Gonzalez and Cathy Amanti. The authors describe household visits by teachers as "research visits for the express purpose of identifying and documenting knowledge that exists in students' homes."[75] In their work, the authors reject and abolish the notion of deficient students. With the help of ethnographic tools, they train teachers to look for the knowledge over which their students possess authority and make this knowledge matter in classroom interactions and coursework. It is this deeply "social, political and transformative education" (Abu El-Haj 2018) of teachers by students, and of students by teachers, that I find essential to an inclusive approach to education. Furthermore, I find the following publications helpful: *Diversity in Early Childhood Education and Care: Centering Global South Conceptualization of Childhood/s* (2017) by Michelle Salazar Perez and Cynthia M. Saavedra, who criticize "a normalized White, male, middle-class, heterosexual version of childhood, where minoritized children are viewed as deficit."[76] The critique of the deficit orientation is also present in the works of Eric Gutstein (*Critical Action Research With Urban Youth: Studying Social Reality Through Mathematics,* 2013) and Pauline Lipman (*Collaborative Research with Parents and Local Communities: Organizing Against Racism and Education Privatization,* 2013). Their articles are inspirational in showing how emancipatory education can help students learn the tools to critique and confront the social

---

[75] Gonzalez, Norma et alii (1995): Funds of Knowledge for Teaching in Latino Households. In: *Urban Education*, 29, pp. 443-470.
[76] Salazar Perez, Michelle and Saavedra, Cinthya M. (2017): A Call for Onto-Epistemological Diversity in Early Childhood Education and Care: Centering Global South Conceptualizations of Childhood/s. In: *Review of Research in Education*, 41, pp. 1-29, p. 1.

realities within which they live disadvantaged lives along the lines of racial and socio-economic oppression. Gonzalez, Moll et al., Gutstein and Lipman provide great examples of education that abstains from what Abu El-Haj critically summarizes as "discrete, abstract tasks, the use of knowledge decontextualized from politics as somehow epistemologically neutral, and perspectives on self-discipline as individualized actions rather than embodied practices through which young people are learning forms of personhood."[77] Finally, the work of Robin M. Smith, *Considering Behavior as Meaningful Communication* (2014), similarly to other authors (Donnellan, 1984; Skilton-Sylvester and Slesaransky-Poe, 2009; Skoning and Henn-Reinke, 2014) argues in favor of the notion that students should be met with the least dangerous assumption when educational opportunities are being designed. Cheryl Jorgensen draws on Anne Donnellan's work on the least-dangerous assumption and summarizes:

> *the least-dangerous assumption when working with students with significant disabilities is to assume that they are competent and able to learn, because to do otherwise would result in harm such as fewer educational opportunities, inferior literacy instruction, a segregated education, and fewer choices as an adult.*[78]

From this approach, Jorgensen derives the following implications for schools: person-first-language, i.e. students with disabilities; descriptions of students based on their abilities and strengths; faculty speak directly to students than to assistants; age-appropriate vocabulary; individual student plans focus on academic curriculum, as well as skills to participate in mainstream school and community life, among other recommendations.[79]

2.3.3 Historical, Spatial and Political Aspects of Difference

Producing Classroom Homogeneity

Specific to the context, I build on Hana Cervinkova's concept of *Producing Homogeneity as a Historical Tradition* (2016), through which educational practices in Poland affect the way mainstream education stages homogeneous classroom communities geared toward performance and competition. I contextualize the Polish experience within an education-historical perspective and draw attention to the transformation processes that post-Socialist countries faced after Communism collapsed. Stephen Carney's *Negotiating Policy in an Age of Globalization* (2009) helps to read inclusive education as a liberal concept that receives strong pushback from schools and practitioners in Poland's neo-conservative climate.

---

[77] Abu El-Haj, Thea R. (Nov. 16, 2018): Council on Anthropology & Education (CAE): Past President's Distinguished Lecture, American Anthropological Association 2018, San Jose, Calif.
[78] Jorgensen, Cheryl (2005): The Least Dangerous Assumption: A Challenge to Create a New Paradigm. In: *Disability Solutions: A Publication of Creating Solutions, A Resource for Families and Others Interested in Down Syndrome and Developmental Disabilities*, 6:3, pp. 4-9, p. 5
[79] Ibid., p. 8 ff.

Local Stigma

Within the Austrian context, I focus on works that illuminate how local knowledge penetrates schooling culture -- the knowledges and truths, as well as discourses and practices in education (Erickson 1984; Geertz 1983). For the Austrian perspective in particular, I build on such literature as *On Austrian Soil: Teaching Those I Was Taught To Hate* (2005) by Sondra Perl, two pieces of local literature (2017) on the Gestapo camp near my research site and eyewitness accounts (2017) of the notorious neighborhood surrounding the primary school of my study. I also draw on Isolde Heintze's research with regard to the socioecological factors affecting educational mobility of children in urban quarters of Dresden, Germany (2007). These sources are enriched by American literature on the significance of space, architecture and social memory presented by Richard Rothstein in *The Color of Law: A Forgotten History of How Our Government Segregated America* (2017), *The Power of Place: Urban Landscapes as Public History* (1999) by Dolores Hayden, and *Mapping Contested Terrains: Schoolrooms and Streetcorners in Urban Belize* (1993) by Charles Rutheiser.

Urban Neighborhoods, Housing Policies and "Chosen Segregation"

In the German context, I pay attention to the specificities of the urban school setting to understand the spatial and historical aspects of producing difference. I draw on the work by Franz-Josef Kemper (*Restructuring of Housing and Ethnic Segregation: Recent Developments in Berlin,* 1997), the tipping point theory introduced by Thomas Schilling in *Dynamic Models of Segregation* (1971), and West and East German accounts of housing policies that illuminate the present-day "ghetto" districts as results of deliberate discriminatory government containment policies (Waldman, 2017; Kemper, 1997). The works of such scholars as Peggy Piesche (*Black and German? East German adolescents before 1989: A retrospective view of a 'non-existent issue' in the GDR,* 2002), Ingrid Gogolin (*The 'monolingual habitus' as the common feature in teaching in the language of the majority in different,* 1994) and Mechtild Gomolla (*Mechanisms of institutional discrimination against migrant children and adolescents in the German school system,* 2013) help in understanding and critiquing the migrant experience in the German education system. Thea R. Abu El-Haj's book *Unsettled Belonging: Educating Palestinian American Youth after 9/11* (2015) especially contributes an inspirational lens through which I approach the experiences of Muslim students and their teachers and pedagogues at my research site.

2.3.4 Social Learning

Keeping in mind that "learning is social, education is political, and as such education is always potentially transformative,"[80] I want to highlight that inclusive education is a deeply social concept. It aims to do away with walls of segregated schools, separate corners and special classrooms to which those who do not fit are directed. Inclusive education builds, essentially, on the idea of school as a place where being together happens. Inclusion is about grappling with (each) Other, and as such it requires practices that allow for talking, negotiating, listening and reconciling. If school is the one place in life where people meet who would otherwise be separated by income, skin color, belief system or sexuality (Edelstein, 2011), it is a crucial place where sociality may be practiced. I understand social learning as a twofold category: as a didactical approach to acquiring knowledge and skills, and as a pedagogical objective that shows itself through communication and conflict-resolution skills. Social learning as a didactical approach entails ways of knowledge acquisition that build on team work instead of individualized tasks.

David J. Connor and Subini A. Annamma suggest a variety of learning settings that enact inclusive education in this sense. They propose that teachers acquire a strength-based view of students, plan universal design, differentiate instruction, use multiple intelligences, embrace multiculturalism, and employ flexible grouping.[81] Not every student always wants to interact with others. However, sociality is upheld if individual work also allows students to communicate about a common theme to which everyone is able to contribute thoughts and insights.

Social learning as a pedagogical objective helps students work out conflicts that may arise through their different life experiences. For example, in multicultural, hyper-diverse classrooms, at times students whose cultures consider each other as "intimate enemies" (Benvenisti, 1995; Theidon, 2012) learn together. The conflicts of countries of origin may play out in the receiving cultures where students whose parents refuse to talk to each other or whose ethnic groups are even at war meet. Traditions, conflicts and customs might overshadow communication in classroom communities. Stress from socio-economic conditions, emotional and material neglect, and health conditions may also affect the ways students articulate themselves and address one another, their teachers and pedagogues. Essential to inclusive education is the commitment to a pedagogy that builds social relations

---

[80] Abu El-Haj, Thea R. (Nov. 16, 2018): Council on Anthropology and Education (CAE): Past President's Distinguished Lecture, American Anthropological Association 2018, San Jose, Calif.

[81] Connor, David J., and Annamma, Subini A. (2014): The Art of Inclusive Teaching: Developing a Palette to Reach All Learners. In: Lawrence-Brown, Diana, and Sapon-Sevin, Mara (Eds.): *Condition Critical: Key Principles for Equitable and Inclusive Education*, pp. 133-152, pp. 135-145.

among students. With technologies advancing quickly and the entire world's wealth of knowledge at students' disposal on their mobile devices, what students can truly practice in schools are ways of being with each other that are nonviolent, respectful and creative. To grasp what I understand as social learning, I borrow from Stacey N. Skoning and Kathryn Henn-Reinke's accounts of classroom communities: "In a shared classroom community, where educators and students work together to establish a positive democratic environment, students learn and practice conflict-resolution skills and hear the perspective of others."[82] Adding to this, I build on Alfie Kohn, who explains:

> *In saying that a classroom or school is a "community," then, I mean that it is a place in which students feel cared about and are encouraged to care about each other. They experience a sense of being valued and respected; the children matter to one another and to the teacher.*[83]

Kohn stresses that community-building and learning to be social must be facilitated.[84] He emphasizes certain prerequisites for building classroom communities, such as frequent and spontaneous dedication of time to forming the community, a limited number of students, and teachers who themselves are "part of a collaborative network of educators."[85] Teacher communities are significant resources through which classroom communities within schools can grow. As a hands-on approach to building classroom communities, I emphasize the pedagogical intervention of class councils. In plenary sessions, students learn to articulate problems, address them together and find ways to resolve them. To illustrate the class council approach, I draw on the works of Jürgen Budde and Nora Weuster (*Class Council Between Democracy Learning and Character Education,* 2017), Wolfgang Edelstein (*Education for Democracy: Reasons and Strategies,* 2011) and Gerhard Himmelmann (*Democracy-Learning: What? Why? What For?,* 2004).

3. A Stranger in Three Fields: Multi-sited School-Based Ethnographic Research

> *Our methods allow us to map the ways that macro processes unfold and are shaped and reshaped in the practices of everyday life.*[86]

---

[82] Skoning, Stacey N. And Henn-Reinke, Kathryn (2014): Building Inclusive Communities. In: Lawrence-Brown, Diana, and Sapon-Sevin, Mara (Eds.): *Condition Critical: Key Principles for Equitable and Inclusive Education*, pp. 117-132, p. 127.
[83] Kohn, Alfie (1996): *Beyond Discipline: From Compliance to Community. Alexandria: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development*, p. 101.
[84] Ibid., p. 109.
[85] Ibid., p. 110.
[86] Abu El-Haj, Thea R. (Nov. 16, 2018): Council on Anthropology and Education (CAE): Past President's Distinguished Lecture, American Anthropological Association 2018, San Jose, Calif.

I immersed myself as a professional stranger in three fields (Agar, 2008), to illuminate how the concept of inclusive education is put into action in schools; how inclusive principles and policies interplay with schooling cultures embedded in the specific educational traditions of each national context; and how pedagogies work complacently with or contest deficit notions of the disabled/the Other. I build on the ethnographic maxim of making the familiar strange and the strange familiar (Spindler and Spindler, 2000) to learn about the nuances of inclusive education that surfaced in each of the mainstream primary schools I researched. The "inclusion turn" in education had received legal impetus for serious implementation efforts through the ratification of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons With Disabilities by the European Union, as well as by each of its member countries on a bilateral basis (Austria in 2008, Germany in 2009 and Poland in 2012). However, grass-roots initiatives organized by parents and disability rights activists that precede this broader, international call for inclusion by many decades have fought for educating students with and without challenges together. In all three country contexts of my dissertation, the call for inclusion has been spearheaded by parent initiatives that advocated ending the containment of children with disabilities in segregated care facilities and special schools from the 1980s to the present. (See Molitor, 2008, for Austria; Kossowska, 2017, for Poland; and Wocken, 1987, for Germany). I consider the local contexts of my research sites drenched in a history of discrimination, sterilization and even murder of people with disabilities as well as the ethnic or cultural "Other." This history creates a sensitive background to the discussion on human rights and educational justice in the Central European context that cannot be ignored or rendered neutral (Perl, 2005; Snyder, 2017; Hayden, 1997). Therefore, my research is historically contextualized to illuminate the complexities of implementing inclusive education. The shift from a segregating approach to a an inclusive one must be examined both on highly local and contextualized grounds and in light of transnational and global developments (Carney, 2008, Appadurai, 1996, Rubin and Cervinkova, 2019). I see the methods of anthropology as suitable for "mapping the ways that macro processes unfold and are shaped and reshaped in the practices of everyday life."[87]

3.1 Educational Anthropology

My dissertation's theoretical framework also informed the methodological choice of educational ethnography as a methodology of empirical research and its representation (Spindler, 2000; Erickson, 1984; Willis, 1977). Educational anthropology is "deeply grounded

---

[87] Ibid.

in ethnographic research methodology and focuses on marginalized subjects, especially children, youth and families of immigrant and minority backgrounds" (Cervinkova, 2018). It deals with such topics as "the social and cognitive development of children" (Erickson, 1982), the "the delivery of educational services," "bilingual and multicultural education" (Abu El-Haj, 2006; Moll and Gonzalez, 1995), "desegregation" (Spindler, 2000), "school community relations" (Heath, 1982; Lipman, 2011) and other related areas.[88] The multi-sited school-based ethnographic study at hand contributes to several aspects with which educational anthropology is concerned. Through ethnography, I illuminate how European primary schools practice multicultural and multi-needs education to include students with disabilities into mainstream education.

Though the ethnographic account has its limits (Willis, 1977; Willis and Trondman, 2002), I agree with Paul Willis that ethnography "records a crucial level of experience and through its very biases insists upon a level of human agency."[89] Despite the limitations of the ethnographic lens, which I will discuss in detail below, I value this research framework immensely, for it allows studying the practices of educators side by side (Erickson, 2010), immediately experiencing the workings of daily school life, and producing knowledge on a relational basis (Apple, 2016). To summarize drawing on the words of Dennis Beach, "ethnography is in this sense about developing the close-up detailed descriptions of education identities and activities through situated investigations that produce knowledge about basic educational conditions and practices and the perspectives of the participants involved in them … without over-steering from purely personal ideas or pet theories."[90] Through the methods of ethnographic research, I "explicate and challenge the effects of educational policies and implementation in/on practice."[91] I designed my research as a multi-sited, school-based ethnographic study (Marcus, 1995) to enquire about the concept of inclusive education. Thereby I draw "attention from the actual places where things happen to focus on how meanings get taken up, shift, and circulate across different situations."[92] Inspired by Thea Renda Abu El-Haj, I study everyday classroom dilemmas (2006) with regard to the local

---

[88] Schensul, Jean J., Borrero, Maria Gonzalez, Garcia, Roberto (1985): Applying Ethnography to Educational Change. In: *Anthropology and Education Quarterly*, 16, pp. 149-164, p. 149 ff.

[89] Willis, Paul (1977): *Learning to Labor: How Working-Class Kids Get Working-Class Jobs*. New York: Columbia University Press, p. 194.

[90] Beach, Dennis (2011): On Structure and Agency in Ethnographies of Education: examples from this special issue and more general. In: *European Educational Research Journal*, 10:4, pp. 572-582.

[91] Beach, Dennis and Lahelma, Elina (2015): Introduction. In: Smeyers, Paul, Bridges, David, Burbules, Nicolas C., Griffiths, Morwenna (Eds.): *International Handbook of Interpretation in Educational Research*. New York: Springer, pp. 679-685, p. 680.

[92] Bogdan, Robert C., and Biklen, Sari Knopp (2007): *Qualitative Research for Education: An Introduction to Theories and Methods*, p. 76.

specifics of the neighborhoods where schools are situated, and to the contexts of a larger global policyscape that pushes for inclusive education (Carney, 2008; Appadurai, 1996; Rubin and Cervinkova, 2019).

3.1.1 School-Based Ethnography

School-based ethnographic research presents the researcher as a subject (Beach and Lahelma, 2015; Schratz et al., 2012), through whom data collection becomes relational and transparent with regard to the positioning of researcher, research participants, schools, neighborhoods, country contexts and so on. Margaret Eisenhart highlights Erickson's accomplishment as "an approach that would begin by investigating what actually happens between teachers and students in classrooms … and how these actions and meanings relate to large-scale patterns of social action and structure."[93] Ethnography allows the interplay between quotes and descriptions from the field that nurture the reader's engagement with "social existence whilst resisting tendencies towards empiricism, naturalism and objectification of the subject."[94] The ethnographic approach takes a clear stance against positivist, experimental and survey research designs. In that vein, I situate my work contrary to the terrain of positivist epistemologies in which the knower is detached, a neutral spectator whose cognitive efforts are replicable by any other individual knower in the same circumstances.[95] I encourage engagement with the moments I observed to create knowledge on the circumstances under which individuals experience discrimination in educational institutions.

The pioneering ethnographies of teacher and classroom research include the works by Shirley Brice Heath - *A Lot of Talk About Nothing* (1983), Perry Gilmore - *"Gimme Room": School Resistance, Attitude and Access to Literacy* (1985), or George and Louis Spindler - *The Processes of Culture and Person: Cultural Therapy and Culturally Diverse Schools* (1993). Ethnographies that tell counternarratives challenging the deficit stigma of ethnic minorities at the intersection of disability and race include those by Jean J. Schnesul and colleagues - *Applying Ethnography to Educational Change* (1985), Norma Gonzalez et.al. - *Funds of Knowledge for Teaching in Latino Households* (1995), or Thea R. Abu El-Haj on

---

[93] Eisenhart, Margaret (2001): Changing Conceptions of Culture and Ethnographic Methodology: Recent Thematic Shifts and Their Implications for Research on Teaching. In: Richardson (Ed.): *Handbook of Research on Teaching*, Fourth Edition. Washington, D.C.: American Educational Research Association, pp. 209-225, p. 209.
[94] Willis, Paul (1977): *Learning to Labor: How Working-Class Kids Get Working-Class Jobs*. New York: Columbia University Press, p. 194.
[95] Code, Lorraine (2012): Taking Subjectivity into Account. In: C.W. Ruitenberg and D.C. Phillips (Eds.): *Education, Culture and Epistemological Diversity, Contemporary Philosophies and Theories in Education*, pp. 85-100, p. 87.

Elusive Justice: Wrestling With Difference and Educational Equity in Everyday Practice (2006). Focusing on teacher education in urban school settings, Katherine Schultz and colleagues have presented ethnographic studies in *Listening to Students, Negotiating Beliefs: Preparing Teachers for Urban Classrooms* (2008). Mary Hamilton has introduced *Ethnography for Classrooms: Constructing a Reflective Curriculum for Literacy* (1999).

Notable studies on ethnographic school-based research in the German-speaking context have been conducted by the Austrian ethnographers of education Andrea Raggl and Christina Huf in *Social Orders and Interactions Among Children in Age-Mixed Classes in Primary Schools* (2015), as well as the German anthropologist Christoph Wulf and colleagues, who conducted a 12-year ethnographic study on rituals and performances in family, school, peer culture and media published as *The Berlin Ritual Study* (2010). In addition, significant qualitative research that takes the experiential and phenomenological perspective of education into view has been done by the research collective of the Innsbruck Vignette Research led by Michael Schratz, Johanna F. Schwarz, Tanja Westfall-Greiter and colleagues (Schratz et al., 2013; Symeonidis and Schwarz, 2016). Innsbruck Vignette Research seeks to illuminate educational research on "students' learning experiences as they occur rather than measuring learning by its outcome,"[96] which I see as strongly connected to the ethnographic approach that aims to thickly describe the schooling conditions in which education takes place.

In Kathryn M. Anderson-Levitt's *Anthropologies of Education: A Global Guide to Ethnographic Studies of Learning and Schooling* (2012), Gabor Eröss explores the educational anthropology scene of Central Europe. With regard to the Polish context, he summarizes: "A new generation of young anthropologists also has emerged, attempting to break (at least partially) with the philosophical tradition (Anna Fitak, Alicja Sadownik and others) studying, for example, institutions like vocational schools (Sadownik, 2006)."[97] Furthermore, I want to mention school-based ethnographic research in Poland that illuminates school cultures with regard to the enactment of student resistance (Babicka-Wirkus, 2015), cultures of trust (Maria Czerepaniak-Walczak, 2018) and practices of citizenship education (Cervinkova 2016, Rubin and Cervinkova 2019).

---

[96] Schratz, Michael, Schwarz, Johanna F., and Westfall-Greiter, Tanja (2013): Looking at Two Sides of the Same Coin: Phenomenologically Oriented Vignette Research and Its Implications for Teaching and Learning. In: *Studia Paedagogica*, 18:4, pp. 57-73, p. 58.
[97] Eröss, Gabor (2012): Central Europe (Bulgaria, the Czech Republic, Hungary, Poland, Romania, Slovakia). In: Anderson-Levitt, Kathryn M. (Ed.): *Anthropologies of Education: A Global Guide to Ethnographic Studies of Learning and Schooling*. New York: Berghahn, pp. 167-192, p. 168.

3.1.2 "Being there … and there … and there…!"[98]: Multi-sited Ethnography

Informed by George E. Marcus's concept of multi-sited ethnographies (Marcus, 1995), I conducted ethnographic field research in primary schools in three different country contexts. In this way, I examined the concept of inclusive education by drawing "attention from the actual places where things happen to focus on how meanings get taken up, shift and circulate across different situations."[99] Multi-sited ethnographies bring significant qualities to the research process; for example, they allow objects of study to be traced in the specific contexts within which they appear through different modes and techniques. Marcus describes the following process:

> *These techniques might be understood as practices of construction through (preplanned or opportunistic) movement and of tracing within different settings of a complex cultural phenomenon given an initial, baseline conceptual identity that turns out to be contingent and malleable as one traces it.[100]*

Drawing on Marcus, I carefully planned my research stays in each primary school where I collected data. I conducted field research in Poland from September to December 2016, in Austria from March to July 2017, and in Germany from April to July 2018. Against the "initial, baseline conceptual identity" of inclusive education that I derived from literature review, I tried to trace, describe and interpret the concepts of inclusive education each schooling culture presented to me. I conducted each research stay with respect to the local conditions that principals and teachers set, as well as my own obligations as an early-stage researcher within a European Union-funded Ph.D. program. As Marcus highlights, "not all sites are treated by a uniform set of fieldwork practices of the same intensity."[101] I did not intend to create perfect conditions for comparison. I spent two to three days a week at my research site in Poland; in Austria I visited the school every Tuesday and every Thursday; and in Germany I spent one week at a time at my research site, six weeks altogether spread out over four months. Ulf Hannerz problematizes questions of breadth and relationships, highlighting that "we realize how one site in a multi-site study now differs from the single site of that mid-20th-century anthropologist."[102] In his multi-sited ethnography engaging with the cityscapes of Tokyo, Jerusalem and Johannesburg, Hannerz "was clearly not trying to study

---

[98] Hannerz, Ulf (2003): Being there … and there … and there…! : Reflections on Multi-Sited Ethnography. In: *Ethnography*, 4:2, pp. 201-216.
[99] Bogdan, Robert C. and Biklen, Sari Knopp (2007): *Qualitative Research for Education: An Introduction to Theories and Methods*, p. 76.
[100] Marcus, George E. (1995): Ethnography In/Of the World System: The Emergence of Multi-Sited Ethnography. In: *Annual Review Anthropology*, 24, pp. 95-117, p. 106.
[101] Ibid., p. 100.
[102] Hannerz, Ulf (2003):): Being there… and there… and there…! : Reflections on Multi-Sited Ethnography. In: *Ethnography*, 4:2, pp. 201-216, p. 208.

the 'entire cultural and social life' of these three cities."[103] Similarly, I needed to limit my frame of observation. I decided on one fifth grade class in Poland, one fourth grade class in Austria, and one sixth grade class in Germany, often observing its pupils together with classmates from the parallel class unit.

As I moved from Szkola Podstawowa to Volksschule to Grundschule, I learned of discourses and practices that define disability, special educational needs, inclusion, diversity, a good student, a bad class and so. In this vein, I experienced what Marcus emphasizes as essential to multi-sited research: "what is not lost but remains essential to multi-sited research is the function of translation from one cultural idiom or language to another."[104] The notion of translation (Anderson-Levitt and Rockwell, 2017), of cultural mediation and intercultural communication, was inherent in the European dimension of the research framework under which I conducted my doctoral study. A multi-sited ethnography was therefore an invaluable theoretical and methodological design to achieve a truly European perspective on educational inclusion, "regardless of the variability of the quality and accessibility of that research at different sites."[105]

Furthermore, Marcus emphasizes that multi-sited ethnography focuses attention on the changing research landscapes as well as the researcher herself. He summarizes: "In practice, multi-sited fieldwork is thus always conducted with a keen awareness of being within the landscape, and as the landscape changes across sites, the identity of the ethnographer requires renegotiation."[106] Studying the individual school sites always demanded deep engagement with the educational and spatial landscapes within which the sites were set. Interpreting my data required me to carry out broad historical research to understand the tradition of categories and labels, and to see how they interacted with the language and practices suggested through the global policyscapes, i.e., the UN-CRPD and its call for educational inclusion. I studied the Polish language and Polish etiquette to increase trust and understanding with my research participants; I studied the history of special pedagogy in Austria, and I explored migrant histories in Germany. At each site I became an ethnographer with a different focus of inquiry.

Similar research endeavors have been undertaken by the researchers Joseph J. Tobin, David Y. H. Wu and Dana H. Davidson, who embarked on cross-cultural research in their study *Pre-School in Three Cultures: Japan, China and the United States*. I faced similar

---

[103] Ibid.
[104] Marcus, George E. (1995): Ethnography In/Of the World System: The Emergence of Multi-Sited Ethnography. In: *Annual Review Anthropology*, 24, pp. 95-117, p. 100.
[105] Ibid.
[106] Ibid., p. 112.

challenges in grasping three research sites without assuming representational character. Tobin, Wu and Davidson solved this problem by showing their research material on one preschool in a specific country context to different practitioners in the same cultural context:

> *We showed our videotape of Kyoto's Komatsudani Day-are Center to audiences in Osaka, Hiroshima, Tokyo, and Chiba. ... In each city we asked preschool parents and staff, and students and faculty at university early child education programs to tell us in what ways the preschools we videotaped were typical or atypical of others in their country.[107]*

These responses from the broader research field provided another perspective on the material. For the scope of my research, I approached the problem of typicality by gathering voices on my research material from experts in academia and administration. I drew on their expertise and experiences, through which we reflected together on my interpretations. I also carried out a detailed policy analysis that provided a rich background, against which I read the data I gathered at each of my research sites. Though I shy away from the positivist vibe that comparability implies, I agree with the experiences that Kathryn Anderson-Levitt and Elsie Rockwell share with regard to ethnographies in different local contexts:

> *Ethnographic studies ground the understanding of education in local context, the context in which learning and teaching processes must be understood. However, one's understanding of each context grows significantly when one compares and contrasts contexts across studies.[108]*

In a similar vein, it is not a better classification of each school system that I attempted through multi-sited research, but a better understanding of each context in which I explored the meaning of inclusive education. I see my work as well matched to the ethnographic studies that Kathryn Anderson-Levitt and Elsie Rockwell present in their book *Comparing Ethnographies: Local Studies of Education Across the Americas* (2017). The guiding principles with which they assembled a collection of educational ethnographies on North and South America ring true to in multi-sited study. Anderson-Levitt and Rockwell selected ethnographies that provided "ample descriptions of the situated histories of localities and research traditions," as well as promoting "understanding rather than accumulation of knowledge."[109] In detail, I described the neighborhoods and the conditions under which each

---

[107] Tobin, Joseph J., Wu, David Y. H, and Dana H. Davidson (1989): *Pre-School in Three Cultures: Japan, China and the United States*. New Haven: Yale University Press, p. 8.
[108] Rockwell, Elsie, Anderson-Levitt, Kathryn (2017): Comparing Ethnographies Across the Americas: Queries and Lessons. In: Anderson-Levitt, Kathryn, Rockwell, Elsie (Eds.): *Comparing Ethnographies: Local Studies of Education Across the Americas*. Washington D.C.: American Educational Research Association, pp. 1-26, p. 1ff.
[109] Ibid., p. 10.

school operated. I aimed at interpreting my data, not at drawing hasty conclusions. To give an overview of like-minded scholars, I want to mention a few works that Anderson-Levitt and Rockwell's book features. Gabriela Novaro and Lesley Bartlett's work, *Ethnographies of Migration and Education in the United States and Argentina;* Patricia Ames and Ana Maria R. Gomes's exploration of the education of indigenous people in Peru and Brazil, *Mainstreaming or Differentiating Processes in Schooling* and Anderson-Levitt and Belmira Oliveira Bueno's, *Teacher's Work: Comparing Ethnographies From Latin America and the United States*.

3.2 Methodology

In my approach to educational ethnography, I am inspired by Thea R. Abu El-Haj's scholarship on the imperative of the discipline. She frames educational ethnography as a methodology with corresponding tools that enable and oblige the researcher to:

> *unearth the imperial architecture that continuously tries to remain buried underneath the everyday practices of education. Staying close to the ground, observing carefully the practices of everyday lives, we track the ways that these historical ruinations are embedded in, taken up, reshaped, and sometimes blown apart in particular global contexts.*[110]

In what follows, I will introduce the research design of my study and the methods I applied to collecting data. Drawing in particular on Frederick Erickson's scholarship on qualitative, ethnographic research in schools, I will make transparent the steps I followed in data analysis and the decisions I had to consider in presenting my data in written form.

3.2.1 Research Design

I researched the fifth grade of a *Szkola Podstawowa* in Poland from September to December 2016, the fourth grade of a *Volksschule* in Austria from March to August 2017, and the sixth grade of a *Grundschule* in Germany from April to July 2018. I did not select the same number of participants or the same grade level in every research context. Nonetheless, parameters of my research sites were carefully chosen. I researched the highest grade level in each primary school, since literature indicates that the phases of transitioning from primary to secondary education bring segregating practices to the forefront (e.g., Tyrol Monitoring Report, 2015). I ended my research when I reached the point of data saturation (Bogdan and Biklen, 2007), and when interviews and field notes seemed to speak to my questions and to

---

[110] Abu El-Haj, Thea R. (Nov. 16, 2018): Council on Anthropology and Education (CAE): Past President's Distinguished Lecture, American Anthropological Association 2018, San Jose, Calif.

give me an understanding with which I was able to interpret the individual school cultures (Brantlinger, 2005).

During my fieldwork, I documented classroom activities and interactions and informal conversations, and extensively described artifacts I found in each school's formal and informal educational spaces, such as hallways, the schoolyard, the foyer, and leisure spaces inside and outside the school. Every day in the field was concluded by at least two hours of copying my field notes from the notebook I used in school into Word files I titled by date. In addition, I wrote analytical memos and kept a research diary as a way of meta-reflection on my field notes. Furthermore, I interviewed teachers, pedagogical staff members and the principal or vice principal in each school community. I contextualized the school-based data with policy analyses with which I outlined the legal background of each of the studies and expert interviews from the field of education studies and school administration. Each ethnographic study consists of two parts: policy analysis with expert interview material, and the school ethnographies, in which I display my field notes, illuminated and enriched with international literature on inclusive education, childhood studies and pedagogy.

Table: Research Design

	Poland	**Austria**	**Germany**
Research time frame	Sept.-Dec. 2016	March-July 2017	April-July 2018
Main research site	Szkola Podstawowa Primary School	Volksschule Primary School "Out There"	Grundschule Primary School "Tipping Point"
Secondary research site	Lyceum	Primary School "City Center"	-
Grade level	5th Grade	4th Grade	6th Grade
School size	500 pupils	200 pupils	220 pupils
Class size	25	22	19
Research participants			
Teachers	5	2	3
Pedagogues	-	-	1
Special pedagogues	1	1	1
Directors	1	1	1
External experts			
Academia	3	2	2
Administration	1	2	1
Practice/Activism	1	0	0

Source: Author

3.2.2 Methods of Data Collection

I collected data through participant observation, field notes, diary entries and analytical memos, as well as interviews with the research participants: teachers, pedagogues and principals (Emerson, Fretz and Schaw, 2011; Brantlinger, 2005; DeWalt, DeWalt and Wayland, 2000). Outside the field, I carried out an extensive policy analysis modeled after Bowen's document analysis (2009) for each of the three country contexts and interviewed external experts of my research sites from academia and administration (Meuser and Nagel, 1991).

As observing participant, I immersed myself in the school cultures of my research sites. At each school I joined one class unit and followed it throughout the school day. In this way, I intended to create a routine for everyone involved in the research process. From my own experiences as a teacher, I was aware that a stranger could create a lot of stress and disturb classroom dynamics. I hoped everyone would become familiar with my presence and grow accustomed to my note-taking. Balancing participation and observation (Bogdan and Biklen, 2007; Berry, 2011) turned out to be challenging at times. Regularly, I became a participating observer when teachers involved me in their lesson activities, since they knew that I was a trained English teacher. In the Austrian context, I was asked to check pupils' English-language work in Germany, I taught a smaller group of pupils with special educational needs when their teacher was absent; and in Poland, I gave German-language lessons. I embraced all these situations as valuable moments to observe my own responses to the group. Taking responsibility for the group or individual pupils was a humbling reminder of my own privileged position as an observer when teachers grappled with the day-to-day classroom challenges. I also appreciated these opportunities as moments when I could do something useful for the pupils and get to know their perspective on being pupils in their school. Key dialogues and observations from these instances have provided entries into my chapters and starting points of discussion.

As an observing participant, I experienced how schools conceptualized education for their pupils, how they organized education spatially and timewise, what was taught, which rules applied to classroom behavior, how teachers and students interacted, how breaks were distributed and spent. I paid attention to the languages that were spoken, the religions that were present, the special educational needs that were articulated and addressed, and those that were not. By joining a specific class unit, I took the pupils' perspective on the teaching situation presented to them. I usually sat in the back of the classroom or at a desk in the last row. During group work activities, I sometimes joined groups, watched their activities, and

listened to the way they negotiated tasks and work. I never took the front of the classroom without being invited. I was interested in the way pupils responded to their teachers, what concerned them and how they spoke among themselves. I included teachers' perspectives on my observations through the interviews I conducted with them, but also through informal conversations during breaks or after lessons that I noted in my research diary. Some teachers gladly used these opportunities to exchange thoughts on didactics and pedagogical interventions with me. After school I turned my field notes into elaborated digital texts and narratives. However, writing field notes was not a process of "passively copying down 'facts' about 'what happened.' "[111] I transformed events and scenarios into linear written form. My field notes were a mirror of my own perceptions, of the focus I decided to place on people and interactions. Conscious of the interpretative character of field notes, I transparently documented my emotional responses, the circumstances under which observations took place and my own activities in the field.[112] As my research continued, I commented on my notes when I recognized a recurring theme, a situation that spoke to an issue I had encountered before or something that I wanted to pay attention to in the future. I also made notes in preparation for the interviews with research participants that I conducted toward the end of each research stay. I treated these interviews as situations in which we could sit down quietly and focus on the observations that I had made. In this way, I invited participants to a joint reflection on their pupils, their own teaching practice, their school and the neighborhood, as well as matters of disability and diversity in education. Each interview opened with a question regarding the career biography of the research participant and closed with an invitation to comment freely on the topic of my research. Interviews were only roughly structured, since I chose to give space to the directions my research participants spontaneously decided to take and the thoughts they expressed (Brantlinger, 2005). I also used diary entries to write down questions and puzzling observations on the country-specifics of the schools I researched. As activities within schools are closely connected to housing, heath, resources, and the socio-economic status of neighborhoods and communities, I paid attention to urban settings that stood of the respective country contexts (Erickson, 1984; Schultz, Jones-Walker and Chikkatur, 2008). These observations helped me enter into the reflective interviews with the external experts who were familiar with the country context but strangers to the specific school community I had researched. I conducted expert interviews after Meuser and Nagel with education scholars and school administrators. Semi-prepared interviews structured the

---

[111] Emerson, Robert, Fretz, Rachel, and Linda Shaw (2011): Field notes in ethnographic research. In: *Writing ethnographic field notes*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, pp. 1-16, p. 9.
[112] Ibid., p. 15.

conversations, which lasted from 45 minutes to two hours. These interviews also provided valuable starting points for my policy analysis.

I carried out document analysis to understand the historical, political and socio-cultural circumstances that have led to education policies on inclusion, disability and diversity. It was important for my research to trace the development of inclusive education as a push for social justice, for which families and disability rights activists had struggled. Furthermore, I drew on government reports, monitoring reports, and European Union and OCED studies to grasp the education political field in which the school I researched was situated. Drawing from Bowen, document analysis pointed me toward questions and situations in my research to which I wanted to pay particular attention (Bowen, 2009). I searched documents for trends and for statistics that showed systemic discrimination against certain groups of students. In my research, I tried to understand how systemic discrimination played out in the practices and the individual school biographies of the pupil I encountered. I sought to illuminate the troubling state of education that students exhibited through the educational data; at the same time, I tried to see the data through the eyes of my research participants and their pupils. The fact that a school cannot make considerable progress with its students becomes less puzzling in light of the predictors of school success linked to socio-economic factors and multilingualism that education reports formulate. Hence, the ethnographic research of a single school became significant with regard to the overall developments that characterized the school systems as "inheriting education" (Austria), "geared for homogeneity" (Poland) and "migrants as the great losers in the German education system" (Germany).

3.2.3 Data Analysis

Drawing on Frederick Erickson's suggestions in *Qualitative Methods in Research on Teaching* (1986), I organized data analysis by "searching the data corpus – reviewing the full set of field notes, interview notes or audiotapes, site documents, and visual recordings."[113] After completing each research stay, I printed out all the field notes I had turned into roughly five-page accounts of the day and organized them chronologically. Then I would read through them day after day, highlighting specific moments and episodes that spoke in particular to my research interest. I would highlight phrases expressed by pupils, teachers, pedagogues that I saw as a suitable comment, description or title for a specific episode that had taken place.

---

[113] Erickson, Frederick (1986): Qualitative Methods in Research on Teaching. In: Wittrock, Merlin (Ed.): *Handbook of Research on Teaching*, 3rd edition, New York: MacMillan, pp. 119- 161, p. 146.

Erickson points out that data "does not simply *appear* to the researcher."[114] Hence, what stands out as prominent themes in field notes is not the result of natural formulas; rather, "each data point, each *datum*, must be defined and identified in a process of searching repeatedly through a set of information sources."[115] Therefore, Erickson suggests considering field notes, interview transcripts and archival records, etc. as "resources for data reconstruction within which data must be recovered … patterns or themes in the data also must be *found*- they do not simply 'emerge.' "[116] Through my own lens informed by the theoretical foundations I laid out above, I constructed patterns and themes through which I reconstructed and reorganized the data in my field notes. For example, I paid attention to deficit notions that teachers expressed orally toward their pupils, or that I interpreted as practices that implied deficit notions. Hence, I concur with Erickson that it would be naïve to believe that qualitative research is "simply and unitarily objective; conclusions about pattern are found by processes based on low-inference coding judgements."[117] Nonetheless, by transparently presenting my own biases toward categories that interested me, I invite the reader to question or enter into a discussion of my interpretations.

With regard to the interview material, I proceeded slightly differently. I followed roughly the first three steps suggested by Meuser and Nagel for qualitative content analysis. Hence, I prepared interview transcriptions, grouped the transcripts into paragraphs, and developed headlines for these paragraphs.[118] Then I would group the headlines into a table and add suitable quotations from the original transcripts, including line descriptions. In this way, I created a document with which I was able to easily navigate through my interview material. I created one navigation document for the interviews I conducted with members of the school community, and another for the interviews with the external experts. Since my questions differed, to some extent, it did not make sense to group the two sets of interviews together. As a third step, I highlighted specific interview passages that spoke to passages in my field notes that I had marked for detailed analysis. The navigation documents were still roughly 20 pages long, but they summarized the essence of up to six interviews, each 20

---

[114] Erickson, Frederick (2004): Demystifying Data Construction and Analysis. In: *Anthropology and Education Quarterly*, 35:4, pp. 486-493, p. 486.
[115] Ibid.
[116] Ibid.
[117] Ibid.
[118] Meuser, Michael, Nagel, Ulrike (1991): Expertinneninterviews – vielfach erprobt, wenig bedacht. Ein Beitrag zur Methodendiskussion. (Expert interviews – many times practiced, less appreciated. A contribution to a methods discussion) In: Garz, Detlef, Kraimer, Klaus (Eds.): *Qualitativ-empirische Sozialforschung. Konzepte, Methoden, Analysen* (Qualitative-empirical social science. Concepts, Methods, Analyses). Opladen: Westdeutscher Verlag, pp. 441-471, p. 459 ff.

pages strong. This way, I had an overview that was much easier to handle. This overview also helped me keep track of significant interview passages that I thought absolutely necessary to include in the respective school study.

Finally, before starting to write, I would go through all other forms of data I had collected in the field, i.e., pictures I took of each school, artifacts, the halls and classrooms, as well as the neighborhood, the city, etc. I would also revisit worksheets I collected during classes, bulletin board papers, presents from pupils and teachers, e-mail exchanges, etc., to better recall "what it was like" in the field. Then I would be ready to start "telling the story."[119]

3.2.4 Writing

As each country study was presented through a policy analysis and accounts from the field, I had to incorporate two different writing styles. The policy analysis was a rather straightforward presentation of findings to illuminate the wider context within which the schools operated. Here I included quotes from interviews with experts so that I could show a thorough command of the field and present their insights as commentaries on the national and international reports I had read. To depict the accounts from school research posed a different challenge, as I wanted to achieve "a sense of *being there* in the scene."[120] After each policy analysis was completed, I opened the accounts from the field with a rather long introduction to the local context within which the school was situated. I modeled these "first impressions" after Thea R. Abu El-Haj's chapter openings in her book *Elusive Justice*.[121] As I appreciated the power of description to spur on the readers' mind and convey a feeling for the research site, I followed her example in each of my studies.

Furthermore, I decided to place my field data very prominently in my dissertation. It was the scenes, the dialogues, the commentaries I grasped during my research in schools that I wanted to be the opening statements that started discussions on inclusion and exclusion. I expanded field notes into vignettes of "rhetorical, analytic, and evidentiary"[122] quality. As Erickson explains, "the vignette is a more elaborated, literarily polished version of the account

[119] Brantlinger, Ellen, Jimenez, Robert, Pugach, Marleen, Richardson, Virginia (2005): Qualitative Studies in Special Education. In: *Exceptional Children*, 71:2, pp. 195-207, p. 197.
[120] Erickson, Frederick (1986): Qualitative Methods in Research on Teaching. In: Wittrock, Merlin (Ed.): *Handbook of Research on Teaching*, 3rd edition, New York: MacMillan, pp. 119- 161, p. 150.
[121] Abu El-Haj, Thea Renda (2006): *Elusive Justice: Wrestling with difference and educational equity in everyday practice*. New York: Routledge, p. 27 ff.
[122] Erickson, Frederick (1986): Qualitative Methods in Research on Teaching. In: Wittrock, Merlin (Ed.): *Handbook of Research on Teaching*, Third edition, New York: MacMillan, pp. 119- 61, p. 150.

found in the field notes."[123] Often I presented a sequence of vignettes from different research days to show reoccurring themes that became apparent to me as the research process continued, such as the class council meetings in the German study, the verbal and physical attacks on Sim in the Polish example, or references to a bleak future for the children of the school "Out There" in the Austrian study. In this way, I tried to show that the instances I presented were not singular events to "persuade the reader that the event described was *typical,* that is, that one can generalize from this instance to other analogous instances in the author's data corpus."[124] In the analysis that followed the presentation of the vignettes, I engaged the voices of the teachers, pedagogues and principals that I had captured in interviews. In this way I aimed to expand my perspective on the events that had taken place in class or that I observed in the hallway, in the neighborhood, etc. through "locals." They contrasted with or supported the vignette that I showed. Similarly, Erickson recommends:

> *Direct quotes from those observed are another means of conveying to the reader the point of view of those who were studied. These quotes may come from formal interviews, from more informal talks with the fieldworker on the run (as when during the transition between one classroom event and the next the teacher might say, "Did you see what Sam just did?"), or in a chat at lunch.[125]*

I would then include voices of international scholarship on the themes I presented through the vignettes. In this way, I was able to bring out the specificity of certain scenarios, as well as how very similarly, for example, the construct of disability and differences takes place along the lines of race, poverty, gender, etc. As Clifford Geertz points out:

> *Previously discovered facts are mobilized, previously developed concepts used, previously formulated hypotheses tried out; but the movement is not from already proven theorems to newly proven ones ...A study is an advance if it is more incisive – whatever that may mean – than those that preceded it; but it less stands on their shoulders than, challenged and challenging, runs by their side.[126]*

Finally, a note on the risk of manipulation that Erickson points out, since "the analytic narrative vignette, like any other conceptually powerful and rhetorically effective instrument, is a potentially dangerous tool that can be used to mislead as well as to inform."[127] Vignettes are always only a "reduced account, clearer than life."[128] Sometimes I shied away from taking notes in class, as I could see that teachers felt nervous about the situation. In that case, I would

---

[123] Ibid.
[124] Ibid.
[125] Ibid., pp. 150-151.
[126] Geertz, Clifford (1973): *The Interpretation of Cultures*. New York: Basic Books, Inc., Publishers, p. 25.
[127] Erickson, Frederick (1986): Qualitative Methods in Research on Teaching. In: Wittrock, Merlin (Ed.): *Handbook of Research on Teaching*, Third edition, New York: MacMillan, pp. 119-161, p. 150.
[128] Ibid.

sit down during lunch break and tried to recall as best as I could the events of the first three lessons of the school day. It was very possible that in this process, I missed some details and overemphasized others. When I then turned field notes into vignettes, I am certain I produced a much more lyrical account than what had actually taken place. Thus, as Erickson states, "the vignette does not represent the original *event itself,* for this is impossible. The vignette is an abstraction."[129] In this vein, all three studies turned out to take different stylistic turns. The Polish study was written almost as a play with a prologue, a climax and an epilogue. The Austrian and German studies were conceptualized as thematic studies of phenomena I extracted from my field notes. I tried to map the data for readers engagingly so that their interest in the analytical interpretation would grow and be plausible, allowing us to come together to some understanding of what the truth could have been like in their experiences and in mine. I wrote this dissertation not only for academics, but also for practitioners to see their own challenges and experiences reflected.

3.3 Research Ethics

Shortly before starting my doctoral work in March 2016, I had passed the government examinations that followed two years of teacher training at an urban integrated secondary school (ISS) in Germany. Through my own experiences as a teacher, I was to some extent familiar with the conditions of all three of my research sites. I was accustomed to the setup of mass, public schools, the pressures of a tight teaching schedule, and challenging classroom situations. It came as no surprise to see pupils seated at desks while teachers stood up front. Principals always had their own offices, while teachers shared a single faculty room. Education took place in classrooms, while playtime happened in the corridors and outdoors. It took some time for me to move from being a former participant in the classroom to an observer; at first everything seemed too familiar (Spindler, 2000). Only over time did I start to read each site as a constructed social entity that staged its own schooling mission in practices, artifacts and language. As I moved from site to site, I developed a routine of carefully observing the arrangements I encountered. Through the multi-sited approach of my research study, the nuances each school chose to emphasize became visible and readable to me.

3.3.1 Negotiating Access

At my first research site, a primary school in Poland, I conducted fieldwork several days a week in a fifth grade class unit from September to December 2016. Poland sparked my interest as a post-socialist European Union member country that had risen to achieve great

---

129 Ibid.

success in PISA testing after just a few decades of political, economic and social transformation. I was wondering whether a schooling culture that championed high-stakes testing could also advocate for social justice through access to inclusive primary and secondary education for all children. This school was the most carefully organized research site I encountered in my fieldwork. Much attention was given to rituals and representations that I needed to follow to gain access. My supervisor, Hana Cervinkova, vouched for my ethical and professional integrity, as well as for the EDiTE network and its commitment to school research for social change. I was granted access to the primary school only after several preparatory meetings (in May and September 2016), during which the principal and the vice principal learned of my research proposal, negotiated my times at the school and endorsed my presence as a researcher. Teachers remained skeptical of a stranger to the school community. I needed to arrange access to classrooms individually on a day-to-day basis. With some teachers I never reached a basis of trust; others allowed me to observe their lessons on every occasion. Language barriers hindered me in approaching research participants. Nonetheless, the silences that came with my hesitant language skills helped me focus my attention on nonverbal communication, on the rituals and habits that constituted teaching, and on the actions that took place among the pupils. I grasped the school as a richly decorated place of religious and political symbolism that contributed to the discipline I encountered in corridors and classrooms.

During classes, the language barrier was eased with the help of the English-speaking special pedagogue who accompanied the class unit I observed. She supported my research by translating small classroom interactions for me or sharing valuable information on pupils' behaviour or Polish school culture after class. In this way, she helped induct me in the workings of the school as a key informant (Wolcott, 1987). She also offered great insights into the field of special-needs education. Having worked in both special and general schooling, she was familiar with both worlds. During interviews in Polish, I was accompanied by the linguist and Polish language scholar Lukasz Rogozinski. He was not only a translator but also a cultural mediator who helped me navigate the socio-linguistic norms in various situations. All interviews recorded in Polish were meticulously translated by him into English.

From there I then moved on to a Polish lyceum, the academic choice after middle school. Again, access was granted only after Hana Cervinkova had arranged for me to meet with the principal of the school and the head teacher twice before my research work. On Fridays, I shadowed a group of students from first to final lesson of the day. The data I

collected there was significantly smaller and served only as another angle for interpreting the observations I had made at the primary school on which the Polish ethnographic study is based. Several expert interviews helped me contextualize my research data and allowed me to dive deep into the analysis of my research site and its education-political landscape. Altogether I interviewed six experts from education policy, academia and practice apart from the teachers, the special pedagogue and the vice principal of my research site. I used five external expert interviews as well as an extensive policy analysis to contextualize my observations. In my Polish study, I was able to give voice to experts personally involved in the struggle to open mainstream education to students with disabilities, as well as scholars representative of the discipline of special pedagogy.

In Austria, where I conducted research in the fourth grade at two primary schools from March to July 2017, I was intrigued by the local educational landscape as well as Austria's history as a multiethnic state. I was curious to research how schools grappled with diversity on a cultural level, but also with special educational needs, since Austria, like Germany, had a history of discrimination and prosecution of people with disabilities. The city where my research sites were situated was drenched in local knowledge. The smallest city in my three studies, it showed strong contrasts between the center and the periphery. Therefore, I chose to research two schools, one in the neighborhoods "out there" and one in "the city center." My research study, however, focused largely on the data I collected at the school "out there" because I was interested in the almost mythical and notorious character of the neighborhood, as portrayed to me by locals. I wanted to investigate these depictions and find out how they overshadowed, interplayed with and shaped the teachers' approach to pupils and lessons at the neighborhood's primary school. Interestingly, both schools I observed were truly multicultural school communities, with students from nearly 30 different nationalities. Encountering very different school cultures helped me see the particularities and the systemic similarities of dealing with inclusion and diversity in each of them.

In the case of one of the schools, I was able to draw on the EDiTE network of partner institutions that my co-supervisor Michael Schratz had built. Thanks to his trust in my research agenda, he paved my way to the political and academic experts who offered me invaluable insights into the Austrian education system and reflections on my field observations. At the second school, which did not want to be part of the EDiTE network, I recruited research participants on my own. Whereas the EDiTE partner institution was accustomed to researchers and strangers to the school community, at the newly recruited

institution I slowly needed to build trust among teachers and school management. Although I met with the principal of the research site before my fieldwork and explained my research proposal, I regret that I did not plan an initial preparatory meeting with the teachers I observed. I attribute their unease at times about my note-taking, my questions and my overall presence to the lack of building trust at a first meeting. In addition to the two head teachers of the class unit I observed, the principal and the special pedagogue, I also interviewed two education scholars who were experts on disability studies in education and two regional education administrators. I interviewed male and female experts, as well as scholars who personally shared experiences with the disability community. I was very pleased with the voices and perspectives I was able to capture in my Austrian study.

My final fieldwork took place in the country context most familiar to me as a German woman and teacher. From April to July 2018, I spent altogether seven weeks with a class of sixth graders at a German all-day primary school. However, my familiarity was kept at bay, since I had never taught at primary-school level and had never encountered a school with a Muslim migrant population of nearly 90 percent. I chose to research the German educational context because Germany had the second-most-segregated school system in Europe, after Belgium (Barometer of Inclusive Education, 2012).[130] As a teacher trainee in 2015, I witnessed the effects of refugee migration into Germany on the local schools as gyms were turned into shelters and refugee children entered classrooms. I decided to do my fieldwork at a primary school that had rich spatial and historical ties to issues of discrimination and neglect. I wanted to understand segregation not only from the perspective of disability, but also at the intersection of special educational needs, poverty and migrant experiences. School statistics accessible online drew my attention to the Tipping Point School, as I call it, which had undergone great changes to create a positive environment for its pupils, who ticked nearly all the boxes of risk factors for poverty listed in national surveys and reports. After one phone call, I became a stranger in this school community, in which I quickly toggled between participant observer and observing participant. Since the school was constantly in need of a quick helping hand, I often stepped in as a teacher of smaller learning groups. These experiences shaped my perspective on educating students with special needs and sensitized me to the challenges that inclusive education undoubtedly poses. I interviewed all the teachers I observed, the special pedagogue, the class pedagogue and the principal. Again through the

---

[130] Schädler, Johannes, and Dorrance, Carmen (2012): Barometer of Inclusive Education – Concept, Methodology and Preliminary Results in Selected European Countries. In: *Acta Technologica Dubnicae*, 2:1, pp. 17-26, p. 24.

excellent support of my co-supervisor Michael Schratz, I was connected to the German research community on inclusion and primary education. Although I tried multiple times to arrange for an expert interview with various scholars or local politicians on the topic of migration and education, none of my attempts were successful. To contextualize my data, I conducted interviews with two scholars from Humboldt University and one school administrator. I realize the shortcomings of my ethnographic study, which would have been richer if I could have gathered voices of disability rights advocates or experts on migrant experiences of young Muslims in the German education system.

3.3.2 Establishing Rapport

As DeWalt, DeWalt and Wayland note (1998), the research method of participant observation raises greater concerns about ethical conduct than a structured interview or a written survey. Since I was interested in the culture of each school I researched, I always took notes and always entered conversations with my research participants to understand how they made sense of situations and issues concerning pupils and the school community. This approach required a friendly yet professional relationship, as well as a certain degree of trust between me and the research participants. I realized that establishing this relationship was a double-edged sword and the power relations were strongly in my favor. I risked nothing in these conversations, but my research participants were agreeing to discuss their place of work with me. Frequent feedback from my side on the state of my observations, on the matters I considered in my writing and the purpose of my research, eased the concerns of some participants. I tried to prepare each departure from my research site with an official moment of appreciation that involved treats for the pupils and flowers for the teachers, pedagogues, and principals and vice principals. However, I consider it a great weakness of my research process that my involvement did not explicitly benefit the school communities. My doctoral work fell short of linking research back to the practice that I observed.

My ethnographic research took place in a government institution, not in the private sphere of individuals. I engaged with the research participants, teachers, pedagogues and principals on the basis of their professional identities as educators, accountable for their actions and approaches to their students, and their positions within the school. I purposely did not spend breaks in teacher common rooms when I did not have a specific question or a planned observation. However, I did take notes on conversations among colleagues when I was seated in the hallway waiting for another lesson or when teachers offered me their explanation of a previous situation.

In all three research contexts, I ensured consent with my research activities through the declaration of consent written in German, or Polish, which was signed by the research participants and of which they had copies. The form outlined the purposes, methods of data collection and nature of their participation; it explicitly stated that participation was voluntary and that they might withdraw participation, samples or data at any time during the process, without consequences. The form also stated how data would be collected, protected during the project, and either destroyed or reused subsequently. It also stated what procedures would be implemented in the event of unexpected or incidental findings. The form also communicated that data would be used for publication and that all personal information would be completely anonymized. Throughout the research period, I also assured participants that their cooperation was voluntary and that they could withdraw any interviews or field notes that concerned them. The independent external ethics adviser, Priv.-Doz. Mag. Dr. phil. Robert Rebitsch, appointed by the EDiTE-EJD project, to monitor and report ethics issues to the Research Executive Agency (REA) advised me on the consent/assent procedures I applied. Rebitsch, a member of the Ethical Board of the University of Innsbruck, agreed to the declaration of consent form I developed for the Austrian research context and also used in the German context. With regard to the Polish context, all research procedures were in line with the EU's Data Protection Directive and EU Directive 2002/58/EC, Directive 2006/24/EC, the general requirements of Directive 95/46/EC and the Model Clauses. These procedures were also in accordance with the Personal Data Protection Act, dated 29.08.1997 (uniform text: Journal of Laws of the Republic of Poland 2002 No 101, item 926 with further amendments). All data will be kept in a MS OneDrive personal account; an encrypted copy will be written to DVD at the end of the research and kept at the University of Lower Silesia. Anonymization was implemented as a procedure for ensuring that data were kept secure and that publication did not lead to a breach of agreed confidentiality.

Since I conducted research in primary education institutions, I was indirectly involved with vulnerable individuals when I taught or observed lessons. As a teacher myself, I have been fully aware of the responsibility that work with children requires. I have never taken advantage of the trust that grew between pupils and me, or between teachers, pedagogues and principals and me, to receive explicit information on a particular student's background or condition that went beyond the purpose of my research. All information I received was on the basis of relevance to my field research and under the code of moral and professional integrity. The measures I took to prevent the risk of enhancing the vulnerability and stigmatization of children included anonymization of the class, the school and the city in which the research

was carried out. I encoded individual reactions and avoided identifying features of individual children, decided on gender neutrality or changed children's gender.

During the time I spent in educational facilities, I faced ethical problems on several occasions. When physical or emotional violence took place among pupils, I sometimes stepped into the situation before their teachers did. I also needed to draw the line carefully with regard to information on students that was shared with me. I never asked for access to students' records. All institutions handled their students' privacy with great discretion and care. When I interviewed research participants, I assured them that the transcripts were read only by me. Liv Sindler, who helped me transcribe the German-language audio files, has signed a confidentiality agreement, as has Lukasz Rogozinski in terms of the Polish research context.

The protection of data in any research and qualitative research in particular is a complex task ridden with challenges and imperfections. I have strived to apply all available ethical measures and precautions to protect the identity and data of my research participants.

4. Poland

This chapter explores the practices and policies of educational inclusion in Poland. It is based on ethnographic research carried out in a public primary school located in the region of Lower Silesia from September to December 2016. In cooperation with the school, its teachers, pedagogues and students, I observed lessons whenever I was granted entry to the classrooms in which class 5x was taught. This was a privilege not every teacher gave me, for various reasons. Therefore, I spent several hours during my field research observing and describing the communal space outside classrooms, the situatedness of the school within its neighborhood and the reactions I received from being "foreign" in this school. Often when I was waiting for the next lesson to start, I sat on a wooden bench outside the classroom like a child who had been sent into a time-out. The language barrier I faced because of my limited Polish required me to reflect on my observations with many insiders to the particular school context, as well as insiders to the general educational system within which this school operated. I interviewed the teachers whose lessons I was allowed to observe. I was able to inquire quickly and spontaneously about situations I did not understand in class and observations with the class pedagogue, who had been employed to take care of one particular student in 5x diagnosed with an emotional/social disability. I conducted one formal interview with the pedagogue, but our informal conversations were numerous and helped me understand her point of view as a special educator and specific classroom dynamics. In addition, I led

many informal conversations with the school's vice principal, who invited me to her office when I was not able to see a lesson, and with whom I was able to speak about different aspects of my research. She offered me insights into the pedagogical procedures in place for working with children with special educational needs and disabilities, as well as essential background information about class 5x and the teaching staff.

I contextualized my school-based research with several interviews I conducted with education experts from different universities, namely Professor Maria Czerepaniak-Walczak of the Institute of Pedagogy at the University of Szczecin; Dr. Magda Lejzerowicz of the Maria Grzegorzewska Academy for Special Pedagogy at the University of Warsaw; and Dr. Aneta Slowik of the Department of Pedagogy at the University of Lower Silesia. I also visited Dr. Agnieszka Kossowska and her family – powerful advocates of the rights of people with disabilities in Poland. Kossowska's book, *Duże Sprawy w Małych Głowach*[131] (*Big Matters in Small Heads*), is composed of chapters in which children with various disabilities describe what it is like to have a hearing impairment, to use a wheelchair or to experience autism spectrum disorders (similar to the condition that her own son has). In the book, she gave imaginary children a voice in depicting their own lives with disabilities, based on her many encounters with families from the disabilities community. When I met with Kossowska, she was a member of the independent Children's Rights Ombudsman's Team for the Development of Recommendations for Working with Children with Special Educational Needs (Członkini Zespołu ds. Wypracowania Zaleceń do Pracy z Dziećmi ze Specjalnymi Potrzebami Edukacyjnymi przy Rzeczniku Praw Dziecka). Furthermore, she held the title of an Ambassador of the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons With Disabilities (Ambasadorka Konwencji ONZ o Prawach Osób z Niepełnosprawnościami). I drew from her personal experiences as the mother of an 8-year-old son with autism, epilepsy and a hearing impairment, as well as her professional experiences as a researcher and activist. Finally, I interviewed the *wizytato*r, or school inspector responsible for the implementation of inclusive education in the region, Piotr Chladzynski of the Kuratorium, the board of education for Lower Silesia, who illuminated for me the policy level of how educational inclusion was organized in Poland.

The chapter is divided into two parts. First, I outline the larger Polish educational landscape that was reshaped time and again by geopolitical transformations. With the fall of communism in 1989 and Poland's entry into the European Union in 2004, the country

---

[131] Kossowska, Agnieszka (2016): *Duże Sprawy w Małych Głowach* (Big Matters in Small Heads). Opole: Stowarzyszenie Terapeutów Zależnych.

undertook enormous efforts to adapt to EU and international standards, measured by transnational standards of PISA and other test-based agencies. The strategy for success was clearly to give priority to content learning over social learning. However, having ratified the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Peoples with Disabilities in 2012, Poland allowed more and more students with special needs to enter general public education. This recent trend towards acknowledging student heterogeneity with regard to culture, sexual diversity as well as special educational needs puts the current Polish education system under pressure. My policy research shows the Polish educational system in the state of transition during which it lacks the tools to create learning communities that facilitate communication among students whose differences take center stage in a class community. The second part of this chapter shows on how these pressures transpire in a school setting on the example of a struggle that stirred the fifth grade of a public primary school where I conducted my ethnographic research.

4.1 Policy Analysis

The foundations of contemporary Rzeczpospolita Polska, the Republic of Poland, were established in 1989 with the fall of Soviet-controlled state socialism and the establishment of a democratic political system. In 2019, Poland will observe 30 years of independence from foreign interventions, the longest period of Polish sovereignty since the 18th century. From 1775 to 1918 Poland was partitioned by the Prussian Kingdom, the Austro-Hungarian Empire and the Russian Empire; it was invaded and occupied by Nazi Germany and the Soviet Union in September 1939, and it remained a Communist satellite republic of the Soviet Union from 1945 to 1989. As the education scholars Katarzyna Charzynska, Marta Anczewska, and Piotr Switaj summarize: "Turning points in Poland's history, such as the partition of the country or beginning of Soviet's supremacy, had major effects on the priorities and organization of education."[132] For example, during Partition, Poles within the Prussian Kingdom and the Russian Empire could not speak their own language in schools for the sake of complete assimilation, also referred to as Germanization or Russification.[133] In the Austro-Hungarian Empire, language politics were exercised slightly less radically with the toleration of Polish in schools. On a structural level, 123 years of Partition have left their mark on Poland's demarcations and statistics visible even today; as the 2001 report by the Center for Social and Economic Research pointed out: "Settlement patterns, as well as the distribution of small rural

---

[132] Charzynska, Katarzyna, Anczewska, Marta and Piotr Switaj (2012): A Brief Overview of the History of Education in Poland. In: *Comparative Education & History of Education*, pp. 92-98, p. 92.
[133] Ibid., p. 93.

schools, are not governed by some objective present-day conditions, but rather by the boundaries of partitioned Poland in the 18th and 19th centuries."[134] Later, Nazi and Soviet occupation during World War II destroyed Poland to the core. The educational sector was particularly targeted with the goal of eliminating Polish intelligentsia.[135] University staff was systematically murdered and school curricula were limited to topics of agricultural and service work.[136] Prof. Czerepaniak-Walczak summarized this period as follows: "

> *[...] our intelligentsia was killed by both of the occupants. When the Soviet Union invaded Poland in 1939, people like teachers, people working with the forests, they were educated some of them had a diploma of higher education but some of them had a diploma just for professional work but they were intellectuals – they were intelligentsia. In January 1941, Russia, the Soviet Union, started to imprison them and resettle them to the Asian part of the Soviet Union: Siberia, Kazakhstan, Uzbekistan. Yes, and whole families were resettled. And in the villages and in the towns, they left just simple people, not educated but some of the educated people in Wilna or Lwow, they started to hide, some of them changed their names, they pretended to be someone else. At the same time, Germans asked professors from Jagiellonian University for some meeting. They said we would like to get to know you, we would like to meet you but no one survived this meeting. They were taken to the concentration camps. So, the Second World War, a part of the damage was in the material sphere - the most damage was done to the intellectual capital.[137][138]*

Prof. Czerepaniak-Walczak alludes here to a meeting that Nazi officials had with professors and members of staff at the Jagiellonian University in Krakow on November 6, 1939. The meeting ended in the deportation of 183 professors to Dachau and Sachsenhausen Concentration Camps. Nobody survived what became known as 'Sonderaktion Krakau.'[139]

In 2004, Poland joined the European Union after drastic and rapid socioeconomic restructuring that propelled the country "close to the top-performing countries"[140] of the

---

[134] Levitas, Anthony, Golinowska, Stanislawa and Jan Herczynski (2001): *The Centre for Social and Economic Research: Improving Rural Education in Poland. Report prepared for the Warsaw Delegation of the European Commission by CASE Foundation*, pp. 1- 49, p. 13.

[135] Gierlak, Maria (2000): Deutschunterricht im deutsch besetzten Polen in der Zeit des Zweiten Weltkriegs. German lessons in German-occupied Poland in the times of World War II. In: *Zeitschrift für Ostmitteleuropa Forschung*. (Journal for East-Central European Research), 49:2, pp. 194-220, p. 198 ff.

[136] Hansen, Georg (2006): Schulpolitik im besetzten Polen 1939-1945. (School politics in occupied Poland 1939-1945). In: Elisabeth Zwick (Ed.): *Bildungsforschung*. Education research. Focus: War and Education, 3:1, pp. 1-16.

[137] Transcript 1 Poland, Interview with Prof. Maria Czerepaniak-Walczak, Jan. 23, 2018, ll. 213-226.

[138] "In Poland, 40 % of those who had completed higher education did not survive the war." See: Ministry of Foreign Affairs Republic Poland: Poland and Poles in the Second World War, accessed from: https://ww2.pl/terror-the-extermination-of-polish-elites-by-both-occupiers/#, on Aug. 1, 2018.

[139] Ministry of Foreign Affairs Republic Poland: Poland and Poles in the Second World War, accessed from: https://ww2.pl/terror-the-extermination-of-polish-elites-by-both-occupiers/#, on Aug. 1, 2018.

[140] Jakubowski, Maciej (2015): Opening up Opportunities: Education reforms in Poland. In: *IBS Policy Papers*, 1/2015, Instytut Badan Strukturalnych. (Institute for Structural Research), p. 3

OECD PISA study but also plunged it into "immiseration Capitalism."[141] With the introduction of the market economy in Poland, unemployment skyrocketed to 20 percent by 2002 compared to 6.5 percent in 1990.[142] The 2001 report "Improving Rural Education in Poland" for the Warsaw Delegation of the European Commission by the Center for Social and Economic Research (CASE report) stressed the necessity of assessing and further developing strategies to help alleviate the fact that wealth and GDP growth was concentrated in urban areas, leaving rural areas impoverished and under-resourced.[143] This divide was observable in household incomes, for example: "60 percent of rural households had per capita disposable incomes in below 200 PLN (ca. 50 Euros) a month, as compared to 7 percent of urban households."[144] As consequences of poverty in rural areas, the report listed alcoholism, deteriorating work ethic, low additional funds that parents could contribute to the education of their children, reduced general revenues of the local governments and, in turn, lower expenditures for public libraries and other cultural institutions.[145] CASE pointed out that in 1988, "more than 60 percent of rural adults had completed no more, and often less, than primary school education."[146] Only 1.8 percent of people that came from the Polish countryside held university degrees.[147] The divide between urban and rural education performance was so large that the CASE report concluded in 2001 that "rural schools will actually have to outperform urban ones if the gap in educational levels between town and country in Poland is ever to be narrowed."[148]

The education reforms of the 1990s sought, according to the authors of the CASE report, „a return to pre-World War II traditions and to 'normalcy', and [...] the dismantling of the authoritarian communist state."[149] Most crucial were the educational reforms of 1999, which included: "overhauling teaching curriculum and materials, introducing new three-year gymnasiums for grades 7-9 and opening the sector to private and non-profit community

---

[141] Cervinkova, Hana and Pawl Rudnicki (forthcoming). Austerity Capitalism and Education in Poland. In: Hill, Dave, Chrysochou, P. (Eds.): *Immiseration Capitalism and Education Austerity, Resistance and Revolt*. Brighton: The Institute for Education Policy Studies.
[142] Ibid.
[143] Levitas, Anthony, Golinowska, Stanislawa and Jan Herczynski (2001): *The Centre for Social and Economic Research: Improving Rural Education in Poland. Report prepared for the Warsaw Delegation of the European Commission by CASE Foundation*, pp. 1- 49, p. 12.
[144] Ibid., p. 11.
[145] Ibid., p. 12.
[146] Ibid., p.11.
[147] Ibid.
[148] Ibid., p. 13.
[149] Ibid., p. 39.

schools."[150] The Warsaw- based education reform analysts Ireneusz Białecki, Maciej Jakubowski and Jerzy Wisniewski referred to the new three-year lower secondary school, the gimnazjum, as the "flagship of the reform."[151] With the gimnazjum, general education was prolonged by one year, which Bialecki et al. saw as a "crucial factor of improved performance" by Polish students, measured by PISA results from 2003 to 2012.[152] In 1999, the Ministry of Education also implemented standardized testing at the end of all educational levels in Poland, i.e., after primary school in grade 6, after gymnasium in grade 9, and after secondary education in grade 12,[153] increasing comparability of testing results and training in international testing formats. The 2014 PISA report summarized that from 2003 to 2012 Poland increased its share of top performers and reduced its share of low performers in mathematics, achieving equal results with students from Canada, Finland and the Netherlands, and significant improvement in reading performance.[154]

In the 1990s, neoliberalism penetrated the Polish education system not only through testing but also through decentralization, which transferred "managerial control for more than 40,000 schools and non-school educational institutions [from the state] to local governments."[155] The 2001 CASE report predicted: "All efforts to improve the efficiency of Poland's educational system will in large depend on the willingness and ability of local governments to design, finance and implement rational strategies of reform."[156] In Poland, national education policy is developed centrally, while local authorities are responsible for its implementation - the gmina (borough) running primary and secondary education and the powiat (county) being responsible for education above the secondary level.[157] This has led to the following distribution of responsibility, as the Education Policy Outlook Poland report by

---

[150] Levitas, Anthony, Golinowska, Stanislawa and Jan Herczynski (2001): *The Centre for Social and Economic Research: Improving Rural Education in Poland. Report prepared for the Warsaw Delegation of the European Commission by CASE Foundation*, pp. 1- 49, p. 8.

[151] Białecki, Ireneusz, Jakubowski, Maciej, and Wisniewski, Jerzy (2017): Education Policy in Poland: The impact of PISA (and other international studies). In: *European Journal for Education*, 52, 167-174, p. 169.

[152] Ibid., p. 170.

[153] Levitas, Anthony, Golinowska, Stanislawa and Jan Herczynski (2001): *The Centre for Social and Economic Research: Improving Rural Education in Poland. Report prepared for the Warsaw Delegation of the European Commission by CASE Foundation*, pp. 1- 49, p. 35.

[154] OECD (2014): PISA 2012 Results in Focus: What 15-year-olds know and what they can do with what they know, accessed from: https://www.oecd.org/pisa/keyfindings/pisa-2012-results-overview.pdf, on Aug. 1, 2018, p. 4.

[155] Levitas, Anthony, Golinowska, Stanislawa and Jan Herczynski (2001): *The Centre for Social and Economic Research: Improving Rural Education in Poland. Report prepared for the Warsaw Delegation of the European Commission by CASE Foundation*, pp. 1- 49, p. 8.

[156] Ibid., p. 28.

[157] OECD (2015): Education Policy Outlook: Poland, accessed from http://www.oecd.org/education/POL-country-profile.pdf, on Aug. 1, 2018, p. 4.

the Organization for Economic Co-Operation and Development (OECD) and the European Commission from 2015 observed:

> *School leaders in Poland work in schools where responsibilities for curriculum and assessment are the highest among all OECD countries, but their level of autonomy for resource allocation is below the OECD average.*[158]

Hence, whether policy implementation can be successful in Polish schools depends to a large extent on the resources each Gmina directs to its schools. Hana Cervinkova and Pawel Rudnicki conclude in their article "Austerity Capitalism and Education in Poland" that the shift of budgetary responsibility for education from the central to the local governments led to misallocations of subsidies, which "generates further discrepancies in wealth and educational level between regions, individual schools and pupils."[159] Furthermore, they highlight the effects of hidden privatization of public schools, which started to occur in 2009 when local governments received the right to close schools attended by fewer than 70 students.[160] These schools were often reopened by parents and teachers as non-public, i.e., private institutions.[161] This dual structure of public and non-public schools that has emerged is an essential feature of the Polish education system needs to be considered when discussing the implementation of inclusive education of children with disabilities. The drastically unequal modes of allocating of financial resources to public and non-public schools will be further discussed with regard to the current governmental policies with regards to educational inclusion (See: 2.4.1).

4.1.1 "Dobra Zmiana" – The "Good Change"

On October 25, 2015, Prawo i Sprawiedliwość (Law and Justice), known as PiS, was elected as governing party to the Sejm, the Polish parliament. For the first time since 1989, the political left was not represented in the Polish parliament, and PiS, a right-to-center party, won 38 percent of the votes, corresponding with the absolute majority of seats in parliament.[162] PiS won the election with the slogan Dobra Zmiana (Good Change), referring

---

[158] Ibid., p. 11.

[159] Cervinkova, Hana and Pawl Rudnicki (forthcoming). Austerity Capitalism and Education in Poland. In: Hill, Dave, Chrysochou, P. (Eds.): *Immiseration Capitalism and Education Austerity, Resistance and Revolt*. Brighton: The Institute for Education Policy Studies.

[160] Ibid.

[161] Ibid.

[162] "In the Polish voting system a large portion of the votes for the political groups that do not reach the parliamentary threshold in effect accrues to the party which wins most votes, and thus the approximately 38% of the vote which L&J won gave the party an absolute majority in Parliament." See: Mazur, Dariusz and Zurek, Waldemar (2017): So called 'Good change' in the Polish system of the administration of justice, accessed from https://www.jura.uni-bonn.de/fileadmin/Fachbereich_Rechtswissenschaft/Einrichtungen/Lehrstuehle/Sanders/Dokumente/Good_change_-_7_October_2017_-_word.pdf, on Aug. 1, 2018, p. 4.

to the planned "deep reform of the state."[163] The non-governmental organization Freedom House summarized the following key developments of 2016 as follows:

> *In January [2016] the European Commission (EC) initiated its first-ever probe into a European Union (EU) member state's commitment to the rule of law, [...] several key pieces of legislation [...] were enacted through fast-tracked procedures that did not allow for significant consultation or debate [...] the government attempted to silence or discredit academics, journalists and others whose work challenged PiS's preferred historical narrative."[164]*

The "Good Change" also brought forward repeated attempts to install an almost total ban on abortion, and "a new law on state media was passed, subordinating them directly to the minister of culture; 130 journalists were fired or resigned."[165] Dariusz Mazur, criminal court judge of the Third Criminal Division of the Regional Court in Krakow, and Waldemar Zurek, civil court judge in the Second Civil Appeal Division of the Regional Court Cracow and spokesman for the National Council of the Judiciary, summarized:

> *The ruling 'Law and Justice' party has been acting consistently through the year 2016 and the major part of 2017 not only to subordinate and paralyze the work of the Constitutional Tribunal but also to introduce changes in the Act concerning the Public Prosecutor's Office, which will lead to its subordination to political factors.[166]*

Despite alarming infringements on human rights and the rule of law, Marcin Kulczyk attributes the support of 41 percent of Poles for PiS in August 2016 to the party's pro-family policy "Rodzina 500+" ("Family 500+") and "Mieszkanie+" ("Home+").[167] The "Family 500+" policy refers to a monthly family allowance of 500 PLN (115 Euros) for each child in the family, excluding families with a single child, single parents with one child and non-traditional families.[168] Parents with a combined income of less than 800 PLN (185 EUR) a month, receive the allowance of 500PLN after the first child.[169] "Family 500+" was aimed at tackling Poland's weak fertility rate, "one of the lowest in Europe," and decreasing the rate of extreme child poverty.[170] According to government statistics presented by Elzbieta Rafalska,

[163] Balcer, Adam, Buras, Piotr, Gromadzki, Grzegorz, and Smolar, Eugeniusz (2016): Change in Poland, but what change? Assumptions of Law and Justice party foreign policy. *Stefan Batory Foundation*, p. 1

[164] Freedom House: Poland, accessed from https://freedomhouse.org/report/freedom-world/2017/poland, on March 7, 2018.

[165] Gebert, Konstanty (2016): Poland: The "Good Change." In: *notes internacionals CIDOB*, pp. 1-7, p. 3

[166] Mazur, Dariusz and Zurek, Waldemar (2017): So called 'Good change' in the Polish system of the administration of justice, accessed from https://www.jura.uni-bonn.de/fileadmin/Fachbereich_Rechtswissenschaft/Einrichtungen/Lehrstuehle/Sanders/Dokumente/Good_change_-_7_October_2017_-_word.pdf, on Aug. 1, 2018, p. 53.

[167] Kulczyk, Marcin (2016): Family rights and family policy in Poland. *European Center for Law and Justice*, p. 2.

[168] Ibid., p. 11.

[169] Ibid.

[170] Goraus, Karolina, and Inchauste, Gabriela (August 2016): The Distributional Impact of Taxes and Transfers. World Bank Group: Poverty and Equity Global Practice Group, Policy Research Working Paper 7787, p. 26

the Polish Minister for Family, Labor and Social Policy: "One in two children in Poland benefits from 500+, since the program covers 55% of Polish children aged up to 18."[171] The current prime minister, Mateusz Morawiecki, specified on the Polish National Mayor Day in March 2018 that families in rural areas particularly benefitted from the program:

> *Our pro-family program, the biggest pro-family program in 30 years – in 130 years, even – has always been aimed primarily at the Polish rural areas. It is in the Polish rural areas that the majority of children is born. Our 500+ program serves primarily Polish rural areas, and they are where around 50% of all resources are directed.[172]*

The World Bank Group encouraged this program to tackle child poverty, as "improving income support to low income families is a critical first step."[173] Celebrated by some, Family 500+ has also been criticized by scholars who pay attention to its effect on women's involvement in the labor market. Drawing on Polish Labor Force Survey data, Iga Magda and Aneta Kielczewska of the Warsaw-based Instytut Badan Strukturalnych (Institute for Structural Research) and Nicola Brandt of the OECD state: "Labor force participation rate of mothers would have been 2-3 percentage points higher in the absence of the reform."[174]

Since benefits are withdrawn as soon as family income reaches a certain threshold, the incentive for women to stay at home increases. Furthermore, Magda, Kielczewska and Brandt contend:

> *The new child benefits may thus have reinforced a longer-standing falling trend of labour force participation among lower-skilled women in Poland. Despite a strong labour market, participation among women has not increased in recent years, unlike that of men. This is because of a sharp fall in labour force participation among low-educated women, with less than upper-secondary education, from 2013 onwards.[175]*

Hence, especially women of lower socio-economic background are more likely to become dependent on state benefits or the second breadwinner in the family, simultaneously enforcing the role of women to stay at home with their children. In essence, employment for men increased, while "parental leave was lengthened in 2013 and extended to unemployed

---

[171] Summary of "Family 500+" program and changes in the government program (April 4, 2017), accessed from https://www.premier.gov.pl/en/news/news/summary-of-family-500-programme-and-changes-in-the-government-programme.html, on April 5, 2018.

[172] Prime Minister Mateusz Morawiecki: "We treat Poland as a great value, as our common good" (March 11, 2018), accessed from https://www.premier.gov.pl/en/news/news/prime-minister-mateusz-morawiecki-we-treat-poland-as-a-great-value-as-our-common-good.html, on March 26, 2018

[173] Wes, Marina (Dec. 8, 2015): Poland can do more to support the poor. World Bank Group, accessed from: http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/opinion/2015/12/08/poland-can-do-more-to-support-poor, on April 5, 2018.

[174] Magda, Iga, Kielczewska, Aneta, and Brandt, Nicola (March 2018): *The "Family 500+" Child Allowance and Female Labor Supply in Poland*. Instytut Badan Strukturalnych, pp. 1-19, p. 4.

[175] Magda, Iga, Kielczewska, Aneta, and Brandt, Nicola (March 2018): *The "Family 500+" Child Allowance and Female Labour Supply in Poland.* Instytut Badan Strukturalnych, pp. 1-19, p. 8.

and inactive women for children born in 2016 and later,"[176] in this way contributing to the overall increase in employment. Though tailored to the benefit of children, 500+ enforces gender stereotypes and pressures on women to follow a rather traditional family model, increasing dependency of disadvantaged women in society. What is more, families with children with disabilities receive 1,200 PLN in monthly support.[177] However, parents who stay at home as primary caretakers of grown-up children unable to work themselves, may not take up any occupation at all. Agnieszka Kossowska, whose husband stays at home with their son, captured the consequences of this rule in her email to me in May 2018: "The parent of a child with disabilities may be 'only mother'/'only father' and nothing else." In the spring of 2018, the Polish parliament made international news when people with disabilities, together with their parents and disability rights activists, occupied the Sejm (parliament). Physical violence was applied to protestors when they tried to hang banners in English, news coverage reported.[178] They protested the unconstitutional practice of cutting state allowances for people with disabilities who turn 18, even though they continue to need care and assistance from their parents.

4.1.2 "Dobra Szkoła" – the "Good School"

The "Good Change" also introduced the "Dobra Szkoła" – the "Good School" reform, met by substantial outcry and protest from the Polish teachers' union, at times mobilizing "50,000 teachers, parents and other opponents" in Warsaw against the closing of the middle school, the gimnazjum.[179] In November 2016, within a year after the election of PiS to the Polish parliament, the Council of Ministers adopted the draft school reform, which was implemented ten months later, on Sept. 1, 2017.[180] Polish students now attend eight years of primary school, after which they have a choice of secondary education: the four-year general secondary school, the five-year technical secondary school, the three-year special school preparing for employment.[181] This education reform reduced 10 years of full-time compulsory education (introduced through the 1999 educational reform) by one year. Before September

---

[176] Ibid., p. 8
[177] Kulczyk, Marcin (2016): Family rights and family policy in Poland. *European Center for Law and Justice*, p. 11.
[178] Sieradzka, Monika (April 26, 2018): Parents of disabled children occupy Poland's parliament. *Deutsche Welle*: accessed from https://www.dw.com/en/parents-of-disabled-children-occupy-polands-parliament/a-43555600, on July 4, 2018.
[179] Teachers protest against Polish school reforms (Nov. 19, 2016), *The News*: accessed from http://www.thenews.pl/1/9/Artykul/280692,Teachers-protest-against-Polish-school-reforms, on March 8, 2018.
[180] Prime Minister Beata Szydło: Polish schools need a change (November 9, 2016), accessed from https://www.premier.gov.pl/en/news/news/prime-minister-beata-szydlo-polish-schools-need-a-change.html, on March 26, 2018.
[181] Ibid.

2017, Polish children attended kindergarten (przedszkole) for one year, followed by six years of primary school and three years of gimnazjum; now preschool and primary school, amounting to nine years, are the compulsory steps in Polish education. This dramatic structural changes came only two years after the then-Prime Minister Donald Tusk of the Civic Platform Party commented on Poland's outstanding PISA results:

> *Polish lower secondary school students are among the best in Europe. [...] the education system, criticized so often, delivers good outcomes. Today, the Polish school does not need a revolution, and Polish teachers have good reasons to be satisfied with their work.*[182]

In September 2017, the new Polish Minister of Education Anna Zalewska of PiS, was quoted by Euronews explaining: "The aim of the current reform is to guarantee the same level of education for everyone, regardless of whether the school is located in a small town or a big city."[183] In a similar vein, the Education and Training Monitor 2017 remarked that recent policies sought to address "inequalities between schools in lower secondary education."[184] In government statements, PiS has repeatedly stressed that it listened to its voters, which Szydlo explained was also the reason why the decision was made to return to the school entry age of 7, as an implementation of the „parents' postulate on this issue."[185] This postulate, however, did not mirror evidence-based research, as the Education and Training Monitor 2016 stressed "the recent decision to raise the school entry age to 7 is not following international evidence emphasizing the importance of early learning."[186] The PiS MP Dariusz Piontkowski defended the "Dobra Szkola" school reform against critiques from the opposition, which he contended had implemented 'teaching to the test' to boost scores in high-stake testing. Similarly, the Education and Training Monitor 2016 remarked that „the school system is centered on transferring knowledge using passive learning methods and preparing students for testing by imposing ready-made solutions, rather than supporting independent problem-solving, critical thinking and creativity."[187] However, Piontkowski's approach did not tackle these weaknesses

---

[182] Success of Polish lower secondary school students. Global results from PISA 2012 survey (February 27, 2015), accessed from https://en.men.gov.pl/2015/02/27/success-of-polish-lower-secondary-school-students-global-results-from-pisa-2012-survey/ , on March 26, 2018.

[183] Euronews (September 8, 2017): Poland rips up school system in rapid reform, accessed from http://www.euronews.com/2017/09/08/poland-rips-up-school-system-in-rapid-reform, on March 26, 2018.

[184] European Union (2017): Education and Training Monitor – Country Analysis Poland 2017, p. 6.

[185] Prime Minister Beata Szydło: Polish schools need a change (November 9, 2016), accessed from https://www.premier.gov.pl/en/news/news/prime-minister-beata-szydlo-polish-schools-need-a-change.html, on March 26, 2018.

[186] European Union (2016): Education and Training Monitor – Country Analysis Poland 2016, p. 2ff.

[187] European Union (2016): Education and Training Monitor – Country Analysis, Poland 2016, p. 4.

of the Polish education system, when he announced: "We are bringing back the teaching of history. We are bringing back patriotic education."[188]

4.1.3 Competing Notions of Homogeneity vs. Diversity in Polish Schools

Not only have structural changes been implemented under PiS, but the National Ministry of Education has also introduced a new core curriculum with particular attention to Polish history and language. Anna Dzierzgowska, a history teacher, and Piotr Laskowski, a history teacher and university lecturer, both members of the Social Education Monitor, commented on the proposed new core curriculum in August 2017. The authors rejected the core curriculum on the grounds of its „erroneus understanding of the role of history education."[189] As an example Dzierzgowska and Laskowski criticized the various formulations in reference to the „homeland" that they found to describe the core curriculum for history education, such as „love for the Fatherland," „native history," „mother tongue," „we the Poles." The Social Education Monitor was alarmed by this use of vocabulary, since it implied a focus on the concept of „nation" that includes only those in agreement with how „we, the Poles" are defined without clarifying the concept citizenship. However, the core curriculum, Dzierzgowska and Laskowski highlighted that „we, the Poles" was closely entwined with the „love of freedom." This concept was explicitly tied to the sovereignity of the nation, but not to equality, solidarity, labor rights, or the right to be free from religious or patriarchal domination.The free nation, then, was situated within „European values" that were presented without criticism. That, according to Dzierzgowska and Laskowski, „is not the task of historical education, which is supposed to complicate the picture of reality, not simplify it."

It would complicate the picture of „we the Poles" to thematize Poland's vivid, culturally diverse heritage before World War II, when Poland was home to the largest Jewish community (three million) in Europe. The historian Norman Davies stressed in his account of Polish history that:

> *for more than a thousand years up to the Second World War, [...] Poland was a multinational state of vast proportions [...] and was not only the homeland of most of the Poles in Europe, but also the homeland of almost all of the Ukrainians, Belorussians and Lithuanians, of several million Germans, and of the principal Jewish community in the world.[190]*

---

[188] Radio Poland (Dec. 15, 2016): Polish MPs approve education reforms, accessed from http://www.thenews.pl/1/9/Artykul/284655,Polish-MPs-approve-education-reforms, on March 26, 2018.
[189] Dzierzgowska, Anna and Laskowski, Piotr (August 6, 2017): Opinia o projekcie podstawy programowej z historii dla liceum ogólnokształcącego i technikum. Opinion of the Social Monitor of Education team on the draft core curriculum of history for high school and technical school. Spoleczny Monitor Edukacji. Social Education Monitor, accessed from https://www.monitor.edu.pl/analizy/opinia-o-projekcie-podstawy-programowej-z-historii-dla-liceum-ogolnoksztalcacego-i-technikum.html, on Aug. 1, 2018.
[190] Davies, Norman (1984): Poland's Multicultural Heritage. In: *Acta Slavica Iaponica*, 4, pp. 79-87, p. 79.

Because of the Holocaust and anti-Semitic policies adopted by the People's Republic of Poland in 1968[191], Polish society today is in fact, largely homogeneous. In 2017, the population of the sixth largest country in the European Union is 38 million people (96.9 percent Polish, 1.1 percent Silesian, 0.2 percent German, 0.1 percent Ukrainian, and 1.7 percent other and unspecified).[192] Today, 87.2 percent of Poles belong to the Catholic Church; 1.3 percent is Orthodox, 0.4 percent Protestant, 0.4 percent other and 10.8 percent unspecified.[193]

However, „we Poles," speaking in ethnic categories, are enriched through those Poles who left their country and returned to Poland after many years of living abroad, through employees and managers who follow industry and international businesses that open branches in Poland, and through geo-political factors that fuel migraton into the country. To date, there have been largely negative messages in the media and politics on the topic of refugees and migration. When Poland celebrated its annual independence holiday on Nov. 11 in 2017, the Guardian reported, „60,000 nationalists march on Poland's independence day."[194] An unprecedented number of nationalists from all over Europe had joined forces in a mass protest in Warsaw, exhibiting slogans like "Pure Poland, White Poland," "Refugees get out" or "We want God."[195] One interviewee, asked why he had joined the protest, reportedly told the TVP television channel to „remove Jewry from Power."[196] This „great march of patriots," as TVP news coverage called it, displayed a strong alliance of anti-refugee, anti-Semitic and pro-Catholic supporters who chose the day of Polish independence after 123 years of occupation to produce a notion of Polish patriotism that was highly exclusive and discriminatory against those who opposed far-right rhetoric and goals.

Gdansk, the city where the Polish solidarity movement Solidarnosc first assembled to revolt against and finally bring down Communism in the 1980s, is today home to 25,000 refugees from Ukraine, Chechnya, the former Soviet Union, Rwanda and Syria. Though mayor of Gdansk Pawel Adamowicz, a member of the Civic Platform, has not received

---

[191] Grudzinska Gross, Irena (2011): 1968 in Poland: Spoiled Children, Marxists and Jews. In: Vladimir Tismaneanu (Ed.): *Promises of 1968: Crisis, Illusion and Utopia*. Budapest: Central European University Press, pp. 43-53; Stola, Dariusz (2006): Anti-Zionism as a Multipurpose Policy Instrument: The Anti-Zionist Campaign in Poland, 1967–1968. In: *Journal of Israeli History*, 25:1, pp. 175-201.
[192] Central Intelligence Agency (CIA): The World Factbook Poland, accessed from https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/pl.html, on March 9, 2018.
[193] Ibid.
[194] Taylor, Matthew (November 12, 2017): 'White Europe': 60, 000 nationalists march on Poland's independence day, *The Guardian*, accessed from https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/nov/12/white-europe-60000-nationalists-march-on-polands-independence-day, on March 29, 2018.
[195] Ibid.
[196] Ibid.

funding from the central government, he has introduced a comprehensive model to help refugees and migrants to integrate, drawing on education, culture, labor and health institutions to facilitate the process.[197] When in 2015 asylum-seekers reached Greece and Italy over the Mediterranean Sea because of unbearable living conditions in their homelands, the European Union decided on a quota system in solidarity with first-arrival-countries. Poland at the time officially allowed for the resettlement of 900 asylum-seekers instead of 6,000 asylum seekers, merely 15 percent of its share. Because of the Ukrainian conflict that started in 2014 when "pro-Russian activists seized control over government buildings in towns and cities across the Donetsk and Luhansk regions,"[198] larger cities in Poland have become home to Ukrainian communities, amounting up to 400,000 Ukrainians across the county in 2015.[199] The presence of students with language barriers in primary and secondary schools was a new situation for teachers, Aneta Slownik said in our interview. She stressed that the current situation was a unique moment in Polish schooling culture:

> *People cannot deny the presence of other people. So there is some kind of movement, there are discussions, and I would say that you are here in a good moment because it is happening now. There is pressure from teachers because there is not one student; there are five students from the Ukraine in a classroom: "Please prepare me for working with them." Not only with the children from the Ukraine but also children with special needs [...] There is pressure from the parents who are saying sometimes good, sometimes bad things. "But my child has problems. She cannot go quickly in the process of learning because the teacher spends more time with the other children. I don't want that."[200]*

Slowik positively highlighted that migration has caused teachers to ask for help from education officials and academics to work better with children whose first language was not Polish. However, not only the technical tools of teaching in a multilingual classroom had to be developed, but also an approach to diverse needs in one classroom, since some parents feared that their children's learning progress would be slowed due to the demands of accommodation the growing classroom diversity.

To exemplify this point better, Slowik who conducts biographical research on matters of migration and multiculturalism in education gave the example of a Roma child who

---

[197] Womack, Helen (February 16, 2018): Polish city leads the way in solidarity with refugees, *UNHCR:* accessed from http://www.unhcr.org/news/stories/2018/2/5a83febd4/polish-city-leads-way-solidarity-refugees.html, on March 29, 2018.

[198] Kirby, Paul (February 18, 2015): Ukraine conflict: Why is east hit by conflict? *BBC News:* accessed from http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-28969784, on March 8, 2018.

[199] MacDowall, Andrew (May 13, 2015): Ukraine's refugees find solace in Poland, Europe's most homogenous society. *The Guardian:* accessed from https://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/may/13/ukraines-refugees-find-solace-in-poland-europes-most-homogenous-society, on Aug. 1, 2018.

[200] Transcript 10 Poland, Interview with Aneta Slowik, March 15, 2018, ll. 143-151.

attended a classroom in which one parent asked the teacher not to organize activities during which children would hold hands to prevent his child from having physical contact with the Roma child.[201] Whereas Roma children have attended Polish schools since well before 2014, the migration wave from the Ukraine to Poland, Slowik said, was "too visible, too present to deny."[202] It was the first time she had experienced "this kind of pressure and this dynamic process,"[203] in which emails from parents and teachers reached her asking for help.

With regard to the emphasis on patriotic education in schools and PiS party politics geared toward the nation, the cultural and educational anthropologist Hana Cervinkova described Polish schools as „sites in which homogeneity is produced through both the curriculum and concrete cultural practices."[204] She explains that „modern Polish partiotic education relies on the silencing of the historical multiculturalism of Poland and nurtures a concept of ethnically homogeneous Polish citizenship."[205] As stressed by Cervinkova and the Social Education Monitor, the limited concept of freedom to which the nation and „we, the Poles" is tied does not leave much space for notions of diversity within the curriculum and the classroom. Cervinkova's concept of the „production of homogeneity"[206] serves as a crucial vantage point for describing the treatment of disability and special needs in the Polish education system.

4.1.4. Managing Disability in Education

In Poland, a child who shows characteristics outside the norm, which means deviation from average behavior and average student performance, may be sent for evaluation to the Poradnia Psychologiczno-Pedagogiczna – PPP (Psychological and Pedagogical Counseling Center).[207] In these institutions, the child's special needs or disabilities are diagnosed and officially determined. The child may receive either an opinia (opinion) or an orzeczenie (decision); both being judgments on the health and the constitution of the child. Whereas an opinia is a recommendation regarding the child's special needs, an orzeczenie is a formal ruling that includes the classification of the child's disability. An orzeczenie is tied to the financial subsidy for the child according to the severity of the disability, which is usually treated with medication or some kind of aid and requires significant adjustments from the

---

[201] Transcript 10 Poland, Interview with Aneta Slowik, March 15, 2018, ll. 151-155.

[202] Transcript 10 Poland, Interview with Aneta Slowik, March 15, 2018, l. 221.

[203] Transcript 10 Poland, Interview with Aneta Slowik, March 15, 2018, l. 224.

[204] Cervinkova, Hana (2016): Producing Homogeneity as a Historical Tradition. Neo-Conservatism, Precarity and Citizenship Education in Poland. In: *Journal for Critical Education Policy Studies*, 14:3, pp. 43-55, p. 49.

[205] Ibid., p. 50.

[206] Ibid. 48 ff.

[207] Transcript 12 Poland, Interview with Piotr Chladzynski, March 20, 2018, ll. 96-102 (English version).

surrounding environment. In Poland, the parent has the right to allow for a diagnosis of the child. However, for fear of stigmatization, not every parent is inclined to send a child to the counseling center, as Piotr Chladzynski, member of the Kuratorium of Lower Silesia, as well as the pedagogue of my research site, explained.[208] In legal terms, ordinance 1578 from August 2017 of the Educational Law (Journal of Laws of 2017, items 59 and 949), lists the following options for the education, upbringing and care of disabled children at the primary school level: schools that are generally accessible, schools that are generally available with integration departments, integration schools that are generally accessible with special branches, and special schools. The European Parliament report on Poland for the Study on Member States' Policies for Children With Disabilities groups these variations into four general options: mainstream schools providing inclusive education; mainstream schools providing integration classes; integration schools and special and residential special schools for the blind, the visually impaired, the deaf and hearing-impaired, the intellectually disabled, the physically disabled and ill children; and centers for socially maladjusted youth.[209] Hence children who show social and emotional challenges may also be diagnosed in the pedagogical counseling centers, the poradnia, and considered disabled because of social maladjustment or the threat of it.[210] In my interview with Magda Lejzerowicz, the researcher presented her perspective on the educational choices for children with special needs and disabilities in Poland:

> *I would say that inclusion is like a third step of education of people with disability in Poland. […] I would say the first step is special education, the second is integration and the third is inclusion. […] I don't think there is a contradiction. A lot of people who were trained as special pedagogues work, for example, in the academia of special education in Warsaw. They advocate the idea of integration as well as the idea of inclusion.*[211]

---

[208] "[…] rodzice właśnie nie zauważają problemów czasami, że to dziecko jest agresywne, że należy do szkoły specjalnej, że będzie tam lepiej zaopiekowane. Nawet często nie chcą do lekarza, do psychiatry, bo mamy często takie przypadki. Też byłem ostatnio na kontroli: dziecko jest agresywne a rodzic powiedział, że nie będzie leczył, bo uważa, że nie." /"Even the parents often do not want to see a doctor, a psychiatrist, because we often have such cases. I was also recently on a visit (do the controlling): the child is aggressive and the parent said that he will not visit the doctor with the child because simply, no!" See: Transcript 12 Poland, Interview with Piotr Chladzynski, March 20, 2018, ll. 598-601 (in English version).

[209] European Parliament, Principalate General for Internal Policies, Policy Department C: Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs (2013): Country Report on Poland for the Study on Member States' Policies for Children with Disabilities, accessed from http://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/etudes/join/2013/474429/IPOL-LIBE_ET(2013)474429_EN.pdf, on Aug. 1, 2018, p. 29.

[210] "One też wtedy diagnozowane w tej poradni psychologiczno-pedagogicznej, są uważane za niepełnosprawne - tylko tam to jest wydawane ze względu na niedostosowanie społeczne albo zagrożenie niedostosowaniem społecznym" See: Transcript 12 Poland, Interview with Piotr Chladzynski, March 20, 2018, ll. 39-41 (in English version).

[211] Transcript 9 Poland, Interview with Magda Lejzerowicz, March 2, 2018, ll. 215-222.

Lejzerowicz stressed that advocates of inclusion were not in contradiction with special pedagogues. Instead of a binary opposition between special pedagogy and inclusive pedagogy, Lejzerowicz presented a multi-level system that offered options for everyone to choose from. This way, severity of the disability as well as parental preference could be taken into account in making the appropriate school choice. Integration and inclusion differed in the sense that integrated classes are required to adhere to a student ratio of 5:15, i.e., five children with a special needs/disability diagnosis and 15 without such a diagnosis.[212] Those five students have their own teacher, and they are often times grouped together and contained in one part of the classroom. Lejzerowicz warned of integrated settings that did not meet the needs of students who were, for example, hearing-impaired. Students would neither receive enough instruction to acquire sign language nor experience support to join the rest of the class and their activities. Lejzerowicz illustrated:

> *Special educators realized that this system of integration concerning children with hearing and vision problems doesn't work at all because they were sent to integration classes or integration schools and there was no one who could teach them reading, writing, etc. So they were sitting like in a theater - watching - nothing more.[213]*

These comments point to the feature of the Polish legal framework, which created an interesting situation that builds on a seemingly natural evolution of special education, instead of reforming the system through a central decision to abandon special schooling. On the one hand, every child and her/his parents have been granted the option of joining any school they wish: mainstream, integrated or special school. On the other hand, there is no explicit government stance on the legitimacy of the biological model of disability represented by the framework of special pedagogy. Asked how Poland negotiated between the inclusive schooling put forward by the UN-CRPD and the three-tier-system of special, integrated and inclusive schooling offered in Poland, Piotr Chladzynski of the Kutarorium explained that, in fact, the central government had no plans to close special schools. However, he commented on what he considered a favorable trend within education:

> *We have always had special schools in our system. […] And now, in connection with the ratification of the UN convention, these children are being introduced into general education. […] I just wanted to add that it was particularly visible because we have four degrees of impairment – light, moderate, significant, severe – and the children with light impairment, after the new regulations, we have observed a sudden outflow*

---

[212] Transcript 12 Poland, Interview with Piotr Chladzynski, March 20, 2018, l. 117 (in English version).
[213] Transcript 9 Poland, Interview with Magda Lejzerowicz, March 2, 2018, ll. 113- 116.

of children. These schools do not change but rather relate to the outflow of these children and special schools have fewer children. [...] We support this trend.[214]

Chladzynski's observations point toward changes made in compliance with the United Nations Convention on the Rights of People with Disabilities, which have encouraged more children with mild disabilities to attend integrated and inclusive learning settings than special schools. The Polish government considered this a positive development. Chladzynski's observations seem to support the contention of Iwona Radlinska, Marta Bazydlo and Beata Karakiewicz of the Pomerian Medical University of Szczecin who consider the UN-CRPD within Polish education policy to be the "most important legal act on the rights of disabled people, incurring legal liability of the State Parties."[215] Requested by the European Parliament's Committee on Civil Liberties, Justice and Home Affairs, the Country Report on Poland for the Study on Member States' Policies for Children with Disabilities was released in 2013. The report mentioned that the positive impetus on Polish legislation to move toward more inclusive educational measures can be traced back to the fact that the UN-CRPD encouraged a participatory approach instead of treating people with disabilities as subjects of social care.[216] However, structures were still lacking that ensured assistance of people with disabilities to live independently and self-governed as much as possible.[217]

In 2013, a year after Poland ratified the United Nations Convention on the Rights of People with Disabilities, the European Parliament's country report on Poland commented on the practice of inclusive education in Poland:

With regard to education of students with special needs, over the past 20 years the Polish system has evolved from a model of segregation toward a model of inclusion. The "in-between' integration model, introduced in the 1980s, in the opinion of the literature and the stakeholders, has not proved effective. [...] the implementation of the law is not sufficient. [...] the legal framework providing for equal access to

---

[214] "U nas w systemie zawsze istniały te szkoły specjalne. Tylko do tej pory to były oddzielne budynki - dla tych dzieci szczególnie upośledzonych umysłowo. Natomiast teraz, w związku z ta ratyfikacją [konwencji ONZ] te dzieci są wprowadzane do tego szkolnictwa ogólnego można by powiedzieć.[…] Tak dzieci do normalnych szkół] Właśnie chciałem dodać, że szczególnie było to widoczne - bo u nas są 4 stopnie upośledzenia (umysłowego): lekki, umiarkowany, znaczny i głęboki i właśnie te dzieci z „jedynki", z lekkim upośledzeniem, po wejściu w życiu tych przepisów zostało zaobserwowane u nas nagły odpływ dzieci. Odpływ. Te szkoły nie że się przemieniają tylko raczej polega to na odpływie tych dzieci i szkoły specjalne coraz mniej mają dzieci.[…] Tak, [ten trend] jest wspierany." See: Transcript 12 Poland, Interview with Piotr Chladzynski, March 20, 2018, ll. 162-188 (English version).

[215] Radlinska, Iwona, M Bazydlo and B Karakiewicz (2014): The rights of persons with disabilities in Poland. In: *Journal of Public Health, Nursing and Medical Rescue*, 4, pp. 25-30, p. 26.

[216] Pogodzinska, Patrycia (2013): *Country Report on Poland for the Study on Member States' Policies for Children with Disabilities*. Brussels: European Union, p. 9.

[217] European Parliament, Principalate General for Internal Policies, Policy Department C: Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs (2013): Country Report on Poland for the Study on Member States' Policies for Children with Disabilities, p. 31.

education in all types of schools for children with disabilities is not properly
implemented. This is mainly due to a flawed system of financing education of children
with special needs, resulting in a situation where the financial resources designated
for these children do not always reach the schools accommodating them. Moreover,
mainstream schools' teachers lack necessary experience and knowledge in dealing
with children with disabilities.[218]

The country report identified two weaknesses with regard to the practical implementation of inclusive schooling on which I want to focus here: a flawed system of financing education of children with special needs, and a lack of implementing the legal framework for educating children inclusively. In the following section, I will discuss the misallocation of financial resources for children with disabilities, present commentaries on the protection of the rights on children with disabilities, and discuss the tools of inclusive education granted by the Polish law.

4.1.4.1 Misallocation of Financial Resources for Children With Disabilities

The flawed system of financing for inclusive education, as mentioned by the European Parliament's monitoring report, is rooted in the misallocation of generous financial resources from the state for children with disabilities managed through the gminas, the boroughs. As the CASE report stated in 2001: "all efforts to improve the efficiency of Poland's educational system will in large part depend on the willingness and ability of local governments to design, finance and implement rational strategies of reform."[219] The financing body that provides the gmina with resources to equip primary and secondary education is an institution that belongs to the executive branch of government – for example, the city hall. This financing body may distribute funds it receives from the central government in the form of a disability subsidy to a student. This subsidy should follow that student to the public school of choice. However, the European Parliament's monitoring report points to serious flaws of this system as it is implemented in practice:

> *For a student with disability, the amount of education subsidy is from 1.4 to 9.5 times*
> *higher than for other students. Subsequently, the local authorities are supposed to*
> *transfer the funds to the respective schools. In theory the budget should be directed to*
> *the school chosen by the student. In practice, the subsidy is not divided between*
> *schools according to this formula. Instead, **local authorities use the education***
> ***subsidy according to their own priorities**. In the best case, the part of the subsidy*
> *intended for education of students with disabilities supports education of healthy*

---

[218] European Parliament, Principalate General for Internal Policies, Policy Department C: Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs (2013): Country Report on Poland for the Study on Member States' Policies for Children with Disabilities, p. 6.
[219] Levitas, Anthony, Golinowska, Stanislawa and Jan Herczynski (2001): *The Centre for Social and Economic Research: Improving Rural Education in Poland. Report prepared for the Warsaw Delegation of the European Commission by CASE Foundation*, pp. 1- 49, p. 28.

pupils. This practice leaves the schools accommodating children with disabilities with increased expenses which are not compensated.[220]

To illuminate the impact of these mechanisms on daily experiences of students with disabilities and their families, I will to draw on personal accounts that Agnieszka Kossowska shared. Her engagement in protecting the rights of children and adults with disabilities is unique and well recognized. She works closely with Poland's Ombudsman on the Rights of Children to prevent physical and emotional abuse of disabled children, who that are especially prone to such experience. When her son, Franek, was diagnosed with hearing impairment, epilepsy and autism disorder spectrum, doctors first said he would be unable to speak. However, his parents and sister learned sign language to communicate with him and to teach him how to use the language. As a result, Franek has been verbal since the age of 5.

When Franek reached the age of formal education, an orzeczenie was issued for him, which ruled that he would receive a subvencja (a subsidy), of up to 5000 PLN a month. Initially, Kossowska considered a public school for Franek, but she was worried that the gmina would use his subsidy for other purposes.

> *If the child enters a public school or a public kindergarten, […] the city or the community decides how much money goes to the school or the kindergarten. […] for example, the city decides to make public toilets accessible for the disabled by providing them with handles; then these kind of renovations are paid for by the money that was supposed to go to MY child. The money is not marked as money that goes to Kossowski.[221]*

When I asked Piotr Chladzynski of the Lower Silesian Kuratorium whether the gmina, the borough, transfers 100 percent of the subsidies for the students with disabilities to the schools that they attend, he replied:

> *We do not know that; – it should be so. Because this sum for a child contains everything –teachers' salaries, what the school needs to exist because we have free education.[222]*

Integrated classes were another option that Kossowska considered, but she feared that Franek would have to join a class attended by four other children who needed as much attention as he did with only one support teacher. This way, she explained, he would be sent to individual teaching soon after starting school, since his nervous system would react with epileptic

---

[220] Ibid., p. 34

[221] Transcript 11 Poland, Interview with Agnieszka Kossowska, November 2017, ll. 53-72.

[222] "Tego nie wiemy - tak powinno być. Bo ta suma [pieniędzy] na dziecko zawiera wszystko - tam są pensje nauczycieli, to, co szkoła potrzebuje, żeby istnieć. Bo mamy bezpłatną edukację." See: Transcript 12 Poland, Interview with Piotr Chladzynski, March 20, 2018, ll: 230-232.

seizures in such an environment. Hence, she turned to non-public schooling, but finding a kindergarten for Franek that would guarantee him speech therapy, support of the pedagogue and maximum participation turned out to be a truly challenging task for the whole family.

> *I spoke to one teacher, my Franek started kindergarten in September, and she called in March and said: "You know, maybe your son could come in May because I have so much debt. I have to pay the rent, the electricity and this way I could …" And I said, "I can't believe you are telling me that you need the money from the subsidy for your debts?!" So I had to change the kindergarten.*[223]

In the next institution, Kossowska encountered similar views on how to work with Franek's subsidy. Finally, she found a principal who struck a deal with her. They agreed that Franek would start kindergarten in September, but they would register him for the subsidy in July so that they would have two months' subsidy to reorganize the kindergarten in a way that was suitable for children with autism:

> *In the rooms, every wall was painted in a different color. It looked like a circus. This does not help the healthy children, either. So everything was changed. However, this was a fair move by the principal. She said to me, help us and tell us which furniture we should buy, which colors or which patterns should be on the walls. She told me in a fair way that if they received the subsidy for two months, they will have 10,000 PLN to buy what he needs.*[224]

From the accounts above, assessment of the implementation of inclusive measures, financial allocations and pedagogical work need to take place on a broad scale. Offices and institutions such as the Children's Ombudsman and the Supreme Audit Office of Poland provide valuable insights into the state of protecting the (educational) rights of children with disabilities.

4.1.4.2 Protecting the Rights of Children with Disabilities in Schools

On Oct. 16, 2017, Kossowska became part of a monitoring team that has worked closely with the Rzecznik Praw Dziecko, the Ombudsman for Children's Rights, a notable office in defense of the rights of children with and without disabilities. Kossowska, together with Małgorzata Wokacz-Zaborowska and Sylwia Mądra, represent parents who want "to improve the situation of students with special educational needs throughout Poland."[225] As an Ombudsman, Marek Michalak has unique authority, such as requiring public authorities, organizations or institutions to submit explanations as well as disclose relevant files and documents considering the cases he investigates.[226] Furthermore, as the Commissioner for

---

[223] Transcript 11 Poland, Interview with Agnieszka Kossowska, November 2017, ll. 118-125.
[224] Transcript 11 Poland, Interview with Agnieszka Kossowska, November 2017, ll. 141-148.
[225] Rzecznik tworzy zespół monitorujący (The Ombudsman Creates a Monitoring Team), Rzecznik Praw Dziecka, accessed from http://brpd.gov.pl/aktualnosci/rzecznik-tworzy-zespol-monitorujacy, April 4, 2018.
[226] Ibid., pp. 33-34.

Human Rights, he may appear before the Constitutional Tribunal and initiate proceedings in cases of constitutional claims concerning the rights of the child.[227] In an interview, Kossowska explained that Michalak decided to create a monitoring team on the basis of accounts of severe violence against a child with disabilities that she had discussed previously, in September 2017, in her blog Dzielny Franek (Brave Franek). According to the parents' testimonies, their child was carried out of the class by his hands and feet and locked in a dark room during school days. As a consequence of such treatment, the 10-year-old third grader in primary school, developed depression.[228] Kossowska stressed that such acts of violence were not uncommon in schools and institutions attended by people with disabilities.

Another monitoring body, Najwyższa Izba Kontroli - NIK (Supreme Audit Office of Poland), holds the position of a highly acclaimed institution in service of the Republic of Poland. In its current report on Supporting Special Education Students with Disabilities in Public Schools and Kindergartens, the NIK consulted the following institutions for information on the state of affairs on inclusion: the National Ministry of Education; all 16 kuratoria (school boards), corresponding with the 16 wojewodztwo (provinces) of Poland; 75 gmina and powiat (boroughs and counties); the rzecznik praw dziecka (the ombudsperson for the rights of children) and the rzecznik praw obywatelskich (the ombudsperson for citizens' rights); pełnomocnik rządu ds. osób niepełnosprawnych (the government plenipotentiary for disabled people's affairs); and the 16 prezesów regionalnych izb obrachunkowych (the 16 regional chambers of auditing).[229] In this report, the NIK recognized Poland's obligation to implement an inclusive schooling system in accordance with the UN-CRPD that grants children with disabilities equal access to quality and free-of-charge primary and secondary education.[230] The report confirmed Chladzynski's evaluation that there was a movement of

---

[227] Ibid.

[228] "I helped a mother in September because the child was simply locked into a dark room in school. And the child was also carried, for example, by its hands and feet out of the classroom and into the room that it would be locked into. And the child because of that had depressions; it was in third grade of primary school, so a 10-year-old child. He had to change schools. And the mother is looking for justice and that no other child would have to suffer like that. I have written the whole matter down in my blog. Of course, without city and names. And now the case is with the ombudsman. We had very much information from the parents, which is why we wrote to the ombudsman. He said OK, and now we are waiting. Maybe next week this team will be assembled, and then we will officially start our work." See: Transcript 11 Poland, Interview with Agnieszka Kossowska, November 2017, ll. 298-307.

[229] NIK (2017): Wspieranie kształcenia specjalnego uczniów z niepełnosprawnościami w ogólnodostępnych szkołach i przedszkolach lata szkolne 2014/2015-2016/; Supporting special education of students with disabilities in public schools and kindergartens school years 2014 / 2015-2016. Warsaw, pp.1-26, p. 4.

[230] NIK (2017): Wspieranie kształcenia specjalnego uczniów z niepełnosprawnościami w ogólnodostępnych szkołach i przedszkolach lata szkolne 2014/2015-2016/; Supporting special

students from special schooling toward inclusive settings, omitting integration classes.[231] Whereas 49 percent of students attended special schools in the 2014-15 school year, the figure was 42 percent in the school year 2016-17. Numbers went up for inclusive education - in 2014-15, 32 percent of children were taught in inclusive settings, compared to 39 percent in 2016-17. The number of students in integration classes stood at 19 percent in both school years under comparison.

However, when the NIK evaluated the use of IPET in inclusive settings, it discovered that only 50 percent of the audited institutions appropriately implemented the program:

> *IPET: Only in 14 out of 28 controlled institutions for all students, there are properly planned forms, periods, scope and time of granting assistance, i.e., in accordance with the recommendations of the judgments [orzeczenia] on the need for special education and educational regulations.[232]*

Reasons for the lack of proper application of IPET measures included:

> *It [poor implementation] resulted from the lack of appropriate specialists to conduct classes, financial restrictions imposed by the executive body [organ prowadzący] and failure to exercise due diligence, and insufficient supervision over the implementation of these tasks.[233]*

The report further claimed that "most of the inspected establishments (75%) did not use the existing possibilities to ensure proper financing of special education."[234] On an optimistic note, however, it concluded:

> *The results of the inspection and the information obtained allow us to state that the idea of inclusive education in recent years has been gaining in popularity, and teachers and the community of public schools began to notice the benefits of its implementation.[235]*

Nonetheless, it remains to be seen how a lack of implementation of inclusive measures grants meaningful and successful education to students with disabilities in mainstream education.

---

education of students with disabilities in public schools and kindergartens school years 2014 / 2015-2016. Warsaw, pp.1-26, p. 1.

[231] See for following statistics, NIK (2017): Wspieranie kształcenia specjalnego uczniów z niepełnosprawnościami w ogólnodostępnych szkołach i przedszkolach lata szkolne 2014/2015-2016/; Supporting special education of students with disabilities in public schools and kindergartens school years 2014 / 2015-2016. Warsaw, pp.1-26, p. 6

[232] Compare: Tylko w 14 z 28 objętych kontrolą placówek dla wszystkich uczniów prawidłowo zaplanowano formy, okresy, zakres i wymiar godzin udzielania pomocy, tj. zgodnie z zaleceniami orzeczeń o potrzebie kształcenia specjalnego oraz przepisami oświatowymi. Ibid., p. 8.

[233] Ibid., p. 18.

[234] Ibid., p. 19.

[235] Ibid.

4.1.4.3 Tools of Inclusion – Tools of Exclusion?

Based on the Polish Prawo Oswiatowe (Polish Education Law), the system of education guarantees the "taking care of students with disabilities by enabling the realization of individualized education process, forms and curricula and revalidation classes."[236] The standard procedure for granting this right is the development of the **IPET, the Individual Educational and Therapeutic Program**, with which Polish educators work first and foremost in inclusive settings. The IPET is regulated by ordinance 1643 from Aug. 31, 2017. The process of becoming a recipient of an Individual Educational and Therapeutic Program includes the following steps. Once a student receives an orzeczenie, a decision from the pedagogical counseling center, the IPET program is prepared for this specific student by a team of teachers, pedagogues, psychologists, and parents. Piotr Chladzynski explains:

> *In this IPET should be all his needs secured, how the child works, his strengths and weaknesses, what to focus on. This is also an official document. [...] IPET is also helpful because it describes functioning [of the student] at all levels. How does the child deal with math, with Polish [...] but also describes his emotional sphere: whether he is hyperactive or motivated. [...] every teacher can look at this IPET to know how to work with this child.*[237]

It should be stressed that IPET is a tool of assessment focused entirely on the individual who has been diagnosed with a disability or social maladjustment by the specialists at the pedagogical counseling centers. From the moment of diagnosis until entry into the inclusive setting, the child is judged through the lens of his or her shortcomings or impairments to full functionality. The IPET as it is conceptualized in the Polish policy context reflects the deficit model of disability by asking "What is wrong with this child?" instead of asking "How did school fail this child?"[238] The deficit model does not consider class dynamics and social barriers to inclusion, but rests its verdict entirely on the imagined functioning and dys-functioning of the individual in question. Chladzynski's comment illustrates this deficit dynamics - "teachers try to involve these children in all the activities of

---

[236] Dziennik Ustaw Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej, Warszawa, dnia 11 stycznia 2017 r. Poz. 59 USTAWA z dnia 14 grudnia 2016 r.; Journal of Law of the Republic of Poland, Warsaw, January 11, 2017. Pos. 59 of the Act dated Dec. 14, 2016.

[237] "Ten IPET sporządza tak zwany zespół specjalistów, czyli zespół osób, które pracują z tym dzieckiem. W tym IPET-cie powinny być wszystkie jego potrzeby zapisane, to, jak ono funkcjonuje, mocne, słabe strony dziecka, na czym się skupić. To jest taki też oficjalny dokument. […] IPET też na tyle jest pomocny, że po prostu opisuje to funkcjonowanie na wszystkich płaszczyznach. Czyli, jak ono jest w edukacji, jak sobie radzi: takie typowo przedmioty, czy radzi sobie z matematyką, z polskim, ale także opisuje tę sferę emocjonalną […] no i tu każdy nauczyciel może zajrzeć w ten IPET, żeby wiedzieć, jak z tym dzieckiem pracować." See: Transcript 12 Poland, Interview with Piotr Chladzynski, March 20, 2018, ll. 264-272 (English version)

[238] Dudley-Marling, Curt (2015): The Resilience of Deficit Thinking. In: *Journal of Teaching and Learning*, 10:1, pp. 1-12, p. 6.

the other children 'in the norm,' so to speak."[239] This way, inclusion is understood as a deficit located in the body of the individual in need of compensation to adapt to the norm. The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Persons with Disabilities, however, deconstructs this notion of disability and works with the social model, which takes into view the structures and attitudes that hinder the individual's participation in society. Rhetoric and actions derived from the IPET do not mirror this approach to difference. Instead, IPET manifests the label of the disabled Other and does not dominantly encourage pedagogical strategies for creating an inclusive classroom and school. Therefore, I would like to support the verdict, put forward by Beata Borowska-Beszta of the Faculty of Education Sciences at Nicolaus Copernicus University, who aptly summarizes that "integration is still much more widespread in Poland and constantly present in the Polish reality of the legal, theoretical and practice areas."[240]

Another support mechanism in inclusive settings is the **special pedagogue or the assistant** to the learning process of the student, described in ordinance 1643:

> *§ 3. 1. Psychological and pedagogical help provided to the student in school and institution consists of recognizing and satisfying the individual student's developmental and educational needs as well as recognizing the individual student's psychophysical abilities and environmental factors affecting his functioning at school and the institution, in order to support the student's developmental potential and create conditions for his active and full participation in the life of the school and institution as well as in the social environment. 2. The need to provide the student with psychological and pedagogical help in the school results in particular:*
>
> *1) from disability;*
> *2) from social maladjustment; […]*[241]

The pedagogical specialists conduct classes to help students develop talents and learning skills.[242] The goals of the actions provided by in-school and external specialists include:

> *3) recognition of the causes of educational failure or difficulties in the functioning of students, including barriers and restrictions hindering the functioning of students and their participation in the life of the school and institution[…].*[243]

---

[239] "Po prostu starają się te dzieci włączyć we wszystkie działania dzieci „w normie", że tak powiem." See: Transcript 12 Poland, Interview with Piotr Chladzynski, March 20, 2018, ll. 288-289 (English version)

[240] Borowska-Beszta, Beata (2014): A review of lights and shadows of Polish education integration. In: International Research Journal for Quality in Education, 1:2, pp. 23-30, p.23

[241] §3.1, Ordinance 1643; Journal of Law of the Republic of Poland, Warsaw, August 31, 2017; Dziennik Ustaw Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej, Warszawa, dnia 31 sierpnia 2017 r. Poz. 1643 Ministra Edukacji Narodowej 1)z dnia 28 sierpnia 2017 r.

[242] Amendment to Ordinance 532, §7 in Ordinance 1643, 5) b) 1) and 2), Journal of Law of the Republic of Poland, Warsaw, August 31, 2017; Dziennik Ustaw Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej, Warszawa, dnia 31 sierpnia 2017 r. Poz. 1643 Ministra Edukacji Narodowej 1)z dnia 28 sierpnia 2017 r.

In accordance with the UN-CRPD, barriers hindering the student from functioning and participating in school should be recognized. However, there is no particular focus on removing these obstacles. Pedagogical specialists who are involved with one particular student are, therefore, not asked to assess general educational setting that is provided to all students, but merely the student with whom he or she is appointed to work.

If a child is unable to go to school because of a broken leg, for example,[244] indywidualne nauczanie (individual teaching) takes place. This is regulated by ordinance 1616 from Aug. 29, 2017, which states:

> *§ 1. The Regulation specifies the manner and procedure for organizing [...] individual teaching of children and adolescents, hereinafter referred to as "individual teaching", whose health makes it impossible or much more difficult to attend a kindergarten, another form of pre-school education, and a pre-school branch at primary school or school.*

Furthermore, the ordinance specifies that individual teaching is "organized for a definite period"[245] and "individual classes are conducted in the place where the child or pupil is staying, in particular in the family home."[246] At the time of my interview with him in March 2018, Piotr Chladzynski contended that this tool of individual teaching had just been modified, since it had been widely overused:

> *the verdicts [for individual teaching] were often issued for children who behaved badly. [...] It was just abused, because big money goes with it, too. Often, for autism, for example, individual teaching was issued because these children can be very disturbing; they interfere with classes. Well, but it was illogical because you need to socialize, because this child with autism, the trouble is that he does not enter into relationships with people. Now this is changed; they have to learn in schools. A so-called psychological help is to be provided so there is inclusion in the class.[247]*

---

[243] §19.1.3, Ordinance 1643; Journal of Law of the Republic of Poland, Warsaw, Aug. 31, 2017; Dziennik Ustaw Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej, Warszawa, dnia 31 sierpnia 2017 r. Poz. 1643 Ministra Edukacji Narodowej 1)z dnia 28 sierpnia 2017 r.

[244] National Ministry of Education/ Ministerstwo Edukacji Narodowej, accessed from https://men.gov.pl/ministerstwo/informacje/najczesciej-zadawane-pytania-i-odpowiedzi-dotyczace-wsparcia-dzieci-ze-specjalnymi-potrzebami-edukacyjnymi.html, on Feb. 2, 2018

[245] §2, Ordinance 1616; Journal of Law of the Republic of Poland, Warsaw, August 29, 2017; Dziennik Ustaw Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej, Warszawa, dnia 29 sierpnia 2017 r. Poz. 1616, Rozporządzenie Ministra Edukacji Narodowej z dnia 9 sierpnia 2017 r.

[246] §5, Ordinance 1616; Journal of Law of the Republic of Poland, Warsaw, August 29, 2017; Dziennik Ustaw Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej, Warszawa, dnia 29 sierpnia 2017 r. Poz. 1616, Rozporządzenie Ministra Edukacji Narodowej z dnia 9 sierpnia 2017 r.

[247] "Przed tymi zmianami bardzo często były wydawane te orzeczenia dla dzieci, które się źle zachowują. A teraz nie. Właśnie to było nadużywane, bo za tym idą też duże pieniądze. Często na przykład dla autystów było wydawane [orzeczenie o indywidualnym nauczaniu], bo szaleją, przeszkadzają w zajęciach. No ale to było nielogiczne, bo trzeba uspołeczniać, bo jego [dziecko z autyzmem] przypadłość polega na tym, że on nie wchodzi w relacje z ludźmi. Teraz jest to zmienione - oni mają się uczyć w szkołach. Ma być tam udzielana tak zwana pomoc psychologiczna, czyli włączanie do klasy. Dlatego ten dodatkowy nauczyciel też jest. Ma

Hence, children who acted out and misbehaved were prone to receiving individual teaching time, which amounts to 6 to 8 hours of teaching a week for first to third graders, 8 to 10 hours for fourth to sixth graders and 10 to 12 hours for seventh and eighth graders.[248] Had the child stayed in class he or she would have been exposed to at least 23 hours of teaching a week.[249] It is understandable that a child with a severe disability may not be able to manage 23 hours of lesson material. However, if a child is denied a third of its education time because of misbehavior, it is safe to speak of a serious infringement of the right of the child to education. Though individual teaching is granted for a definite period one semester at a time, reduced education for half of a school year may result in serious weaknesses to which the child is exposed on top of the impairment. According to Chladzynski, this loophole in education policy, through which challenging students were channeled out of regular education, has been recognized by the Polish government. However, when the draft regulation of ordinance 1616 was released in early 2017, Agnieszka Kossowska met with the Minister of Education, Anna Zalewska, in Warsaw, expressing fears of parents concerning the measure of individual teaching. Kossowska explained: "In the draft Regulation of the Ministry of National Education, it was written that individual teaching would only take place at the child's place of residence. This would mean that children with disabilities would have to be locked in their homes; they would be deprived of the opportunity to socialize."[250] During this meeting Kossowska was informed that:

> In 2014 or 2013, there were a little over 2,000 children with this kind of orzeczenie [decision for individual teaching] in Poland. Now, in 2017, there are around 26,000 children.[251]

Despite these objections, ordinance 1616 on individual teaching in the case of severe obstacles to in-school education took effect on Sept. 1, 2017, severely limiting social opportunities for children with disabilities and their rights as members of Polish society.

---

pomagać włączać do grupy." See: Transcript 12 Poland, Interview with Piotr Chladzynski, March 20, 2018, ll. 305-312 (English version).

[248] § 9.1, Ordinance 1616; Journal of Law of the Republic of Poland, Warsaw, Aug. 29, 2017; Dziennik Ustaw Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej, Warszawa, dnia 29 sierpnia 2017 r. Poz. 1616, Rozporządzenie Ministra Edukacji Narodowej z dnia 9 sierpnia 2017 r.

[249] Gil, Malgorzata (2007): From Segregation to Equalization: The Polish Perspective on Educating Children With Intellectual Disabilities. In: *Journal of Contemporary Issues in Education*, 2:1, pp. 40-52, p. 46.

[250] Żołądź, Magdalena (17.05.2017): Agnieszka Kossowska: daję ministerstwu ogromny kredyt zaufania, Nowa Trybuna Opolska, accessed from: http://www.nto.pl/nto-tv/gosc-nto/a/agnieszka-kossowska-daje-ministerstwu-ogromny-kredyt-zaufania,12080716/, on March 21, 2018.

[251] Transcript 11 Poland, November 2017, Interview with Agnieszka Kossowska, ll. 238-240.

4.1.5 Summary

Polish education policy points toward the goals of limiting barriers to education and encouraging all children to participate in mainstream schooling. However, the tools in use to facilitate the shift from the special pedagogical treatment of students to a more inclusive approach follow the concept of an individual deficit-based approach to disability. The IPET, assistants to learning and individual lessons focus on supporting students with special educational needs to fit into the system of mass mainstream schools in Poland. These tools do not address a fundamental change with which barriers to education can actually be limited. The medical gaze remains on the student, not on the institution or the community in which he or she is to be included. The preceding policy analysis demonstrates an understanding of the concept of educational inclusion that rests on a three-tier-system that sees special pedagogy at the foundation of educational efforts to teach children with disabilities. Inclusive education is regarded as a third step in teaching children within the spectrum of special education. This way, inclusive pedagogy cannot emancipate itself from a discipline that claims to provide expert knowledge and specialist treatment on the disabled body. Breaking with this tradition means reconsidering schooling. In the Polish context, this would require an honest appreciation and protection of diversity within social institutions. However, in the wider social-political context depicted, it may be observed that activities by the current Polish government are directed toward homogenizing and unifying of the political apparatus (for example, limiting the sovereignty of the Constitutional Tribunal). Fostering human rights and values of pluralistic democracy take second seat. Tendencies toward simplifying the complexities of historical education and the "production of homogeneity"[252] reinforce the narration of a mono-cultural Poland and mirror the political push to establish a single dominant cultural perspective. The continuing emphasis on content-learning over social skills in the Polish education system was justified by the striving to reform and "catch up" with the European Union standards based on testing that became indicatory for Poland after the fall of the Iron Curtain in 1989. After more than a century of foreign rule and occupation, Poland's entry into the market economy and the European Union labor market brought the adoption of the educational trend enforced by the OECD's PISA studies of measurable performance and accountability. Overemphasizing content over social learning, however, has not served the development of active citizenship skills and attitudes, including critical thinking, empathy and

---

[252] Cervinkova, Hana (2016): Producing Homogeneity as a Historical Tradition. Neo-Conservatism, Precarity and Citizenship Education in Poland. In: *Journal for Critical Education Policy Studies*, 14:3, pp. 43-55, p. 48 ff.

multiperspectivity. Valuing students' differences is one crucial step toward establishing a perspective that is alternative to the focus of impairment and "deficit."

4.2 A Typical Neighborhood in an Exceptional City

In late September 2016, seven months after I had moved to Poland, I began conducting participant observations at a *Szkoła Podstawowa*, a primary school in a large Polish city roughly three hours from the German border. In the run-up to my research stay, which lasted until December 2016, I familiarized myself with the Polish language and gained insights into the geo-political conditions of the city and country. The city was in the heart of the territories affected by the postwar border shifts that caused Poland to lose more than 70,000 square miles to the Soviet Union while acquiring more than 40,000 square miles of German territory, including Silesia, Pomerania and the southern part of East Prussia.[253] Forty years of state socialism kept the People's Republic of Poland under the close and brutal surveillance of the Soviet Union.

In 2018, this city allowed for enough sentimentality that elderly German tourists felt comfortable reviving memories of their families' roots during weekend visits. An intriguing mix of familiar architecture (cathedrals, Baroque merchant houses) and exotic-enough Polish goods (*pierogi,* filled dumplings, and homemade *lody*, ice cream), constituted part of this destination's charm. Away from home but very accessible through German-language signs on restaurants and public buildings, the old city has successfully marketed its past. Memories of a different kind were neatly stored away in the district where Orthodox, Catholic and Protestant churches were situated next to a Synagogue. One of the largest Jewish communities in the German Reich was deported from this city and murdered in the concentration camps and execution sites Auschwitz-Birkenau, Sobibor, Belzec and Kaunas. Only a plaque on the premises of the synagogue reminds passers-by of this layer of German Jewish memory in the city. The largest synagogue was burned down during Reich's Kristallnacht in November 1938, and after the war its space was used for tenant houses. One of the remaining Jewish cemeteries grants final rest to famous German Jewish personalities.

An exhibition on the market square stressed the active life of the city's Polish minority before World War II. As in many other cities that had German-majority populations before the war, this one also drew on various rituals and narratives to stress a Polish right to this city. Polonization in the newly acquired formerly German territories had to fulfill the goal of

---

[253] United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, Washington, D.C., Holocaust Encyclopedia: Poland in 1945, accessed from https://www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10005599, on May 2, 2018.

establishing a Polish identity that would be inclusive enough for all those resettled from the lost territories in the east to the new territories in the west. Within two years (1944-1946), Poles were forced to leave their homes, which almost overnight belonged to Soviet-governed Ukraine, Lithuania and Belarus, and moved to an area that had undergone exactly the same process of expulsion. Resettling and melting into communities required a lot of initiative from heartland Poland, which proved successful by forgetting about the city's former residents. During one of my visits to a vocational school, a student made sure that I, as a German, was aware of the Polish name this city carried, since "it is not German anymore," as he emphasized. Hence, 70 years after Poland took the shape it holds today, authority over name and place still mattered. The city's universities and their renowned departments of economics and information technology have drawn students from the wider region and abroad, preparing them for the modern labor market's demand for entrepreneurs, engineers and business experts. The image campaign of the city has created a reputation of an international community that welcomes foreigners in this city. On Nov. 11, Poland's National Independence Day, this embrace of the foreign has been put increasingly to the test as crowds marched in defense of white, Catholic Poland in this city and elsewhere in the country. Xenophobia has become the dominant trope of a holiday, which commemorates independence from foreign occupation.

Less frequented by visitors was the way to my research site, leading past longer stretches of park and residential areas without any particular attractions. The school was in a less visually appealing part of the city where tourists would go only if they wanted to see a Soviet war memorial, two tanks dedicated to the memory of 2,000 Red Army officers. Other than that, this was where regular people lived; city officials and inhabitants told me. The tram meandered into an area of 10-story apartment buildings. As it passed churches on the way to the last stop on the line, several people crossed themselves at the sight. According to the U.S. Department of State, more than 96 percent of Polish citizens identify as Roman Catholic.[254] A large part of this neighborhood had been constructed in the 1970s, when resources were scarce and affordable housing was needed for the growing city's population. Opposite the tram stop was a McDonald's, and a *centrum handlowy*, or shopping center, which offered convenient shopping opportunities, none of the exclusive big brands that could be found in the malls around the city center. Instead, home supplies, groceries, and everyday items and

---

[254] U.S. Department of State: Diplomacy in Action Poland, accessed from
https://www.state.gov/j/drl/rls/irf/2005/51573.htm, on July 2, 2018.

services could be purchased in a large supermarket, a drug store, a bakery, a bookstore, a shoe repair shop, etc. – all under one roof.

Leaving the tram, I entered the maze of buildings, and after a few turns a gap opened up. No street sign showed the way; no plaque told the visitor that this was a school. To enter the school building, I had to cross a grassy area half the size of a football field. The apartment buildings towered over the school. Through gloomy windows the school lay in full panoptical gaze.

4.2.1 'Szkoła Masowa': A School for the Masses

When I entered the foyer in early October, an installation displaying the school insignia caught my eye. At its center was a large, heavy, red flag onto which the image of the school's patron and the school's number were embroidered. The flagpole was topped with a silvery eagle wearing a crown, the national symbol of Poland. In front of the flag, a wooden basket with seven grave candles was placed on a small stool covered with a dark blue cloth. Candles and school flag were flanked by a blue pin board onto which "25 Lat" ("25 Years") was pinned in yellow letters, hinting at the school's anniversary, and an enlarged black-and-white photograph of the patron. Behind the flag, a crest with the name of the city, the school's name and the school's number hung framed on the wall, though not higher than the flag.

Looking around the entry hall, I spotted nature-themed pictures and artwork. Next to the installation, the foyer was decorated with display cases holding trophies, certificates, and students' paintings and projects. Facing away from the installation and toward the hallway from which the classrooms could be entered, a large dark blue pin board displayed new information about the school or individual classes. Two sentences in large white letters were pinned to the board: JESTEM BARDZO WESOŁY BO JUZ CHODZĘ DO SZKOŁY (I am very happy because I already go to school) and SUKCES TKWI W DĄZENIU DO CELU (Success lies in pursuit of the goal). Names of students who had succeeded in competitions and brought honour to the school were published here. On a shelf above the pin board, stuffed animals were lined up, dressed in blue police uniforms, with ties and hats. They looked like a small army of police, watching over the entry hall: three very large animals backed up by six smaller ones in front. A certificate, also from the police, hung in the entry hall, as the first graders regularly received safety instruction from the police.

Down the hall, classrooms could be reached by turning either left or right. Green and yellow lockers stood between the doors of classrooms. On the ground level, the doors had

different sizes, colors and designs, some flat white, some with wooden designs. Here and there, a few benches and posters lined the hallway. One poster in particular caught my eye: the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child, in Polish, was framed and hung between ceiling and the top of the door frame, so high that I could make out only the sentences of the last paragraph. I thought about children frequenting this hallway and realized they could not read it.

From the foyer, all further ways into the school could be accessed. Crossing through the foyer, you could go downstairs to the ground floor, where there was the teachers' room and the classroom for religious education. On the foyer level was the auditorium, a large empty room where school ceremonies took place. Crossing through the auditorium you would get to the Gimnazjum, which occupied the other half of the building. Gimnazjum and primary school shared the gym, in which sports classes took place. The foyer also led to the administrative office and the vice principal's office. The principal's office could only be reached through the secretariat, entering through a door covered with leather. On the second floor, the school had a library that was, however, difficult to use, since a school day was divided into 45-minute-lessons from 8 a.m. to at least 1:20 p.m., with 10-minute breaks.

The school was attended by approximately 500 students, grouped into units of 20 to 25, mainly Polish children with smaller numbers of Ukrainian and Roma pupils. In the afternoons, a shadow schedule existed during which therapeutic classes for children with special needs were organized. Those classes included art, speech, visual, hearing and social therapy. None of these classes took place during the regular school day to ensure a smooth schedule of subject learning. Some students were accompanied by assistants in regular classes, depending on the diagnosis of their disabilities. Assistance was given either by special pedagogues or by helpers without a distinct qualification. Nearly 100 percent of the children attended religious class, which was taught by a Roman Catholic nun and focused on the teachings of the Bible in the Catholic interpretation. Altogether, 10 children in the school either refrained from religious classes or chose to attend ethics class instead, identifying as Protestant or Muslim.[255] Foreign languages taught at this school were English and German.

The school's interior presented the institution in clear reference to the city, the nation and the school's educational mission. The installation in the entry hall was dedicated to the memory of the patron, who was born in pre-war Polish territories that were lost to the Soviet

---

[255] Transcript 8 Poland, Interview with Vice Principal, Nov. 21, 2016, l. 452.

Union, mirroring the lives of many of the city's citizens. School spirit was strictly aligned with success in the shape of trophies, diplomas and certificates that students had earned. A strong sense of discipline was conveyed by the neatly distributed space into hallway and classrooms, with no leisure or common rooms at the students' disposals. Spatial rigidity overlapped with the temporal organization of the school day, during which subject teaching took place in 45-minute periods divided by loud bell rings. Summing up, educational offerings for children who did not belong to the majority by faith or ability, i.e., non-Catholics or children with special needs or disabilities were organized outside the regular school schedule.

4.2.1.1 Welcome to 5x

During my research stay, I conducted participant observations in class 5x. The principal and vice principal had recommended this class unit for my research purposes, since the class (teachers and pupils) struggled with an inclusion of a student with severe social and emotional difficulties. I was informed that I had to work with great sensitivity toward the teaching staff and be understanding when colleagues denied me access to their classes, since "this is a hard class. [The child] has given them a hard time. They are just tired of everything,"[256] as the vice principal explained to me. Therefore, the student was accompanied by a special pedagogue who would watch over the child during every lesson in which he/she participated in the activities of 5x. The pedagogue spoke English and agreed to mediate if classroom interactions needed clarification or I wanted to communicate with students or teachers. She was the third pedagogue employed to work with the child. The others had prematurely ended their working contracts, since the pupil had "kicked and pushed the assistants,"[257] the vice principal told me.

On a regular Thursday at school, the children of 5x would have classes from 8 a.m. to 2:25 p.m. Except for the regular 10 minute-breaks between 45-minute-lessons, there was one 20-minute-break between lesson five and six, the former being a voluntary class for German language-learners. On Thursdays, I was freely allowed into sports, mathematics and optional German classes, rather unwillingly into nature class and not at all into two classes of Polish and a class called technics. Therefore, most Thursdays, my observation time was interrupted by periods I spent outside the classroom on a wooden bench in the hallway or together with the student and his pedagogue in her office or the vice principal's. On other days of the week,

---

[256] Transcript 8 Poland, Interview with Vice Principal, Nov. 21, 2016, ll. 265-266.
[257] Transcript 8 Poland, Interview with Vice Principal, Nov. 21, 2016, ll. 472-473.

it was a very similar situation. Every week, I would ask teachers again whether I could watch their classes. Therefore, as a one-time opportunity, I also observed Polish and English class.

Class 5x had 22 students, almost equally divided into boys and girls. They did not have their own classroom but moved from one subject room to another throughout the school day. After one lesson ended, they picked up their bags and carried them to the next room, which was locked during the break. The hallway was extremely noisy throughout these 10-minute-breaks, since all students spent this time locked out of the classrooms. There was no common room for students. We ate our sandwiches sitting on the floor or on empty seats on the wooden benches in the hallway. There was no routine of allowing children to play outside on the lawn. They also had no hot meal during the day.

Every student in 5x attended religion class, including the only Ukrainian boy. He also participated in voluntary German classes together with roughly half of his classmates. He remained mostly quiet and spoke so softly that throughout my stay I never heard his voice.

4.2.1.2 "It is like a war and we don't know what will happen next."[258]

My research stay was dominated by a sense of rising tension that became more and more palpable every week I spent at the school. When I interviewed the vice principal about the events that were taking place in 5x, she summarized the situation as a war between two sides in which the safety of students and teachers was at risk because the student's actions were unpredictable. For the sake of granting anonymity and protecting the student's privacy, I will continue to write about the student as an ungendered person called Sim and use the pronouns of *they, their* and *them*. For the sake of protecting the professional identity of teachers I interviewed and observed I will refer to them not by the subject they taught but by numerical order: Teacher 1, Teacher 2, and so on. The student had a notorious reputation at school. Previously, Sim had attended a special school affiliated with a hospital to better diagnose the core of their social maladjustment.[259] In grade three, at the age of about 9, Sim received individual teaching from the school's vice principal. In grade 4, three assistants had quit working with Sim, since Sim "was kicking and pushing the assistants."[260] The child was known to take strong medication which Sim was responsible themselves to have every morning.[261] On days that Sim had not taken the medication, the behavior was remarkably

---
[258] Transcript 8 Poland, Interview with Vice Principal, Nov. 21, 2016, ll. 585-586.
[259] Transcript 7 Poland, Interview with Pedagogue, Dec. 2, 2016, ll. 116-120.
[260] Transcript 8 Poland, Interview with Vice Principal, Nov. 21, 2016, ll. 472-473.
[261] "I know that they take […]. This is a strong medication. But as you know they take it on their own. So also we have problems with it because we don't… we can't do anything… yes? We can't give them medicine; only

different. The medication helped to control Sim's impulses and calmed the child down, as the pedagogue explained to me.[262] She was their third assistant and had expressed the wish to quit working with Sim within a month of first interacting with the child. Before she met with Sim, she familiarized herself with several different types of official documentation on the child:

> *When I first came here, I had to read many, many, many documents about [the child]. From school, from doctors, from many, many institutions and also from the court. And from a neurologist [...].*[263]

At age 11, Sim already had a police record. One teacher informed me: "We had two situations in which the intervention of the police was needed."[264] In an informal conversation, one of the teachers told me that if police intervention was required one more time, drastic measures would have to be taken against Sim. To avoid further escalation of conflicts, the school had applied for another semester of 8 to 10 lessons of individual classes, which would be the student's only access to education, for the sake of separating Sim from the rest of the class. While the school waited for a decision by the city council, the pedagogue had been employed to assist Sim. She described her tasks as follows: "I work with, especially one child [...]. I help [the child] with lessons, with homework, with everything."[265] At the beginning of November, roughly five weeks after I had started my observations, a turning point occurred, since measures of control over the child and the class unit increased sharply in the aftermath of this day. The following field notes will provide insights into the accounts that occurred.

Wednesday, November 2, 2016

During a 10-minute-break between lessons two and three (around 9:40 a.m.)

I sit on a bench in the hallway. The pedagogue sits next to me and Sim next to her. The way we are seated, the pedagogue and I separate the child from the classmates sitting at the other end of the bench. Occasionally they peek over. Neither child nor group engages in active communication with each other. The child hands me a piece of chocolate wrapped in shiny gold paper. As I take the piece of chocolate, I notice that the skin around the child's fingernails is bitten bloody. The classroom door opens and we enter. The child sits in the first row next to the door.

Polish Class (9:50-10:35a.m.)

---

parents [can do that]. But I think when you now look at Sim, you can say they took medicine or they didn't."
Transcript 7 Poland, Interview with Pedagogue, Dec. 2, 2016, ll. 162-165.
[262] Transcript 7 Poland, Interview with Pedagogue, Dec. 2, 2016, ll. 157-160.
[263] Transcript 7 Poland, Interview with Pedagogue, Dec. 2, 2016, ll. 57-59.
[264] Transcript 5 Poland, Interview with Teacher 4, Dec. 8, 2016, ll. 145-146.
[265] Transcript 7 Poland, Interview with Pedagogue, Dec. 2, 2016, ll. 41-42.

Curtains and blue roller blinds cover the windows. The walls are painted bright yellow. The teacher reads aloud. The class listens. No one says a word. Individual students are asked to read out smaller paragraphs from a textbook. Some students listen; others look up from their books, out of the window. The view is onto high-rise buildings opposite of the school.

The students silently focus on the tasks in front of them. The teacher walks through the rows of students and checks their work. Sim looks around the room. The teacher notices Sim's distraction and draws the student's attention back to the task. The child continues to work. No chatting, no noise.

Another 10-minute break (10:35-10:45 a.m.), then math lesson (10:45-11:30 a.m.)

The Teacher speaks to the pedagogue. Sim gets up from the bench and takes off into the hallway. The pedagogue follows. She reaches Sim, and they turn around and make their way back to the classroom. The break is over. The class enters the room. Sim takes a chair, lifts it up and threatens to attack a classmate. The child just looks at Sim, doesn't move and stands indecisively behind his table. Sim puts the chair down and slaps the table loudly with the palm of their hand. Sim bumps into the table behind them. This accidentally causes the chair standing on the table behind Sim to fall with a loud bang. Tav, the boy sitting behind Sim, becomes angry. Tav attacks Sim, and the two start wrestling and hitting each other. They are separated. Sim wears a hat and pulls it over their face. Tav gets up from his seat and pushes his table forward against Sim. Tav walks around his table and toward Sim, then turns to the class and starts shouting. Teacher and pedagogue stand next to Sim. They talk softly to Sim. Seconds later, the teacher continues her routine of reading out the name of every student to check attendance. The pedagogue whispers with Sim. The children are still loud and talk to one another. Nervous chattering, wiggling in chairs; nobody focuses on the teacher; eyes return to watch Sim's next move. The teacher hits the table with the palm of her hand and shouts "5x!" The classroom falls into silence. The lesson continues. Sim bites into their math notebook and rips out snippets of paper. Then Sim starts writing.

A new teacher enters the room. She stands in front of the whole class and starts talking loudly to Sim. One girl gets up and says something to the teacher. The girl starts crying. Sim just sits, watches, says nothing. The lesson continues. Sim does not show any response to what happens in front. The crying girl and a friend of hers leave the room together. Soon after, her friend comes back and packs all the girl's belongings into her backpack. The other kids point at Sim and whisper. Sim looks around the room. The teacher continues the lesson. The kids seem to regain their focus and work on the math tasks they were given.

A group of boys starts distracting one another, chat, call each other's names. They wiggle around in their chairs. One girl goes to the board to do a calculation. She has trouble. Again the turmoil in class increases. The children lose their patience, do not pay attention to the board and chat sometimes in pairs, sometimes in groups of four. The pedagogue sits behind Sim and observes the student. She cannot involve Sim in paying attention to the math task. The anxiety increases. There is lots of chatting and signing among three boys. The Teacher 1does not interrupt the class but continues with her math exercises. Again and again, she glances over to the clock on the wall:15 minutes left … I, too hope this lesson ends soon without another eruption of violence between the students.

The teacher shouts again at the class. The boy points at Sim. Tav disrupts the class; he chats with other children in his closer vicinity. The other boys pay closer attention to Tav instead of to the teacher or the student at the board. The boys throw an eraser back and forth. Now it's

Sim's turn to calculate in front of the board. He needs help. The boys show each other signs，but they don't say anything. The lesson is over.

Break (11:30-11:40 a.m.)

As the class leaves the room, Tav walks past Sim. I can't quite see what happens next, but then Sim kicks Tav. In the hallway, Tav pushes Sim. The pedagogue steps in and separates the two. One girl makes a strangling gesture. Tav and another kid leave.

Downstairs in front of the room where religion class takes place, some of the boys are involved in play fighting. The school day is supposed to go on for three more lessons. Sim stands at the other end of the hallway and observes the classmates. It seems as if Sim does not dare to approach them. Sim waits, hangs out far away from the group and keeps peeking over. Sim goes into one of the classrooms, a few meters away from where the classmates hang out. Tav moves in closer to the room and looks inside; he runs back to the rest of the group. The pedagogue and other teachers stand in front of the room in which Sim waits; discussing something. Sim leaves the room and stands next to the teachers. Tav and another boy walk toward Sim, they pass Sim, wait until the teachers aren't looking, and start kicking Sim's leg and punching Sim's back. The teachers step in, and each of them holds one of the three students back. The situation calms down again.

Religious class (11:40 a. m -12:25 p. m.)

Religion class takes place in the library. Nervously, Sim pulls up a chair next to them and offers it to me. Sim keeps looking around and checks where the other classmates sit. Sim sits close to the exit door. The lesson continues without disturbance.

English class (12:35- 1:20 p. m.)

In English class, the teacher is absent. A substitute teacher takes over. I am allowed to stay with the class. I sit next to Sim. Twenty minutes into the lesson. Sim and I work together on a task on a worksheet. Another teacher enters the room. She orders Sim to leave with her. Sim looks, gets up and follows the teacher outside. As the door opens, the other students glimpse the police standing outside the classroom. A boy turns back to the class and shouts, "Policja!" Murmuring breaks out among the students. The teacher hushes the children. Sim runs back into the class, sits down in their seat, buries their face in their arms and cries. The teacher stands behind Sim, talks to the student and tries to move the child up from the chair. Sim waits. Eventually, they get up from their chair and slowly walk outside. Other children mock Sim by making whining sounds. The teacher does not intervene. Sim leaves the room, accompanied by the mocking sounds of the classmates. The teacher remains silent. The substitute teacher walks over to me and says the problem was that Sim had hit a girl.

The lesson continues.

I am puzzled. The lesson is over; I sit, disbelieving, in my chair. The substitute teacher walks over to me and says Sim probably cried because of the police. I mention class dynamics and provocations among different students. To this, she replies that Sim was a naughty child and

had caused problems since the first grade. I get up and leave the classroom. The hallway is empty.

During this school day, I witnessed how a boiling conflict between Sim and other students in the classroom mostly led by Tav, carried over from one lesson to the next, erupting in an attack on Sim by two students under the eyes of their teachers. Violence took place during several incidents that day, either committed or experienced by Sim. The day ended with one of Sim's numerous contacts with the police since the student had earlier in the day supposedly strangled the crying girl who left the class during math. Motivated and provoked by Sim's behavior, other classmates seemed to want to take revenge on Sim. However, teachers showed no interest in resolving these conflicts. The priority of content learning over social learning became particularly apparent when Teacher 1 continued her lesson even though it was interrupted by repeated outbursts of emotion and violence. Nonetheless, there was no pause in the routine of the lesson; one after another, children were asked to calculate in front of the class at the board. Conflicts in the hallway were not taken up and discussed during any of the lessons until finally the police stepped in and removed Sim from the school. In the following, I want to look at the educational inclusion of Sim that took place in class 5x from three perspectives. Through my ethnographic material, I seek to explore the experience of Sim, the pedagogue and class unit 5x. All three perspectives strongly show the lack of social learning in this schooling context that is so desperately needed to bridge the gap between all parties involved in the process of inclusion.

4.2.2 "The Child Has Been a Bad Student Since the First Grade"[266]

The notion of Sim as a naughty and bad student seemed to be common sense among the teachers, since various staff members repeated it to me on several occasions. Whereas the vice principal and the pedagogue kept stressing that the acting out and becoming violent toward other children were not Sim's fault alone, at the end of the English lesson Sim was once more judged as the source of the problem — in contrast with the previous week, as the teacher stressed, when Sim complied with classroom rules and the situation was "good."

Wednesday, October 26, 2016

English class (12:35-1:20 p.m.)

---

[266] Taken from: field notes from Nov. 02, 2016.

The teacher enters the classroom, no warm-up, no smooth introduction to the lesson. She asks the students to open their textbooks. The teacher is upset because the children do not listen to her orders. They do not concentrate on the task; they chat with one another. The teacher turns on a tape recorder. English is spoken on the tape. The students are supposed to listen to the conversation between the voices on the tape and fill in answers in their textbooks. The teacher stops the listening activity. She speaks to the class. Sim speaks up without permission. The pedagogue whispers something to Sim. The teacher starts counting in a very warning voice. The class quiets down. The lesson continues. Sim sits with a classmate in the front row. Time passes. From 1:07 until the end of the lesson, the following incidents take place.

Sim starts chatting to the students sitting close by. The class seems bored. Students don't engage in reading of the textbook; they talk to one another. Sim takes out a remote-controlled car and puts it on the floor. Sim navigates the car through the class from where they sit. One child notices. He looks with big eyes from the car to the teacher and back again. He looks at us, at me and the pedagogue. There is no reaction from any of the adults. I am not sure whether the pedagogue sees what is going on. While Sim drives the car through the classroom, Sim looks excited and tries to catch reactions from the other children. The teacher ignores the car, which races with a buzzing sound through the rows of students. Sim claps loudly, gets up and walks to the blackboard. The student wipes the board and erases the date and the topic of the lesson. The teacher walks around Sim. She ignores that Sim shares the space with her in front of the class and that Sim has erased all her writing. Sim shouts "Thank you, thank you" in English, the only natural speech act in the foreign language that I have heard from him? until now.

But Sim is completely invisible to the teacher. The more invisible Sim is, the louder Sim becomes. Tav who has been attentively watching the scenery as he sits behind Sim, flips out. Tav jumps up from his chair and starts pushing and kicking Sim. Sim hits back. The teacher and the pedagogue intervene by pulling Tav back… Sim continues to make loud, obnoxious noises. Meanwhile, other students in the class get up from their seats and walk around to visit their friends in other parts of the room. The teacher has verbal mini-fights with other students who do not do their work. The teacher continues with the lesson.

When the lesson is finally over, the teacher comes to me and says that Sim is the problem and the sole reason this lesson got out of hand. She says Sim needs to leave, needs to be in a special school. But, she says, Sim's parents are too comfortable. This school is close; therefore they keep Sim here. She says there have been good days, and she wishes I had attended last week when Sim explained something to the group. Everyone was quiet and it was very good.

My field notes reveal how the teacher in charge avoided explicit communication with the student who misbehaved in class. Neither the teacher nor the pedagogue stepped into the moment when Sim, on impulse, took out a remote-controlled car and drove it through the class. Also, when Sim invaded the teacher's space in front of the class and erased her writing, a clear boundary was crossed and it was not the teacher, but another student in the class who decided to act. The teacher, instead, carried on with the lesson and pushed for content learning. The fight that commenced between the two students was treated as yet another argument to push Sim out of the mainstream into special school. Such transfer was undermined by Sim's parents because they were seen by the teacher as "too comfortable."

My field notes also show that whereas Sim's behavior certainly most drastically affected discipline within the class, other students also had trouble controlling themselves or felt the need to express their anger or frustration during the school day. In situations in which Sim acted out, other students similarly committed smaller acts of disobedience, such as getting up from their seats to visit classmates in different parts of the classroom, throwing erasers, chatting, punching Sim. All this occurred in the shadow of Sim's all-attention-consuming behavior. Focusing attention on Sim alone, however, rendered the other students' difficulties invisible and normalized such behavior as punching and bullying another classmate. The tale of the bad student that Sim's teachers discursively reproduced, therefore, affected the whole class community in that some received a free pass regarding their misbehavior. Normalizing the misbehavior of other students in the light of Sim's misconduct became apparent in another teacher's comment on the situation:

> *Of course, but these kinds of pupils like [Tav, …] are present in every class, in every school. But their behavior, we wouldn't call this a provocative behavior if it happened among them. Nobody would pay attention; nobody would react to this kind of behavior. It is only we [teachers, pedagogue] who see this because we know that if Sim passes by and brushes somebody, we know that this is a provocation, but in a normal situation nobody would pay attention, nobody would react. Sometimes all you need is a simple look. In the normal situation even among the students with higher levels of aggression, they know there is tolerance for some things, after which we can explode. In Sim's case, it is unpredictable. […] Everyone who would have taken a look and would be around Sim for some time could tell that in Sim's behavior there are such unpredictable actions that are not the result of interactions. For example, Sim could enter the class and suddenly push somebody against the door with full strength and nothing would happen; everything was all right. It is not a matter of somebody in the classroom; these are children. Those provocations happen in every single class. Children somehow bump into each other.[267]*

In other words, Sim's condition freed all the other children of responsibility for their own actions within the class community. However, the pedagogue and Teacher 1of 5x judged the situation differently. The pedagogue had observed that children would react to Sim before Sim even looked at them. She concluded:

> *Sim's class was tired, and they were so aggressive even, even when Sim … I don't know, looked at someone, even when Sim hadn't even done anything, they started to cry, scream and so on. They were so, so tired of Sim…[…] they know Sim; they know that Sim did very many bad things.[268]*

Sim's record of bad behavior had, consequently, affected the students' trust toward their classmate. In the absence of encounters and activities during which communication and trust-

---

[267] Transcript 4 Poland, Interview with Teacher 3, Nov. 21, 2016, ll. 373-392.
[268] Transcript 7 Poland, Interview with Pedagogue, Dec. 2, 2016, ll. 285-292.

building could ensue, many students distanced themselves from Sim and some students sometimes took advantage of the situation. The Teacher 1 drew attention to a number of other students, whom she considered problematic and who would occasionally set Sim off:

> *There is Sim and Sim's case, but we must not forget that there is also Wojtek, who is very nervous, excitable, although he doesn't have any opinion (opinia) from the clinic (poradnia); there is Vladyslaw from the Ukraine; there is Tav, very active in provoking; and there is Piotr, sitting next to the window. And all of them very often provoke Sim.[269]*

Drawing on Broderick and Leonardo, I argue that Sim's reputation as a naughty student supported by Sim's diagnosis of social maladjustment "result[ed] in a 'thickening' process wherein students become recognized by peers and teachers as particular 'types' of students: in this case, 'good' and 'bad' […]."[270] Broderick and Leonardo grasp "goodness" as a "form of property in schools:"[271]

> *Our contention is that students' identity as constructed as either 'good' or 'bad' produces material consequences vis-à-vis their access and sense of entitlement (or not) to opportunities, privileges, and myriad forms of cultural capital. In short, goodness is a form of property."[272]*

Sim's badness had already had material consequences in that Sim had been previously placed in individual teaching at home during grade 3, which limited Sim's access to education to 8 to 10 hours of instruction a week with one teacher. Consequently, individual teaching also limited Sim's opportunities to interact with other children. As Sim's psychologist recognized, Sim's lack of exposure to social interactions placed the child at risk of losing the weakened social competences that Sim already struggled to maintain.[273] Currently, the school was again trying to find ways to organize individual teaching for Sim to re-establish peace in the classroom. It is crucial to bear in mind that the definition of granting individual teaching rested on conditions such as serious illnesses or broken limbs (See: Policy Analysis, part 2.4.3, p. 25) ―matters that physically prevented the child from attending lessons with the rest of the class. Individual classes were not intended to separate children from one another or to protect the safety of some at the expense of another child's access to education. Broderick and Leonardo find that "[…] goodness is less about a set of behaviors and more a regulating

---

[269] Transcript 2 Poland, Interview with Teacher 1, November 2016, ll. 52-55.
[270] Broderick, Alicia A. and Zeus Leonardo (2016): What a Good Boy: The Deployment and Distribution of 'Goodness' as Ideological Property in Schools. In: Connor, David J., Ferri, Beth A. and Subini Annamma (Eds.): DisCrit: Disability Studies and Critical Race Theory in Education. New York: Teachers College Press, p. 62.
[271] Ibid., p. 55.
[272] Ibid., p. 57.
[273] Transcript 4 Poland, Interview with Teacher 3, Nov. 21, 2016, ll.130-134.

system that justifies the differential treatment of students."[274] Sim's reputation as a bad student reinforced itself week by week when I visited the school. Sim's language teacher was certain that Sim belonged in a special school because of the behavior Sim showed in class. Throughout the lesson, she did not interfere with Sim's action, allowing Sim to act out and demonstrate in full force the inappropriateness of its behavior.

D.L. Adams and Nirmala Everelles provide an inspiring analysis of teacher pathologization of student behavior. They analyze the language that teachers employ to place responsibility for failure, i.e. for making "good" or "bad" decisions on the student. They explore what they refer to as the "language of pathology"[275] that teachers employ to make sense of failure and dilemmas that their students experience albeit through a simplified logic of choice and willingness that does not address the complexity within which students need to navigate their lives in and outside of school. The authors summarize:

> *As the educators construct the students as dysfunctional, naughty, criminal and dis/abled, the students move from the classroom, through the office, past the professionals with the diagnosis and treatment, into the segregated spaces, and out the door. In this way, oppressive (rather than empowering) discourses of disability and race are deployed at the intersections of social difference to justify the casual dis-location of student bodies as dis/respectable and therefore as matter out of (White, normative) place.*[276]

This quote reminded me of Sim and the many schooling experiences they passed through in their short yet eventful schooling career. At the age of 10, Sim had been referred to several educational institutions that the Polish education system offered and their journey was not about to come to an end any time soon as efforts were underway to place Sim back into individual teaching. From the classroom, to the therapeutic school, to individual teaching back to general education where Sim was about to fail yet again, the pathologization of the student was fully embedded in teacher language addressing Sim and their situation in school.

---

[274] Broderick, Alicia A. and Zeus Leonardo (2016): What a Good Boy: The Deployment and Distribution of 'Goodness' as Ideological Property in Schools. In: Connor, David J., Ferri, Beth A. and Subini Annamma (Eds.): DisCrit: Disability Studies and Critical Race Theory in Education. New York: Teachers College Press, p. 58.
[275] Adams, D.L, and Everelles, Nirmala, (2016): Shadow Play: DisCrit, Dis/Respectability, and Carceral Logics. In: Annamma, Subini, Ferri, Beth and David Connor (Eds.): DisCrit: Disability Studies and Critical Race Theory in Education. New York: Teachers College Press, p. 141
[276] Ibid., p. 144.

4.2.3 "How many pedagogues are needed to support [Sim]?"[277]

Numerous changes regarding the treatment of Sim and their classmates were considered and enacted after the violent offense that took place in early November. First, I will derive from my field notes the general set of tools mobilized after the incident. Second, I will discuss the role of the pedagogue. Her tasks had greatly expanded when I visited the school again in the third week of November. She had turned from a mere observer of Sim's behavior, seated in the back of the room, into a chaperone. Her transformed presence was reminiscent of a shadow that constantly followed Sim on every step through the school. While motivated by an effort to solve the critical situation at school, the pedagogue in her new role added to the special status of Sim and her presence became counterproductive to Sim's inclusion.

Wednesday, Nov. 23, 2016

It is another 10-minute-break in between lessons, but students are not allowed to run in the hallway. Time and again, some of the kids start running through the corridor, being called out to be quiet by the teacher who supervises the hallway. Loud screams, kids push one another, they nudge and shove, lift one another up. I sit on the bench and want to cover my ears, it is so loud. The English teacher comes and sits down next to me. She asks me not to go to her lesson today because the room is too small. I agree. She thanks me: "You are a nice person." The Teacher 1approaches the classroom door. Students have to line up in pairs in front of the classroom. Girls stand with girls, boys with boys. First, the girls may enter; they go to their seats and sit down. Then the boys may enter. When everyone is seated, Sim joins the class with the pedagogue.

One day later: Thursday, Nov. 24, 2016

Gym class (8:15 a.m.)

Gym lesson started 15 minutes ago. The pedagogue is looking for Sim, who has not appeared in the classroom yet. The lesson proceeds without Sim.

Math class (8:55-9:40 a.m.)

During the break, the pedagogue sits on a bench in front of the blue notice board where all the timetables of every class unit are displayed. I sit down next to her and ask her whether the school is looking for a new place for Sim. She says no because no other school wants to take Sim. She explains that there is a plan to arrange individual teaching for Sim, but Sim's parents oppose this. They say Sim has no problems. When math class starts, the pedagogue is still waiting outside the classroom for Sim. Five minutes into the lesson, the school principal enters the classroom. All the students get up at once and greet her in unison "Dzien dobry"

---

[277] "How many pedagogues should we place next to him?" Taken from: Transcript 4 Poland, Interview with Teacher 3, Nov. 21, 2016, l. 212

("Good day"). She speaks about Sim. Kids shrug their shoulders. Three minutes later the principal turns to the door. Everyone gets up again and says in unison,"Do Widzenia" ("Goodbye"). The class continues with the lesson. The Teacher 1asks the children to calculate in front of the class on the board. Kut raises his hand and wants to calculate, but the teacher says no, they will calculate one by one in order of their seating. Kut puts his hand down and looks at his folder.

Sim and the pedagogue enter the classroom. It is very silent. They sit down, and the pedagogue opens the notebook for Sim. Sim writes down the tasks from the board; the pedagogue helps Sim to find the start of the task and what needs to be copied into the notebook.

Sim needs some more time to solve the math problem correctly on the board. Sim receives a lot of help from the teacher. The class remains quiet — no teasing, no provocations. Sim and Tav pass each other as Tav makes his way to the whiteboard. Everything remains calm.

The pedagogue writes in Sim's notebook. She talks softly to Sim. Sim starts writing. The bell ends the lesson. Sim and the pedagogue get up and go to her office. There she turns on the computer for Sim. For few minutes Sim plays a game while she makes herself coffee. Then they need to get up again and leave for the next lesson. They rush down the stairs; the next lesson has already started.

One week later: Thursday, Dec. 1, 2016

Before gym class (7:50 a.m.)

I wait in front of the gym for the students of 5x and their physical education teacher. I don't see Sim or the pedagogue, so as I enter the gym with the students, the teacher tells me that Sim is now in 5y. Lost in thought, I sit down on the wooden radiator covers. A girl sits down next to me. Her thumb is bandaged, so she can't join the class. We speak about her finger, and then I ask whether she knows where Sim is. "In 5y," she answers, "together with the pedagogue." I continue to ask whether she is happy that Sim is not in her class anymore. She smiles and answers, "Yes, because Sim was beating us." Other girls gathering around us nod. The sports teacher begins the lesson.

I leave 5x and make my way to Sim's new class, 5y.

Sim is quiet. Nervously, Sim flips through the green, blue and orange papers in their folder. The Teacher 1announces the topic of the day. Sim does not pick up the pen to copy the task into the notebook. They starts writing on one of the colored papers in the folder. The pedagogue sits next to Sim and talks to Sim. She wants Sim to write in the notebook. Sim doesn't react. "Jak chcesz," She says — "As you want."

When turmoil arises in class, the teacher interrupts the class immediately and waits. One student calculates a task in front of the class. The pedagogue raises her hand. The teacher goes to the pedagogue and Sim, and writes something in Sim's notebook. Sim starts writing in the notebook. Sim raises their hand and wants to calculate on the board in front of the class.

Sim solves the first task correctly. No disruptions, no smiley faces appear on the board. Sim seems content with the achievement of solving the task correctly. While going back to their seat, Sim raises their hand to calculate another task on the board, Sim begs the teacher: "Moge ja?" — "May I?"

After a few other children, Sim's name is called again. Sim makes a little mistake and starts fidgeting, nervously erases some of the work, writes something, erases it again. The teacher remains calm and goes through the task with Sim step by step. When Sim is back at the table, Sim rips out a page of colored paper from the folder.

The teacher mouths to the pedagogue: Is Sim working? Sim doesn't notice their communication. The pedagogue shakes her head. The teacher says something to Sim. Sim puts the paper away and starts writing in the notebook. The teacher turns her attention to the whiteboard where students are working. Then she comes back and looks at Sim's writing. In the meantime students continue to calculate in front of the class. The teacher praises students; she helps Sim. Sim raises their hand and wants to calculate in front of the class. The first task Sim solves without any problems. The second one is more difficult. The teacher explains something to Sim, then, draws the class's attention to the homework for next week. Sim completes the task correctly. The teacher praises Sim. When Sim reaches the seat, Sim continues to write on colored paper. The pedagogue writes in the notebook for Sim. The lesson is over.

Religion class

Toward the end of the class, the children say the Lord's Prayer. Sim wears a nametag that the pedagogue has drawn during the lesson. They get up from their seat and pray a second time. Sim plays with the chain of keys hanging around their neck. As the bell rings, Sim is the first to leave the classroom. The pedagogue runs after Sim, tries to catch up.

The preceding field notes capture some of the atmosphere and the decisions made by the school's principal and teaching staff in the aftermath of Nov. 2. The girl Sim had hurt was hospitalized and missed school for two weeks. During her absence, the following measures were installed to re-establish a feeling of safety for the students of 5x. First, a new discipline was adopted. In the hierarchy of entering the classroom, the children were divided into three groups: first the girls two by two, then the boys two by two, and finally Sim and pedagogue entered. This way, the moment of moving from outside the classroom, where chaos was tolerated to some extent in the hallways, into the sphere of discipline was regulated through strict organization. This procedure also indicated clearly who was trusted enough to be seated first, second and third. Sim, as the only student without a classmate by their side, entered supervised by the pedagogue under the watch of the teacher and all the students. It was a strong moment of surveillance that singled out Sim and framed this student as the most

different, but also as the most deserving of attention. In this fashion, Sim's call for attention was answered completely by a march-in of the students.

Furthermore, several options circulated for placing Sim outside this school. It was the school's initiative to invite a new psychologist who would monitor and find nuances that would give guidance on how to proceed with Sim in terms of directing the student toward individual teaching or finding a new school.[278] Here I would like to draw attention to the preceding policy analysis and the interview with school board official Piotr Chladzynski who pointed out that changes had been implemented that would make it more difficult to apply for individual teaching, since:

> *verdicts [for individual teaching] were often issued for children who behave badly. [...] It was just abused because big money goes to it, too. Often, for autism, for example, individual teaching was issued because these children can be very disturbing; they interfere with classes. Well, but it was illogical, because you need to socialize, because this child with autism, the trouble is that he does not enter into relationships with people.*

The option of finding a new school for Sim was a difficult step to realize since Sim's parents did not support this idea and other schools had signaled that they did not have places available. Hence, when the girl that was hurt by Sim returned to school, Sim was taken out of class 5x and transferred to class unit 5y.

Turning back to the field notes I presented at the beginning of this subchapter, I want to draw attention to how the pedagogue positioned herself in her professional work with Sim. I will bring together my observations of her actions with her own perspective on her work and the perspective of the teachers I interviewed regarding the pedagogue's tasks and her place in this school. In this way, I want to address the role of the pedagogue in the process of Sim's inclusion in the classroom and school community.

The pedagogue has been employed to work with Sim since September 2016. Employing pedagogues for students with special needs was one of the measures the IPET, the

---

[278] "Teacher: So now, I think, I believe that starting from today there is a person from Poradnia psychologiczna who is supposed to observe Sim for a while to verify that opinion, is it really like that that Sim being in this public school … but this is a kind of situation that it didn't come from the parents' side. […] maybe some new examinations because it's like that that it's obvious that the behaviour of Sim proves that there is some examination of Sim should be run and maybe they will give some more answers.
JW: And that was the initiative of the school? [New psychologist coming to school]
Teacher: Yes. That was the initiative of the school. So on the one hand, we have the wall of parents, the events/ situations that policed were informed about. And on the other hand, the parents of the pupil [Sim] do not want to step down. So what now? School doesn't have the instruments/tools." Transcript 4 Poland, Nov. 21, 2016, Interview with Teacher 3, ll. 280-291.

Individual Program for Education and Therapy, was able to regulate. A pedagogue or an assistant had the task of helping the student to integrate into the class unit (See: Policy Analysis, part 2.4.3, p. 25). Until the crucial incident in early November 2016, I had only seen the pedagogue sitting in the back of the classroom, taking notes on Sim's actions and behavior. During breaks, when Sim took off into the hallway with the other kids, the pedagogue had time to catch her breath. However, in November, after the critical incident, she shadowed Sim's every step. When Sim ran out of the classroom, she chased after the student. If Sim did not appear in class in the morning, it was her task to find out where Sim was. During the break she would either usher Sim to her office to play video games on the computer or stay behind with Sim in the classroom, where she would occupy both of them with drawing pictures. They were an unequal couple. The pedagogue, a young woman in her mid-20s, hair dyed in fashionable gray-blond, wearing heavy make-up and always dressed in black, could have been mistaken as Sim's older sister when the rather tall 11-year-old would sit at the computer in the pedagogue's office while she sipped coffee. On the wall in her office hung a contract written by Sim, stating that Sim would behave well, signed by Sim and the pedagogue. It was, however, a contract over which the pedagogue held no power of enforcement, since there were no tools — no interventions to varying degrees — that could have been indicated as consequences if Sim violated the contract. Whether Sim behaved well depended on whether Sim listened to what the pedagogue said, which was an order and not an agreement based on reasoning.

When the pedagogue and Sim sat together in class to draw mandalas, it would sometimes just be the pedagogue who drew while Sim wandered around the classroom. As long as Sim remained calm and inside the classroom, separated from the rest of the class, she accomplished her task of shielding Sim. The 10-minute-breaks were too short to start a meaningful activity, but they were too long to risk Sim's engagement with other students. This way, Sim and the pedagogue had entered a relationship in which the pedagogue built on Sim's need for a friend, which she fulfilled by spending free time with Sim as none of the other kids in 5x did. The pedagogue became an adult friend to Sim, with troublesome consequences. She imitated a friendship, standing in Sim's way of making meaningful connections with peers. The pedagogue described her strategy for working with Sim in the following way:

> *I first, I thought that Sim has to… I don't know how to say it in English… must maybe be a little scared… […] Yes, more discipline. Sim had to listen to me and do all the things that I told Sim to do, but then I decided to be more like a teacher and friend.*

And when I changed my role, Sim changed behavior because I think Sim started to work, to listen, to cooperate with me and with other teachers and I think it was a good decision.[279]

The pedagogue outlined a change in her role when working with Sim: from someone who disciplined Sim and relied on strict orders to someone who acted as a friend and teacher. She found Sim to be more cooperative when she started to act as a friend and teacher rather than a disciplinarian. She shielded Sim from attack but also made sure that Sim would not engage in any aggressive or provocative behavior. One of the teachers of 5x expressed this situation in the following words:

So let me put it this way: that under these conditions the pedagogue was somehow trying to increase the dose of safety of the other students. Although I think that her role was limited to only… not because of her, but because of the surroundings in which we are now, that the function/role of this special pedagogue was limited only to limiting the situations of conflict. To secure the other children from Sim.[280]

This teacher described the pedagogue's task as decreasing of the possible threat from Sim toward other children, thereby increasing their security. As he indicated, her function was limited to this task pointing to the fact her current work was a harsh reduction of her expertise.

In addition, other teachers considered the pedagogue someone who functioned as a buffer between Sim and the other children. Teacher 1 explained:

I think she should be like Sim's shadow, always beside Sim. Teachers will sometimes not be fast enough to react. Pedagogue should be like a kind of a sphere around Sim or a kind of protective field so that Sim would not be a threat for anybody.[281]

A different account was given by the another teacher. She was worried by Sim's constant control by the pedagogue:

I am really grateful for her work here, but I think that she should give Sim more, some more self-… not self-reliance […] self-responsibility. She shouldn't take from Sim too many things. Sim should do more on their own. And the pedagogue sometimes tends to do things for Sim. So my opinion […] Sim should be able to do or she should let Sim do more things on their own, not taking care of things that Sim should do.[282]

Teacher 2 remarked that Sim had to be more in control of their own work. She did not appreciate that the pedagogue did tasks for Sim that the student was capable of doing themselves. Another teacher commented in a similar way:

---

[279] Transcript 7 Poland, Interview with Pedagogue, Dec. 2, 2016, ll. 70-76.
[280] Transcript 4 Poland, Interview with Teacher 3, Nov. 21, 2016, ll. 316-320.
[281] Transcript 2 Poland, Interview with Teacher 1, Nov. 2016, ll. 70-72.
[282] Transcript 3 Poland, Interview with Teacher 2, Dec. 15, 2016, ll. 200-209.

Now she [the pedagogue] sits with Sim and writes and reacts, helping with learning and checking on Sim. But is it a punishment or a reward? In my opinion we should think about it more in the terms of 'it is protection for the children.' Sim doesn't understand if it is punishment or reward. And school doesn't understand, either […]. For now it is all about trying to avoid this kind of situation from happening again.[283]

She also questioned whether the pedagogue's presence in class was to be regarded as a punishment of the student or a reward. The pedagogue's presence clearly elevated Sim to special status in the class, as someone who received full attention of another adult. However, it also meant Sim had no privacy at all. In the end, it did not matter, the teacher contended, since the pedagogue's involvement in class served the goal of deterring Sim from creating further situations in which violence could take place, and not necessarily contribute to their progress in learning.

Finally, another teacher judged the pedagogue's work as follows:

I didn't notice that the presence of the assistant [pedagogue] somehow changed Sim's behavior, for several times I have noticed during the sports classes that she was talking to Sim, had some conversation with Sim . . . and I think that maybe she does most of work during the breaks. That's at least what I think should happen. […] I know that they have some kind of a point system with the assistant [pedagogue] and Sim as a kind of help, but I didn't want to interrupt this, and there was a joke that in the previous year Sim finished three assistants and now the last is still holding on.[284]

Repeatedly, Teacher 4 referred to the pedagogue as an assistant which indicated that he either was unfamiliar with the different terminology or did not see it as a priority to address the pedagogue by her proper title. To him, the pedagogue was an assistant whose work with Sim took place primarily during breaks, not in class. He joked that the pedagogue would be another assistant that Sim would eventually "finish," i.e., force to quit her job. It seemed to be anticipated that the pedagogue would sooner or later leave her job, as she in fact did at the end of the semester. During her time as Sim's pedagogue, she reflected on her work:

I work with especially with one child, Sim. I help Sim with lessons, with homework, with everything. I spend also a break, breaks with Sim because, as you know, Sim is aggressive, and during breaks Sim, I think, when we spend breaks in classroom alone. Sim calms down and relaxes, and we do so many, many things. Especially art, sometimes like this, painting and so on, and I think. And yes this is my work mostly.[285]

From her account, it is clear that the pedagogue saw her work as strictly beneficial to Sim. She explained that painting in class during breaks helps Sim calm down. Whereas the Teacher 1 and Teacher 3 considered the pedagogue someone who shielded Sim from others,

[283] Transcript 2 Poland, Interview with Teacher 1, Nov. 2016, ll. 73-78.
[284] Transcript 5 Poland, Interview with Teacher 4, Dec. 08, 2016, ll. 173-181.
[285] Transcript 7 Poland, Interview with Pedagogue, Dec. 2, 2016, ll. 41-45.

she saw pedagogical value in her own work. Teacher 3 put forward the question "How many pedagogues are needed to support [Sim]?" He responded to the pedagogue as a guard who monitored Sim's behavior, which did not improve. On the contrary, the failure of the pedagogues who ended up leaving their jobs, was seen as another proof of Sim's unsuitability for this school. However, I would like to suggest that the pedagogue's task was never one of working with pedagogical tools to improve Sim's social skills. Instead, she was overburdened by the constant attention she had to pay to Sim, by the very one-sided nature of the task of shielding Sim, and by the very little cooperation and communication she received from the teachers of 5x. Whereas the pedagogue attempted to work pedagogically with Sim, the teachers of 5x did not recognize the pedagogical value of her work, but instead considered her a guard shielding other children from Sim.

The results of my research indicate that the measures taken in the aftermath of Nov. 2 contributed to Sim's isolation from the rest of the class. The march-in of Sim by themselves, the request for individual classes, the transfer to another class unit, and especially the one-on-one-shadowing by a special pedagogue, underlined Sim's status as out of place in the regular schooling context. Furthermore, the pedagogue was not viewed in her actual capacity of fostering inclusion but instead, as a protective shield for and from Sim. Her presence added to Sim's reliance on adult help; it created dependence on the pedagogue as a friend, and essentially functioned as a human barrier to Sim's inclusion. All these measures rested on the assumption that it was the individual with a disability that needed to be assessed, monitored, and surveilled. However, as Ellen Skilton-Sylvester and Graciela Slesaransky-Poe strongly emphasize "a focus solely on individuals will not lead to better policies and practices in schools."[286] They suggest to direct attention away from particular students, labeled as special needs, and take into view "improved assignments", "opportunities for individual and collaborative learning" as well as "meaningful participation by a greater number of classroom participants."[287] They notice an interesting tension between "addressing individual educational needs" and "creating a collective school vision."[288] This tension became also visible in the way that the special pedagogue was placed in the school where I did my research. She was responsible for taking care of the needs and realizing educational opportunities of Sim but there was no greater school vision that would tie her work to an

---

[286] Skilton-Sylvester, Ellen and Graciela Slesaransky-Poe (2009): More than a Least Restrictive Environment: Living up to the Civil Covenant in Building Inclusive Schools. In: Perspectives on Urban Education, pp. 32-36, p. 32
[287] Ibid., p. 33.
[288] Ibid.

agenda that all teachers subscribed to. However, this divide – whereby one teacher takes care of the child with special needs while another teacher provides instructions for the rest of the class is not a rare sight in inclusive school settings. In fact, according to Scruggs, Mastropieri and McDuffie, this "one teach, one assist" model is the most common variation of organizing co-teaching of a general education teacher and a special education teachers/ pedagogues in an inclusive classroom.[289] Out of five variations of co-teaching that have been used to analyze classroom practice by a number of scholars,[290] the "one teach, one assist" model comes closest to what I encountered in class 5x. The subject teachers taught 5x while the special pedagogue assisted Sim, i.e. "provided individual support as needed."[291] However, none of the variations in the literature on staff collaboration in inclusive classrooms assumed that the pedagogue would be the sole care-giver of the student with special needs, without any cooperation with the general education teachers. The IPET was then the only moment in which a planned exchange and communication took place among all members of staff on behalf of Sim's education. This, I claim, did not suffice the need for regular communication over the needs and challenges that Sim and Sim's educators faced on an almost daily basis.

4.2.4 "This class is specific"[292]

Finally, I want to focus attention on the class unit 5x, a crucial partner in the process of Sim's inclusion. A row between Sim and a few classmates who sneaked drawings onto the board throughout the lesson was ended when the teacher stepped in and cleaned the board of Sim's final drawing. This was met by great applause of the rest of the students. As will become clear from the following extract from my field notes, when it came to choosing alliance with either their classmate Sim or with their teacher, a majority of children cheered against Sim.

Wednesday, Nov. 23, 2016

Math Class (10:45-11:30 a.m.)

I enter the classroom with the girls of 5x. Then the boys follow us in pairs. Sim joins the class, together with the pedagogue, a few minutes later. The class works ambitiously on math problems: Children raise their hands, wave them impatiently and want to calculate in front of the group on the board. After Sim sits down, the pedagogue explains the task to Sim, who

[289] Scruggs, Thomas E., Mastropieri, Margo A. and Kimberly A. McDuffie (2007): Co-Teaching in Inclusive Classrooms: A Metasynthesis of Qualitative Research. In: Council for Exceptional Children, 73:4, pp. 392-416, p. 392.

[290] Friend and Cook 2003; Walther-Thomas, Korinek, McLaughlin and Williams 2000; Sotiria Tzivinikou 2015

[291] Scruggs, Thomas E., Mastropieri, Margo A. and Kimberly A. McDuffie (2007): Co-Teaching in Inclusive Classrooms: A Metasynthesis of Qualitative Research. In: *Exceptional Children*, 73:4, pp. 392-416, p. 392.

[292] Transcript 5 Poland, Interview with Teacher 4, Dec. 08, 2016, l. 80.

copies the math problems into a notebook. The teacher asks Sim if they understand the task. She again explains the task on the board. Work continues in class. One student after another goes to the board and calculates a task in front of the class. It is Sim's turn. It takes some time, but Sim is able to finish the task with the help of the teacher. Sim draws a smiley-face under the problem. Bir gets up and erases the smiley from the board. Sim goes back to the board and draws it back on. Sim washes their hands in the sink next to the board. Bir gets up once again and erases the smiley. Sim wants to get up, but the pedagogue holds on to their arm. Sim casts her hand off and goes back to the board. The smiley reappears. The calculations on the board continue. Bir gets up and goes to the front to throw something away. On his way back, he erases the smiley again. Sim gets up immediately and draws it back on. The class laughs. Another student gets up and pretends to throw something away. He holds a piece of crumpled paper in his hand and heads for the bin. As he passes the board, he erases the mouth of the smiley. Some children look up and watch for Sim's reaction. Sim is busy talking to the pedagogue and doesn't see what happened. As the calculations start to cover the whole board, the teacher takes a sponge and wipes the board. She erases the smiley. The class breaks into loud cheering. Sim looks up from their notebook and only stares at the board.

Given the violent behaviour Sim had shown against some of the students of 5x, a certain reluctance toward Sim was understandable. The fact that the pupils cheered for their teacher instead of Sim spoke to the strong rejection of Sim. Their alliance was with their teacher, not with their classmate. As justified as their fear or bias toward Sim might have been, the class had shown very low levels of empathy for Sim and were also not asked by their teachers to develop empathy when Sim cried at the sight of the police who came for the student. In the following, I present accounts of the teachers of 5x on the classroom community since inclusion "depended also on the children – if they want it to work,"[293] as their Teacher 1remarked. To varying degrees, the teachers attested to the weak social cohesion among the pupils of 5x. Their performance levels were in line with the average and above-average expectations of their teachers, but friendship, alliance, honesty and trust did not characterize the class community. The head teacher described 5x as a completely "average" class with regard to classroom performance:

> *So this class team, we can say that is a sort of average for national public school in Poland, and by average class team, I mean that there are some – there are several pupils – students with higher motivations, ambitions, and they are like, want to learn and get the knowledge in more, let's say, mmm… they want more than the average, than the others. There are several pupils who are here because they just simply must, because there is the obligation; they are not interested in really in getting, yes, learning something. And a majority of the class is just, simply, average. There are*

---

[293] Transcript 2 Poland, Interview with Teacher 1, Nov. 2016, ll. 78-79.

better and worse students according to knowledge, but just simply the average in public school.[294]

While the head teacher focused on evaluating the class community based on performance levels, the gym teacher commented on class 5x as follows:

> *It is not an orderly class, a messy, not well-organized class [a little bit crazy]. It's a kind of specific group, and maybe not in order because there are two or three children with ADHD. And what's more, there are also three or four girls who are constantly up to something bad: cheating [break the rules], lying a little bit, and I even caught them smoking cigarettes once or twice. Or there was the situation that they, the girls, pretended to have an injury with their arms and went to the infirmary with an injury after sports classes, but they hadn't taken part in sports classes, so it was impossible for them to get an injury. But they claimed there was something wrong with their arms after the volleyball lesson, and the nurse gave them some medical help ... [...] This class is specific [particular, strange], we can say that. So there are closer friends – there are two or three close friends – but it's a much unlevelled class, unbalanced.*[295]

The gym teacher judged the pupils on their social skills. He stressed that social cohesion among students was weak; that he did not know of many students who were friends with each other; that several students had behavioral problems mirrored in the fact that they were lying or showed signs of ADHDS. To the gym teacher, 5x was a "strange" class, since students seemed to act chaotically. He repeated this notion later in the course of the interview:

> *And I want to add to this that I think that the other classes are somehow closer as a group, as a team, as a unit [stronger relationships to each other], and this 5x is rather, specific, not so close to each other.*[296]

Though the gym teacher had previously called the police to intervene on Sim's account, gym classes did not get out of hand when I observed them. Instead, Sim was incorporated in basketball games, even though Sim and the Ukrainian pupil were always chosen last by the team captains. I asked the gym teacher why he thought his classes went so well. It had been a deliberate choice of his to change classes in a certain way, he explained to me:

> *And I think I found the solution for resolving the problem because for two years we have these mixed sports classes, boys and girls together. And when there were some exercises or team games, then I let the children pick their own teams, and it came to the point that boys were taking the best players. Sim often ended up in this mixed group with girls and weaker boys, where Sim was more accepted and could measure up to their potential. And I have accomplished somehow to make this work well.*

---

[294] Transcript 4 Poland, Interview with Teacher 3, Nov. 21, 2016, ll. 83-90.
[295] Transcript 5 Poland, Interview with Teacher 4, Dec. 08, 2016, ll. 71-81.
[296] Transcript 5 Poland, Interview with Teacher 4, Dec. 08, 2016, ll. 118-120.

Hence, mixing boys and girls helped Sim work in a team that was essentially a way of responding to the needs of a student, instead of ordering him or her to work in a certain team organized according to gender. It was a way of individualizing classroom activities that the gym teacher tried out and found to work well. Gym classes were the only times during the school day when I heard Sim's name called for something positive like "Sim, pass me the ball!" or "Sim, here I am!" Gym classes were exceptional as kids were asked to cooperate and treated each other mostly respectfully.

The Teacher 1portrayed class 5x with regard to their social as well as performance behavior, stating:

> *The way I see it, there are many boys, and they are divided into groups, not integrated as a class unit but, rather, integrated in those smaller groups of friends. As a class unit, I can say that they are very „talkative" maybe even over-loquacious, too much „talked-up." And they are a little bit too distracted and diffuse during lessons. But talking about the learning process, I guess it is OK. There are no major problems when it comes down to learning: there are two children who are „at risk" – that means they have to start doing better if they want to avoid repeating the year in the same class. But all in all the class is very active. The teacher can feel that they want and like to take part in lessons, to do something… I can tell that they want to work, they want to learn. And they really do their homework. Marks/grades are quite good in this class; well, they are not bad, at least.[297]*

The Teacher 1stressed weak relationships among the students. However, on the level of performance, she praised the class and their ambitious striving for performance. By mid-November, Sim was transferred to a different class unit in which Sim's former Teacher 2was the head teacher. Asked to compare the way 5x and 5y had responded to Sim, the Teacher 2 gave the following response:

> *Let me put it this way. I teach 5x, right? And I worked with Sim. Sim came to 5y, to my class, because I am the head teacher of 5y, […] I have some different rules of being head teacher because every head teacher has different rules. So for now Sim hasn't started any particular relations with my children, although the children know a lot about Sim. […] When I am a head teacher with Sim, it is more difficult than to come for science class and teach because in this class there is a boy and he is not the only one, so I have a boy who came from therapeutic school and he is in my class since September. And I have a boy who – I don't know how to say this – is afraid of everything [he is afraid of his own shadow]. I also have boys who are hyperactive, who punch first and then think. […] I have to be alert to avoid the moment of the beginning of the conflict, to put it down, to resolve it as fast as possible. Because children at this age are very, mmmm, they remember everything. If they do not punch back in that moment, they will punch the next day or the day after. But against all the*

---

[297] Transcript 2 Poland, Interview with Teacher 1, Nov. 2016, ll. 34-43.

odds, it is my opinion that in 5y those children welcomed Sim much more peacefully than they expected they would. In 5x, there were conflicts, and the kind of attitude was even ugly. And those children, when they found out that Sim was transferred to 5y, the children from 5x came to the children from 5y and told stories about what they should be expecting from Sim to happen in the future. […] I ordered the children that if they don't agree with Sim, they must tell Sim right away. They say "No" to Sim in the moment of trouble, not like in the other class (5x). I will give you the example. In 5x, they [the other children and Sim] agreed to do something, but then the other kids ran away. Maybe Sim forced children into their play they initially agreed on but then left Sim standing. So to avoid this, children in 5y are urged to oppose Sim from the beginning and give Sim clear signs. […] Children in my class are taught this way, that they should say "No," "I will not do this with you" or "I will not talk with you." I want them to speak up for themselves.[298]

From the interview, it was clear that the teacher placed emphasis on conflict resolution among all her students, without focusing on Sim alone. Furthermore, she appreciated that her class, 5y, had welcomed Sim rather calmly. The Teacher 2acknowledged that several pupils in her class showed challenging behavior. She encouraged direct contact and clear communication with Sim instead of further alienating Sim from their new classmates. Furthermore, she shared that Sim's classmates had warned the pupils of 5y of Sim and the type of behavior they could expect of Sim. Despite these warnings, 5y remained calm, which the Teacher 2considered a great accomplishment. Teaching the pupils to be upfront with Sim seemed to be her biggest tool in managing the new situation. This was a communication strategy she did not observe in 5x, where children would agree to play with Sim but then break their agreement.

In the light of these accounts that spoke to weak social bonding among the pupils of 5x, Sim's exclusion seemed just one side effect of an overall lack of communication skills that the students of 5x showed. Classroom activities did not foster cooperation, and so they did not experience one another as friends and partners in team work. Positive moments with someone they would usually not spend time with were not created, so patterns that had developed over the course of five years were hard to break. The head teacher of 5x explained that numerous attempts to integrate Sim into 5x had been initiated, but that the students knew Sim too well:

Sim is well known here since the first grade, and pupils know very well about all the dysfunctions that are somehow connected to Sim. So all the pupils of this class have known Sim for several years. And through all these years, since first grade, there have been multiple occasions in every school year, every semester, and so-called actions to deal with it in … So there have been multiple actions that consider this, run by the

---

[298] Transcript 3 Poland, Interview with Teacher 2, Dec. 15, 2016, ll. 56-92.

> *school, that take into consideration how to fit Sim into the class team, the class group, and also preparing the class for that. For several years there have been attempts to build up the group, to unify the group.[299]*

In general, he head teacher saw the class community as shattered beyond repair. A tool like the Individual Program of Education and Therapy (IPET), which documented the limitations of a specific pupil, such as learning difficulties, behavior, social maladjustments and so on did not take into account the missing bond between classroom community and Sim.

I also observed lessons of a second grade teacher with exceptional training and expertise in the field of autism and Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder. We discussed the use of IPET with regard to a student she included in her second grade class unit. In our interview, she read to me part of the IPET report and commented:

> *So let me just briefly read it out to start with. It's the official medical opinion/ diagnosis that was given in June 2016, so this year. And it speaks of my boy with Asperger and ADHD: emotional and behavioral disorders; risk of social maladjustment; because of the health condition, it is recommended for the child to stay in small class units. Please notice all the paradoxes here. This boy was diagnosed with strong emotional lability and hyper-sensibility (over-reaction), impulsivity, changing of moods, dysphoria (profound state of unease/dissatisfaction, depression, anxiety, (...), disturbed/abnormal relationships with children of his age, in difficult situations aggression, dysphoria, problems with concentration and attention of higher degree. We get nothing out of this. It is useless to us. To the degree that the boy is described, I don't see this behavior in him, to such an extent.[300]*

It was this teacher's goal to create a classroom community in which her student would feel accepted and all other students would be taught according to their performance level. A medical assessment of the child's shortcomings did not help her accomplish this goal. She worked toward building small alliances among the children of her class and the boy. She explained to me that the child had attended first grade at the public primary school. When she noticed that he showed signs of social maladjustment, she advised him to consult the psychological and pedagogical centers. Attendance at a therapeutic school followed, where the boy received special treatment. There, however, he felt lonely and wanted to go back to his old class. The teacher agreed to take him back with his old classmates. Though reintegration did not succeed immediately and all the time, she was proud of what the class had accomplished together:

> *It works. At the beginning of the school year, the boy was a little bit confused, like lost, because the class group was already somehow like well attuned, was a team for*

---

[299] Transcript 4 Poland, Interview with Teacher 3, Nov. 21, 2016, ll. 114-121.
[300] Transcript 6 Poland, Interview with Teacher from grade 2, Dec. 07, 2016, ll. 94-103.

one year. But little by little the child started to assimilate with the group. It wasn't sudden and it wasn't forced. There was no force, only time. So I gave the child time, for example, and the possibility for this child, for example, to choose with whom he would like to sit. At the beginning he didn't want to sit with anybody. Although he was very much motivated – "Hooray!" – and happy because he returned to this class, like his class, my class, he kept repeating all the time. He was all about getting back to my class. And one day I had goosebumps when he came to me and asked, "Miss, can I sit with Pawel?" So he did it on his own. And he's been sitting with Pawel all the time up to this day. Pawel accepted him and his request to sit with him. They help each other; they support each other. But they are interested in different stuff. But they are getting along very well.

In the first grade, he wasn't able to accept himself. He had these thoughts that I am doing everything badly, I am not good; he wouldn't be able to accept anything. And now he's able to let it go, some stuff like... and be happy about what he has accomplished. That is a huge success. His and maybe (I think) ours.

[...] he wanted to be in my class (Laughs), at school but my class. Because there were plenty of other classes, even in this school, that the mother could or he could choose, but they have chosen my class. And we cannot say that he was accepted in the first grade. He wasn't accepted. There were huge conflicts, especially with the other kid who has ADHD. Constantly they clashed/ bumped into each other, constantly in conflict, and constantly those conflicts were big. And today all of this has calmed down, into the quiet. Everything could have mattered: positive attitude of the teacher, talking, conversation each day and just simply these human, human gestures]. Everything matters, has its own value – the methods of working with children, very often contact with parents. I don't know, I think everything is important. One should consider the whole spectrum of actions.[301]

With regard to social learning, the teacher had developed a number of skills that helped her form a class unit with several students who showed challenging behavior and conditions. From her accounts, she had practiced conflict resolution; she had practiced means of respectful communication; she tried to support empathy, acceptance and understanding among her pupils. I did not observe an emphasis on these skills in the pedagogical work that took place in 5x. Though Sim exposed at times brutal behavior that had to be condemned and punished, the members of class 5x were not helped to develop tools with which they could reconcile with their classmate. A dispersed group with little team spirit, as described by the teachers of 5x, continuously disciplined through regroupings and alienated from one another through individual work, the children of the class were unable to form an inclusive community in which everyone's differences would be accepted. On the contrary, pupils fended for themselves and not for the community.

---

[301] Transcript 6 Poland, Interview with Teacher from grade 2, Dec. 07, 2016, ll. 135-185.

4.3 Conclusion: The Szkola Podstawowa – A School for Whom?

When I conducted my ethnographic field research at a Polish primary school in fall 2016, I also visited a local secondary school on Fridays. This school was considered one of the most prestigious and high-ranking "lyceums" of the city. Polish students attend a lyceum after they complete primary school and the gimnazjum and pass an entry exam of the given lyceum.[302] Other options after the gimnazjum are the vocational schools where students also pass the matura exam but can study subjects to prepare for employment in mostly manual professions. For several weeks, I observed a group of eleventh graders from first lesson to last. They attended this school because most of them wanted to study law or the humanities at a university. For medicine or science, different secondary schools in the city were known to prepare their students best one student told me when we chatted between lessons.[303] At this elite school, I asked myself how students had to act to be considered "good" students. They were essentially on the way to becoming the future intellectual elite. I was curious which virtues students had to have developed in primary school and gimnazjum to be selected for attendance at this lyceum. Regarding the prestige that came with graduating from this institution, I assumed that these students were the most positive result the Polish education system had created. From my observations, I can conclude that students who successfully managed the rigid school days of 45-minute periods in primary school passed the first test of eligibility for lyceum. The eleventh graders read, calculated, and took notes in silence and on their own from lesson to lesson. During classes, they were asked questions for which they provided answers that the teachers judged either right or wrong; no discussions took place. Students were regularly summoned to the board in front of the class to calculate and solve problems given by the teachers. Students at this lyceum had to be extremely hard-working, judging from the tasks that they had to manage. Math classes involved the calculation of algorithms, such as $\log 712 - \log 72 = \dots$[304] In the Polish class, students analyzed text passages from the Bible; and in history, they memorized the development of the Polish constitution in the different republics.[305]

The classes I observed at the primary school, indeed, put great effort into preparing pupils for the highest standard of education as it was practiced on further levels of the system. Early competition and testing were valued and trophies decorated the school's foyer. Long

---

[302] Since the 2017-18 school year, students no longer attend gimnazjum but pass from primary school (extended to grade eight) to higher secondary schools.
[303] Field notes from Friday, Dec.2, 2016.
[304] Taken from: Field notes from Friday, Dec. 2, 2016
[305] Taken from: Field notes from Friday, Nov. 25, 2016.

school days during which children copied math exercises into their notebooks while one after the other went to the front to calculate in front of their classmates, foreshadowed what they would encounter at the lyceum on an advanced level. Art therapy, social therapy, etc. were placed at the end of the school day so that subject learning received priority in the students' schedule. No space for leisure existed for the students; no fixed classroom displayed the students' work or held their belongings. A sense of discipline prevailed as students, even on their breaks, were ordered to be quiet while hanging around the hallway, as all classrooms were locked. The primary school appreciated excellence understood in the frame of the expectations of the higher levels of the educational system.

From my observations, I would say that out of all 22 children of 5x, one boy clearly stood out and seemed to have the potential to master the classes at the elite lyceum. He did all the tasks with great focus, raised his hand for nearly every question and never got into trouble. While the teachers perfectly monitored and noted his achievements, some other students blended into the background. Vladyslav, the Ukrainian boy, barely spoke out loud and was always chosen last for sports teams. He was ambitious, yet almost invisible in the class community. Several other children showed signs of ADHD or behavior that worried the teachers, but these traits were not a matter of pedagogical intervention. Finally, there was Sim, the pupil considered unsuitable for a mass public school. Regarding the standard of education I saw at the lyceum and the type of "goodness" expected of the eleventh graders I observed, Sim really was no fit. Sim was disobedient and unconventional, forcing the teachers to come up with alternative strategies, which only some were willing to consider. However, Sim was not an exception in the classroom, although that student was depicted as the only problem of the class unit 5x. Acts of resistance by different pupils took place in many ways throughout the school day.

Unfortunately, Sim's voice was barely included in the material that I present here. The student and I had one occasion to talk when I sat next to them. I asked: "Do you like this school?" Sim answered that they did so very much, nodding their head and returning back to the task of coloring on a sheet of paper. I was not able to communicate much with Sim, mostly non-verbally since my Polish language skills were weak and the student did not always respond to my attempts at communicating. One day, Sim shared chocolate with me. A different day, Sim pulled a chair up next to them so I could sit with them. I think Sim felt at times observed, knowing that with all the attention on the student, I was probably just another

person who wanted to look and judge. I avoided focusing my attention on Sim alone and rather aimed at observing interactions among students and teachers.

I want to close this chapter by stressing that educating Sim was not an option that teachers could choose or not choose to do. Sim was entitled to mainstream education, which the Polish government facilitated by law and with generous funding. Misallocation of funding is one problem; a lack of commitment to inclusive education as a fundamental right is another one. Putting school organization under scrutiny, Tony Booth and Mel Ainscow published the Index of Inclusion, a standard reference work that has helped school leaders establish inclusive school communities. In the third edition of the index, published in 2011, three dimensions are named under which school structures and crucial themes of inclusive education are listed. Each dimension assembles a number of indicators that may be used for self-evaluation. The first, "Creating inclusive cultures," lists the following top indicator: "Everyone is welcome." [306] Hence, it is fundamental to have a general appreciation for all pupils, whether or not they have the potential to attend elite secondary schools.

The Polish education system underwent dramatic upheavals during the years of political transformation, especially with regard to the preparation for and consequences of the country's membership in the European Union (2004). Where function followed form, in many ways policy did not lead to practices that would do justice to the ambitious goals of the political agenda. Such is the case of the promise of accessibility of mainstream public education to all students. Neoliberal policies from the 1990s onwards manifested in the way that schools focused on training students for high stake testing in Poland. Furthermore, financing and funding of primary education was shifted to local governments, which added to the inequality within cities and regions, creating the culture of high-stakes testing and competitiveness. These developments impacted school cultures and placed scoring high at the heart of education across the county. Meanwhile, bottom-up, grass roots movements and campaigns failed to achieve general appeal and impact. Currently, the Polish education system is undergoing yet another drastic reform as the gimnazjum (a result of the 1992 education reform) is being closed and primary schools are forced to organize teaching in two to three shifts. Teachers face great pressures to prepare students for higher education after eight years of primary school where neither material nor spatial resources are sufficient to accompany the transition. In this situation, rights of children with special needs take a

---

[306] Booth, Tony, and Ainscow, Mel (2011): *Index for Inclusion: Developing learning and participation in schools*, Center for Studies on Inclusive Education, p. 14.

backseat on the list of priorities. Considering the Polish case, it seems paradoxical that practice stands in the way of implementing policy successfully. Critical scholar on education policy and globalization, Stephen Carney, explores educational "policyscapes," by investigating in "locality and the situated history, politics, and culture of distinct places while acknowledging the ways in which these phenomena are themselves products of international dynamics."[307] Drawing from Appadurai, he speaks of globalization as deeply impacting the local through concepts that, however, did not arise from this locality.[308] Perhaps what can be seen in the Polish example is a pushback on liberal ideals, such as inclusive education, by teachers and school communities that do not "accept the preeminence of the state and its alleged vertical reach from top to bottom."[309] The United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities endorsed and promoted by the European Union and channeled into national education policies lacks, thus, grounding in Polish grass-root actions and civic engagement led by teachers and educators. Hence, the "spatial reach,"[310] as Carney calls it, does not enter into schooling cultures to transform learning and teaching opportunities for all children.

5. Austria

The focus of this chapter is the practices and policies of educational inclusion in Austria. It is based on ethnographic research carried out in a Tyrolian primary school from March to July, 2017. I collected weekly data by observing participants in classroom activities and interactions in the fourth grade classroom. I documented informal conversations and gathered extensive descriptions of artifacts I found in the formal and informal educational spaces of this particular school, such as hallways, the schoolyard, the foyer and leisure spaces inside and outside school. Furthermore, I interviewed the two teachers of this class, the special pedagogue and the principal of the school.

My account of Austria is divided in two main sections. The first one is largely a policy analysis in which I rely on data from national and international education reports, literature analysis and expert interviews that I conducted with Tyrolian School Board Officials, Roland Astl and Ingrid Handle, as well as education researchers and scholars of disability studies from the University of Innsbruck, Volker Schönwiese and Lisa Pfahl. The document analysis

---

[307] Carney, Stephen (2009): Negotiating Policy in an Age of Globalization: Exploring Educational "Policyscapes" in Denmark, Nepal, and China. In: *Comparative Education Review*, 53:1, pp. 63-88, p. 63.
[308] Ibid., p. 64.
[309] Ibid., p. 65.
[310] Ibid.

is grounded in Michel Foucault's method of archaeology which Una Crowley from the Center for Teaching and Learning at Maynooth University summarizes as: "a process for working through archives of a society (parliamentary debates, prison records, chronicles, journals, […], official records, grand theories, popular knowledge, subjugated knowledge, etc.)" to "isolate and deconstruct components of accepted knowledge."[311] Hence, I analyzed national government reports and statistics as well as international commentaries by the European Union and the United Nations, with regard to an intersectional approach that pays attention to categories of disability, race, class and gender in Austrian education.

The second part is a historically-contextualized ethnographic description of a primary school through which I aim to understand and illuminate the complexities of implementing inclusion in schools. I draw on the principles of thick ethnographic description outlined by Clifford Geertz as "deeply contextualized descriptions of microscopic instances"[312] as well as social actions understood as "comments on more than themselves."[313] In addition, I rely on the tradition of anthropology and education, specifically the branch of school based ethnography developed by American school ethnographers, George and Louise Spindler[314], Frederick Erickson[315], Harvé Varenne and Ray McDermott,[316] among others. School ethnography pays particular attention to the contextual dimension in which "everyday dilemmas"[317] of schooling appear. In the *The European Teacher*, Michael Schratz discusses five competence areas for the teaching profession: reflection and discourse, professional awareness, collaboration and collegiality, ability to differentiate, and personal mastery. It is the sixth discipline, "the context in which the domains appear,"[318] that I foregrounded in my ethnographic description of the school "out there." My research site was a school located in an area that one teacher described to me as "ghettoized."[319][320] She explained that the

---

[311] Crowley, Una (2009): Genealogy, method. In: *International Encyclopedia of Human Geography*. Elsevier, 341-344, p. 4, accessed from http://eprints.maynoothuniversity.ie/3024/1/UC_Genealogy.pdf, on Sept. 4, 2018.
[312] Geertz, Clifford (1973): *The Interpretation of Cultures*. New York: Basic Books, Inc. Publishers, p. 21
[313] Ibid., p. 23
[314] Spindler, George and Louise Spindler (2000) (Eds.): *Fifty Years of Anthropology and Education 1950-2000*: A Spindler Anthology. London: Laurence, Erlbaum Associates, Publishers
[315] Erickson, Frederick (2010): Studying Side by Side: Collaborative Action Ethnography in Educational Research. In: Spindler, G. and L. Hammond (Eds.): *Innovations in Educational Ethnography: Theories, Methods, and Results*. New York: Psychology Press
[316] Varenne, Harvé and Ray McDermott (1995):Culture as Disability. In*: Anthropology and Education Quarterly*. 26:3, pp. 324-348.
[317] El-Haj, Thea Abu (2006): *Elusive Justice: Wrestling with Difference and Educational Equity in Everyday Practice*. New York: Routledge, p. 3.
[318] Schratz, Michael (2014): The European teacher: transnational perspectives in teacher education policy and practice. In: *CEPS Journal*, 4:4, pp. 11-27, p. 15
[319] All translations of interview transcript or policy papers from German into English have been conducted by the author herself.
[320] "Es ist so, dass dieser Stadtteil eher mmmm… böse Zungen würden dies als ghettoisiert bezeichnen." See: Transcript 6 Austria, Interview with Teacher B, May 2, 2017, ll. 3-4

catchment area of the primary school was the result of "political failures" due to which the "social underclass, many unemployed parents, uneducated classes, people with a migration background" lived here.[321] The school's neighborhood seemed notorious for being inhabited by unfavorable groups of society, the unemployed, foreign, criminal, and the uneducated. Since Clifford Geertz referred to ethnography as a craft that "works by the light of local knowledge,"[322] I explored the origins of stigma that were attached to this district. Historical research illuminated that the neighborhood was first inhabited by the residents of two former settlements. In Melanie Hollaus and Heidi Schleich's book, the authors revived city history and revealed glimpses into local myths grounded in the "extraterritorial" [323] nature of the Bock settlement and the former Gestapo Camp which was populated by destitute Tyrolians in the post-World War II years. Interviewee Sigrid M. remembered: "Many [Locals] considered the camp and the Bock settlement as patches of shame for the city."[324] After social housing policies were implemented in the 1960s, these former "patches of shame" were moved into the neighborhood that was today the catchment area of my research site. This spoke to a rich and complicated place memory impacting its position in the contemporary imagination of this area. Dolores Hayden called this "The power of place – the power of ordinary urban landscapes to nurture citizens' public memory."[325] As my research site was troubled by the power of its place, in other words situated in a neighborhood at the edge of the city and inhabited by undesired parts of society, I decided to not treat the educational settings "as passive and disconnected backdrops to the dramaturgy of authority and resistance, rather than as constitutive elements of cultural meaning and social activity"[326] in classroom practices, interactions and discourse.

5.1 Policy Analysis

My empirical research fell in a period of careful adjustments to current policy regarding the education of children with disabilities and special needs, pushed forward by Austria's commitment to the goals of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of People

---

[321] "Also..., meiner Ansicht nach sind einige politische Versäumnisse... sind die soziale Schicht ist eher Unterschicht und viele arbeitslose Eltern, bildungsferne Schichten, eben Leute mit Migrationshintergrund." Transcript 6 Austria, Interview with Teacher B, May 2, 2017, ll. 4-6

[322] Geertz, Clifford (1983): *Local Knowledge*. New York: Basic Books, p. 167.

[323] Hollaus, Melanie, Schleich, Heidi (Eds.) (2017): *Bocksiedlung. Ein Stück Innsbruck*. Innsbruck: Studienverlag, p. 29.

[324] Ibid.

[325] Hayden, Dolores (1999): *The Power of Place: Urban Landscapes as Public History*. Cambridge: The MIT Press, p. 9.

[326] Rutheiser, Charles (1993): Mapping Contested Terrains: Schoolrooms and Streetcorners in Urban Belize. In: Rotenberg, Robert, McDonogh, Gary (Eds.): *The Cultural Meaning of Urban Space*. London: Betgin & Garvey, pp. 103-120, p. 103.

with Disabilities (UN-CRPD). Austria had ratified the UN-CRPD in 2008, followed by the release of the National Action Plan Disability 2012-2020[327] four years later. The key paragraph of the UN-CRPD with regard to education reads as follows: "Persons with disabilities can access an inclusive, quality and free primary education and secondary education on an equal basis with others in the communities in which they live" (Art. 24.2b). In the National Action Plan Disability 2012-2020, the federal Ministry for Labor, Social Affairs and Consumer Protection, then run by the Social Democratic Party of Austria (SPÖ), declared the goal of organizing "Inclusive Model Regions" in Carinthia, Styria and Tyrol. An inclusive model region "has the aim to increase inclusive pedagogical quality and support at regular schools so that segregating facilities will not be needed anymore in accordance with the UN-Convention on the Rights of People with Disabilities and the National Action Plan Disability 2012-2020."[328]

Reutte, an educational region within Tyrol, has extensively established inclusive schooling and lesson designs for 20 years. From these experiences, the inclusive model region Tyrol draws expertise that it seeks to expand to the whole of Tyrol.[329] Compared to the other pilot regions of Carinthia (1.0%) or Styria (0.8%), in Tyrol 1.8%, 497 children with special-needs status, are taught outside mainstream education. Roland Astl, a representative of the Highest School Board of Tyrol[330] and coordinator of the establishment of pedagogical counseling institutions for inclusive education, contends: "In comparison to other regions in Austria and also in comparison to international developments, Tyrol has a great need to catch up on questions of inclusion."[331] Tyrol is one of nine federal states that make up the Republic of Austria. The country has a population of roughly 8.7 million.[332] Vienna, its capital and a federal state of roughly 415 km², is home to 1.8 million. Though Tyrol is three times the area

---

[327] Bundesministerium für Arbeit, Soziales und Konsumentenschutz: Nationaler Aktionsplan Behinderung 2012-2020: Strategie der österreichischen Bundesregierung zur Umsetzung der UN-Behindertenrechtskonvention, accessed from: https://broschuerenservice.sozialministerium.at/Home/Download?publicationId=165, on Sept. 3, 2017.
[328] "Das Ziel einer IMR [Inklusiven Modell Region] muss sein, die inklusive pädagogische Qualität und den Support an Regelschulen so zu heben, dass aussondernde Einrichtungen möglichst nicht mehr gebraucht werden, wie es die UN-Behindertenrechtskonvention und der Nationale Aktionsplan Behinderung 2012-2020 vorsehen." See: Bundesministerium für Bildung und Frauen: Verbindliche Richtlinien zur Entwicklung von Inklusiven Modellregionen, p. 66 accessed from https://bildung.bmbwf.gv.at/schulen/bw/abs/rl_inklusive_modell_2015.pdf?61edru, on Jan.5, 2018.
[329] Salvador, Eva and Monika Windisch (2017): The Inclusive Model Region Tyrol. In: Svecnik, Erich, Petrovic, Angelika and Ulrike Sixt (Eds.): *The Implementation of Inclusive Model Regions in Austria: Case Studies to the Processes of Strategies in Carinthia, Styria and Tyrol*. Bundesinstitut für Bildungsforschung, Innovation und Entwickung des österreichischen Schulwesens.
[330] Oberste Schulbehörde für das Bundesland Tirol
[331] "Das Bundesland Tirol hat in dieser Frage [inklusive Bildung] Aufholbedarf im Vergleich zu anderen Bundesländern würde ich mal sagen auch im Vergleich zu den internationalen Entwicklungen." See: Transcript 2 Austria, Interview with Roland Astl, July 4, 2017, ll. 4-5
[332] Accessed from www.statistik.gv.at, on July 7, 2017.

of Vienna, only 8.5 percent of Austria's population resides in this Alpine region. The city in which my research takes place is one of five largest in Austria.[333] Therefore, it takes up the position of a small urban island within an otherwise vast rural region. Service industries in the city offer low-skill jobs and housing opportunities that cannot be found in the scattered villages of Tyrol.

This region has seen a considerable influx of migrants from North Africa, the Middle East and the Balkans in recent years. German political decisions in the wake of the refugee movement in the summer of 2015 have led to an unprecedented 890,000 asylum-seekers (primarily from Syria, Iraq and Afghanistan, but also from the Balkan countries of Albania and Kosovo) to cross the border into Germany through Austria.[334] While Austria was a country of refuge for Europeans in the 20th century,[335] most notably after the Hungarian uprising of 1956, the Prague Spring in 1968 and during the Balkan war in 1995, the newest wave of refugees has been used to change the political climate. The Freedom Party Austria (FPÖ) achieved dramatically high levels of voter support in the 2016 presidential election. The previous year, a dramatic and widely publicized case of human trafficking shocked the Austrian public.[336] In a refrigerator truck on its way from Hungary to Austria, 71 people from Afghanistan, Iraq and Syria suffocated to death.[337] The truck, which did not allow enough air to reach the 59 men, 8 women and 4 children aboard, was found abandoned on the road in Burgenland, Austria, on August 27, 2015. In April of the same year, more than 600 people drowned in the Mediterranean after their boat capsized on its way from Libya to Italy.[338] The shift of the humanitarian crisis from the Mediterranean to the doorsteps of Central Europe marked a caesura in German and Austrian refugee politics. When the Hungarian government refused the transport of refugees westwards and people started to walk

---

[333] Statstics Austria (Ed.) (2017): Austria: Numbers, Data, Facts, p. 13
[334] Konar, Özlem, Kreienbrink, Axel and Anja Stichs (July 3, 2017): Zuwanderung und Integration. Aktuelle Zahlen, Entwicklungen, Maßnahmen. In: *Aus Politik und Zeitgeschichte*. Vol: 67, 27-29, pp. 13-20.
[335] Pongratz-Lippitt, Christa (June 10, 2016): Austria has a proud history of helping refugees – but for how much longer? *The Guardian*: accessed from https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2016/jun/10/austria-refugees-migration-crisis-eu, on Dec. 1, 2018.
[336] Die Zeit: http://www.zeit.de/gesellschaft/zeitgeschehen/2015-09/oesterreich-tote-fluechtlinge-ungarn-kuehltransporter-schlepper; Der Standard: https://derstandard.at/2000021736258/71-tote-Fluechtlinge-auf-A4-Fahrer-des-Wagens-unter-Verhafteten ; The Guardian: https://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/aug/28/more-than-70-dead-austria-migrant-truck-tragedy; Le Point: http://www.lepoint.fr/monde/camion-charnier-en-autriche-les-victimes-ont-etouffe-en-tres-peu-de-temps-04-09-2015-1962034_24.php
[337] Harding, Luke (28.08.2015): Hungarian police arrest driver of lorry that had 71 migrants inside. *The Guardian*: Accessed from https://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/aug/28/more-than-70-dead-austria-migrant-truck-tragedy, on Sep. 6, 2017.
[338] The UN Refugee Agency, UNHCR accessed from http://tracks.unhcr.org/2015/12/2015-the-year-of-europes-refugee-crisis/, on Sept. 9, 2017.

toward Austria and Germany, neither country closed its borders but instead provided humanitarian aid and refuge.[339] [340]

Nonetheless, in a society where one out of four children speaks a language other than German at home,[341] with 6.6 percent of primary school children speaking Bosnian, Serbian or Croatian at home, 6.5 percent Turkish and 0.3 percent English[342], the FPÖ has led successful campaigns with slogans like "Daham statt Islam," ("Home instead of Islam"), "Heimatliebe statt Marokkaner-Diebe" ("Patriotism instead of Moroccan Thieves") or "Volksvertreter statt EU-Verräter" ("People's Representatives instead of EU traitors"). The party program's introductory statement calls for "Austria First" and resembles closely the discourse of various populist groups on both sides of the Atlantic.[343]

5.1.1 Disability, Gender and Multiculturalism in the Austrian School System

Looking at the social demographics of students who go to special schools, it becomes apparent that a migration background, low performance in school and special-needs status overlap in a very drastic fashion. Disability in the Austrian education system is established as a special needs-status, given to a child who "as a consequence of a physical or psychological disability cannot follow the lesson [...] without special pedagogical support."[344] The National Action Plan Disability 2012-2020 summarizes: "Students, whose first language is not German, are strongly over-represented in special schools."[345]

The first school that is mandatory for children is the *Volksschule*, which I will call "primary school" in this study. The primary school comprises basic level I, which entails one year of preschool, grade 1 and grade 2, as well as basic level II, which summarizes grade 3 and 4. Compulsory education starts when children turn six before September 1 of the school year. Already in preschool, children can be given special-needs status. Parents may then decide whether their children join a regular school as "integration children" carrying the

---

[339] Ibid.

[340] This situation changed drastically when Austria and the Balkan and Visegrad states jointly closed the Balkan route within the following year. The EU-Turkey "refugee-deal" also considerably decreased the inflow of migrants into Germany. See, for example, Emir Numanovic (July 1, 2016): "Austria takes steps to control migration on Balkan route", Deutsche Welle, accessed from http://www.dw.com/en/austria-takes-steps-to-control-migration-on-balkan-route/a-19372251, on Sept. 6, 2017, or Schwarze, Till (February 2, 2017): "Flüchtlingsabkommen mit der Türkei", *Die Zeit*, accessed from http://www.zeit.de/politik/ausland/2017-02/fluechtlingsabkommen-tuerkei-eu-inhalt, on Sept. 9, 2017.

[341] Wohlhart, David, Böhm, Jan, Grillitsch, Maria, Oberwimmer, Konrad, Soukup-Altrichter, Katharina, Stanzel-Tischler, Elisabeth (2015): Die österreichische Volksschule./ The Austrian Primary School. In: *Nationaler Bildungsbericht Österreich*, Band 1, p. 30.

[342] Ibid., p. 31

[343] Accessed from https://www.fpoe.at/themen/parteiprogramm/parteiprogramm-englisch/, on Sept. 5, 2017.

[344] §8, Abs. 1, Schulpflichtgesetz [SchPflG]

[345] "Schülerinnen und Schüler mit anderen Erstsprachen als Deutsch sind überproportional stark in den Sonderschulen vertreten [...]" See: Nationaler Aktionsplan Behinderung 2012-2020, p. 65

special-needs status or enroll in a special school. The transition from preschool to primary school is, therefore, the first hurdle children must overcome on their way into mainstream education. The National Education Report Austria states: "The transition from the compulsory year of preschool into primary school is marked by the attempt to create 'homogeneity' with the help of selective mechanisms, such as school readiness assessments, the intake of exceptional students, assigning students to grades and testing for special pedagogical needs."[346] The report Migration and Integration shows that more children with Turkish as their first language attend special schools (5.2 percent) than primary schools (2.1 percent). Similar ratios are found for children from the former Yugoslavia, with 4.0 percent taught in primary schools and 6.8 percent in special institutions.[347]

In the fourth grade, primary schools are required to evaluate pupils' performance on the scale of 1 to 5 to award AHS-maturity or readiness. AHS stands for "Allgemeinbildende Höhere Schule" (General Higher Education School, i.e. Academic High School) and may also be referred to generally as Gymnasium, attended only by children who fulfill certain criteria at the end of the fourth grade. In Tyrol, the general rule is that children need to receive the grade of *very good* (1) or *good* (2) in the main subjects, German and mathematics.[348] On a national level, out of one cohort that transitions from primary school to secondary school, 36 percent of students were admitted AHS in the school year 2013/-14, while the remaining roughly 63 percent entered New Middle Schools (NMS).[349] After successful completion of AHS, students may continue their education at universities. All other children, who go to the NMS, either aspire to a vocational career or continue a rather academic track after completing NMS by passing the matura exam at a profession-related higher college. However, places in Gymnasiums are scarce in Tyrol, and in 2015 more than 180 children who fulfilled the criteria for admission were not admitted.[350] Only 7 percent of children who were not Austrian citizens

---

[346] "Der Übergang aus dem verpflichtenden Kindergartenjahr in die Volksschule ist vom Versuch gekennzeichnet, ‚Homogenität' herzustellen. Selektionsmechanismen wie Schulreifefeststellung, Aufnahme als außerordentliche Schüler/innen, Transfer zwischen Klassen, Zuordnung zu Schulstufen und Feststellung von sonderpädagogischem Förderbedarf werden eingesetzt." See: Wohlhart, David, Böhm, Jan, Grillitsch, Maria, Oberwimmer, Konrad, Soukup-Altrichter, Katharina, Stanzel-Tischler, Elisabeth (2015): Die österreichische Volksschule./The Austrian Primary School. In: *Nationaler Bildungsbericht Österreich*, Band 1, p. 40.

[347] Statistics Austria (2011): Migration and Integration: Numbers, Data, Indicators, p. 43.

[348] § 40 SchOG Schulorganisationsgesetz: Aufnahmevoraussetzungen (School organisation law: requirements of admission), Recht.Schnell (Justice/Law.Quick) accessed from https://www.jusline.at/gesetz/schog/paragraf/40, on Dec. 6, 2018.

[349] Bruneforth, Michael, Lassnigg, Lorenz, Vogtenhuber, Stefan, Schreiner, Claudia, and Simone Breit (Eds.): *National Bildungsbericht Österreich 2015 Band 1, Das Schulsystem in Spiegel von Daten und Indikatoren* (The School System in the Mirror of Data and Indicators). Leykam, p. 76.

[350] "Not enough places at Tyrol Gymnasiums"/ "Zu wenige Plätze an Tiroler Gymnasien" (March 27, 2013), accessed from http://tirol.orf.at/news/stories/2702178/, on Sept. 6, 2017.

(mostly from the former Yugoslavia and Turkey) went to the AHS in the 2009-10 school year. In special schools, on the other hand, this group constituted 18 percent of students.[351]

The second big transition in the life of schoolchildren in Austria is, therefore, one with far-reaching consequences. At age 10, children are grouped by performance into different educational tracks. After completing NMS, children who are not admitted into AHS may still achieve the *matura* exam qualification by attending evening Gymnasium classes while working. Pressure and stress in ambitious households begins even before fourth grade because the standards or competences a child needs to acquire are nowhere clearly defined.[352] Hence, teachers have great power over children's future. It is they who determine a child's maturity. Without teachers' recommendation to a Gymnasium, children are not allowed to attend. Volker Schönwiese and the Tyrol Monitoring Report describe the transition after fourth grade as the high point for segregation based on disability. Schönwiese summarizes:

> *Everyone who is visibly disabled, such as children with Down syndrome or in a wheelchair, or something else – there is no discussion. It is clear: They start their education in special schools or they become integration children. And then, when someone has made it into integration, they usually stay – at least during the time of primary education. Children whose parents have a rather deprived background, who enter mainstream education but show strategies of disrupting and not paying attention, are sorted out over the course of their school career. The non-visibly disabled children are transferred to special schools usually when they transition from primary to secondary education. That's when many of them disappear from mainstream education.[353]*

It is very rare in Tyrol that children with special-needs status are taught inclusively throughout their schooling. The Tyrol Monitoring Report summarizes that it is often in the ninth grade that students with special needs are taken out of regular schooling and placed in special facilities where they can spend up to three more years in an educational setting.[354]

The Austrian education system follows a differentiating approach to schooling based

---

[351] Statistics Austria (2011): Migration and Integration: Numbers, Data, Indicators, p. 42.

[352] „Welche Kompetenzen ein Kind am Ende der Volksschule mindestens aufweisen muss, ist nicht definiert." See: Wohlhart, David, Böhm, Jan, Grillitsch, Maria, Oberwimmer, Konrad, Soukup-Alrichter, Katharina and Elisabeth Stanzel-Tischler: Die österreichische Volksschule (The Austrian Primary School). In: Bruneforth, Michael et alii. (Eds.): Nationaler Bildungsbericht Österreich 2015 Band 2, Fokussierte Analysen bildungspolitischer Schwerpunktthemen (Focused Analyses of educational political key topics). Leykam, p. 20.

[353] "Alles was visibel mit Behinderung zu tun hat, sichtbar Kind mit Down Syndrom, sichtbar Rollstuhl, sichtbar dieses oder jenes – da gibt's keine Diskussion. Ist ja klar. Entweder Sonderschule oder Integrationskind. Und dann, aber wenn man es in die Integration schafft unter diesen Bedingungen, dann bleibt man meistens drinnen. Zumindest in der Grundschule. Bei den Kindern, die ich zuerst genannt habe, wo die Eltern eher einen benachteiligten Hintergrund haben, wo die Kinder, die in die Schule kommen und alle möglichen Strategien haben des Nichtaufpassens und des Störens und so, die kommen dann im Laufe der Schuljahre ...leicht weg. Die nicht visibel behindert sind die kommen in Sonderschulen und der Hauptumstiegspunkt unter Apostroph ist am Ende der Volksschule, wo es zur Sekundarstufe geht. Da kommen dann ganz viele weg." Transcript 1 Austria, Interview with Volker Schönwiese, June 29, 2017, ll. 283-291.

[354] "Zu einem besonders dramatischen Anstieg von SchülerInnen in der Sonderschule kommt es in der 9. Schulstufe." See: Tyrol Monitoring Report, 2015, p. 10.

on merit. In primary school, the German language has priority in school programs, with seven hours (à 45 minutes) a week through all four years, followed by mathematics with four hours, and science with 3 hours. In this system, children whose mother tongue is not German face immense challenges on the way to meet the maturity criteria for entering the AHS/Gymnasium. The 2015 National Education Report Austria states: "Upon differentiation into secondary education, segregation of children with a non-German everyday language rises. While they make up in total 23 percent of students of a grade level, their representation at AHS is with 17 percent below-average and rises at Hauptschule and New Middle School to 22 percent respectively 28 percent (together 25 percent) and in special schools to 30 percent."[355] Furthermore, in Vienna two-thirds of children who attend Hautpschule or NMS speak a non-German language in everyday interactions.[356] A closer look at the social demographics of children who do not excel in primary education shows that migration and social class are significant predictors of success and failure. The 2015 National Education Report Austria states that parental education is the strongest predictor for children's success in mathematics: "The performance of children is best predicted by the education of their parents. Substantial contributors to success are the number of books at home as an indicator of cultural capital, preschool skills, a non-German native language and the socio-economic index."[357] Moreover, it is remarkable how important educational aspirations of parents are for the success in mathematics: "Which type of education parents aspire to for their children is determined by the education that parents themselves achieved."[358] Hence, it is not the effort that children show in school that counts, but the home that they come from. This, the report strongly states, is not an adequate correlation for a democratic society and calls into question

---

[355] "Mit der Differenzierung zur Sekundarstufe I nimmt die Segregation von Kindern mit nichtdeutscher Alltagssprache zwischen den Schularten zu. Während sie insgesamt 23 % der Schüler/innen dieser Schulstufe ausmachen, ist ihr Anteil in den AHS mit 17 % unterdurchschnittlich, steigt in den Hauptschulen und Neuen Mittelschulen auf 22 % bzw. 28 % (zusammen 25 %) und erreicht in den Sonderschulen 30 %." See: Vogtenhuber, Stefan, Lassnigg, Lorenz, Bruneforth, Michael, Edelhofer-Lielacher, Edith and Thilo Siegle (2015): Indicators B: Inputs – Personal and financial resources. In: Bruneforth, Michael et al. (Eds): *National Education Report Austria: The School System Mirrored by Data and Indicators*, Volume 1, pp.37 - 70, pp. 42-44.
[356] "In Wien sprechen zwei Drittel der Schüler/innen der NMS und Hauptschule eine nichtdeutsche Alltagssprache [...]." See: Ibid., p. 44.
[357] "Die Leistung lässt sich am besten durch die Bildung der Eltern vorhersagen. Substanzielle weitere Beiträge liefern die Anzahl der Bücher zu Hause als Indikator für kulturelles Kapital, die vorschulischen Fähigkeiten, nichtdeutsche Muttersprache und der sozio-ökonomische Index." See: Wohlhart, David, Böhm, Jan, Grillitsch, Maria, Oberwimmer, Konrad, Soukup-Alrichter, Katharina and Elisabeth Stanzel-Tischler: Die österreichische Volksschule. Bildungsbericht Österreich 2015, p. 26.
[358] "Welche Bildung Eltern für ihr Kind anstreben, ist vor allem durch die eigene Bildung der Eltern bedingt." Ibid.

the "promise of education," which is that effort, not social class, determines success in school.[359]

Analyses of upward mobility, i.e., exceeding the achieved educational standard of parents, give insight into the school and professional careers of certain social groups. The report of the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), *Education at a Glance*, summarizes that in Austria, 50 percent of 25-to-44-year-old people whose parents were born abroad and did not acquire a secondary-schooling diploma, did not achieve this goal either, surpassing the OECD-average by 13 percent. Those born to native Austrian parents, had much higher chances of achieving a higher educational level than their parents. Only 16 percent did not complete a secondary-school diploma, while the OECD average is 27 percent.[360] The 2012 National Education Report Austria describes clearly the importance of parental background as a predictor of the future of children in Austria and refers to it as "education heredity."[361]

In my interview with Prof. Volker Schönwiese, an education scholar and disability rights activist, I asked whether the Austrian school system was a meritocratic system that valued success. He said it was not and instead spoke of a "Ständesystem[362]":

> *So we have to see that in our school system, social class structures matter, i.e.,*
> *[children] are distributed by social origin and possibilities when it is decided to*
> *leave a person where he or she comes from. This is achieved by an early distribution*
> *that is irrevocable later on. You come from a lower class, and you will always stay*
> *in it. And the other principle would be the meritocratic principle: Let those*
> *rise, even if they come from the underclass, if they are capable. This would be*
> *a more permeable system. This would lead to a permeable comprehensive*
> *school system that follows the logic of performance and the idea of equal*
> *opportunities. Our system is a lot more based on social class than on merit.[363]*

---

[359] "Dieser Befund stellt das Leistungsprinzip als demokratisch und gerecht empfundene Legitimationsfgur für die Erreichung von Bildungsabschlüssen insofern infrage, als weniger die persönlichen Leistungen honoriert werden als die Startchancen, die einem Kind per Geburt zufallen." Ibid, p. 27.

[360] OCED (2016): Austria. In: *Education at a Glance 2016: OECD Indicators*. OECD Publishing, Paris, p. 4, accessed from http://www.keepeek.com/Digital-Asset-Management/oecd/education/education-at-a-glance-2016/austria_eag-2016-42-en, on: Feb. 13, 2018.

[361] "Die Bildungsherkunft wirkt in Österreich so stark, dass in diesem Zusammenhang beinahe von einer Bildungsvererbung gesprochen werden kann, die die soziale Mobilität stark einschränkt." See: Bruneforth, Michael and Lorenz Lassnigg (Eds.): *Nationaler Bildungsbericht Österreich 2012: Das Schulsystem im Spiegel von Daten und Indikatoren*, Band 1, p. 124.

[362] "Stand" can be translated as social class, hence: a system based on social class

[363] "Also wir müssen sehen, dass in unserem Schulsystem ständische Strukturen, d.h. sie teilen nach Herkunft und nach Möglichkeiten bei der Entscheidung, die Personen da zu lassen aus welcher Herkunft sie kommen. [...] eine frühe Zuweisung ist, die später nicht mehr aufhebbar ist. Du kommst aus einer unteren Schicht und wirst es auch immer bleiben. [...] das andere Prinzip, das wäre das meritokratische nach Leistung [...]: die hinauf kommen lassen, auch wenn sie Unterschicht sind, aber wenn sie fähig sind. Das wäre ja ein durchlässigeres System. Das würde ja auch in die Richtung eines durchlässiges Gesamtschulsystem münden [...] Förderung von Leistung eher diesem Prinzip von Chancengleichheit [...] Unser System ist noch viel stärker ständisch als meritokratisch." Transcript 1 Austria, Interview with Volker Schönwiese, June 29, 2017, ll.393- 403.

Roland Astl of the Tyrolian Education Board supported this notion: "In education politics, a central topic in Austria is the type of school for the 10- to 14-year-olds. We have a segmented school system, the two-track system […] But it's about what happens with these two types of schools at the lower secondary level [Gymnasium and NMS] … it has been ideologically the most charged topic in Austria […] for 30 years."[364] The early separation by performance after primary school affects children who neither excel academically nor acquire particularly strong basic knowledge for vocational training. They end up in special schools, at the bottom of the schooling hierarchy.

The Austrian case points to the need to analyze disability at the intersection of various categories that describe disadvantage, such as race, class and gender. The overlapping of descriptors, such as male, migrant and disability, affects children in special schools particularly painfully. Considering gender distribution in special schools, during the 2014-15 school year, 62.4 percent of children educated outside mainstream schooling were male.[365] While boys seem to face alarming discriminatory practices in school, the aforementioned National Action Plan Disability 2012-2020 highlights that women and girls with disabilities are particularly vulnerable to physical and sexual violence, as cognitive impairments or the inability to communicate verbally places them especially at risk.[366] Since people with a migrant background are particularly prone to becoming victims of discrimination and disadvantage in daily and professional life, the National Action Plan Disability 2012-2020 speaks of the risk of threefold discrimination that disabled girls with a migrant background may experience.[367]

5.1.2 The Rocky Path to Integration/Inclusion

Though very close to the border with Italy, where educational inclusion has been practiced since 1977, Tyrol maintained a tradition of spatial separation based on physiological, psychological or cognitive difference in the past. The push for integrative schooling settings was initiated by local pilot projects that led to changes in legislation only in the early 1990s. Volker Schönwiese comments: "We, too, demanded the closing of special

---

[364] "bildungspolitisch in Österreich ist ein zentrales Thema: die Schulform der 10 bis 14-Jährigen. Wir haben da ja ein getrenntes Schulsystem, also zwei also drei Track System [...] es geht darum, was passiert mit diesen beiden Schulformen also Unterstufe und... es ist ideologisch das meist aufgeladene Thema in Österreich ist seit 30 Jahren ist da eine Blockade drinnen." Transcript 2 Austria, Interview with Roland Astl, July 4, 2017, ll. 641-646.

[365] Tirol Monitoring Report, 2015, p. 6.

[366] "Frauen mit Behinderungen werden neben behinderungsspezifischen Belastungen zusätzlich durch geschlechtsspezifische Benachteiligungen belastet (**Mehrfachdiskriminierung**)." National Action Plan Disability 2012-2020, p. 20.

[367] "Behinderte Frauen mit Migrationshintergrund können von einer dreifachen Diskriminierung betroffen sein." See: National Action Plan Disability 2012-2020, p. 23.

schools much earlier but this was considered a total utopia of a few disabled people."[368] Nonetheless, in the 1980s, inspired by the close proximity to the inclusive school system of Italian South Tyrol, parents in Austrian Tyrol started to wonder what might be possible for their children. In the late 1970s, Heinz Forcher founded Vianova, a support group for families with disabled children in the Tyrolian region of Reutte. Vianova initially represented 80 families who were interested in educational alternatives to special schools, institutionalized care and vocational workshops as their children's only option for higher learning. In a biographical account, Forcher remembers that his son, who had suffered brain damage, was recommended to be institutionalized many kilometers away from his family because of his mental and physical impairments.[369] As weekend visits home ended with great emotional distress for father and son,[370] Forcher initiated talks with Norbert Sydrow, principal of the special school of Reutte, who was skeptical about his students' learning progress: "My students repeated year after year the same lessons and rose to the next grade without exhibiting any considerable progress. It happened that eight out of ten children were not verbal. Under such conditions, there was no exchange, no incitement and almost no stimuli."[371]   To understand the practices of institutionalized care facilities during these times, I will briefly discuss research by Brigitte Wanker, Petra Flieger, Volker Schönwiese and Sascha Planggar. Planggar and Schönwiese state that support for people with disabilities in the German-speaking world after 1945 largely followed the pedagogical and charity organizational trends of the prewar years.[372] Wanker's ethnographic descriptions in "Mauern Überall" ("Walls Everywhere") sheds light on daily routines that children at the St. Josefs-Institute in Mils, Tyrol, experienced at the hands of the religious order the Sisters of Mercy in the early 1980s. Children were beaten for not finishing their meals; they had to eat their own vomit; they were forced to take ice-cold showers and punished with confinement in dark

---

[368] "Wir haben damals ja auch schon die Auflösung der Sonderschulen gefordert und solches Zeug, ganz utopisch, ein paar Behinderte fordern die Auflösung der Sonderschulen und so." See: Transcript 1 Austria, Interview with Volker Schönwiese, June 29, 2017, ll. 85-86.

[369] Molitor, Andreas (2008): Sonderschulefreie Zone. In: *brand eins.*, accessed from: https://www.brandeins.de/magazine/brand-eins-wirtschaftsmagazin/2008/bildung/sonderschulfreie-zone, on Feb. 18, 2018.

[370] Ibid.

[371] Huainigg, Franz-Joseph (May 9, 2010): Integration – Die Sonderschule eine Menschenrechtsverletzung? (Integration – The Special School a Human Rights' Violation?). In: *Der Standard*, accessed from http://diepresse.com/home/bildung/universitaet/563981/Integration_Die-Sonderschule-eine-Menschenrechtsverletzung, on Sept. 7, 2017.

[372] Planggar, Sascha, Schönwiese, Volker (2010): Behindertenhilfe – Hilfe für behinderte Menschen? (Work with the Disabled – Helpf for disabled people?) In: Schreiber, Horst (Ed.): *Im Namen der Ordnung. Heimerziehung in Tirol* (In the Name of Order. Residential Education in Tyrol). Innsbruck: Studienverlag, pp. 317-346, p. 328.

rooms.[373] The special school for the severely disabled was affiliated with this institution, which provided no educational stimuli for its students. They sporadically received speech or physical therapy; pedagogical focus was geared toward social, personality and religious education.[374] Wanker writes: "Tied-up children in white hospital beds, leather straps, I hear screams again, unrecognizable sounds. A boy lies in bed wearing a straitjacket because he broke a crucifix in deep despair or wild anger. Each stirring, all deviations or attempts of escape are brutally suppressed. They usually end in straitjackets, with beatings to the face or cold showers."[375] According to Plangger and Schönwiese, the St. Josefs-Institute was founded in 1925 as the House of Care for the Poor and the Cretins. Today, together with the integrated special school, the facility counts as one of the largest institutes for people with disabilities in Tyrol. When St. Josef received broad criticism for its abusive practices in the 1980s, the provincial government, the Roman Catholic Church, the religious order and the media attacked the whistle-blowers and defended the Sisters of Mercy.[376] The all-boys home St. Josef in Tyrol can be mentioned as an institute that exposed similar spatial continuities. This "Bubenburg" (Boys' Castle), founded in 1889 as a school for children who needed special attention, was confiscated by the Nazis and turned into a Gauerziehungsheim (Children's home run by National Socialists in the spirit of NS ideology) in 1939. Since 1946 it has served as a boys' care home.[377] In 1982, Capuchin Pater Magnus Kerner, the head of the boys' home St. Josef, received decorations of honor for his social work from the city of Innsbruck, but he was stripped of them in 2013 when historians provided proof of the violent pedagogical methods he had employed.[378] Heinz Forcher's fear of institutionalizing his son resonated with Plangger and Schönwiese's observations that many families dreaded

---

[373] Wanker, Brigitte (1982): Mauern überall. In: Forster, Rudolpf, Schönwiese, Volker (Eds.): *BEHINDERTENALLTAG – wie man behindert wird* (Everyday life of the disabled – how one becomes disabled). Wien: Jugend und Volk, pp. 21-34, p. 22-25.

[374] Ibid., p. 24.

[375] Ibid., p. 6.

[376] Plangger, Sascha, Schönwiese, Volker (2010): Behindertenhilfe – Hilfe für behinderte Menschen? (Work with the Disabled – Helpf for disabled people?) In: Schreiber, Horst (Ed.): *Im Namen der Ordnung. Heimerziehung in Tirol* (In the Name of Order. Residential Education in Tyrol). Innsbruck: Studienverlag, pp. 317-346, Plangger and Schönwiese 2010, p. 322.

[377] Universität Innsbruck: Heime in Tyrol und Voralberg (Residential Homes in Tyrol and Voralberg), accessed from https://www.uibk.ac.at/iezw/heimgeschichteforschung/heime-in-tirol-und-vorarlberg/bubenburg.html, Dec. 1, 2018.

[378] Flieger and Schönwiese (2014): Behindertenheime – Die Stiefkinder der Aufarbeitung von Missbrauch und Gewalt/ Homes for the Disabled – The Step children of Reappraisal of Abuse and Violence. In: Jarosch, Monika et al. (Eds.): *Gegenstimmen* (Counter Voices). Innsbruck: Studienverlag, pp. 144-150, accessed from bidok, on Dec. 1, 2018, p. 8.

permanent separation from their children in care wards, which were still "connected with euthanasia programs and the image of mere care and detention wards."[379]

Eventually parent initiatives started pushing for inclusive schooling programs. In 1984, the first inclusive school pilot project started in Tyrol. Over the course of twelve years, special school principal Norbert Sydrow did not admit new students to his school so that the regular school of Reutte could gradually build an integrated learning community. Volker Schönwiese remembers the many decision-makers who had to be convinced that the integrative school was an option worth pursuing by the district: "The parents wanted this, the special school principal wanted it, the school inspector was not against it, and the doctor of the children's clinic in Reutte was in favor of this effort. Because of this alignment, the district decided to support the effort."[380] The inclusive schooling project in Tyrol, however, was an exception in Austria. In districts where civil initiatives were missing, integration was not an option for children with disabilities. Schönwiese summarizes: "In other districts there was practically no integration at all because individuals who fought for it were missing and the representatives of the special schools were powerful. Legislation that would allow parents to choose [the educational path] for their children came later, although counseling remained with the special schools."[381] The success in Tyrol eventually stimulated similar initiatives in Styria and Graz. A legal basis for these pilot projects was established only through the 11th law amendment concerning school organization in 1988. Until then, these unique project schools, according to Schönwiese, were operating on the verge of legality. In 1992, Austria's Federal Government released the Disabled Concept, which acknowledged the new insights and successes of the schooling pilot projects. The Disabled Concept called into doubt whether the education of a child with a disability always needed to take place in special facilities: "Historically, the establishment of the special school was undoubtedly a significant progress. This way, the right to education of disabled children was recognized and isolation as well as social exclusion was mitigated. However, the special school has a number of severe

---

[379] Johannes Schädler, Paradigmenwechsel in der Behindertenhilfe unter Bedingungen institutioneller Beharrlichkeit: Strukturelle Voraussetzungen der Implementation Offener Hilfen für Menschen mit geistiger Behinderung/ Paradigmatic change in care for the disabled under conditions of institutional perseverance: Structural prerequisites of implementing open help for people with cognitive disabilities. Dissertation, Universität Siegen 2002.

[380] "Dazu gehört, dass die Eltern das wollten, der Sonderschuldirektor dort wollte es, der Schulinspektor war nicht dagegen und der Primararzt der Kinderklinik in Reutte war dafür. Aus der Konstellation heraus ist es in diesem Bezirk gekippt." Transcript 1 Austria, Interview with Volker Schönwiese, June 29, 2017, ll. 109-111.

[381] "[...] in anderen Bezirken war praktisch überhaupt keine Integration, weil auch die Einzelpersonen gefehlt haben, die dafür gekämpft haben und die Vertreter der Sonderschulen usw. mächtig waren. Die Gesetzgebung ist erst später gekommen, dass dann über die Wahlfreiheit der Eltern aber mit der Einschränküng, dass die Beratung an den Sonderschulen bleibt." See: Transcript 1, Interview with Volker Schönwiese, ll. 117-120

disadvantages."[382] The Disabled Concept highlighted that "because of its great distance from home, children were forced to live in boarding schools and had to leave their social environments."[383] Furthermore, the Disabled Concept was critical: "The permeability between special schools and regular schools is often very low. Therefore, the label of 'special student' is attached, which is connected in our meritocracy to weak opportunities on the job market and social discrimination."[384] The document also stressed that special schools and regular schools should aim to enhance the potential of the child, not focus on his or her deficiencies, as special schools were prone to do.[385] Lastly, the Concept recommended integration into regular schools "whenever it is possible"[386] and stated that the Federal Republic of Austria "aimed at replacing mandatory education of children with disabilities in special schools with special educational support."[387] Nonetheless, the Disabled Concept also declared clearly that "an individual right to school integration does not exist."[388] In 1993, parents pushed for a new law that would grant this individual right to integrational schooling. Their initiative "Law Instead of Mercy" ("Gesetz statt Gnade") criticized families' continuing dependence on the mercy of regional decision-makers who decided whether their child could be taught inclusively. The parliamentary hearing of the 15th School Organization Law Novella was accompanied by a silent vigil of parents and supporters of disability rights. Massive pressure against this law was mobilized by the teachers' union, which called on the Austrian People's Party (ÖVP) for support. The union wanted to keep the decision-making power with the special schools instead of an independent pedagogical center. Pedagogical counselling in independent centers would have significantly reduced the influence of special schools on the educational paths of children in Austria. A week before the policy negotiations came to the final ratification stage, the ÖVP intervened and said it would withdraw support for the law unless pedagogical counseling fell under the sovereignty of special schools. Hence, Schönwiese summarizes: "[…] who would receive the label 'special needs status' and which

---

[382] "Historisch gesehen war die Einführung der Sonderschule zweifellos ein wichtiger Fortschritt. Das Recht behinderter Kinder auf Bildung und Erziehung wurde damit allgemein anerkannt und die herrschende Isolierung und soziale Ausgrenzung behinderter Menschen gemildert. Die Sonderschule hat jedoch eine Reihe von gravierenden Nachteilen [...]" See: Disabiled Concept of the Austrian Federal Republic, 1992, p. 22

[383] "Durch die größere Entfernung zum Wohnort sind die Kinder häufig gezwungen, in Schülerheimen zu wohnen, und müssen ihr soziales Umfeld verlassen." See: Disabled Concept of the Austrian Federal Republic, 1992, p. 22

[384] "Die Durchlässigkeit zwischen Sonderschulen und allgemeinen Schulen ist oft sehr gering. Dadurch bleibt die Etikettierung ‚Sonderschüler' bestehen, das in unserer Leistungsgesellschaft mit schlechten Berufschancen und sozialer Diskriminierung verbunden ist." See: Disabled Concept of the Austrian Federal Republic, 1992, p. 22

[385] Ibid., p. 22

[386] "Wo nur immer möglich, sollte jedoch die schulische Integration behinderter Kinder gefördert und vorgezogen werden." Disabled Concept, p. 22

[387] "Die Regierung beabsichtigt daher: den verpflichtenden Sonderschulbesuch durch ein Sonderschulangebot zu ersetzen." Disabled Concept, p. 25

[388] "Ein individuelles Recht auf schulische Integration besteht daher nicht." See: Disabled Concept, p. 24

[educational choice] would be recommended to parents remained in the hands of the special school."[389] Nonetheless, when the law was finally passed, it provided the legal basis for pilot projects in integrative schooling and gave parents the right to choose special or regular schooling for their children.[390] The 1993 legislation started "battles within the Austrian education system," according to Schönwiese, "and Tyrol was still so torn that official politics and the special schools were, of course, entirely against integration. A culture of confrontation developed that has not ended yet."[391] The impact of the laws passed in the mid-1990s can hardly be underappreciated, since "[…] the effort over integration is the only point that has attacked the class/meritocratic system and achieved some kind of legal effect. […] The battle over inclusion is the single school policy impetus that we have had in Austria that truly works at the roots of the educational mission,"[392] Schönwiese states. In other words, no other schooling reform has truly affected the principle of selection via meritocracy. It is the push for integration that has called the logic of the differentiated school system into question.

5.1.3 Excesses of the Double System

Despite the steps that have been taken toward inclusive schooling, the UN monitoring report released in 2013 points out that Tyrol is the weakest county in Austria when it comes to successful implementation of the requirements of the UN-CRPD. The UN committee "notices with concern reports suggesting that the number of children in special schools is on the increase and that insufficient effort has been made to support the inclusive education of children with disabilities."[393] On the basis of this report, the Tyrolian Monitoring Committee, a regional monitoring branch for the implementation of the UN-CRPD, published a commentary that tied this criticism specifically to the Tyrolian context. The authors summarize:

---

[389] „[...] wer kriegt das Etikett spnderpädagogischer Förderbedarf und was sagt man den Eltern, was für sie gut ist, blieb in der Hand der Sonderschule." See: Transcript 1 Austria, Interview with Volker Schönwiese, June 29, 2017, ll.127-129

[390] 15SchOG Novella, §8a, p. 3822

[391] "Dann haben die ganzen Kämpfe im österreichischen Schulsystem begonnen und Tirol war immernoch so in dieser Spaltung drinnen, dass die offizielle Politik und auch die Sonderschulen selbstverständlich vollständig gegen die Integration waren. Und sich so eine Auseinandersetzungskultur auch entwickelt hat, die bis jetzt nicht zu Ende ist." See: Transcript 1 Austria, Interview with Volker Schönwiese, June 29, 2017, ll. 101-104

[392] "[...] das Bemühen um Integration [...] ist der einzige Punkt, die dieses ständische/meritokratische System angreift und eine bestimmte gesetzliche Wirksamkeit erreicht hat. [...] Der Kampf um Inklusion ist der einzige schulpolitische Impetus, den wir in Österreich haben, der tatsächlich an den Wurzeln des Bildungsauftrags arbeitet." See: Transcript 1 Austria, Interview with Volker Schönwiese, June 29, 2017, l. 412-413

[393] The Monitoring Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities: Concluding Observations on the Initial Report of Austria adopted by the Committee at its Tenth Session 2-13 September, 2013, accessed from https://www.sozialministerium.at/cms/site/attachments/6/1/8/CH3434/CMS1450780852436/crpd_list_of_issues.pdf, on Dec. 6 2018, p. 6.

[...] from school year to school year the number of students of a specific cohort, who receive a special-needs status, rises. Where there were 181 students with a special-needs status in the first grade all across Tyrol, in seventh grade, 323 children received this status. This is a considerable increase. [...] The data also show that special schools take in more and more students. Whereas, in the first grade of a cohort, there are 98 students who attend a special school, in seventh grade, it is 143. It can be said that the regular school shows a push-out effect and the special school a pull-in effect. Keeping in mind the right to inclusive education manifested in the UN-CRPD, this mechanism needs to be recognized as highly problematic.[394]

The paradoxical situation characterized by the rising number of children with special needs and disabilities educated in mainstream education and in special facilities, is referred to as the double system. Schönwiese explains: "Percentagewise there are as many children in special schools as there were in the beginning of the 1990s, and in additional we have integration classes. This is the doubling of the system that developed from the school choice of parents plus obligatory counseling provided by the special school."[395] Since the policies of the 1990s did not remove pedagogical counseling of children with disabilities from the authority of special schools, those children's educational path was substantially shaped by advice from representatives of the special school. Placing counseling in the hands of independent pedagogical centers would mean the following, according to Schönwiese:

The special-needs status is not as automatically linked to the demand of the special schools anymore. The special-school principals are employed at special schools where one does not have many children. That now somebody would say, "I will give these kids to the regular school, where I will accompany the teachers and show them how to work with the child, although I would need this child at my own school so it is not closed and I can stay a principal," is – you know? This is a powerful set-up that oftentimes ignores professional evaluation but turns into machinery of ascribing the special-needs status and attendance at special schools."[396]

---

[394] "[...] von Jahr zu Jahr die Anzahl der SchülerInnen, denen ein SPF zuerkannt wird, ansteigt: Im beobachteten Jahrgang gab es auf der ersten Schulstufe tirolweit 181 SchülerInnen mit SPF, in der siebten Schulstufe waren es bereits 323. Diese Steigerung ist beachtlich. Dabei fällt auf, dass der Anstieg im dritten und vierten Schuljahr besonders stark ist. Auch in der *Sekundarstufe 1* steigt die Anzahl von SchülerInnen mit SPF kontinuierlich. Dabei bleibt der Anteil von SchülerInnen mit erhöhtem Förderbedarf in der Integration/Inklusion in der Volksschule relativ konstant, ab der fünften Schulstufe nimmt die Anzahl der SchülerInnen mit erhöhtem FB in der Regelschule deutlich ab. Wahrscheinlich wechseln sie in die Sonderschule. Die Daten zeigen außerdem, dass die Sonderschulen immer mehr SchülerInnen eines Jahrgangs aufnehmen: Auf der ersten Schulstufe des beobachteten Jahrgang besuchen 98 SchülerInnen eine Sonderschule, in der siebten Schulstufe waren es 143. Es zeigt sich, dass einerseits die Regelschule eine Aussonderungsund andererseits die Sonderschule eine Sogwirkung hat. Im Sinne des in der UNBRK verankerten Rechts auf *inklusive Bildung* ist dieser Mechanismus als hochproblematisch einzuschätzen." Tyrol Monitoring Committee for the Implementation of the UN Convention on the Rights of People with Disabilities (2015): Opinion on Inclusive Education in Tyrol, p. 9
[395] "Es sind wieder prozentual genauso viele Kinder in den Sonderschulen wie Anfang der 90er Jahre und zusätzlich haben wir die Integrationsklassen. Das ist die Verdopplung des Systems, das entstanden ist durch die Wahlfreiheit der Eltern plus Beratungszwang durch die Sonderschulen selbst." Transcript 1 Austria, Interview with Volker Schönwiese, June 29, 2017, ll. 132-135
[396] "Sonderpädagogischer Förderbedarf, nicht mehr so automatisch an den Bedürfnissen der Sonderschulen orientiert. Jetzt sind die Sonderschuldirektoren und die SBZ Leiter keine bösen Leute, aber sie sind angestellt an einer Sonderschule, wo man eine Freistellung hat, weil man SBZ Leiter ist und weil man sonst so viele Kinder

Recognizing that the numbers of children with a special-needs status had considerably risen in recent years all across Austria – a fact that could not be explained with comparable national or international data on disability – the federal government issued a statement on April 20, 2017. The statement outlined conditions under which a special-needs status would not be granted:

> *insufficient school performances without the characteristics of a disability do not legitimate a special-needs status [...]; the special-needs status is also not given to pupils with different first languages who have not been diagnosed with psychological or physical disabilities [...]; students with contemporary learning difficulties and learning weaknesses, behavior problems and speech impairments have a specific pedagogical need, but without a diagnosis of an additional psychological or physical disability, §8 Compulsory Education Act is not applied.*[397]

Nonetheless, the double system continues to be a phenomenon that is politically supported by the Tyrolian branch of the ÖVP – for example, as stated in its recent agenda paper titled Tyrol Plan: "We strive to increase integration numbers, but we will not entirely abandon special pedagogical centers."[398] The 2015 party program reads: "We stand for the merit principle and for a differentiated school system that caters to the different talents and interests of children. Therefore, we acknowledge the Gymnasium and all other types of schools of a differentiated school system and support further school autonomy."[399] In the Austrian parliamentary elections on Oct. 15, 2017, the ÖVP achieved a thin majority of votes, and the party is now involved in a coalition with the FPÖ, the far-right Freedom party founded in 1956 by former Nazis, including Anton Reinthaller, a member of the SS.[400] The FPÖ is a strong supporter of

---

hat. Jetzt zu sagen, geb dein Kind in die Regelschule, ich begleite die Lehrer wie sie es machen können, wenn ich weiß, ich brauche das Kind, damit die Schule hier voll bleibt, damit ich weiter freigestellter Direktor bin. Nicht zu unterrichten muss, ja? Die Kraft dieser Konstellation überwindet manches fachliche Bemühen und manche subjektive Freundlichkeit, sondern wird zur institutionalisierten Maschinerie der Zuschreibung SPF und Sonderschule." See Transcript 1 Austria, Interview with Volker Schönwiese, June 29, 2017, ll. 141-149

[397] "Ungenügende Schulleistungen ohne das Bestimmungsmerkmal der Behinderung begründen keinen sonderpädagogischen Förderbedarf [...]; der sonderpädagogische Förderbedarf ist auch nicht auf Schülerinnen und Schüler mit anderen Erstsprachen, bei denen keine diagnostizierte psychische oder physische Behinderung vorliegt, anzuwenden. [...]Schülerinnen und Schüler mit vorübergehenden Lernschwierigkeiten und Lernschwächen, Verhaltensauffälligkeiten und Sprachstörungen haben einen besonderen Förderbedarf, ohne Diagnose einer zusätzlichen psychischen oder physischen Behinderung ist § 8 des Schulpflichtgesetzes jedoch nicht anzuwenden. " See: Bundesministerium für Bildung: Richtlinien für Differenzierungs- und Steuerungsmaßnahmen im Zusammenhang mit der Feststellung des sonderpädagogischen Förderbedarfs (SPF), p. 4, accessed from http://www.cisonline.at/fileadmin/kategorien/RS_23-2016_SPF.pdf, on Oct. 25, 2017.

[398]"Integration und Sonderpädagogik: Wir streben eine Erhöhung des Integrationsanteils an, werden aber auf Sonderpädagogische Zentren nicht gänzlich verzichten können." (Der Tirol Plan, 2013, p. 16)

[399] "Wir bekennen uns zum Leistungsprinzip und zu einem differenzierten Schulsystem, das den unterschiedlichen Talenten und Interessen der Kinder gerecht wird. Daher bekennen wir uns auch zum Gymnasium und allen anderen Schularten in einem differenzierten Schulwesen und setzen uns für die Erweiterung der Schulautonomie ein." (Grundsatzprogramm der Österreichischen Volkspartei, 2015, p. 38)

[400] Oltermann, Philip: Austria's far-right Freedom party invited to enter coalition talks (Oct. 24, 2017). *The Guardian*: accessed from https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/oct/24/austrias-far-right-reedom-party-invited-to-enter-coalition-talks-sebastian-kurz-ovp-fpo-europe, on Oct. 25, 2017.

the special-school system. Its party program states: "Schools and education must take account of the diverse abilities and interests of people, match this diversity and abstain from all forms of ideological paternalism."[401] The FPÖ position opposes the recent goals of the National Action Plan Disability 2012-2020, which seeks to gradually decrease admission to special schools.

5.1.4 Summary

My ethnographic data analysis is informed by the policy analysis above. First, I would like to emphasize the term *education heredity,* which the 2012 *National Education Report Austria* used to describe the correlation between student performance and academic background of the student's household. No other factor determines school success as much as the professional background of the family into which a child is born. While educational success seems to be reserved for an exclusive group of native Austrian German-speakers with high socio-economic status, the numbers of students with a special educational needs status have doubled since integrative schooling started in the 1990s. This fact has been noted with criticism by the Austrian Federal Ministry for Education, which responded by issuing a statement prohibiting the awarding of special educational needs status on the grounds of insufficient German language skills. Taking away authority from special schools by placing the judgment of special educational needs status in the hands of independent counseling centers has been a significant step toward limiting the conflicts of interest that arise when special schools are in charge of regulating their own student populations. Considering that more students whose mother tongue is Turkish or Bosnian/Serbian/Croatian currently attend special schools than mainstream facilities, this has been a crucial step. Therefore, in my discourse analysis, practices of *belonging* take up particular attention. Austrian school officials have shown awareness of the particular vulnerability to which individuals who exhibit a disability as well as a migrant background are exposed. The 2012 National Education Report Austria highlights the risk of *triple-fold discrimination* that non-native German-speakers who are female and hearing-impaired are likely to experience in Austria.

5.2 "Out There": The Republic at the Edge of the City[402]
On a Friday morning in late March 2017, I took the bus from the city center. The bustling town life amidst beautiful old buildings, grandiose churches, luxury boutiques, cafés and restaurants with a picturesque view of the Alps vanished after a few turns and some longer

---

[401] FPÖ party program, accessed from https://www.fpoe.at/themen/parteiprogramm/parteiprogramm-englisch/, on Sept. 5, 2017.
[402] The title is inspired by a newspaper article on the area.

stretches of country road. Later in my conversations, members of the local school board and colleagues would refer to my research site as the school "da draußen"– "out there." What at first seemed a spatial descriptor to simply locate the school may have been in fact much more a way of indicating a social difference between the people who lived "here" in the city center and the people "there," on the city periphery. When the bus crossed the river, the cityscape changed drastically. No more entertainment or leisure spaces; multi-story houses greeted the arrivals. "There" was where mothers wearing a hijab with strollers and small children got off, and foreign languages reached my ear. Within minutes I stood inside a miniature town of block buildings, urban canyons granted a peek at the Alps only from time to time. Whereas the catchment area of this school's district was considered the most deprived in Tyrol, housing prices in the villages on the other side of the river, close to the mountains, were among the highest in all of Austria. The apartment towers surrounding my research site had been built as accommodations for the athletes who took part in an international sporting event in the area some decades ago. When the champions left, new tenants were needed to fill the neighborhood, which was never built to function as a community but simply as a human storage unit. "Before the migrants moved into the block buildings, this area was inhabited by the Austrian underclass," a local told me. The loud noise from construction work pierced my ears. Through a maze of barriers and scaffolds that protected pedestrians from road construction, I followed the children, who were used to this labyrinth through which they reached their school. A student from a neighboring high school helped the kids cross the road safely. Because of the construction barriers, drivers had trouble seeing the first graders approaching the street crossing, yet they passed by at regular speed. Since I still had time to explore the area before my appointment with the principal, I strolled through the main street, along which the housing blocks speared the sky. Instead of a coffee place or a supermarket, I encountered a betting office and one or two closed bars. I wondered where teachers bought their lunches and where they met over coffee to discuss matters outside the staff room. Nothing "out there," it seemed, invited the visitor to stay.

5.2.1 The Republic's School

When I reached the school building, morning break was about to end. On a green lawn with a couple of play structures, fenced off from the street, the children were engaged in play and clamor. A group of teachers stood at the top of a flight of stairs, guarding the passageway from yard to school building. They chatted and watched over the children playing. One of them took out a golden bell and rang it loudly. The children in the bustling schoolyard quickly lined up in pairs and met their teachers; one line after the other marched up the stairs into the

school building as their teachers constantly reminded them to be quiet. In the meantime I made my way into the building through the main entrance where a "Willkommen" sign, in colorful letters and translated into many different languages, greeted me. The flat-roofed two-story building was unique among the skyscrapers. Classrooms for first and second graders were downstairs, while the older kids, grade three and four, climbed the stairs to their second-floor classrooms. Looking at the groups of children passing me, I understood that a great diversity of children attended this school. According to information that I obtained later, the 240 children attending the school were of 14 different nationalities, 70 percent of migrant backgrounds. In addition to German, language classes were offered in Bosnian, Serbian, Croatian and Turkish. German was encouraged as the classroom language throughout the regular school day, and among children in their leisure time on the school premises. Religion class was offered for at least six different orientations at the time I conducted research at this school. As soon as there were more than four children of the same denomination, they had the right to their own religion class. Children could choose between Roman Catholic, Greek Orthodox, Protestant, Free Church, Islam and a branch of Islam, called Alevi. The principal considered this situation problematic as we sat in her office discussing the purpose and the length of my research stay. To her, school and religion were too closely entwined. She preferred that religious education become a private matter children integrated into their afternoon activities so that religious classes would not take up time in the regular schooling schedule. When I asked for her opinion on inclusive education of children with special needs in mainstream education, she responded that she had been working with multiculturalism for over 20 years. Children with special needs, she replied, should attend schools that take care of these needs. We agreed that my research stay would begin the following Thursday.

5.2.2 "These are their roots, but their Heimat [home] is here now."[403]
On the day I started my ethnographic research, the principal walked me to a classroom where she informed the teacher greeting incoming pupils that I would be their guest for some time. My classroom observations took place in a fourth grade class, which I will call 4x, taught by two women in their 30s who shared all curriculum subjects. Since both teachers had small children, they worked part time sharing one full position. One took the morning, while the other taught the later lessons; the next day, they switched. Class 4x consisted of four boys and 15 girls. No one had an official special-needs status, but six received Besonderer Förderunterricht (BFU), additional lessons in German during the regular school day. A

---

[403] Transcript 6 Austria, Interview with Teacher B, May 2, 2017, ll. 217-218

designated BFU teacher would enter the classroom and collect her group for extra German in the school basement. In the following section, I include my field notes written from participant observations and analytical memos, which illustrate the first day I researched classroom interactions and teaching practices in 4x.

Thursday, March 23, 2017

After briefly introducing myself to the teacher, I sit down on a little chair at the back of the classroom. There are just a few minutes left until the lesson starts; the principal approaches a girl with African features. Her hair is braided tightly around her head. She strokes the girl's head, takes her pigtail in her hands and feels the ends of the braids. Then she looks into her face and asks whether the braids don't hurt her head. The girl says no. The bell rings and the principal leaves the classroom.

On this Thursday morning, the lesson begins with writing a math test. Here and there children ask me who I am. I do not explain anything about myself yet. I wait for the teacher to introduce me to the group. I smile, make eye contact with the children and nod encouragingly. The girl with the braided hair turns around to look at me. She is interested in who I am and whispers: "Wer sind Sie?" ("Who are you?") While the teacher hands out exams, I remain anonymous in the back of the class. As the children start to write, my gaze wandered and above the blackboard, just as in Poland, I spot a wooden cross to which a miniature Jesus is nailed. On the blackboard, the date is written in German. In the right hand corner of the classroom next to the blackboard is a sink. A laminated piece of paper, which tells the date in English, is stuck to the tiles. In the "computer corner," which earns its title from two desks with PCs that have internet access, I sit and discover more sentences in English, for example: "Educating the mind without educating the heart is no education at all." Or: "Before you speak, THINK. T – is it true?, H – is it helpful?, I – is it inspiring?, N – is it necessary?, K – is it kind?" From the spot where I sit I can also read the classroom rules, which are pinned to the board that hangs next to the entrance door:

"In our class…
- "we listen attentively to one another.
-"we are polite, helpful and a great role model."
-"everyone should feel comfortable and well."
-"everyone is warmly welcome."
-"we carefully handle all material."
-"we learn from our mistakes and never laugh at someone."
-"we show [raise our hand] if we want to say something."

From the classroom rules my eyes wander to a basket right next to the entry door, which the children filled with their mobile phones. Time passes slowly as the children are hunched over their desks, trying to think of answers to the math exam. My eyes are caught by the book corner, where I discover the "Knickerboxer Bande" by Thomas Brezina, a book series in which four children, Axel, Liselotte, Dominik and Poppi, solve riddles and reveal secrets. Ten minutes before the lesson ends, one girl finishes her exam and hands in her paper. She gets up from her seat and goes to the reading corner to take out one of the books. The teacher tells the class: "Whoever has finished the exam takes out a magazine and reads it." The girl puts the book back on the shelf, turns around and retreats to her seat, where she takes out a magazine and starts flipping pages.

More and more children hand in their work. One boy turns around to talk to his neighbor, just as other kids have started to do. However, a girl shouts: "Tim, be quiet!" Immediately the teacher tells the boy to leave the classroom and stand in front of the door. I am surprised. I did not hear or see him do anything that others did not do, but he has to leave. Tim gets up. He shuts the door behind him with a loud bang. This is only the first lesson of the day, I think to myself.

Time is up – all exams need to be handed in. One girl buries her face in her elbow and cries. Tim is brought back into the class. The teacher asks me to read out of a book to the class in English. It is "The Badly Tempered Ladybird" by Eric Carle. The children listen, but after some time, boredom catches on. I think about an earlier conversation in which I learnt that Susi, the girl with the braided hair, and Ella speak an African dialect of English at home. Some children start teasing Tim, shouting: "At least I don't have a 5 on my report card!" Under his breath Tim mutters back: "Shut your face!" ("Halt die Schnauze!").

During recess, the children play outside on the lawn. I sit on a wooden bench in front of the teachers' office. From here I can observe the teachers who stand at the top of the stairs and guard the passage between schoolyard and building. I wonder where the other teachers who do not have to surveille the schoolyard activities spend their break. I sit on a wooden bench next to the coffee machine, from which I have a good view of the foyer and the children heading out to the school yard. The bell rings, and class 4x walks past me up the stairs to the classroom. I follow them. On the way Susi wipes tears off her cheeks and swears softly. Ceren says to me: "Susi is bullied…because her family is brown, you know?"

The next lesson starts. The German support teacher comes in and reads out the names of six girls. They have to follow her to do extra German, BFU classes. The girls protest, but the German teacher raises her voice and says she doesn't want to hear any arguing. The girls leave the room. The rest of the class is learning about the Middle Ages. After an hour the girls return. Susi complains that it was boring for her to practice personal pronouns. While she studied German grammar, the rest of the class was exposed to complex German words and concepts, such as Verwaltung (administration) and life at the medieval court.

One child asks about a different class test and whether they will be getting the results back today. The teacher says yes, but only at the end of the school day because then she will not have to see them for much longer. Earlier, she told me that the exam had brought very bad results and that there would be many tears.

The lesson continues with sentences on the board. The children need to determine the subject, object, etc. of the sentence. The teacher announces that sentences from the board are to be copied into notebooks, always leaving one line blank before the next line is covered with writing so the children can underline the different sentence parts and determine their cases. She shouts when she sees children underline sentence parts with wavy lines and not with the help of a ruler. One child protests against the teacher. Later, she says, when the kids have jobs and the boss gives them a task, they will also have to fulfill orders, so they need to start obeying now. "Opposing the teacher will always get you in trouble," she adds.

We have moved on to geography class. The teacher asks me about Austrian stereotypes that I, as a German, hold about the Tyrol area. I talk about cows, the mountains, snow and folk music. The children are supposed to show districts and cities on a big map of Tyrol. Only occasionally does a child find what s/he was asked for. The teacher says it is unbelievable that the students still cannot read the map. They have practiced Tyrolian geography for such a long time. She continues that in this class, there are only two girls whose parents are both from Austria. The arms of the two girls in the middle front row shoot up to indicate that she

137

means them. The teacher points out another girl who has one parent of Austrian origin, and the rest, she summarizes, are from somewhere else: "So we are a colorful pile," she says ("Ein bunter Haufen"). The teacher searches on the internet for a song called "Das Kufsteinlied" by Franzl Lang.[404] *In the roughly three-minute track from 1984, in Tyrolian dialect, a singer extols the beauty of Kufstein, a town nearby, the women and the wine. We watch the YouTube video three times in a row. As a follow-up activity, the class talks about yodeln. Fahiva enthusiastically imitates the sound for me.*

The teacher hands back the tests. Most of the girls are crying. Tim punches his bare fist against the classroom wall and sits back down. A few minutes later, he gets up again and punches the wall once more. The children try to calm one another. Boys bring paper napkins to some of the girls who are crying. The girl who covered her face in her elbow to cry after the math exam in the morning is once more in tears. She says "I mog nie mehr leben" – "I don't want to live anymore."

5.2.2.1 Performing: Classroom Rules vs. Classroom Behavior

Except for sporting events, all lessons I observed in class 4x took place in the classroom on the school's second floor. The children's coats hung from a row of hooks outside the classroom; pupils' pictures and artwork decorated the door. Inside, artifacts defined favorable behavior, such as classroom rules for being a good student, books for practicing reading, computers for doing research, a sink for washing hands, a crucifix for believing in Jesus Christ. Classroom space was socially constructed, stressing some values and muting others. For example, English seemed to be encouraged, since dates and certain phrases were presented to the children in English. On the other hand, speaking mother tongues other than German on the school premises was not encouraged, except when pupils attended lessons in Turkish or Bosnian/Croatian/Serbian at the end of the school day on Fridays; extra German classes were confined to a classroom in the basement of the school. Upon entering the classroom, the pupils carried out a number of rituals: shoes had to be taken off outside the classroom and exchanged for slippers; mobile phones were switched off and stored in a basket by the classroom door; work books containing students' homework were placed on the teacher's table. The center of the room was occupied by pupils sitting in pairs along three rows. In the front of the room, the crucifix, blackboard and sink; the play area in the back was divided into areas of carpet, pillows and books, as well as two desks with computers. The windows to the pupils' left let in light. On the right side, shelves stored teaching materials. Thus, student activity was framed on four sides, and teachers could move around freely, while pupils had to wait for permission to go to the spaces organized to serve their learning. During classroom observations, I was interested in the way that artifacts related to the practices

---

[404] Lang, Franzl (1983): Kufstein Lied, GMC Volkstümlicher Schlager, accessed from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=o0BRaUllRII, on August 2017.

within the classroom. However, my field notes and analytical memos pointed to a discrepancy that I first noticed on day one of ethnographic work with 4x.

Classroom rules decorating the walls, such as "In our class, everyone should feel comfortable and well," or "We learn from our mistakes and never laugh at someone" differed greatly from the performance of these rules by teachers and students. Tim repeatedly became the victim as well as the perpetrator of bullying during several incidents I observed. A few days after the school day described above, I witnessed Leonie yelling through the class: "If you stabbed Tim with a knife, you wouldn't even get to his heart because he is so fat." While Tim remained calm in this moment, in a fight with Susi on a different day of sports competitions, he grabbed her by her braids, pulled her down and kicked her torso several times. When Susi and I sat down on a bench afterward, she did not tell me what had caused the fight. Her friend Ceren asked: "Did he say it? Oh no, did he call you a black …?" Susi and Tim had played together peacefully in between waits for the next sports challenge. When he called her by a racial slur, she punched him, causing a full-blown physical attack by Tim. Susi's skin color, braids and African origins were exoticized and regularly triggered discrimination and bullying. When I asked the principal why verbal and physical abuse took place between kids at her school, she explained:

> *I think it is because of the media, the digitalized world, because children grow up without empathy. They constantly have the impression that they can hurt somebody, punch them to the ground, and that this will not have an impact at all – they will get up and feel nothing anyway. Children cannot put themselves in the shoes of others anymore.*[405]

In contrast, in my field notes I depicted moments when children did show deep caring for each other when they saw that their classmates felt sadness and pain over receiving a bad mark. The teachers of 4x gave different reasons for their pupils' aggressive verbal and physical behavior. "Since we have so many different cultural backgrounds, dealing with problems is different, too" Teacher B explained. "There are children who at home are allowed to do everything, but when they reach a certain limit, they feel this limit physically. And this is what they learn."[406] Therefore, dealing with one another without violence was a problem

---

[405] "Ich glaube das hängt sehr viel zusammen mit, was viele nicht mehr mitkriegen also durch da sind wieder die Medien schuld, diese digitalisierte Welt, weil die Kinder empathielos aufwachsen, ja durch diesen Input, den sie ständig kriegen, also ich kann jemanden verletzen, niederschlagen, er steht wieder auf, spürt eh nichts und die Kinder können sich nicht mehr in jemanden anderen hineinversetzten." Transcript 8 Austria, Interview with Director, July 4, 2017, ll. 453-457

[406] "Dadurch, dass es so viele unterschiedliche kulturelle Hintergründe gibt, ist auch der Umgang mit Problemen ein anderer. Also es gibt Kinder, die wirklich alles dürfen zuhause, aber wenn eine gewisse Grenze erreicht, sie

she faced with her pupils, especially in the beginning. She described the catchment area for the school as "rather underclass and many unemployed parents, distanced from education, simply people with a migration background. In some cases parents are illiterate."[407] According to Teacher B, two families in the class were supported by social workers from the Youth Welfare Services, a government institution that helps children who "need to grapple with the divorce of parents, protects children who are at risk of physical and sexual violence as well as deprivation […]."[408] Teacher B illustrated:

> *Two children are cared for with the Youth Welfare Services and yes, with good results. Because of the cultural background some have, parents also need to learn how to deal with problems in our culture. Yes, this works very well. Families are glad about extra help. This is not a punishment for them, but they are happy that someone comes to the family or does something with the children. In some cases, families are financially very weak. The children almost don't leave the house at all. Children have to take care of themselves all day.[409]*

Furthermore, Teacher B mentioned a father "whom we sent to a men's group. They dealt with the topic of violence prevention. How do I cope with my aggressions? We really do have a lot of work with this."[410] Dealing with conflicts in families was a difficult topic, Teacher B stressed. Language barriers sometimes stood in the way of communicating, respect for families and their cultures, and the teachers' duty to care for the well-being of their students was difficult to juggle:

> *On the one hand, one has to be very diplomatic so parents and families do not close themselves in; then we don't have a chance. One always has to present everything as an offer. In reality we only care about the well-being of the child, right? This is a very sensitive topic, I have to say. We always need to prepare well for parent conversations. In some cases they take place in English. For example with those from Africa, one always needs to talk in English; otherwise they don't understand us.[411]*

diese Grenze aber körperlich spüren. Und so lernen sie es auch." Transcript 6 Austria, Interview with Teacher B, May 2, 2017, ll. 26-28

[407] "[...] die soziale Schicht ist eher Unterschicht und viele arbeitslose Eltern, bildungsferne Schichten, eben Leute mit Migrationshintergrund. Teilweise ist das Elternhaus Analphabeten, sind sie Analphabeten." Transcript 6 Austria, Interview with Teacher B, May 2, 2017, ll. 5-7

[408] Tiroler Kinder- und Jugendhilfe, accessed from: https://www.tirol.gv.at/innsbruck/referate/kinder-und-jugendhilfe/, accessed on July 28, 2017.

[409] "Zwei Kinder in dieser Klasse sind betreut über die Jugendhilfe, ... und... ja mit guten Erfolgen, weil durch den kulturellen Hintergrund, den manche haben einfach auch die Eltern lernen müssen, wie man in unserer Kultur mit Problemen umgeht. Ja also ich muss sagen das funktioniert eigentlich ganz gut mit der Jugendhilfe. Und das wird auch angenommen von den Familien. Das ist nicht als Strafe gedacht, die sind richtig froh, dass da wer in die Familie kommt oder auch mit den Kindern was unternimmt. Teilweise sind die Familien finanziell ganz schlecht, stehen sie ganz schlecht da. Die Kinder kommen kaum aus dem Haus. Die Kinder sind auf sich allein gestellt." Transcript 6 Austria, Interview with Teacher B, May 2, 2017, ll. 156-163

[410] "Wir hatten auch einen Vater, den wir zu einer Männerrunde geschickt haben. Also da geht es um Gewaltprävention. Wie gehe ich mit meinen Agressionen um? Also, da haben wir wirklich viel Arbeit. Das muss ich schon sagen." Transcript 6 Austria, Interview with Teacher B, May 2, 2017, ll. 172-174

[411] "Man muss sehr diplomatisch vorgehen, damit die Menschen, die Eltern oder die Familie nicht zu machen, sonst hat man keine Chance, geh?. Man muss es immer als Angebot präsentieren. In Wahrheit geht es um das Wohl des Kindes. Gh? Da muss man, ja es ist ein sensibles Thema, muss ich wirklich sagen. Also wir, wir bereiten uns auch gut auf die Gespräche vor, teilweise sind sie auf Englisch, zum Beispiel bei

Contextualizing the ethnographic material with the policy analysis I carried out previously, I want to emphasize that the individual pressures families struggled with intersected with extremely stressful testing situations that took place almost every time I visited the class. Weekly exams spoke to the fact that grade 4 was the most competitive time for Austrian primary school students because their report cards determined whether they would attend a higher education institution or a vocational training school. Grades weighed heavily on the children's minds; Tim's failure, for example, was used as an insult against him.

Referring to the statistics presented in the policy analysis, children with a migrant background had significantly smaller chances of receiving recommendations for Gymnasium in Austria: "While they make up in total 23 percent of students of a grade level, their representation at AHS is 17 percent below average, rising at Hauptschule and New Middle School to 22 percent and 28 percent respectively (together 25 percent) and in special schools to 30 percent,"[412] the 2015 National Education Report Austria stated (see: 1.1). Though the students were not aware of statistics, they sensed the pressure, feared failure and understood the desirability of a recommendation for Gymnasium. Pedagogical measures to ease tensions in class seemed like props in a play – for example, classroom rules calling for mutual respect and recognition of individual performance, or rituals such as "Das Wort zum Tage" ("The Word of the Day"), used to express thoughts about the day prompted by a sentence starter, such as "Today, I enjoyed…". These stood in stark contrast to moments when students were taught that opposing the teacher would always get them in trouble and that they needed to start learning to follow orders for when they became workers. A meaningful address of racial or performance-based bullying was put off, and such incidents were regarded as personal issues among students.

Afrikanischstämmigen muss man Englisch sprechen, sonst versteht man uns nicht." Transcript 6 Austria, Interview with Teacher B, May 2, 2017, ll. 181-186.

[412] "Mit der Differenzierung zur Sekundarstufe I nimmt die Segregation von Kindern mit nichtdeutscher Alltagssprache zwischen den Schularten zu. Während sie insgesamt 23 % der Schüler/innen dieser Schulstufe ausmachen, ist ihr Anteil in den AHS mit 17 % unterdurchschnittlich, steigt in den Hauptschulen und Neuen Mittelschulen auf 22 % bzw. 28 % (zusammen 25 %) und erreicht in den Sonderschulen 30 %." See: Vogtenhuber, Stefan, Lassnigg, Lorenz, Bruneforth, Michael, Edelhofer-Lielacher, Edith and Thilo Siegle (2015): Indicators B: Inputs – Personal and financial resources. In: Bruneforth, Michael et al. (Eds): *National Education Report Austria: The School System Mirrored by Data and Indicators*, Volume 1, pp.37 - 70, pp. 42-44.

5.2.2.2 Belonging: Between Tyrolian Folklore and International Anonymity

Whereas the children of 4x grew up bi- or even multi-lingual, their performance, as measured by mathematics and German tests, hardly created opportunities to bring these abilities to light. To this classroom in the Alps, 17 out of 19 children brought an extraordinary wealth of linguistic, geographic and cultural diversity. In brief conversations with students here and there, Fahiva told me about the grandparents she visited in Turkey; Sofia spoke of her aunt's wedding in Serbia and a grandma she would like to visit in Canada; and Tim missed his dog back in Bosnia. When we listened to "Das Kufsteinlied," we learnt of Kufstein – "the pearl of Tyrol," "framed by mountains so peaceful and quiet," where one could have a good glass of wine with a girl, here "bei uns in Tirol" – in our Tyrol. The song was written in 1947, by Karl Ganzer, who had been a soldier in World War II from 1940 to 1945, stationed also at the end of his deployment in the Balkans[413] as one of 1.3 million Austrians (40.5 percent of Austrian males)[414] who served in "Hitler's armed forces."[415] "And, when the holidays are over, one needs to bid farewell and go home. One thinks of Kufstein, one thinks of Tyrol. My dear village – farewell." In this context, it should be mentioned that Austrian Wehrmacht soldiers were heavily involved in massacres and war crimes in what was then Yugoslavia as well as the Balkans.[416] Exemplary of this involvement, Kurt Waldheim should be mentioned, who served as United Nations secretary general in 1971 and president of Austria in 1986, despite being listed as war criminal by the United Nations.[417] While I could not find any further biographical information on Karl Ganzer's activities during his deployment in the Balkans, the children of 4x were encouraged to hum along the tune of the song, some of them having family in today's Bosnia and Serbia. Space-making in the classroom was overshadowed by the run-up to this song when the teacher established that two girls in the classroom were "Austrian" since both their parents were Austrian born. The rest, she said, were from somewhere else. The Kufsteinlied was presented to the children as a piece of cultural value. However, instead of stressing a common bond among all the children or asking for personal interpretations of what Tyrol meant to them, the teacher highlighted a binary divide between those whose parents were born in Austria and those whose parents

---

[413] Lang, Franzl (1983): Kufstein Lied, GMC Volkstümlicher Schlager, accessed from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=o0BRaUllRII, on August 2017.
[414] Germann, Richard (2009): Austrian Soldiers and Generals in World War II. In: Plasser, Fritz (Ed.): *New Perspectives on Austrians and World War II.* New York: Routledge, p.1
[415] Bischof, Günther (2004): Victims? Perpetrators? "Punching Bags" of European Historical Memory? The Austrians and Their World War II Legacies. In: *German Studies Review*, 27:1, pp. 17-32, p. 19.
[416] Lubin, Peter (1986): The Waldheim File: Complete and Unexpurgated. In: *The New Republic*, pp.20-24.
[417] Waldheim, Kurt, in: *Shoah Resource Center*, Yad Vashem, accessed from http://www.yadvashem.org/odot_pdf/Microsoft%20Word%20-%206485.pdf, on Feb. 20, 2018.

were not. This way, she stressed the belonging of two girls to this space and their access to the song and muted the perspective and the relationship of all other children to space and song. This lesson which stressed origin instead of contribution drastically limited opportunities for learning and excelling for the majority of the children in 4x.

In the interview, this teacher explained her approach to multiculturalism. She stressed: "It is always my highest goal – otherwise this multicultural class wouldn't work – that we are all the same and that all religions and views are equal."[418] She continued by explaining that her strongest challenge was on the social level, in other words the teaching of tolerance, which she and her colleague tried to achieve by valuing all their pupils' backgrounds:

> *We are learning about national holidays, about our Heimat [home], and we also do projects like "My Roots." Since we have so many nationalities here, we learned a greeting in each nationality, a song, and we had a slide show about the country so that the children could really be proud of their identity but also learn to feel like Austrians so that they can call this their home. These are their roots, but their Heimat [home] is here now.[419]*

5.2.2.3 Discussion: Deficit-orientation in the Early Tracking System

Onto-epistemological diversity in Early Childhood Education and Care (ECER) is a research approach that provides a counterweight to "a normalized White, male, middle-class, heterosexual version of childhood, where minoritized children are viewed as deficit."[420] Michelle Salazar Perez and Cynthia M. Saavedra point out that children of color are rarely praised for their brilliance in academic literature. Instead, "deficit assumptions about economically underresourced children and families" oftentimes pose the starting point for investigations into poverty and failure of minority youths.[421] In conversations with the teachers of 4x, parents were described as violent and incapable of educating their children either in a cultured way (children do not learn at home how to argue without using violence), or in an academic way (parents are often illiterate, unemployed, underclass). It was the

---

[418] "Ja, das ist sowieso immer mein oberstes Ziel, sonst würde diese multikulti Klasse nicht funktionieren. Also, dass wir alle gleich sind und dass alle Religionen, Ansichten gleichwertig sind." See Transcript 6 Austria, Interview with Teacher B, May 2, 2017, ll. 202-203

[419] "Also wir lernen über den Nationalfeiertag und wieso ... eben... unsere Heiiiiimaaaat. Und wir hatten das hab ich vergessen, in der zweiten Klasse ein großes Projekt. Das war aber nur in einer Klasse so... so haben wir das tituliert: „Meine Wurzeln". Und dadurch, dass wir so viele Nationalitäten haben, haben wir wirklich zu jeder Nationalität eine Begrüßung gelernt, ein Lied gelernt und eine Diashow gemacht über dieses Land, so dass wirklich die Kinder auch ihre Identität, dass sie auch stolz darauf sein können, sich aber gleichzeitig als Österreicher fühlen lernen und das hier als ihre Heimat betiteln können. Das eine sind die Wurzeln und ihre Heimat ist jetzt hier." See: Transcript 6 Austria, Interview with Teacher B, May 2, 2017, ll. 212-218

[420] Michelle Salazar Perez and Cynthia M. Saavedra (2017): A Call for Onto-Epistemological Diversity in Early Childhood Education and Care: Centering Global South Conceptualization of Childhood/s. In: *Review of Research in Education*, 41, pp. 1-29, p. 1.

[421] Ibid.

parents' cultural background, the teachers explained, that caused children to show aggressions against one another instead of applying reasoned argument. It was the African-English dialects spoken at home that made it difficult to communicate with parents.

It is difficult to overstate the pressures of the Austrian school system and how these affect all fourth graders in the final year of primary school. In fourth grade, teachers make the profound decision on the direction of each child's future schooling based on maturity and performance. The interpretation of my ethnographic field notes showed that failure mattered deeply to the children of 4x. In moments of stress caused by bad grades, Tim directed violence against himself (punching the wall) as well as others (punching Susi). Shaming based on race and performance occurred repeatedly among the children, although moments of great caring took place, too. In addition to the pressure to perform, the question of belonging played a key role in my observations. By establishing "Austrianness" in the classroom, the teacher supported a hierarchy of belonging that was headed by the pure Austrians and those who came from somewhere else. Adding to this, during break as well as in class, the children applied racial slurs they had learned to insult and put one another down. However, keeping in mind that one in four children in Austria speaks a mother tongue different from German, this classroom community was not so different from the average Austrian classroom. It is therefore necessary to ease the pressures of the early tracking system, as well as to consider teaching approaches that are culturally sensitive and truly inclusive. In their inspiring research, Norma Gonzalez, Luis Moll, et al., teachers use household visits to "identify […] and document […] knowledge that exists in students' homes," which they termed "funds of knowledge."[422] Through household visits and funds of knowledge, the teacher research participants articulated two transformative potentials. First, they reinterpreted the concept of culture as something beyond the strictly castrated signifiers, such as food, a song or a dance. The goal was to understand culture as a dynamic concept expressed through knowledge and insights into household networks in informal market exchanges, cross-border activities, and the way their students were involved in the multidimensional depth and breadth of the household's life.[423] In a similar vein, Michelle Salazar Perez and Cynthia M. Saavedra draw attention to the abilities that multilingual children in monolingual English-centric educational spaces develop and the "powerful contributions they make to their communities and families

---

[422] Gonzalez, Norma, Moll, Luis C., et al. (1995): Funds of Knowledge for Teaching in Latino Households. In: *Urban Education*, Volume 20, 4, pp. 443-470, p. 444.
[423] Ibid., p. 456

as cultural brokers."[424] It could be considered a great asset that many children of 4x were able to assist their parents during parent-teacher-meetings, visits to the doctor or everyday situations. These children's ability to communicate in two languages, as well as on adult matters such as grading or future school choices, was not mentioned to me once as a talent. The second transformative potential that Gonzalez, Moll et al., describe is the alternative to the deficit model of the household that teachers discovered. Encounters with students' immigrant families, who tried to cover the costs of housing and living, left teachers deeply changed in the way they viewed these children.[425] Research participants drew fruitful conclusions from these encounters, tapping into the funds of knowledge the households provided, which they had formerly regarded as impoverished and nothing but deficient. The works of Eric Gutstein and Pauline Lipman provide impressive examples of taking students' experiences into account in lesson planning. In "Critical Action Research With Urban Youth: Studying Social Reality Through Mathematics," Gutstein describes how he designed mathematics classes for his high school students from mostly low-income, working-class Latino and African-American households. The key question he posed to his students was: "What should we study that matters to you in your life and that we will learn about using mathematics?"[426] Together with his students, he developed a curriculum that would explore the housing crisis mathematically that so many of his students' families faced at the time. At the end of the semester, students invited their parents to a presentation in which they explained, with actual advertisements and specific figures, how subprime mortgages, household incomes and interest rates were entwined, creating financial and market pressures that would eventually lead to displacement and gentrification in their own neighborhoods.[427] Similarly, Pauline Lipman conducted research with parents, teachers and community members to explore neoliberal education policies and to challenge dominant groups and ideologies.[428] By combining big data from school districts, federal surveys on gentrification, spatialization of poverty, racial segregation, etc., that the researchers could provide with parents' and teachers' knowledge of how their school building was used, school closings have been contested on the basis of presenting alternative models to the narrative of a "failing

---

[424] Michelle Salazar Perez and Cynthia M. Saavedra (2017): A Call for Onto-Epistemological Diversity in Early Childhood Education and Care: Centering Global South Conceptualization of Childhood/s. In: *Review of Research in Education*, 41, pp. 1-29, p. 2.

[425] Gonzalez, Norma, Moll, Luis C., et al. (1995): Funds of Knowledge for Teaching in Latino Households. In: *Urban Education*, Volume 20, 4, pp. 443-470, p. 458.

[426] Gutstein, Eric (2013): Critical Action Research With Urban Youth: Studying Social Reality Through Mathematics. In: *Forum Oswiatowe*, 3:50, 117-126, p. 119

[427] Ibid., p. 122

[428] Lipman, Pauline (2013): Collaborative Research with Parents and Local Communities: Organizing Against Racism and Education Privatization. In: *Forum Oswiatowe*, 3:50, 127-136, p. 129

school."[429] These examples show that school does not have to be a matter of teacher-centered authority. It can be a place where all parties involved can be valued as knowledgeable and teachable.

5.2.3 "I am the auntie who takes care of the dumb kids."[430]

As my research in the school progressed, I began to understand that Ceren experienced hearing difficulties without receiving treatment or assistance. Repeatedly, I witnessed moments when her hearing impairment affected her learning. On May 2, 2017, in an informal conversation, the teachers shared with me that they were aware of Ceren's hearing troubles and of ear surgery she had undergone. In the following, I present a selection of field notes which capture how teachers and classmates responded to the challenges the girl exhibited. The analysis of the data will take place in two steps. First, I contextualize Ceren's case with data from the preceding policy analysis and critical disability studies literature to understand how her migrant background overlayered her hearing impairment as a reason for school failure. Bearing in mind that Ceren did not receive any support from the school's special pedagogue, in a second step I depict three functions that the special pedagogue's classroom fulfilled in the mainstream school. Exploring notions of special schools, the special educational needs status and the special pedagogue in interviews with the principal, the teachers and the special pedagogue, I conclude that the special-needs classroom essentially upheld the logic of the special school and its claim to the disabled body.

Tuesday, May 9, 2017

Ceren receives her test back and turns around to the kids sitting behind her. She shows her class test to the other children; her mouth is open, her eyebrows are raised. She mouths "everything is red." She takes the paper and shoves it into her school bag. While the children continue with another task, the teacher shows me previous class work of Ceren. Almost every word is underlined with red ink. "She writes 'Busmann' (bus man) instead of 'Busfahrer' (bus driver) to describe the man who drives the bus," the teacher points out to me. I ask whether it would be possible to give the children options about what to write so they have vocabulary help and their writing becomes a little more structured. She says this is already very easy material. These words are familiar from previous tests. She tells me about her daughter, who has to recount a fable in old, very difficult German. "Unimaginable to do something like this here," she says.

Thursday, May 18, 2017

On another day, the weather is bad and we stay inside for recess. I play cards with Ceren and some other girls. The game is similar to bingo where the goal is to find a given object in your own set of cards as quickly as possible. The girls are excited and shout out "Bingo!" when

---

[429] Ibid., p. 131
[430] Taken from: Transcript 7 Austria, Interview with Special Pedagogue, May 9, 2017, l. 442.

they spot a match. Ceren, however, screams the loudest and even in between bingos. She shouts that she is the winner and wants to explain to me why she won. Her voice is unbearably loud. I sit next to her and tell her, "You don't need to scream at me. Just tell me what you want to say in a regular tone."

Thursday, June 8, 2017

In English class, I am asked by the teacher to go outside the classroom so the children can take turns sitting with me and present their dialogues. In pairs, they have practiced questions and answers for each other on the topic of "summer holidays." I take a chair and wait for the pairs. Ceren and Sabrina take the seats in front of me. Ceren has trouble understanding me when I speak to her in English. She turns to Sabrina for help: "Was sagt sie?" ("What is she saying?") Sabrina understands me well and responds with correct answers to my questions. We have a short conversation in English, while Ceren excuses herself to the bathroom. Sabrina will go to Croatia for her holidays to see her family. Then she will visit her family in Serbia. She tells me that she has a grandmother and another aunt in Canada. With a proud look on her face, the girl tells me that she speaks Bosnian, Croatian, Serbian, German and English. Ceren returns from the bathroom and tells us that she also speaks several languages. She speaks Kurdish, Turkish, German and Paris. "Paris?" I ask her. Sabrina says to her, "Do you mean French?" Ceren nods with a shy smile. It is Ceren's turn to ask Sabrina questions. "What is your name?" she asks. I ask her to formulate a question to which she does not know already the answer. I help her translate: "Wie alt bist du?" I write the words down for her in English so she can see the structure of the sentence and the words. I explain each word to her. She observes me while I write. She looks up from the piece of paper, turns to me and asks me, "How old are you?" I tell her, "I am 30 years old." Sabrina says that her mom is 12 years older. Ceren says, "My mom is one year older. I ask Ceren, "Was heißt Geburtstag auf Englisch?" (What does the word birthday mean in English?) She thinks for a moment, then answers,: "Happy birthday." That means "Herzlichen Geburtstag." But what is Geburtstag? I ask. She says: "Happy." That's an emotion, I tell her, but what is "Geburtstag" in English? She looks at me over her glasses and asks hesitantly: "Birthday?"

Thursday, June 29, 2017

For the "Wort zum Tage" ("Word of the Day") routine, Ceren may draw a piece of paper from which she reads out that she should share with the group something she is looking forward to. She says she is excited about the weekend because she will be allowed to see her dad, whom she has not seen for two years. The day has almost come to an end, and the children are asked to place their chairs on top of their tables. With a loud bang, Ceren's chair lands on the table. She has to take it down again and try once more. This time, however, "Softly!" the teacher demands. She succeeds.

5.2.3.1 Special Educational Needs Status: A Status of Privilege?

Although national and international education reports have criticized the double rise of children with special educational needs status in both special schools and inclusive settings, the example of Ceren showed that the mechanisms in store also failed to address impairment where it should have been recognized. Although her teachers were aware that Ceren had had ear surgery and consequently experienced impaired hearing, the girl did not receive any extra help in class, such as visualized tasks or prompts with which she could better follow class discussions. She also did not receive counseling on hearing aids. Her weak performances in

class were attributed to her low German-language proficiency, which her teacher proved by pointing out that a "bus man" was not the correct word to describe a "bus driver." The teacher drew comparisons to her own daughter whose command of German even allowed her to recite a fable in old German flawlessly. That Ceren's failures might have been inflicted by her hearing loss rather than a cognitive weakness was not considered. Ceren was simply a low-performing student who had trouble hearing. Contextualizing my observations with the preceding policy analysis, I would like to suggest that various disadvantageous categories intersected in the person of Ceren. On the grounds of being female with the non-German mother tongue of Kurdish and a hearing impairment, Ceren exhibited vulnerability that made her prone to the risk of threefold discrimination, as pointed out in the National Austrian Education Report of 2012. Furthermore, from Ceren's accounts I would like to point to the pressures her family faced. Her father seemed to be absent from family life for extensive periods of time, leaving her young mother to take care of her and siblings. Since Ceren did not wear hearing aids, her parents had not pushed for the recognition of her hearing impairment, exposing her to a state of vulnerability. The assets the Austrian education system provided for children like Ceren, such as special pedagogical treatment for hearing impairment, counseling for parents and advice on hearing aids, were not mobilized on her behalf because her family did not exercise their right to these services. Roland Astl, Tyrolian school board official, mentioned a lack of language and social capital that some families exhibited. Native Austrian families of higher socio-economic status knew how to talk to educational decision-makers and how to push for their children's rights. Astl summarized from his experiences:

> *Out there, we don't have these parents. There we have the problem that our middle-class school system is not understood by these parents, which means I cannot take for granted that the school system – for these groups of parents, parents that are over-proportionally threatened by unemployment, over-proportionally threatened by the experience of refuge, and who might not share a biography in which school was very present – automatically builds trust.*[431]

At the time of my research stay, the special pedagogue was employed to work with children who carried the special educational needs status. During designated times of the day, she worked with three children on writing tasks and math exercises. Only one of them had a migrant background. This small group of three special-needs students received the full

---

[431] "Und draußen da gibt es diese Eltern nicht. Das ist ein bisschen das Problem, dass unser Mittelschichtsschulsystem von diesen Eltern eben nicht verstanden wird, d.h. da kann ich schon davon ausgehen, dass diese Schulsysteme bei diesen Gruppe von Eltern, ja? Eltern, die von Arbeitslosigkeit überproportional bedroht sind, die von Fluchterfahrungen überproportional bedroht sind. Insgesamt mit dem System Schule in ihrer Biographie vielleicht nicht Erfahrungen gemacht haben, die automatisch dieses Vertrauen sicherstellen." Transcript 2 Austria, Interview with Roland Astl, July 4, 2017, ll. 228-234

attention of the pedagogue to catch up with the curriculum and study in peace and silence what they did not manage to do in class. Every child in mainstream education who held the SPF status had the right to four hours a week with a special pedagogue. Asked whether someone from class 4x could profit from an SPF, Teacher A responded:

> *Nobody needs a special educational needs status. But of course, since almost no one was a German-mother-tongue-speaker, it would be much nicer if there were more extra German classes or support teachers because it is often difficult language-wise. Although our class is not as bad in comparison to the other classes.[432]*

In my interview with education scholar Volker Schönwiese, I enquired about the principles that defined the process and the concept of the SPF. "The principle is that there is no principle,"[433] he replied. The definition of the SPF given by the Federal Education Ministry was a rigid formulation. However, in reality, he said the frame was "arbitrary," "there was no diagnosis" and it depended on the "culture of the community, which enabled or denied the individual access to inclusive structures," Schönwiese contended.[434]

Considering the above, I would like to contextualize Ceren's case in disability studies literature. I argue that migration overlayered impairment and school failure was tolerated on the grounds of poor command of language. Whereas the teacher presented her daughter as a positive example of what children were capable of achieving, she did not realize the privilege her daughter held with regard to the way that the Austrian education system favored children who were white, German-speaking and of an aspirational family background.[435] The unfavorable combination of hearing impairment, a non-majority background and ascribed cognitive weakness thereof has been problematized by studies on the Puerto Rican community in the American state of Connecticut by Jean J. Schensul, Maria Gonzalez Borrero and Roberto Garcia. In "Applying Ethnography to Educational Change," the authors investigated the over-proportionate numbers of Puerto Rican students labeled as "learning disabled," "emotionally or mentally retarded" or "language-delayed" in American mainstream

---

[432] "Also einen sonderpädagogischen Förderbedarf braucht keiner. Aber natürlich ist es bei uns dadurch, dass fast niemand muttersprachlich deutsch ist, wäre es viel feiner, wenn man viel mehr BFU Stunden hätte oder vielmehr Stützlehrer hätte, weil es einfach sprachlich oft schwierig ist. Wobei unsere Klasse ja eh nicht so schlecht ist im Vergleich zu anderen Klassen." Transcript 5 Austria, Interview with Teacher A, May 12, 2017, ll. 45-49

[433] "Also das Prinzip ist, dass es kein Prinzip gibt." Transcript 1 Austria, Interview with Volker Schönwiese, June 29, 2017, l. 225

[434] "Es ist überhaupt nicht eindeutig. Sie [die SPF-Zuschreibung] ist willkürlich wie nur.Es gibt Krankheitsbildauflistung und sonstiges. [...]Was gibt es da für eine Kultur, die das ermöglicht oder auch nicht?" Transcript 1 Austria, Interview with Volker Schönwiese, June 29, 2017, ll. 232-241

[435] National Education Report Austria, p. 26.

schools.[436] While I do not intend to treat both the U.S. and the Austrian contexts synonymously, juxtaposing them offers striking insights into how hearing impairment reflects on the individual and his or her social and ethnic background. In the U.S. example, the authors explained that otitis media (inflammation of the middle ear) was a very common ear infection that 75 percent of children experienced during their early years. The inflammation was treated by antibiotics, often resulting, however, in serous otitis, whereby fluid that remained behind the ear drum caused recurrent acute infections. According to the authors, otitis media was widespread among Puerto Rican schoolchildren in the northeast United States:

> *Hearing is impaired at the time of maximum language learning and social development. This is particularly significant for children raised in a complex bilingual/ multicultural environment [...] Hearing loss impairs interaction between the child and others, resulting in hyperactivity or passive withdrawn behavior, both of which may interfere with classroom social life and learning.[437]*

Since "delays in cognitive and social development may not be identified until the child enters school, at which point hearing seems normal,"[438] intellectual weakness seemed to be naturalized within a certain group of individuals, i.e. it is very tempting to racialize cognitive weakness or language delay. In this example, "teachers, speech clinicians, and school nurses were identifying Hispanic children with language delays and hearing problems in the early grades but were not collecting comprehensive medical histories."[439] The authors described several intervention strategies aimed at raising awareness of the consequences that otitis media may have on the school careers of former patients. With this investigation, they "highlight the need to consider ethnicity as an important variable in disability research," which was also of considerable importance in Ceren's case. I did not have any data on her medical history or that of any other child in special schools. Since children with a migrant background were described as violent and low on conflict management skills because of their foreign cultures, it might be useful to consider the notion of a racialized discourse on children's behavior. With regard to Ceren, I argue that it is crucial to investigate racialized discourses that trace school failure back to the lack of German-language proficiency, instead of a physiological impairment that is in fact treatable.

---

[436] Schensul, Jean J., Gonzalez Borrero, Maria and Roberto Garcia (1985): Applying Ethnography to Educational Change. In: *Anthropology and Education Quartely,* 16:2, pp. 149-164, p. 155.
[437] Ibid.
[438] Ibid.
[439] Ibid., p. 156.

5.2.3.2 The Special-Needs Classroom

I pointed out that three children in this primary school held special-needs status and were each granted four hours a week of individual work with the special pedagogue. This turned the special pedagogue into a unique staff member who embodied the implementation of inclusive schooling and expertise on matters of disability in the mainstream school. Space had been made for her and her needs by giving her a classroom she had requested. Here, a soft carpet covered the floor; a blackboard filled the back wall of the room; she prepared and stocked her material, and exercised authority over lesson content and didactics. "Last year, I was in class a lot because we did not have a room. I used to sit on somebody's table or on the floor in the classroom."[440] Before she had a classroom to herself, teachers would say: "Come back into the classroom. The play lesson is over. […] Time with the play auntie is over. Now we go back to work."[441] This completely undermined the work she did with her students, she said.[442] Having a room to herself spared her these moments: "I close here my door and I am, I have to admit, I am really happy when I don't have to be in class."[443] She continued:

> *I am always the… the auntie who takes care of the idiots. So they don't have to do it, because it is a challenge for teachers, you know? That you also have to take care of such a child. I think I am welcome in class because I help out a lot, but I am the auntie who takes care of the dumb kids and I play with them a little bit. That's their attitude, and one can feel it, you know? Also the kids can feel it.[444]*

I argue that the special pedagogue created a classroom that could be found in a special school, establishing a special-school enclave in a mainstream school building. This classroom, I claim, fulfilled three functions. First, by creating her own space of expertise, she established herself as a staff member against the accusations she felt of being simply a "play auntie." She experienced not only the feeling that her work was not considered valuable, but also that the stigma attached to the children was also attached to her as somebody who only played. In our

---

[440] „Letzes Jahr war ich ganz viel in der Klasse, weil da haben wir keinen Raum gehabt. Da bin ich immer vor der Klasse auf dem Tisch oder auf dem Boden gewesen." Transcript 7 Austria, Interview with Special Pedagogue, May 9, 2017, ll. 73-74.

[441] "Kommt's jetzt alle in meine Klasse! Jetzt ist Schluss mit der Kinderspielstunde – da! [...] Schluss mit der Spieletante. Jetzt gehen wir wieder arbeiten." Transcript 7 Austria, Interview with Special Pedagogue, May 9, 2017, ll. 427-430.

[442] „[...] solche Aussagen, die eigentlich ja meine ganze, gesamte Arbeit völlig in Frage stellen, oder?" in English: [...] these statements completely questioned my entire work." Transcript 7 Austria, Interview with Special Pedagogue, May 9, 2017, ll. 428-429.

[443] "Ich mach dann hier auch meine Tür zu und bin echt, muss ich auch echt zugeben, froh, wenn ich nicht in der Klasse sein muss, geh?" See: Transcript 7 Austria, Interview with Special Pedagogue, May 9, 2017, ll. 423-424.

[444] "Ich bin immer so die... die Tante, was sich halt um die Deppen kümmert. Damit sie es nicht machen müssen, weil es nämlich auch eine Herausforderung ist, als Lehrerin, oder? Wenn man sich dann um so ein Kind auch noch kümmern müsste. Also, ich bin schon, glaub ich, willkommen und gern gesehen, weil ich einfach auch viel Entlastung bringe für die Lehrerinnen, aber ich bin halt die Tante, die sich um die dummen Kinder kümmert und ich tue halt ein bisschen mit ihnen spielen so von der Einstellung her und das spürt man einfach auch, oder? Das spüren auch die Kinder." Transcript 7 Austria, Interview with Special Pedagogue, May 9, 2017, ll. 438-444.

interview, she shared reasons she thought parents did not want to test their children for a special educational needs status: "I don't want my child to be officially a special-school child because then this will be noted on the report card 'taught according to the special-school curriculum.' So parents boycott this process."[445] Hence, even in inclusive schooling, parents feared the stigma of the special school. The special school established itself as the help school that would alleviate the regular school of the socially and biologically deviant child. The stigma of the incapable Other has been attached to the label of the special educational needs status which, I believe, is linked to the historical knowledge of the special school.

Second, I argue that through creating her own space, the special pedagogue contributed to the function of containing disability from regular school life. By affiliating the special-needs child with the special pedagogue and the special classroom, the strict binary between disabled and non-disabled was enshrined and protected from deconstruction. General teachers followed through with their lessons without having to adjust the material, the social form or the didactical approach. In *Abnormal*, Foucault writes, "It is not the legality of the proof, its conformity to the law that makes it a proof: it is its demonstrability. The demonstrability of evidence makes it admissible."[446] I argue that the special-needs status was closely entwined with the demonstrability of disability, which was treated by special staff in special spaces. The demonstrability of difference also became apparent in the way some children received extra German classes. Pull-out measures were taken several times during the week when it came to language weaknesses. Similarly to the special-needs status, language proficiency was an impairment that needed to be treated outside the classroom, despite the Federal Ministry of Education's call to avoid special treatment of students on the basis of language (See: 1.3). The close overlap of language deficiency and disability as treatable outside the general classroom was reminiscent to the fact that non-native German speakers were over-proportionally represented in special schools. The report "Migration and Integration" stated that more children whose first language was Turkish attended special schools (5.2 percent) than primary schools (2.1 percent), as well as children from the former Yugoslavia, with 4.0 percent taught in primary schools and 6.8 percent in special institutions (See: 1.1).[447] To further contextualize these pull-out measures, in "Excesses of the Double System" (See: 1.3) I quoted from the Tyrol Monitoring Report, which observed: "It can be said that the regular school shows a push-out effect and the special school a pull-in effect." My field notes paid

---

[445] "Ich will nicht, dass mein Kind offiziell als Sonderschulkind, weil da kriegt man da auch auf dem Zeugnis ein Vermerk ‚nach dem Lehrplan der Sonderschule'. Also da boykottieren die Eltern auch den Prozess." Transcript 7 Austria, Interview with Special Pedagogue, May 9, 2017, ll. 95-97.

[446] Foucault, Michel (2016): *Abnormal: Lectures at the Collège de France 1974-1975*. London: Verso, p. 8.

[447] Statistics Austria (2011): Migration and Integration: Numbers, Data, Indicators, p. 43.

witness to the fact that also push-out effects were regularly noticeable within primary schools. To an extent, the special pedagogue and the BFU teacher were functions, complicit in upholding the construct of a student who could pass through the Austrian education system successfully. In an education system characterized by "education heredity" (See: National Education Report Austria 2012, p. 124 in 1.1), support was a necessity to pass through the system – not an exception. However, support was considered a flaw and a deviation from the norm, whereas it actually, in fact, applied to the majority of the children.

Third, I argue that the special pedagogue gained authority in the primary school through modeling her space after a special school, thereby catering to the principal's view of special schools as the appropriate place for children with special needs. She explained:

> *[…] but still, I see the special school as a very, very valuable school because it is led by specialists, and the education of the general teachers… they can't manage.[448]*

> *And then parents decided that they wanted to keep their child in this school community. Otherwise the child would have had to change schools. That would have probably been in part much better for the child because in special schools teachers oftentimes have only eight children maximum to take care of. This, to me, is better, too, since I would rather like to be treated by a specialist. I, personally, see it this way. I also go to an expert: when I have a toothache, I go to the dentist. And not to the orthopedist, and this way I see this model of the special school in terms of the training/the education. [...][449]*

> *One has to always tell the parents that when they [their children] go through special education they will have more chances on the labor market because special schools will always make sure that all children with special needs will be integrated in the working life so they have the opportunity to sustain themselves.[450]*

The principal considered special schools as "very, very valuable" because of the following reasons: the expert knowledge of the disabled body, the care provided in settings with a student-teacher-ratio of 8:1 and the education for manual labor in workshops through which people with disabilities became independent from the welfare system. Teacher B explained

---

[448] "[...] aber trotzdem aus meiner Sicht eine sehr sehr wertvolle Schule ist, weil die also von Spezialisten geführt wird und die Ausbildung der Lehrer jetzt können... das bringt's nicht mehr." Transcript 8 Austria, Interview with Director, July 4, 2017, ll. 182-184

[449] "Und dann haben die Eltern entschieden, sie wollen sie lieber an dieser Schule lassen in der Gemeinschaft. Ansonsten hätten sie müssen die die Schule wechseln. Das wäre nachher für diese Kinder sicher teilweise bessere Betreuung möglich, weil in der Sonderschule haben die Lehrer oft acht Kinder maximal in der Gruppe und würde für mich schon bedeuten, von einem Spezialisten lass ich mich halt lieber behandeln. Ich sehe das jetzt persönlich so. Ich gehe auch zum Fachmann, wenn ich Zahnweh habe, gehe ich zum Zahnarzt und nicht zum Orthopäden und so sehe ich dieses Modell auch in der Sonderpädagogik von der Ausbildung her." Transcript 8 Austria, Interview with Principal, July 4, 2017, ll. 244-251

[450] "Wobei man den Eltern immer sagt, sie haben, wenn sie die Spezialausbildung machen mehr Berufschancen einmal, weil die Sonderschule immer schauen wird, dass alle Kinder mit erhöhtem oder Förderbedarf ins Berufsleben integriert werden und dann die Möglichkeit haben, einmal irgendwann sich selbst zu versorgen." Transcript 8 Austria, Interview with Principal, July 4, 2017, ll. 281-284.

that "most parents are not very knowledgeable and repel any advice or counseling, but that this would actually be beneficial to their children, that they would have a chance to receive a degree, you have to bring to the awareness of the parents."[451] In an informal classroom conversation on May 2, 2017, this teacher also stated that children would not feel as weak in special schools as they did in primary school. When others calculated in the thousands, disabled children could gain confidence from handiwork and earn money in workshops. Teacher and principal both stressed that special schools enabled children with disabilities to have chances in the labor market. In the 1980s Heinz Forcher and his parent group Vianova struggled for educational alternatives to workshops (See: 1.2). These were, however, still the only possible career options that principal and teachers considered for children with disabilities/special needs in our interviews 30 years later. The special classroom did not contest this educational value that principal and teachers saw in the special school. As long as the special classroom worked as a special school facility, it functioned within the logic of the special system that educated for manual labor and that stressed the impairment instead of limiting the barrier.

5.2.3.3 Discussion: Unmet Needs

In the preceding subchapter, I focused on the absence of services on the one hand and, on the other, on the construction of disability in the logic of the medical model through the special pedagogue's space-making activities. From my ethnographic material, I illustrated how a racialized discourse on disability played out in tolerating a child's failure in school. In a conversation with Graciela Slesaransky-Poe, a professor of special education and principal of the Annual Inclusion Institute of Arcadia University in Pennsylvania, we reflected on my field work and the case of Ceren. In a similar vein, Slesaransky-Poe said she had observed the distribution of hearing aids at an ethnically diverse school during her involvement in a research site in the United States several years ago. The black children, she remembered, were not given the same technological devices to support their hearing as white children. Apparently it was assumed that they would sell these devices instead of using them. In this way, black students suffered racial discrimination on top of their impairment, putting them at a disadvantage to their similarly impaired white classmates. Literature in disability studies and policy recommendations focus strongly on the overrepresentation of students of color in

---

[451] "die meisten Eltern kennen sich da nicht aus und währen alles ab, aber dass das eigentlich zum Vorteil des Kindes ist, dass das Kind die Möglichkeit hat irgendwann einen Abschluss zu bekommen – das muss man ihnen erst klarmachen." Transcript 6 Austria, Interview with Teacher B, May 2, 2017, ll. 319-322

special-education classrooms.[452] However, research that discusses the school-to-prison pipeline also highlights the consequences that children of color face when their disabilities are not recognized. In the journal Disability and the Law, attorneys Mark McWilliams and Mark Fancher presented data from a report by the American Civil Liberties Union showing that in the Ann Arbor School District in Michigan in 2006-07, for example, black students made up 18 percent of the student population but accounted for 58 percent of suspensions.[453] "The failure to evaluate for disabilities contributes to a demonstrated racial 'suspension gap' that negatively impacts communities of color,"[454] McWilliams and Fancher concluded. Furthermore, they stressed that "many schools consider behavior to be volitional rather than driven by disability, resulting in improper denial of special education services."[455] Special education researcher Claustina Mahon-Reynolds and educational policy and leadership expert Laurence Parker strongly support this notion. They, too, address the policy level in their investigation: "We believe that, ideally special education law should be used to dismantle the [school-to-prison] pipeline so that punishment through incarceration is not the norm for students of color who may have undiagnosed or unmet special needs."[456] Placing these observations next to Ceren's experiences, it becomes clear that discrimination and disadvantage based on an overlap of minority background and unmet special needs is not a singular phenomenon. I argue that the intersectional perspective on Ceren's school failure allows for a nuanced critique of her schooling situation. Although the phenomenon of threefold discrimination that Ceren experienced through race, gender and disability was a risk described by the authors of the National Action Plan Disability 2012-2020, teachers were not sensitive to these mechanisms. Instead of paying attention to barriers that impaired the child, they chose factors to explain her school failure – such as cognitive weaknesses, multilingualism, etc. – that were irrelevant to Ceren's hearing loss.

Following Foucault, who stated that "history is that which transforms documents into monuments,"[457] I argue that the special school was a monument closely related to the Austrian history of the disabled Other and the special classroom within mainstream education. The key

---

[452] Kelly Kreskow 2013; David Connor, Subini A. Annamma, Beth Ferri 2013; U.S. Commission on Civil Rights: Minorities in Special Education, 2007

[453] McWilliams, Mark and Mark Fancher (2010): Undiagnosed Students With Disabilities Trapped in the School-to-Prison Pipeline. In: *Disabilities and the Law*, pp. 28-33, p. 30.

[454] Ibid., p. 29.

[455] Ibid.

[456] Mahon-Reynolds, Claustina, Parker, Laurence (2016): The Overrepresentation of Students of Color with Learning Disabilties: How "Working Identity" Plays a Role in the School-to-Prison Pipeline. In: Connor, David J., Ferri, Beth A. and Subini A Annamma (Eds.): *DisCrit: Disability Studies and Critical Race Theory in Education*, pp. 145-153, p. 146.

[457] Foucault, Michel (1989): *The Archaeology of Knowledge*. London: Routledge, p. 7.

arguments provided by principal and teachers in favor of the special school, i.e., the adequate preparation of students for the labor market, may be contrasted with research by Lisa Pfahl and Justin Powell. They summarized that "approximately eighty percent of special school-leavers each year receive no secondary school credential that qualifies them to go on to postsecondary education."[458] In the book Techniques of Disability, Pfahl showed the devastating impact of the stigma of education in special schools on young adults. Exploring the biographies of four children who attended special schools in Germany, Pfahl concluded that the moment of institutional segregation from "normal" children established a sense of impairment and a limited ability to be educated.[459] This attribution resulted in very low self-esteem and multiplied the risks of failure within an already vulnerable positionality at the bottom of the education hierarchy. The case of Nico Birkholz showed vividly how ascribed status impaired the individual on top of his challenges. In his interview, he described feeling inferior to his classmates with whom he started vocational training to become a chef: "You come from the special school where you are not taught these things that a student from Hauptschule, Gesamtschule or Realschule[460] is taught but you still have to study all the material."[461] In a different interview sequence, Nico explained that English was not taught in special schools, but it was part of his curriculum when he started his training: "We started right away at the level of 'super smart.' Not special school but super smart. They could not wait for me. They came from Gymnasium, Gesamtschule, Realschule, whatever. And I only came from the crummy special school."[462] Pfahl referred to the fact that students from special schools are very rarely reintegrated into regular schools where they can acquire qualifying diploma for further training.[463] Students who graduated from special schools lacked competences and qualifications, turning them into highly disadvantaged and disabled individuals on top of their impairments. The fact that students lacked essential skills and

---

[458] Pfahl and Powell (2011): Legitimating School Segregation: The Special Education Profession and the Discourse of Learning Disability in Germany 1908-2009. In: *Disability & Society*, 24:2, pp. 449-462, accessed from bidok: http://bidok.uibk.ac.at/library/pfahl-legitimating.html, on Sept. 4, 2018, p.3.

[459] Pfahl, Lisa (2011): *Techniken der Behinderung: Der deutsche Lernbehinderungsdiskurs, die Sonderschule und ihre Auswirkungen auf Bildungsbiographien*. (Techniques of Disability: The German discourse on learning disability, the special school and its effect on education biographies) Bielefeld: transcript, p. 228 ff.

[460] Hauptschule: lowest academic schooling branch after primary school, geared toward vocational training, Gesamtschule: a comprehensive school, Realschule: a type of secondary school for average academic performance

[461] Pfahl, Lisa (2011): *Techniken der Behinderung: Der deutsche Lernbehinderungsdiskurs, die Sonderschule und ihre Auswirkungen auf Bildungsbiographien*. (Techniques of Disability: The German discourse on learning disability, the special school and its effect on education biographies) Bielefeld: transcript, p. 186.

[462] Ibid., 187.

[463] Pfahl, Lisa (2011): *Techniken der Behinderung: Der deutsche Lernbehinderungsdiskurs, die Sonderschule und ihre Auswirkungen auf Bildungsbiographien*. (Techniques of Disability: The German discourse on learning disability, the special school and its effect on education biographies) Bielefeld: transcript, p. 110.

employment opportunities was not at all reflected by special school staff members, but rather was ascribed to the labor market dynamics in general, Pfahl concluded.[464]

5.2.4 "Generation AMS" (Generation Unemployment Benefits)

The final selection of field notes builds on the theme of future aspirations. I selected moments when pupils supported one another and were empowered through success, as well as moments when they faced and reproduced negative assumptions on what the future had in store for them. I also include an informal conversation between two colleagues who reflect on their pupils' futures with a devastating verdict. I argue that the power of place, in terms of a catchment area with a long history of stigma, and the early tracking system that trains teachers to look for deficits in pupils' abilities overshadows a differentiated view of pupils and their potentials.

Thursday, May 4, 2017

It is 10 minutes to 8 on another school morning. Some children are in class already. Susi and Ceren push each other in play. Susie skips through the room. Mahmoud stands at the door to the classroom; he is slightly out of breath. He hands his backpack to Susi and asks her, "Can you please unpack?" She says, "Okaaayyy". She carries his backpack to the place where he sits in class, takes out his exercise books and puts them on different piles: one exercise book goes on the teacher's desk, the other on a table at the side where the other kids have already put their exercise books. Unpacking exercise books and placing them on different piles for the teachers to check is a morning ritual for all the kids to perform before school starts. Mahmoud is on his mobile phone; he slips outside of the classroom and disappears into the corridor. When the class starts, he has not yet returned. A few minutes later, he rushes and takes his seat, unnoticed by the teacher.

Morning break – around 10 a.m.

I walk through the building, and one of the long corridors is decorated with many different class group pictures. I spot 4x's picture from last year. Kevin wears a bow-tie, looking very smart and elegant. When their teacher walks toward me, I point at the class picture and comment on Kevin's great look. Together we smile at the picture when her colleague joins our conversation. The teacher of 4x expresses her current frustration with the class, saying that recent weeks have been so tiring and exhausting because she had to test the kids again and again to prepare them for the next school, but that the German class tests were really, really bad. Only two good grades; many kids failed. Her colleague adds that the native speakers are not even better than the other kids. Both blame social media and the way parents only shout orders at their kids: Do this! Bring me that! "Where does this all lead?!," the other teacher exclaims. The teacher of 4x concurs wholeheartedly: "Yes! I only have to look at my own daughter and the tests that she brings home: three mistakes on a 300-word essay with connecting sentences and so on. Well, this [meaning her own class] is generation AMS [Arbeitsmarktservice, Employment Service]. I always say: We do Entwicklungshilfe [Development aid/ Foreign aid] here.

---

[464] Ibid., p. 111

Tuesday, May 9, 2017

The children receive back their German class tests, which showed awful results. There is one girl who did a great job, the teacher says and reads out the girl's essay to the class. This girl is from Chechnya. Her father is in prison, her mom left the family temporarily, so she lives with her older sister and her husband, who is also a criminal, the teacher explains to me. Across the street is the "Chechnya block, as it is called," she says. It really is a ghetto, she says; many Chechens have family members in prison. However, this girl has written a truly fantastic text and made only minor mistakes. Unfortunately, she is not in school today, so she doesn't hear the praise she receives. As the math teacher takes over the lesson, the German teacher shows me a class test by Kevin. The task had been to read the beginning of a story and to continue writing the story in a logical way. In Kevin's story a boy finds a gun under his bed. He points it at a man who enters his bedroom at night. The word "gun" is underlined by the teacher with red ink. Next to his writing, her comment says: "I hope you will never point a gun at somebody."

Thursday, June 8, 2017

The first lesson of the day takes place in "Freiarbeit," self-organized learning without teacher instruction. Written on the board is a list of tasks the children need to finish by the end of the lesson. One task is to take turns sitting with me and presenting interviews the kids have prepared in a previous English lesson.

The children may choose where they want to sit and work. Some sit on the carpet in the book corner, some on the floor, some outside the classroom, and others stay at their tables. The atmosphere is calm; the children are focused.

After several other pairs, Tim and Kevin present their interview to me. Tim asks: "How do you want to be tattooed?" Kevin wants to have two children whose names he will each tattoo on one side of his chest and underneath their names he wants to write their dates of birth. He imagines having a son and a daughter. Tim also wants two children, a boy and a girl. Their exchange continues until Kevin asks, "Would you rather go into the past or into the future?" Tim hesitates. "Into the past," he answers "so I can't ruin the future." Kevin agrees. He would also choose the past as a place to visit so he can see his mom when she was a little girl. "I would go to her school and say, 'Hi! I am your son.'" Tim replies, "But the school would be all torn down and in ruins, wouldn't it, that school?" By now they have switched into German and Kevin shakes his head vigorously. "Oh, because your mom went to school in Bosnia?" Kevin asks. "My mom already went to school here," pointing at the ground. Tim nods.

5.2.4.1 Future Benefit Claimers vs. English Class

Class 4x qualified as a so-called "English class," which meant its students were expected to be more motivated and perform better than other kids of the same year group so they could be challenged with English-language skills in daily classroom communications. Page numbers in their textbooks were announced in English, the date of the day was introduced in English and independent work often involved a speaking activity during which children practiced their level of English. Nonetheless, the informal chat among colleagues that I witnessed in the school's hallway was led by two teachers, exhausted and demotivated by their pupils' performance. Their shattering conclusion regarding the fourth grade classroom I

had been observing was that this group of kids was "Generation AMS" (Generation Unemployment Benefits). In the classroom, however, I observed pupils who were upset when they received bad marks and who competed for success and admiration from their teachers.

In the book The Subject and Power, Foucault discusses the nature of power. Power, he writes "is […] always a way of acting upon an acting subject [...] A set of actions upon other actions."[465] I would argue, then, that teachers' power lay in the way they could structure their pupils' possible field of action. Considering class 4x "Generation AMS" narrowed the possible field of action down to a very limited scope of future aspirations for their pupils. Frederick Erickson contended that "the full significance of many events inside school can only be seen in the context of events throughout the whole school, of influences on the school from outside it, and of influences of the school on the larger society."[466] Reading classroom discourse against the spatial and historical knowledge on the school's catchment area offered a deeper understanding of the dominant negative rhetoric prevalent in so many interactions I encountered. An investigation into local history revealed that during the economic crises of the 1920s and 1930s, people settled in caravans without electricity, sewers or a water supply system on bare fields on the outskirts of the city, called the Bocksiedlung (Settlement of Family Bock).[467] The Bock family ruled the settlement, made up of one-room sheds in which families of up to six people lived. From the mid-1930s until its liquidation in 1964, Yeniche, other traveling people in circuses and the entertainment business, and family clans lived here with many children, exhibiting rather unorthodox lifestyles. From the accounts collected by Hollaus and Schleich, the settlement's shady reputation resulted from its inhabitants' socio-economic status. Those who had to settle in the Bocksiedlung were characterized as people who suffered poverty through unemployment and were often struck by personal misfortunes, such as the loss of a family member or illness, that were occasionally met with alcoholism and violence. On the other hand, different witnesses spoke of a neighborhood with a great sense of community help and self-governing authority, despite the discrimination they experienced outside the settlement and the rough conditions they endured inside. In an interview with Hilde U. – one of the residents, Hollaus and Schleich share the following reflections of former Bocksiedlung residents:

---

[465] Foucault, Michel (1982): The Subject and Power. In: *Critical Inquiry*, 8:4, pp. 777-795, p. 789.

[466] Erickson, Frederick (1984): What Makes School Ethnography, Ethnographic'? In: *Anthropology and Education Quarterly*, 15:1, pp. 51-66, p.10, accessed from http://www.indiana.edu/~educy520/sec5982/week_4/erickson84.pdf, on Sept. 4, 2018.

[467] Hollaus, Melanie and Heidi Schleich (Eds.) (2017): *Bocksiedlung. Ein Stück Innsbruck*. Innsbruck: Studienverlag, p. 107.

One day my younger sister came home from school crying. Her teacher told unbelievable tales about our area. For example, she claimed in front of the whole class: "In the settlement, the curtains only have one purpose – so the people have something to blow their noses into." Many children from this settlement were put into special schools, which used to be called help schools. The reason was most likely their homes and not so much their performance in school.[468]

She continued, "We learned quickly that we would not say we were living in the Bocksiedlung if someone asked us for our address."[469] Similarly, because housing was scarce after World War II, destitute Tyrolians moved into the former Gestapo camp, the "Reichenau Lager."[470] In the only monograph to date dedicated to the history, reappraisal and memory of this camp, Johannes Breit summarized: "The Gestapo […] the regional unemployment office and local companies used the camp as a work education camp, a reservoir for labor force, as detainment for political prisoners, as a transit camp for deported people and a detention center for Italian workers."[471] From there, detained Jews and political prisoners were deported to the Auschwitz, Mauthausen, Ravensbrück and Dachau concentration camps, where they were ultimately murdered. Both the Bocksiedlung and the former Gestapo Camp were considered "Schandflecken" ("patches of shame") by townspeople from the city center. [472] Later, for hygienic and social-political reasons, the city council intensified efforts to close the settlements and launched affordable housing strategies in the late 1950s. The residents of the Bocksiedlung were joined by those of the former Gestapo Camp, two "patches of shame" put together into one huge housing complex that today constitutes the catchment area of the school "out there." Hollaus and Schleich's inquiry about the resettling strategy into the new housing areas tapped right into the crucial question of how disadvantage accumulated in certain areas of a city. Former Mayor Romuald Niescher explained:

One may not put a 'difficult family' in one house with an 'unproblematic family' because this would cause open conflicts where there have been none in the house before. Instead, if one houses several 'problematic families' together, usually conditions stay orderly. […] We have usually placed 'problem families' into one housing block and had good experiences with this conduct.[473]

One of the examples of the results of this conduct was the "Chechen block" of which the teacher spoke and which she characterized as a place where crime, aggression and hopelessness accumulated. That a girl from this block wrote the best German essay in the

---

[468] Ibid., p. 28.
[469] Ibid.
[470] Ibid., p. 181.
[471] Breit, Johannes (2017): *The Gestapo-Camp Innsbruck-Reichenau: History Reappraisal Memory*. Innsbruck: Tyrola publishing, p. 43.
[472] Hollaus, Melanie and Heidi Schleich (Eds.) (2017): *Bocksiedlung. Ein Stück Innsbruck*. Innsbruck: Studienverlag, p. 92.
[473] Ibid., p. 62.

class would be a borderline miracle if we followed the logic ascribed to this area. What could be observed here was a reversal of the conclusions that Paul Willis drew from his ethnographic work on British working-class youths. In Learning to Labor, he contrasted the "lad's culture" that was "making its own realistic bets about its best chances in a class society and about how best to approach an impoverished future in manual work" with the lads' advisors who are "tying themselves up in humanistic, developmental knots which bear very little relation to the actual laboring futures of their pupils."[474] Willis criticized the way teachers were out of touch with their students' future working realities. In contrast, the teachers of 4x seemed to draw their pupils' futures in the darkest colors. "Generation AMS" excluded all other forms of statement[475] that would refer, alternatively, to the recognition of success against most tremendous odds that some children achieved.

According to the prominent urban historian, Dolores Hayden, "[U]rban landscapes are storehouses for these social memories, because natural features such as hills or harbors, as well as streets, buildings, and patterns of settlement, frame the lives of many people and often outlast many lifetimes."[476] Social memory inscribed in the multi-story buildings and local knowledge of this neighborhood overshadowed rays of hope and an approach of "response-ability" as described by Sondra Perl in On Austrian Soil: "the willingness to take another person's words and questions seriously. Not to turn our backs. Not to be silent."[477] I argue that social memory and local knowledge shared by the teachers of 4x amplified the undoubtedly harsh conditions many of their pupils faced. However, I contend that local knowledge spilled over into local myths and influenced teachers' believes about the futures of their students.

5.2.4.2 "Would you rather go into the past or in the future?"[478]

Carrying on with Foucault's methodological approach to discourse, I ask, "What is this specific existence that emerges from what is said?" – i.e., what is the specific existence of "Generation AMS"?[479] In my ethnographic field notes, I captured a conversation between Kevin and Tim that started off as an interview presentation to me. The boys shared a history of migration to Austria from similar regions of southeastern Europe. Whereas Kevin's family

---

[474] Willis, Paul (1973): *Learning to Labor: How Working Class Kids Get Working Class Jobs*. New York: Columbia University Press, p. 205.

[475] Foucault, Michel (1989): *The Archaeology of Knowledge.* London: Routledge, p. 31.

[476] Hayden, Dolores (1999): *The Power of Place: Urban Landscapes as Public History*. Cambridge: The MIT Press, p.9.

[477] Perl, Sondra (2005): *On Austrian Soil: Teaching Those I Was Taught to Hate*. New York: The University of New York Press, p. 84.

[478] Field notes taken on June 8, 2017.

[479] Ibid.

had already gone through the Austrian education system for two generations, Tim seemed to remember destroyed houses and schools from his own experience. Both, however, shared a sense of future failure that they wanted to escape. They imagined themselves as their past-selves, instead of their future-selves for fear of "ruining the future." This fear I would like to set next to an experience that Kevin had as a response to his work. When he wrote about a boy who pointed a gun at a stranger who had entered the boy's room at night, the teacher commented: "I hope you will never point a gun at somebody." These were future assumptions that Kevin was confronted with. Though Kevin's current living situation might not leave much room to imagine the situation differently, the teacher did not use power in a way that would open positive fields of action, but rather expressed to a 10-year-old child an expectation of failure and misconduct. I argue that this sort of judgment pointed to the way the Austrian school system expected teachers to make assumptions about their pupils' schooling careers. As early as in third grade, pupils started building a record of performance that would be considered in formulating recommendations for Gymnasium or middle school. Sadly, the teachers of 4x might even be right in their judgment if we consider the statistics on upward mobility gathered by the OCED and mentioned in subsection 1.1. In Austria, among the 25- to 44-year-olds whose parents were born abroad and did not acquire a secondary school diploma, 50 percent did not finish school successfully, either, surpassing the OECD-average by 13 percent, in contrast to the 16 percent of their Austria-born counterparts who did not manage a secondary school diploma (OECD average: 27 percent).

George and Louise Spindler's depiction of Roger Harker showed how larger social knowledge informed teachers' perception and judgments. The Harker case provides an interesting angle for considering the ethnographic material discussed above. The Spindlers collected data on a young teacher who was highly appreciated by his colleagues and superiors for such qualities as being "fair and just to all of the children."[480] However, in his classroom, attended by children "from a broad social stratum – upper middle, middle, and lower classes" of various ethnic groups, a significant mismatch between the children's ratings and his ratings on who was a good student, who was sociable, etc., became apparent. The Spindlers summarized that Roger Harker called "most frequently on, touched, helped, and looked directly at the children culturally like himself."[481] Furthermore, they stated, "he was also informing lower class-class and non-Anglo children that they were less capable, less socially

---

[480] Spindler, George and Louise Spindler (2000): Roger Harker and Schoenhausen: From Familiar to Strange and Back Again. In: Spindler (Eds.): *Fifty Years of Anthropology and Education 1950-2000*. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc. Press, pp. 201-226, p. 204.
[481] Ibid., p. 205.

acceptable, less worth the trouble."[482] They stressed that he was never cruel or overtly racist, but that he "matched, albeit unconsciously, the children like himself – middle class, achievement-oriented, and 'respectable' – to all that was good and desirable."[483] Just like Roger Harker, the teachers of 4x also never expressed overt racism toward the children in their classroom. They treated them with a clear and honest goal of "preparing them for the next school" at the crucial time of selection for secondary schooling. However, "locked into the system,"[484] they sometimes mutually reinforced the expectation of failure. The differentiated schooling system, that distributed students after performance, trained teachers to look for failure and deficit. Furthermore, the "dominant social structure of the community,"[485] was mirrored by a teaching staff of mostly all female, German-mother-tongue speakers.

5.2.4.3 Discussion: Breaking through the Power of Place

In this third theme I discussed future aspirations that teachers communicated to their students and that students circulated among each other. After Erickson, who recommends investigating what teachers expressed as an undesirable outcome[486] of the learning experience, I looked deeper into the verdict of "Generation AMS" that one of the teachers passed on her pupils. I searched for a better understanding of how this statement was connected to further expressions and expectations of failure, and how these resonated within children's interactions. I showed that the remark about Generation AMS missed any positive attributions. They were invisible for the sake of producing the notion of a lost generation. This I considered a result of social memory and local knowledge, constructed from historical and present-day truths that impaired the differentiated response-ability of teachers to their group of learners. Instead, fears of future failure and assumptions of inherited criminal behavior from the place of socialization created a troubled learning atmosphere. The most crucial task in building agency among students was undermined by the phrase "Generation AMS," exclusive of all hopes and aspirations. According to Isolde Heintze, unemployment "constitutes a strong challenge to families and leads to worries for the future, discontent, fears

---

[482] Ibid., p. 205.
[483] Ibid.
[484] Ibid., p. 208.
[485] Ibid., p. 205.
[486] Erickson, Frederick (1984): What Makes School Ethnography, Ethnographic'? In: *Anthropology and Education Quarterly,* 15:1, pp. 51-66, p.18, accessed from http://www.indiana.edu/~educy520/sec5982/week_4/erickson84.pdf, on Sept. 4, 2018.

and tremendous changes on family life and individual development."[487] Clearly this was what teachers imagined as the worst outcome of their students' schooling experience. The stigma related to unemployment benefits for the lazy, the unqualified, the unfit for work, the burden to society resembled the language used to discredit people with disabilities, as shown previously. The verdict of "Generation AMS," on the other hand, evoked the impression that the teacher spoke of pupils who were capable yet unwilling to perform. Paulo Freire's ninth letter Concrete Context/ Theoretical Context, collected in *Teachers as Cultural Workers*, discussed in a similar way the power of place that gripped novice teachers in Sao Paolo, Brazil. One of them expressed anxiety at the prospect of teaching in one of the city's slums: "What we know of these areas of the city, through television and the newspapers, is that they are an arena of absolute violence and that the children become criminals quickly." This woman, Freire commented, spoke of the slum "as if it had created itself rather than being a result of the struggle for survival […], as if it were the refuge of ethical deviation and […] of the slum children almost without hope."[488] Similarly, Richard Rothstein's analysis of the impact of public housing on the segregation of African-American/Latino populations from white Americans, contended that "an usually large share of public housing units are in high-rise buildings. […] The federal government stopped funding high-rise public housing in the 1970s" as they became the false symbol for "neighborhoods, plagued by crime and drugs, and filled with black (or Hispanic) mothers and their children."[489] Speaking with Rutheiser, "school boundaries are quite permeable; the outside world intrudes in numerous ways," and so does the power of its place. The children of the "republic at the edge of the city" could not rid themselves of the stigma of the "patches of shame" that was dominant in social memory and local knowledge. Their neighborhood was an invisible hurdle that the kids of 4x needed to overcome, even before entering the race for grades.

5.3 Conclusion: The *Volksschule* - A School For Whom?

In "Three Miles," broadcast in March 2013, Chana Joffe-Walt, co-producer of the radio program "This American Life," told the story of a group of children who participated in a program bringing together kids from two very different schools three miles apart. University Heights High School was characterized as a public school with a student population that was

---

[487] Heintze, Isolde (2007): Social ecology, unemployment and growing up. The impact of socioecologic contextual factors on educational mobility of children in selected urban quarters of Dresden. In: *Diskurs Jugend-und Kindheitsforschung*, 2:1, pp. 39-51, p. 48.
[488] Freire, Paolo (2005): *Teachers as Cultural Workers: Letters to Those Who Dare Teach*. Cambridge: Westview Press, p. 141 ff.
[489] Rothstein, Richard (2017): *The Color of Law: A forgotten history of how our government segregated America*. New York: Liveright Publishing Corporation, p. 17.

97 percent black people or Hispanics located in the South Bronx, the country's poorest congressional district. Ethical Culture Fieldston School, on the other hand, was an elite private school, 70 percent white, where tuition costs $43,000 a year. A well-intentioned program that aimed to connect kids left one girl in particular traumatized at the sight of the deep divide in terms of race, class and opportunities she was up against: "They couldn't believe the campus. They felt like everyone was looking at them. And one of the students started screaming and crying – like, 'this is unfair. I don't want to be here. I'm leaving. I'm leaving right now. I'm going home.' "[490] I read Joffe-Walt's study while conducting my school ethnography in Austria. Like her, I also experienced two schools located in close proximity to each other whose stark differences struck me deeply. Here, I wrote at length about the school at the edge of the city. The second school I visited was in the center of the city. The schools did not differ only in terms of location, building, teaching style and material; the city school also placed a belief in potential and growth within the children that I rarely encountered in the other setting. The fourth grade classroom of the city-center school consisted of children from all year groups, i.e., first to fourth graders learning together in one group of 16. This was possible because of lessons mostly built on "Freiarbeit," independent learning. The class I visited was led by two teachers supported by two school assistants, who took extra care of two children who had not even been tested for special educational needs status but were known to struggle with psychological challenges. School resources were mobilized to support teachers and students without special-needs status. It was simply arranged. The school was a project school that worked with Montessori pedagogy, which meant that every teacher had not only completed the state examinations to become a teacher but also acquired a Montessori pedagogy degree, which spoke to the commitment and expertise of the teaching staff. Entering the building during school days, I would encounter children working on carpets with learning materials; others writing stories on the computer and reporting back to the teachers at regular intervals. Cooperation and communication among pupils was facilitated and expected. I was surprised when I noticed that class tests and regular measures of achievement did not matter in this group. The teachers' response to my questions of why there was no such testing, which other schools considered essential to prepare their children for the next school, was simply "We quit testing." Kids would throw up before the tests or feel really miserable so the teachers decided they would stop. While in this school, I would think of the children from the edge of the city, their weekly class tests, the

---

[490] This American Life: Three Miles (March 13, 2015), accessed from https://www.thisamericanlife.org/radio-archives/episode/550/transcript, on Sept. 9, 2018.

tears, the fear, the self-inflicted harm after failing yet again. The city-center school graded the children in fourth grade only to be able to refer them to the next school. In this way, stress was limited to the final year of primary school, and grading was introduced with small assignments.

This class, too, had children with migrant backgrounds from Turkey, Chechnya and the Balkans, even though the ratio of 4:16 in the city-center school was much different from 17:2 in the school at the edge of the city. As I spent another day in the city-center school, one boy returned to the general classroom from the first lesson in Islam class. His family was from Chechnya, his teachers said. On his desk, a trophy had been displayed for a few days. I asked, "What did you get the trophy for?" Wrestling, he answered proudly. Upon returning to the class, he got his folder, sat down and started doing his exercises. Did he live in the "Chechen block," too? Were his relatives considered "criminals," too? I wondered.

Despite the choices the city-center school made to support pupils' confidence, agency and motivation, its teaching staff was also subjected to the logic of the differentiated school system and had to make choices of which pupils would continue their education at the academic secondary school and who would attend the New Middle School. When I asked whether any of the four children in the fourth grade who were about to move up to the secondary school level would continue at the academic Gymnasium or whether someone would go to the New Middle School, their teachers told me that all of them would go to Gymnasium. Just one boy would attend the Waldorf School, which was good for him because he had problems with German, their teacher explained. Another girl with Turkish roots, the teacher said, also had problems in mathematics, but she simply belonged in the academic secondary school. She received enough support from home. Her dad, the teacher explained, would pay for extra tuition in mathematics so she would be able to pass in Gymnasium. This was not the only conversation I had about the future of children whose parents were not financially equipped to help their children pass. A black boy was mentioned, as well as a girl from Serbia, who had acquired the formal criteria of very good grades in all classes but were recommended for NMS, since they would lack financial support needed for Gymnasium.

Going to Gymnasium, therefore, was largely connected to the children's socio-economic status, which played a significant role in opening the next door to higher education. In both schools that I observed, it became apparent that more than good grades – also financial, social and emotional support – were needed to be allowed into the academic secondary school. Teachers were at the heart of the decision-making process of who would most likely turn their

educational chances into successes in the future. Fear of sending the "wrong" child to the academic Gymnasium when it did not perform as expected, increased the pressure on primary school teachers to judge not only the potential of development but also to which extent the child would fit into its future schooling environment. Would it be able to perform well in school among the children of elite academics or would it be better off among students that shared its socio-economic background and maybe even its cultural origin? In special schools, the early-tracking system placed children with disabilities at the bottom of the educational hierarchy. Though students with disabilities in mainstream education have challenged the logic of the Austrian school system, policy measures only reached students whose parents were again able to mobilize the resources for supporting their child in school. Other students, like Ceren, continued in mainstream education unsupported and simply identified as weak. It seemed essential to explore the school's context, understood as the wider policy frame, as well as the narrower urban landscape at the "edge of the city," to see the pressures children faced, which erupted at times in verbal and physical aggressions. With my work, I tried to offer alternatives to reading failure of students and disruptive behavior as culturally and ethnically specific. Instead, I attempted to show the stresses built into a schooling system that allowed only four years of personal development before children were judged on their performance and distributed to different schools, even disqualifying some of them in special schools from day one of their formal educational path.

In my final remark, I would like to refer to the OECD's report on Equity and Quality in Education, which laid out that the first formal selection in OECD countries occurred on average at age 15. No countries other than Austria and Germany tracked children according to performance as early as age 10 years.[491] Such early tracking, the OECD report stated, had harsh implications for students from a lower socio-economic background, from immigrant families and with special needs.

> *Student selection, and in particular early tracking, exacerbates differences in learning between students. It has an impact on educational inequities [...].*[492]
>
> *Students from lower socio-economic background are particularly affected by academic selection, and in particular by early tracking. They are disproportionally placed in the   least academically oriented tracks or groups early on, which widen initial inequities (Spinath and Spinath, 2005). [...] students with an immigrant background, when tracked at an early stage, may be locked into a lower educational*

---

[491] OECD (2012): Equity and Quality in Education: Supporting Disadvantaged Students and Schools, OECD Publishing, p. 56

[492] OECD (2012): Equity and Quality in Education: Supporting Disadvantaged Students and Schools, OECD Publishing, p. 58

environment before they have had a chance to develop the linguistic, social and cultural skills to attain their maximum potential (OECD, 2010c). [493]

These OCED remarks stressed that having less time to develop in primary education created disadvantages for children who did not belong to the majority group of higher socio-economic status. The result was a class-confirming school system in which origin mattered more than contribution. This situation, as criticized by Austrian policy papers, built barriers to inclusion on various frontlines, with special educational needs and disabilities being just one of them.

6. Germany

This chapter explores policies and practices of educational inclusion as encountered in a school community in a large German city. It is based on ethnographic research carried out from April to July, 2018. At regular intervals I spent weeks at a time in a *Brennpunktschule*, a high-risk primary school whose pupils were less than one percent native speakers of German, with the vast majority of Muslim faith. Over the weeks of my research stays, a close bond developed between myself as a researcher, the pupils of 6d and the pedagogical staff. I took over teaching responsibilities for a group of pupils with special educational needs, accompanied the class on a visit to a local mosque for the purpose of intercultural learning, and joined pupils in their cooking class. I collected data through participant observations in classroom activities, field trips, class council meetings, theatre workshops and other everyday situations. Because the school was labeled high-risk, the city government provided ample financial resources for school assistants, learning assistants, pedagogues and special pedagogues. I was assured that I was just one more observer who would not provide distraction to the routine. I was allowed to document informal conversations, as well as all conflict resolution meetings that took place during my time at the school, sometimes even twice a week. I gathered extensive descriptions of artifacts and time-and-space organization of learning, and I interviewed every teacher who spent more than three hours a week with the group. I also conducted interviews with the pedagogue and the special pedagogue of 6d, as well as the principal of the school.

My account of the German experience of inclusive education is divided in two main sections. The first is largely a policy analysis which is historically-contextualized in the pedagogical frameworks that guided educational political decisions on disability and migration in former East and West Germany. With regard to contemporary challenges, I draw on the 2018 federal report *Education in Germany* which analyses extensively the systemic

---

[493] OECD (2012): Equity and Quality in Education: Supporting Disadvantaged Students and Schools, OECD Publishing, p. 59

weaknesses of the Germany education system that play out dramatically in limited chances for students to succeed in school at the intersection of migration, multilingualism, poverty and disability. Furthermore, I introduce literature that sheds light on city development and school segregation, especially the so-called "tipping point" development that schools face when the white, majority population leaves a neighborhood. Another core concern in my document analysis is the overlap of inclusive and intercultural pedagogy and the question of compatibility of religion and democracy in education as the diversity of student populations across Germany becomes increasingly more visible and respected.

Valuable insights into education administration and school structural planning were provided by former school director Mario Dobe, who was responsible for implementing the UN-CRPD in education. As the Speaker for the Topic of Inclusion, the Implementation of the Initiative of Sexual Diversity, Diversity and Democracy Education since 2012, he helped me understand how the regional school administration approached educational inclusion. As a former director of a school with similar demographics, his experiences provided interesting points of reference for reading my own ethnographic data when I enquired about the place of religion and culture in institutions of public education, for example, or the tipping-point dynamics. Furthermore, I interviewed the education researcher Hans Anand Pandt, professor of education at Humboldt University and a member of the academic committee of the German School Prize that recognizes schools of excellence in innovative concepts of educational inclusion. I also interviewed Detlef Pech, head of Humboldt's School of Education and professor of social science education at the primary school level.

The second part is a historically and spatially contextualized ethnographic description of a primary school, through which I aim to discuss the complexities of education in migrant societies and the everyday work schools do to safeguard every student's right to education. Through minute documentation of class council meetings in which the pedagogical team time and again addressed conflicts and struggles of their pupils; communication was practiced instead of violence. Most of the pupils in class 6x lived in precarious conditions, with 84 percent of them receiving financial benefits from the government, such as free school lunches and field trips. On top of this, two refugee children from Syria had joined the class in 2016; one living with her family in one of the city's refugee shelters, the other an unattended minor who had not seen his parents in three years. Furthermore, the grade level had received two more children who were taken into foster care because of severe abuse they had experienced in their home countries. Sixteen out of nineteen children attended Islam lessons in school, indicating a segregated school community that had been abandoned by native German-

speakers and their families. Class 6x was a drastic example of hyperdiversity with pupils whose roots were in the Turkish, Iraqi, Kurdish, Lebanese, Persian, Polish, Portuguese and Syrian communities. With their class teacher, a woman with Turkish roots and an experienced pedagogue who had started her career in the German Democratic Republic, this class community truly spoke to a sense of German identity in the making that did not yet have a blueprint for reference. It was extraordinary to witness the interplay of cultural and religious anecdotes and practices when matters of disability, poverty, violence and neglect were discussed. In this school, learning was facilitated through pushing the students to make experiences different from their daily lives by guiding them on visits in and outside of the school's district to a synagogue, a public swimming pool, the planetarium, or by showing them how to use microscopes or high-functioning cameras. The guiding principle of the entire pedagogical staff was to help their students catch up, one step at a time, to the cultural and material goods of German society, which the pupils of 6x had yet to acquire. Valuing their students' own heritage but pushing them urgently for progress with regard to language, knowledge and behavior was a dominant theme in the pedagogical work, tangible in nearly all instances of learning and interaction.

6.1 Policy Analysis

During my empirical research at an urban primary school in summer 2018, I encountered a microcosm of challenges with which the German education system was currently grappling. The commitment to inclusive education through ratifying the UN-CRPD in February 2009 was slowly trickling down from the pages of dry education policy papers into the gritty sphere of classroom practices and schooling cultures. While many special schools were closed in some states (Bremen, Berlin, Schleswig-Holstein), others (North Rhine-Westphalia, Baden-Wuerttemberg) rejected the notion of *gemeinsames lernen*, (learning together) and continued to give parents the choice of where to educate their children with disabilities and special educational needs. Furthermore, an unexpected number of refugee children and adolescents entered the school system in 2015, many of them coming from war-torn regions, often traumatized and unaccompanied by family. Somewhat without planning, the time was ripe for a wider concept of inclusion in education that was not defined solely by the special pedagogical approach to disability as diagnosed deficit, but rather as an approach to understanding diversity and realizing participation for all.[494] However, as I will

---

[494] In reference to Detlef Pech's statement: "die Grunddebatte zwischen [...] einem weiten und einem engen Inklusionsbegriff. Und interessanterweise sind aber diejenigen, die mit einem engen Begriff arbeiten, [...] die adressieren das ja auf die Bedeutung der Förderschulen. Während ich ansonsten... also ich gucke auf Inklusion

show, a federal political system that slows down any reform efforts in the field of education, on the one hand, and a long history of discrimination against people with disabilities, on the other hand, stand in the way of achieving considerable progress when it comes to inclusive education in Germany.

A reform process that had started 10 years before was showing only sobering effects in 2018, as Hans Anand Pandt of Humboldt University confirmed:

> *There are many winners in a segregated system, I think. Abolishing the special schools – in Germany special schools are not abolished, if we look at the statistics. Since 2008, since ratification [of the UN-CRPD], special schools in Germany have not decreased. Maybe from 3.5 to 3.1 [percent]. That means nothing has happened. [...] the number of special schools have remained the same. This also shows how strong the lobbying of this type of school is to maintain it.[495]*

Organizing education federally means different ways of executing binding central legislation. For example, while all students attend primary education, most students in Germany leave primary school after four years, but in some states they move on to secondary education after six years. In addition, the three-tier secondary school system, first introduced in the Weimar Republic, is interpreted by each state in a slightly different fashion. While most states continue to offer three tiers based on students' performance levels - the academic Gymnasium, the vocational Realschule and the basic Hauptschule, other states occasionally attempted to push for one school for all. However, the three tiers were only reduced to two tiers, for example in Berlin, protecting the existence of the academic Gymnasium and allowing for a second strand of integrated secondary schooling. After World War II, the Western allies as well as the Soviet Union planned to close down the three-tier system to democratize German society and create comprehensive secondary schools.[496] The Soviet Union restructured East German education so that all children would study together from first to tenth grade in the *Polytechnische Oberschule*, the polytechnical schools. Students whose

---

als das.… also eigentlich ist für uns Inklusion sozusagen die Rahmung dessen, was wir mit Umgang mit Heterogenität meinen." (the basic debate revolves around a wider and a narrower concept of inclusion. And interestingly enough, those who work with a narrow concept relate its meaning to special schools. While I, well I look at inclusion, actually inclusion is so-to-say the framework of what we understand as dealing with heterogeneity.") Transcript 1 Germany, Interview with Detlef Pech, May 31, 2018, ll. 46-52.

[495] "Es gibt viele Gewinner eines... eines Segregierten Systems glaube ich auch Aber also die Förderschulen abzuschaffen- werden in Deutschland nicht abgeschafft, wenn man das jetzt mal aus den, ich sag mal aus den Statistiken anguckt. Dann hat es seit 2008, also seit da ratifiziert wurde Deutschland die Zahl der Förderschulen [...] praktisch nicht abgenommen. Es ist irgendwie 3,5 auf 3, 1 runter, ich weiß es nicht genau. Das heißt, da passiert gar nichts. [...]sind die Förderschulen fast gleichgeblieben. Und das zeigt auch, wie stark die Lobby ist letztlich diesen Schultyp aufrecht zu halten." Transcript 2 Germany, Interview with Hans Anand Pandt, June 1, 2018, ll. 255-262.

[496] Edelstein, Benjamin, Veith, Hermann (2017): Schulgeschichte nach 1945: Von der Nachkriegszeit bis zur Gegenwart (School history after 1945: From the post-war years to the present). *Bundeszentrale für politische Bildung* (Federal Agency for Civic Engagement), accessed from http://www.bpb.de/gesellschaft/bildung/zukunft-bildung/229702/schulgeschichte-nach-1945, on Sept. 29, 2018.

grades were outstanding continued their education at the *Erweiterte Oberschule*, an extended grammar school where they could graduate with diplomas that allowed them to enter universities. The Western allies could not install a comprehensive school model, as resistance from the West German states was too strong, leading to the reinstatement of the three-tier system in 1955.[497]

Despite occasional school pilot projects of integrated classes that started in West Germany in the 1970s, children with disabilities and special educational needs have been separated from pupils who performed in the norm range of psychological and motor-physical testing. In Germany, *Sonderschulen* or *Förderschulen* traditionally concentrate on knowledge, care and education of the students in special schools for seven types of focus: emotional and social development, the blind and visually impaired, the cognitively disabled, the deaf or hard of hearing, the physically disabled, the learning-disabled, and the language-disabled. Praised as places where students receive expert treatment and can develop their potential in a sheltered environment, the special schools have seen their reputation crumbling.[498] Students at these institutions rarely acquire any job qualifications and often do not even finish their education.[499] Furthermore, there is a strong bias when it comes to the population of special schools with the focus on learning, which are attended by a disproportionate number of students with migrant backgrounds. Also, where inclusive education is offered, 89.5 percent of students are taught in secondary education outside the academic gymnasium and the vocational Realschule.[500] The education scholar Klaus Klemm labeled this situation as efforts of "inclusion that take place in exclusion."[501] Inclusive education remains a battlefield on which some states revert to compartmentalizing students into specialized facilities and classes, while others try to work with the diversity of their students. In this light, I want to stress the vulnerability to which people with disabilities continue to be exposed, as the *Fifth Poverty and Wealth Report of the Federal Republic of Germany* notes:

> *People with impairments are in comparison to the total population overproportionally endangered by poverty. Their unemployment quota is nearly twice as high as the average. Impairments or disabilities continue to pose a risk for social mobility. For the chronically sick, the risk of poverty is especially high.[502]*

---

[497] Ibid.

[498] Powell, Justin J.W., Edelstein, Benjamin and Jonna M. Blanck (2016): Awareness-raising, legitimation and backlash? Effects of the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities on education systems in Germany. In: *Globalisation, Societies and Education*, 14:2, pp. 227-250, p. 228.

[499] Education in Germany, p. 122.

[500] Bertelsmann Stiftung (2015): *Inklusion in Deutschland. Daten und Fakten*. (Inclusion in Germany. Data and Facts). Prof. Dr. phil. Klaus Klemm im Auftrag der Bertelsmann Stiftung, p. 34.

[501] Ibid.

[502] "Menschen mit Beeinträchtigungen sind im Vergleich zur Gesamtbevölkerung überdurchschnittlich häufig armutsgefährdet. Ihre Erwerbslosenquote ist nahezu doppelt so hoch wie der Durchschnitt. Beeinträchtigungen

6.1.1 Poverty-induced Educational Gaps

Despite humanitarian and financial efforts by the German government in 2015, the German economic system on the whole flourished in 2016. The *Fifth Poverty Report* stressed that the country observed the "highest number of employees and the lowest unemployment rate since reunification [in 1989], as well as increasing real wages, especially for low earners."[503] However, the 2018 federal education report, titled *Education in Germany*, concluded that with regard to the gross domestic product, an essential indicator of economic development, regional disparities between West and East as well as South and North were remarkable:

> *In 2016, the gross domestic product per person in the area of East Germany (including Berlin) was at 29,477 Euros (77.2 percent of the federal average); in West Germany it was 40,301 Euros (105.6 percent).[504]*

A disparity to this extent affected the financial situations of the individual German states, which in turn affected budget calculations and allocations of resources in the states' education systems.[505] One key topic of analysis that *Education in Germany* presented was the calculation of "risk situations." The report highlighted that, compared internationally, in Germany such factors as family conditions, engagement in education, and acquisition of competences were closely interlinked. Looking at parents' degree of education, the family's socio-economic status and parents' involvement in the labor market, the report identified three risk situations: formally low-qualified parents, social risk and financial risk. The report summarized the following statistics on risk situations in Germany in 2016:

> *Almost 30 percent, almost every third child, is affected by one of these risk situations. [...] A typical consequence of the risk situation* formally low qualified parents *can be lack of support for children in school matters [...] 12 percent of children are affected by this risk situation, which has been unchanged since 2006. [...] In 2016, 10 percent*

---

oder Behinderungen stellen weiterhin Risiken für die soziale Mobilität dar. Bei chronisch Kranken ist das Armutsrisiko besonders hoch." Bundesministerium für Arbeit und Soziales: Der Fünfte Armuts- und Reichtumsbericht der Bundesregierung: Lebenslagen in Deutschland, Armuts-und Reichtumsberichterstattung der Bundesregierung (Kurzfassung), pp. 1-48, p. 36, accessed from http://www.bmas.de/SharedDocs/Downloads/DE/PDF-Pressemitteilungen/2017/5-arb-kurzfassung.pdf?__blob=publicationFile&v=2, on Sept. 12, 2018.

[503] Bundesministerium für Arbeit und Soziales: Der Fünfte Armuts- und Reichtumsbericht der Bundesregierung: Lebenslagen in Deutschland, Armuts-und Reichtumsberichterstattung der Bundesregierung (Kurzfassung), pp. 1-48, p. 5, accessed from http://www.bmas.de/SharedDocs/Downloads/DE/PDF-Pressemitteilungen/2017/5-arb-kurzfassung.pdf?__blob=publicationFile&v=2, on Sept. 12, 2018.

[504] Das BIP je Person lag 2016 im Gebiet von Ostdeutschland (mit Berlin) bei 29.477 Euro (77,2 % des Bundesdurchschnitts), in Westdeutschland betrug es 40.301 Euro (105,6 %).

[505] Die wirtschaftliche Leistungsfähigkeit wird wegen der regionalen Unterschiede in den Wirtschaftsstrukturen und der ungleichen Verteilung sehr großer Unternehmen auch noch langfristig von größeren Differenzen geprägt sein; sie hat Auswirkungen vor allem auf die finanzielle Situation der Länderhaushalte und deren Ressourcen auch für das Bildungswesen.

of children grow up with parents who are unemployed. Through this social risk situation *the children miss access to resources of social life that employment positively impacts, such as assistance, contacts and help in finding a job or placement for training and internships. With 20 percent, the* financial risk situation *with a family income below the poverty-endangered-threshold is the most prevalent, independent of migrant status and the family set-up, even if parents are employed.* [506]

As the report highlighted, poverty and migration status were close companions of disadvantage that played out dramatically in the school careers of children in Germany. The 2015 Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) outcomes showed that poverty resulted in differences in student performance in natural sciences of up to one full academic year:

> *As in most OECD countries, also in Germany students with a better socio-economic status score in the field of natural science on average more than 30 points higher than socio-economically disadvantaged students (which equals a head start of up to one academic year).* [507]

Furthermore, reading competences decreased significantly at the primary school level. The education report highlighted a widening gap in performance levels compared to the top results of other countries:

> *Student performance at primary school level has not improved. Competence residue compared to the top group of the OECD comparison has increased. Still, there is a comparably high and with regard to reading an even increasing share of low-performing children. The gap between them and the strongest students has – in contrast to almost all countries who participated in the comparison – increased because the performance peak among primary school students has also become larger.* [508]

---

[506] „In Deutschland ist 2016 mit gut 30 % fast jedes dritte Kind von mindestens einer dieser Risikolagen betroffen. [...]Eine typische Folge der Risikolage *formal gering qualifzierter Eltern* kann die fehlende Unterstützungsmöglichkeit für die Kinder etwa in schulischen Belangen sein [...]. 12% der Kinder sind von dieser Risikolage betroffen, seit 2006 hat dieser Anteil keine wesentliche Änderung erfahren. [...] Dennoch wachsen 2016 10 % der Kinder in Haushalten ohne erwerbstätige Eltern auf. Durch diese *soziale Risikolage* fehlt den Kindern unter Umständen der Zugang zu Ressourcen des gesellschaftlichen Lebens, den Erwerbstätigkeit mit sich bringt, so etwa zu Hilfeleistungen, Anerkennung und Kontakten bis hin zum Finden von Praktikums, Ausbildungs und Arbeitsplätzen. [...]Mit aktuell 20 % (2006: 19 %) ist die *finanzielle Risikolage* mit einem Familieneinkommen unter der Armutsgefährdungsgrenze unabhängig vom Migrationsstatus und der Familienform weiterhin am häufigsten, vor der auch Erwerbstätigkeit nicht immer zu schützen vermag." Education in Germany, pp. 35-36.
[507] "Wie in den meisten OECD-Ländern erzielen sozioökonomisch bessergestellte Schülerinnen und Schüler in Deutschland im Bereich Naturwissenschaften durchschnittlich über 30 Punkte mehr als sozioökonomisch benachteiligte Schülerinnen und Schüler (was einem Vorsprung von einem Schuljahr entspricht)." OECD (2016): *Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) Results 2015: Germany*, pp. 1-16, p. 1.
[508] "[...] haben sich die Schülerleistungen im Primarbereich nicht verbessert; dort ist der Kompetenzrückstand zur Spitzengruppe im OECD-Vergleich größer geworden Nach wie vor gibt es hier einen vergleichsweise hohen, im Lesen sogar steigenden Anteil besonders leistungsschwacher Kinder Ihr Abstand zu den leistungsstärksten

Hence, there were more children who performed very well on standardized testing, but the gap between those who did well and those who scored poorly widened continuously. Furthermore, significantly lower results compared to the average across Germany were achieved in reading at grade levels 4 and 9 in Bremen and Berlin.[509] Those two city-states implemented inclusive education on a large scale, including the closing of most special schools. However, these city-states also shared much higher percentages of migrant students and those at risk from poverty than the top-performing states: Bavaria, Saxony and Schleswig-Holstein.[510]

Education in Germany also highlighted that the more children within one family, the greater probability of a risk situation. Only children were affected by 16 percent, children with one sibling by 17 percent and those from families with three and more children by 33 percent.[511] Children who grew up with only one parent were also at high risk of growing up in poverty, the report stressed:

> *While almost every third child in Germany was affected by one of these risk situations, the share of children growing up with a single parent was nearly twice as high, at 59 percent. Also, children with a migrant background are strongly affected, with 49 percent. [...]*[512]

4 percent of children grow up in households affected by all three risk situations. However, among these 4 percent, 12 percent grow up in single-parent-homes and 2 percent in homes with two parents. In addition, migrant experiences play out in risk situations. Whereas 2 percent of children without migrant backgrounds are affected by all three risk situations, the figure is 8 percent for children who have a migrant background.[513]

Considering these statistics, Education in Germany summarized that the background of a student with socio-economic and migrant-related issues significantly affected school

---

Schülerinnen und Schülern hat sich– anders als in fast allen Vergleichsstaaten – vergrößert, da auch die Leistungsspitze unter den Grundschulkindern größer geworden ist." Education in Germany, p. 8.

[509] "Signifikant höher als der deutsche Gesamtwert fällt sowohl in Jahrgangsstufe 4 als auch in Jahrgangsstufe 9 der Anteil der Berliner und der Bremer Schülerinnen und Schüler aus, die an den Mindeststandards scheitern." Ibid, p.117

[510] Ibid.

[511] "Mit der Anzahl der Kinder in der Familie steigt auch das Risiko der Armutsgefährdung: Kinder in Einkindfamilien sind zu 16%, Kinder in Zweikindfamilien zu 17 % und Kinder, die in Familien mit 3 und mehr Kindern aufwachsen, zu 33 % von dieser Risikolage betroffen." Education in Germany, p. 36.

[512] "Während fast jedes dritte Kind in Deutschland von mindestens einer dieser Risikolagen betroffen ist, ist dieser Anteil bei den Kindern Alleinerziehender mit 59% beinahe doppelt so hoch. Auch Kinder mit Migrationshintergrund sind mit 49% stark betroffen [...]" Education in Germany, p. 38.

[513] "Insgesamt beträgt der Anteil von Kindern, die in Haushalten mit allen 3 Risikolagen aufwachsen, seit 2006 relativ konstant rund 4%. Hier ist ein deutlicher Unterschied zwischen Paarfamilien und Alleinerziehenden festzustellen: Bei Letzteren ist der Anteil derer, die von allen 3 Risikolagen betroffen sind, mit 12% überproportional höher als bei Paarerziehenden mit lediglich 2%. Auch Kinder mit Migrationshintergrund sind zu 8% von allen 3 Risikolagen betroffen, solche ohne Migrationshintergrund demgegenüber nur zu 2%." Education in Germany, p. 38.

success. The report concluded: "Despite education political reform projects and improvements, educational inequality has not been noticeably reduced."[514]

6.1.2 Migrants: "The losers in the German education system"[515]

In a 2009 report, the Boston Consulting Group (BCG), an international management firm, focused on the devastating consequences for the German economy if students with migrant backgrounds continued to be "the great losers in the German education system."[516] The report, titled *Location Factor Educational Integration*, highlighted that 9.6 percent of students in Germany shared a migration background. In secondary education, they made up only 4 out of 100 students enrolled in the Gymnasium - the academic secondary schools. Much larger proportions of migrant students attended the Hauptschule (20 percent), which qualified them for basic, vocational training, or special schools where students with migrant backgrounds made up 16 percent.[517] The BCG report also presented a worrisome outlook based on statistics generated by the OECD PISA-studies. More than 40 percent of students with migrant backgrounds were considered at-risk students, which meant they achieved only the lowest qualification step regarding the competences that PISA measured (natural sciences, reading, and mathematics). Students without migrant backgrounds made up only 12 percent of at-risk students. The report concluded with a grim prognosis for the future of migrant students in Germany:

> *Almost every second teenager with a migrant background is missing elementary basic skills to perform well in further training and job education. Considering these conditions, it is not surprising that today every third migrant born in Germany will remain without a job qualification. Yearly, almost 80,000 young people are released into a life without prospects.[518]*

In 2009, the Kultusministerkonferenz (KMK), the Standing Conference of the Ministers of Education and Cultural Affairs, highlighted that based on PISA statistics in the fields of mathematics and natural sciences, students with migrant backgrounds lagged more than two

[514] "*Als besonders bedeutsam erweist sich dabei nach wie vor die Herkunft, bei der meist sozioökonomische und migrationsbezogene Problemlagen zusammenfallen Trotz vieler bildungspolitischer Reformprojekte und damit verbundener Verbesserungen ist es bisher nicht gelungen, Bildungsungleichheiten entscheidend zu verringern.*" See: *Bildung in Deutschland: Ein indikatorengestützter Bericht mit einer Analyse zu Wirkungen und Erträgen von Bildung. (Education in Germany: An indicator-based report with an analysis on the effects and returns of education.) Autorengruppe Bildungsbereicht (Author team education report), pp. 1-377, p.14.*

[515] Veith, Christian, Koehler, Martin, Monika Reiter (June, 2009): Standortfaktor Bildungsintegration: Bildungschancen von Schülern mit Migrationshintergrund entscheidend für Standort Deutschland. (Location Factor Educational Integration: Educational chances for students with a migrant background crucial for location factor Germany), The Boston Consulting Group, accessed from http://img-stg.bcg.com/Standortfaktor%20Bildungsintegration%20Bildungschancen%20von%20_tcm108-141129.pdf, on Sept. 11, 2018, p. 9.

[516] Ibid.

[517] Ibid., p. 10.

[518] Ibid., p.10.

academic years behind the non-migrant population.[519] Statistics in the *Education in Germany* report showed that the spatial distribution of migrants varied greatly between former West and East Germany. Furthermore, whereas on the whole every fifth person in Germany had migrant experience, the percentages for children and teenagers were much higher:

> *Among those under 6 years olds it is 38 percent, 6-year-olds to 10-year-olds 37 percent and 10-year-olds to 15-year-olds 34 percent who have migrant backgrounds. These shares significantly differ regionally: While among the 6-to 10-year-old children in West Germany and Berlin 42 percent have migrant backgrounds, in East Germany it is only 11 percent. With a total of 96 percent, most people with migrant backgrounds live in West Germany and Berlin. [...] Altogether, 32 percent of people with migrant backgrounds belong to the second generation, which means they were born in Germany. [...] Among the 6-year-olds with migrant backgrounds this share makes up about 87 percent [...]. Until the age group of 22, their share [second-generation migrants] is larger than those who experienced immigration (first-generation).[520]*

The differences in migrant numbers in former East and West Germany can be explained with the different migrant policies that were installed on both sides of the Iron Curtain. When the German Democratic Republic (GDR) needed workers for its industry and building sites, it organized contracts with socialist Third World countries, such as Vietnam, Angola, Mozambique and Cuba,"[521] in the 1980s. These male contract workers were not allowed to stay in East Germany longer than four years. To ensure that they did not attempt to integrate into society, the East German government placed guest laborers in spatially separated hostels and high-rise residential areas close to the building sites and industrial complexes where they worked.[522] Many of these highly discriminative practices were reminiscent of the treatment of

---

[519] "Erlärung der Partner des Nationalen Paktes für Ausbildung und Fachkräftenachwuchs in Deutschland, der Bundesagentur für Arbeit, der Kultusministerkonferenz und der Beauftragten der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration (Statement of the Partner of the National Pact for Traning and Skilled Labor Trainees in Germany, the Federal Agency for Labor, the KMK and the Commissioner of the Federal Republic for Migration, Refugees and Integration) accessed from https://www.kmk.org/fileadmin/veroeffentlichungen_beschluesse/2009/2009_02_00-Potenziale-Integration.pdf , on Sept. 19, 2018.

[520] "Bei den unter 6Jährigen beträgt ihr Anteil 38%, bei den 6 bis unter 10Jährigen 37%, bei den 10 bis unter 15-Jährigen 34% [...]. Während etwa bei den 6 bis unter 10jährigen Kindern in Westdeutschland und Berlin 42% einen Migrationshintergrund haben, sind es in Ostdeutschland nicht einmal 11%. Mit 96% leben weiterhin die deutlich meisten Menschen mit Migrationshintergrund in Westdeutschland und in Berlin [...] Insgesamt gehören 32% der Menschen mit Migrationshintergrund der 2. Generation an, sind also in Deutschland geboren. [...] Bei den unter 6Jährigen mit Migrationshintergrund beträgt ihr Anteil rund 87%. [...] Noch bis zum Alter von 22 Jahren ist ihre Anzahl größer als die derjenigen mit eigener Zuwanderungserfahrung (1. Generation)." *Bildung in Deutschland: Ein indikatorengestützter Bericht mit einer Analyse zu Wirkungen und Erträgen von Bildung. (Education in Germany: An indicator-based report with an analysis on the effects and returns of education.) Autorengruppe Bildungsbereicht (Author team education report), pp. 1-377, p. 26.*

[521] Kemper, Franz-Josef (1997): Restructuring of Housing and Ethnic Segregation: Recent Developments in Berlin. In: *Urban Studies*, 35:10, pp. 1765-1789, p. 1771.

[522] Ibid.

forced laborers during the Nazi regime. The literature and cultural studies scholar Peggy Piesche illuminates the following conditions to which the treaty countries agreed:

> *No possibility of bringing over other family members [...] Immediate deportation in the case of pregnancy [of an East German woman through a migrant worker] (treaties with Cuba, Vietnam, Mozambique, and Zambia) [...] immediate deportation should political activity fall outside previously set framework [...]multi-ethnic couples were not legally entitled to a shared place of residency.* [523]

Before reunification, "in 1989, a total of 191,000 foreign immigrants lived in the GDR, corresponding to 1.2 percent of the population."[524] Needless to say, integration through pedagogical tools was not of interest to East German education policy makers. In contrast to that, *Ausländerpädagogik* developed as a West German product of the 1970s, after guest workers from Italy, Greece, Turkey and other Mediterranean countries had been invited to the federal republic a decade previously. The education scholar Doron Kiesel illuminates the societal and education political changes that led from *Ausländerpädagogik*, foreigners' pedagogy, to intercultural pedagogy in the West German discourse on educating migrants. According to Kiesel, preparation classes had already begun in 1971 to equip migrants' children with German language skills that would support their integration into primary education. In 1971, the KMK also encouraged language classes in migrant students' native languages in schools to enable "'the maintenance of the students' connection to the language and culture of their home countries [Heimat]'" and also, as Kiesel adds to "ensure their capability of returning back."[525] As Kiesel writes, it was the difficulties that migrant students experienced in the German education system that finally drew public and political attention to the societal changes invoked by migrant populations settling in the federal republic.[526] The key purpose of *Ausländerpädagogik*, Kiesel explains, was to help foreigners integrate into society, considered a "one-way process" that had to be accomplished by the foreigner alone.[527] In Kiesel's analysis, *Ausländerpädagogik* constructed the "picture of a migrant who

---

[523] Piesche, Peggy (2002): Black and German? East German adolescents before 1989: A retrospective view of a 'non-existent issue' in the GDR. In: Adelson, Leslie A. (Ed.): *The cultural afterlife of East Germany: New transnational perspectives.* American Institute for Contemporary German Studies Humanities, Vol. 13, pp. 37-59, pp. 42-43.

[524] Kemper, Franz-Josef (1997): Restructuring of Housing and Ethnic Segregation: Recent Developments in Berlin. In: *Urban Studies*, 35:10, pp. 1765-1789, p. 1771.

[525] Kiesel, Doron (2006): Von der Ausländerpädagogik zur Interkulturellen Erziehung: Zur erziehungswissenschaftlichen Rezeption der Zuwanderung in die Bundesrepublik Deutschland (From foreigner pedagogy to intercultural education: On the education scientific reception of immigration into the Federal Republic of Germany). Vortrag (Presentation paper), accessed from https://www.lvr.de/media/wwwlvrde/jugend/beruns/politik_1/dokumente_53/20061129_11tejhk2vortragkiesel.pdf, on Sept. 20, 2018, pp. 1-12, pp. 1ff.

[526] Ibid.

[527] Ibid., p. 3.

was a helpless, infantile foreigner incapable of learning/using the country's host language and in need of support from members of the majority society and its institutions."[528] The construction of foreigners as deficient individuals fueled an approach to the migrant child that Kiesel called *Nachsozialisation*, i.e., the belief that migrant children needed to be resocialized and should receive correction from schools and other government institutions to their upbringing at home. As early as the 1970s, Kiesel highlights, integration was defined by school success. In reverse, the framework of *Ausländerpädagogik* assumed that school failure originated in lower cultural, cognitive and financial capital prevalent in migrant families, not in discriminatory practices found in governmental institutions and schools.

Ausländerpädagogik was increasingly criticized on the basis of its "deficit-hypothesis,"[529] since it depicted German-majority society as the peak of intellectual and cultural development to which migrant children were expected to aspire. In the early 1980s, when it became clear that the newcomers would not go back to their home countries, *Ausländerpädagogik* was replaced by intercultural pedagogy, which postulated that "the German education system needs to adjust itself to learners from very different cultural backgrounds."[530] This approach turned away from facilitating the process of assimilation and instead took into view how multicultural society could support peaceful coexistence of different cultural parties. This way, Kiesel stressed, intercultural pedagogy was equipped with a clear political goal: "In the case of intercultural conflicts, intercultural pedagogy will have to lead all conflicting parties to respecting the principles of a liberal democracy and a democratic way of life." Hence, intercultural pedagogy has the task of accustoming members of an ethnic group to the political rules of modern citizenship and to teach them that "ethnicity enriched someone's existence but was not a constituting characteristic of someone's personal and political existence." Hand in hand with the pedagogical approach of *Ausländerpädagogik*, housing policies pursued the goal of containing migrants in certain districts in West Berlin, for example. Here, Turkish migrants received a seal on their ID cards that would allow them to settle only in districts that were typically inhabited by the working class, others were prohibited to them.[531] By 1991, the urban sociologist Franz-Josef Kemper summarized, "320,000 foreigners lived in West Berlin, the largest ethnic community being the Turks with

---

[528] Ibid.
[529] Ibid.
[530] Ibid.
[531] Waldman, Ofer (Feb. 6, 2017): Der Feind meines Feindes ist ...mein Nachbar (The enemy of my enemy is...my neighbor). *Deutschlandfunk Kultur* (Germany radio culture), accessed from https://www.deutschlandfunkkultur.de/gentrifizierung-in-berlin-neukoelln-der-feind-meines.976.de.html?dram:article_id=378271, on. Oct. 2, 2018.

135,000 inhabitants."[532] Partly as a result of these initial containment strategies, to this day large concentrations of migrants can be found in certain districts of Berlin or West Germany. The 2017 federal report on poverty stressed that

> *Especially in economically strong regions and many large cities and university towns, rents increase significantly. As a consequence, socio-spatial segregation impends: Increasingly, low-income households are concentrated in certain areas of larger cities.[533]*

Coupled with poorly monitored housing policies, segregation can have detrimental effects on schools, as Mario Dobe, a former principal in a West German school district, reported from his own experiences,

> *My experiences from this time or when I think of what I observed at other schools that were pretty much ruined because no more students would be signed up here was that if a school exceeds 80 percent of students from a non-German background, then these demographics cannot be reversed at this school anymore. Then you have to make the best of the situation and try to develop concepts on how to work with this student body.[534]*

In 1971, Thomas C. Schelling, winner of the 2005 Nobel Prize in Economics, published his research on "mechanisms that translate unorganized, individual behavior into collective results,"[535] in other words "segregation – or separation, or sorting – that can result from discriminatory individual behavior."[536] Based on his own and others' works, he summarized that " 'tipping' is said to occur when a recognizable new minority enters a neighborhood in sufficient numbers to cause the earlier residents to begin evacuating."[537] Schilling confirmed Dobe's account: "City school systems evidently lend themselves to this phenomenon [tipping]."[538] Minor decisions based on the close interrelation of racial discrimination and

---

[532] Kemper, Franz-Josef (1997): Restructuring of Housing and Ethnic Segregation: Recent Developments in Berlin. In: *Urban Studies*, 35:10, pp. 1765-1789, p. 1772.

[533] " Insbesondere in wirtschaftsstarken Zuzugsräumen und vielen Groß- und Universitätsstädten stiegen die Mieten deutlich. Als Folge droht sozialräumliche Segregation: Zunehmend konzentrieren sich einkommensschwache Haushalte in begrenzten Teilgebieten größerer Städte." Bundesministerium für Arbeit und Soziales: Der Fünfte Armuts- und Reichtumsbericht der Bundesregierung: Lebenslagen in Deutschland, Armuts-und Reichtumsberichterstattung der Bundesregierung (Kurzfassung), pp. 1-48, p. 40, accessed from http://www.bmas.de/SharedDocs/Downloads/DE/PDF-Pressemitteilungen/2017/5-arb-kurzfassung.pdf?__blob=publicationFile&v=2, on Sept. 12, 2018.

[534] "[…]meine Erfahrung ist aus der Zeit oder wenn ich auch andere Schulen beobachtet habe, die dann auch zum Teil halt tatsächlich richtig kaputtgegangen sind, weil sie keine Schülerinnen und Schüler mehr hatten, wenn man 80% überschritten hat, bei nicht deutscher Herkunft, dann ist das fast nicht mehr umzudrehen. Dann muss man sich damit abfinden, dann muss man versuchen Konzepte zu entwickeln, wie man mit dieser Struktur der Schülerschaft auch arbeitet." Transcript 9 Germany, Interview with Mario Dobe, July 12, 2018, ll. 790-795.

[535] Schelling, Thomas C. (1971): Dynamic Models of Segregation. In: *Journal of Mathematical Sociology*, vol.1, pp. 143-186, p. 145.

[536] Ibid., p 144.

[537] Ibid., p. 182.

[538] Ibid., p. 186.

economic bias can significantly affect a demographic shift in neighborhoods, villages or even cities. Schelling outlined:

> *To choose a neighborhood is to choose neighbors. To pick a neighborhood with good schools is to pick a neighborhood of people who appreciate schools (or of people who want to be with the kind of people who appreciate schools). People may furthermore rely, even in making economic choices, on information that is itself color-discriminating; believing that darker-skinned people are on the average poorer than lighter-skinned, one may consciously or unconsciously rely on color as an index of poverty (or, believing that others rely on color as an index, adopt their signals and indices in order to coincide with them). And if the process goes far enough, alienation, strangeness, fear, hostility, and sheer habit can accentuate the tendency toward avoidance."[539]*

I consider Schelling's work very timely and insightful to the developments that school administrators and practitioners at my research site described to me. The principal explained that his school, over 90 percent of whose students are non-German native speakers, had "tipped," from being a multicultural schooling community into a predominantly Muslim student population from various ethnic contexts. In light of the above and the unprecedented number of refugees Germany accepted in 2015 (1.16 million) and 2016 (635,000) the issue of educating children with migrant experiences as well as neighborhood peace and composition has advanced to top priority for (education) policy and practice. The distribution of refugees across communities in Germany has repeatedly been met with harsh and sometimes violent protests, not only but especially from inhabitants of former East German states. *Education in Germany* summarized the current challenges with the following statistics:

> *Among the newcomers who came between 2014 and 2016, the proportion of persons with university degrees (23%) is higher than in the population average (17%). At the same time, however, the proportion of persons without vocational qualifications (53%) is significantly higher than the population average (26%). 41% of new migrants come from EU countries, 12% more from other European countries. Outside Europe, Syria, Iraq and Afghanistan are the most important regions of origin (25%). Especially for newcomers from these states, their level of education is lower than in the average population. However, the overall education standard of the entire population is barely affected; nonetheless, the integration of newcomers is also a particular challenge for the education system.[540]*

---

[539] Ibid., p. 145.

[540] "*Unter den zwischen 2014 und 2016 Neuzugewanderten ist der Anteil der Personen mit Hochschulabschluss (23 %) höher als im Bevölkerungsdurchschnitt (17 %) Gleichzeitig ist aber auch der Anteil der Personen ohne beruflichen Abschluss (53 %) deutlich höher als im Bevölkerungsdurchschnitt (26 %) 41 % der Neuzugewanderten kommen aus EU-Staaten, weitere 12 % aus anderen europäischen Staaten Außerhalb von Europa stellten Syrien, Irak und Afghanistan mit 25 % die wichtigsten Herkunftsregionen dar. Gerade bei Neuzugezogenen aus diesen Staaten ist der Bildungsstand aber niedriger als im Bevölkerungsdurchschnitt
Insgesamt ändert sich zwar der Bildungsstand in der Bevölkerung aufgrund der im Vergleich zur Gesamtbevölkerung geringen Zahl der Neuzugezogenen nur geringfügig, jedoch stellt ihre Integration auch für das Bildungssystem eine besondere Herausforderung dar.*" Bildung in Deutschland: Ein indikatorengestützter Bericht mit einer Analyse zu

This "particular challenge for the education system," as mentioned above, was strongly noticeable in schools that were at the forefront of integration in the months after the summer of 2015. During the 2015-16 school year primary, secondary and vocational schools observed an increase of "200,000 to 250,000 refugee children and teenagers, partially unaccompanied, underage refugees."[541] The KMK declared education to be the crucial means of integration:

> *Only the access to education enables successful integration. Integration should be created from the very beginning. The [KMK] ministers know that this is the task of a generation.[542]*

Since migrants from the 1970s had been expected to leave Germany once their work contracts ran out, integrational efforts undertaken by the education system were limited back then. This time in 2018, as expressed by the KMK, integration was encouraged "from the very beginning," facilitated through "swift acquisition of language and democratic values."[543] Hence, teachers were presented with the challenge of developing, nearly overnight, adequate language support, sensitive subject teaching, and pedagogical tools to integrate students into the social life of their new schools and neighborhoods. Some schools opened "Welcome Classes" or "Preparation Classes," groups of all-refugee students to teach them basic German until they were integrated into general classes. *Education in Germany* outlined the measures schools took across the country:

> *It is clear that considerable efforts are being made to integrate newly immigrated children and young people into the school system. In all states, intensive classes or courses in German as a second language were opened to prepare for regular education; in 13 states, direct transition into regular classes was also possible with additional language support. The survey for this education report makes clear that mostly in 2015 and 2016 a clear increase in general "Preparation Classes" took place; compared to 2010 classes were offered 20 times as often in 2015 and 2016. Depending on the state, these extra offers included 32 extra lessons a week, working with classes of 4 to 20 students for a period of one school year up to 2 years.[544]*

Wirkungen und Erträgen von Bildung. (Education in Germany: An indicator-based report with an analysis on the effects and returns of education.) Autorengruppe Bildungsbereicht (Author team education report), pp. 1-377, p. 5.

[541] "Der größte Anteil mit 200.000 bis 250.000 Kindern und Jugendlichen entfällt hierbei auf Geflüchtete, zum Teil unbegleitete minderjährige Geflüchtete." KMK (Oct. 6, 2016): Erklärung der Kultusministerkonferenz zur Integration von jungen Geflüchteten durch Bildung. (Statement of the Standing Conference of the Ministers of Education and Cultural Affairs of the Länder in the Federal Republic of Germany on the integration of young refugees through education), pp. 1-4, p. 2.

[542] Nur der Zugang zu Bildung ermöglicht gelingende Integration. Integration soll von Anfang an gestaltet werden. Die Kultusministerinnen und Kultusminister wissen, dass es sich dabei um eine Generationenaufgabe handelt. Ibid., p. 3.

[543] Ibid.

[544] "In allen Ländern gibt es Intensivklassen oder kurse für Deutsch als Zweitsprache, die auf den Übergang in eine Regelklasse vorbereiten; in 13 Ländern ist aber auch eine direkte Aufnahme in eine Regelklasse mit additiver Sprachförderung möglich. Eine Länderumfrage für den Bildungsbericht macht vor allem 2015 und

However, parting with old solutions, such as Welcome Classes, turned out to be difficult in times in which immediate response was needed. Detlef Pech strongly criticized actions that segregated the newcomers from the general school population,

> *Welcome Classes conform with the most bitter varieties of Ausländerpädagogik, [foreigners' pedagogy] of the 1970s. They are almost identical. I will try to explain it this way: How much sense does it make to place, I don't know, 15 children in one group whose only commonality is that they do not speak the language that they should learn?[545]*

Maybe in secondary education this would make sense, Pech remarked, but he did not see any positive effects of Welcome Classes in primary schools. The contemporary discourse on how to integrate refugee children into mainstream education was paradoxical, given that inclusive education had received top priority in educational reform:

> *Public debate is still about the question of integrating refugees. As if we had not spoken about, discussed inclusion for the last 10 years. The word [inclusion] did not even appear anymore. The entire media coverage about refugees also with regard to schools ... as if we simply forgot that [...]that we have been discussing inclusion for over 10 years, even up to the point that we have inclusive schools and in that same moment where a school celebrates inclusion, they [schools] open a Welcome Class. [...] I thought that was so bizarre. I could not have imagined something like that. There were even rules at schools that were actually considered inclusive that had such excluding strategies when it came to refugees, up to the point that there were separate break times so that regular classes and Welcome Classes would not meet.[546]*

2016 deutliche Zuwächse bei den allgemein als „Vorbereitungsklassen" bezeichneten Angeboten sichtbar, die gegenüber 2010 zum Teil einen Ausbau um mehr als das 20Fache erfahren haben (Tab. D13A). Je nach Land umfassen diese Angebote bis zu 32 Unterrichtsstunden pro Woche, arbeiten mit einer Klassen bzw. Gruppengröße zwischen 4 und 20 Schülerinnen und Schülern und sehen eine Teilnahmedauer von einem Schulhalbjahr bis 2 Jahre vor." *Bildung in Deutschland: Ein indikatorengestützter Bericht mit einer Analyse zu Wirkungen und Erträgen von Bildung. (Education in Germany: An indicator-based report with an analysis on the effects and returns of education.) Autorengruppe Bildungsbereich (Author team education report), pp. 1-377,* p. 93.

[545] „Willkommensklassen entspricht ja den bittersten Varianten der Ausländerpädagogik der 70er Jahre. Das ist ja eins zu eins. Es ist immer. Also ich probiere das immer so zu forcieren mit diesem: wieviel Sinn macht es, keine Ahnung... 15 Kinder in eine Gruppe zu stecken, deren einziges Gemeinsame ist, dass sie alle die Sprache nicht sprechen, die sie aber da lernen sollten." Transcript 1 Germany, Interview with Detlef Pech, May 31, 2018, ll. 481-485.

[546] „[...] öffentliche Diskussion [...] geht immer um die Frage der Integration der Geflüchteten. Und als hätten wir nicht 10 Jahre vorher über Inklusion geredet, diskutiert. Das Wort tauchte gar nicht mehr auf. Also in der ganzen Berichterstattung über Geflüchtet auch im Zusammenhang mit der Situation in den Schulen. Da geht es... also quasi als würde mal eben für ein paar Jahre oder nein...für irgendeinen Zeitraum vergessen werden, worüber wir irgendwie seit 10 Jahren reden und bis hin zu dieser Krönung, dass sozusagen Schulen dann den Schritt zur inklusiven Schule gemacht haben und im selben Moment, wo sie das feiern, richten sie eine Willkommensklasse ein. [...] ich fand es so skurril, dass ich mir das gar nicht hätte ausdenken können. Bis hin ja zur Regelung... also dass wir an Schulen auch die quasi als inklusiv Bezeichneten, die dermaßen ausgrenzende Strategien bei den Geflüchteten gefahren haben mit bis hin zu eigenen Pausenzeit, damit die Regelklassen und die Willkommensklassen sich nicht begegnen." Transcript 1 Germany, Interview with Detlef Pech, May 31, 2018, ll. 254-266.

Pech concluded that education administrators' discussions on refugees were essentially racially charged.[547] He explained: "The idea is actually integration. That is what is wanted; it would be a lie if one spoke of inclusion. Because the core of the matter is the question of assimilation."[548] The KMK's call for integrating refugees into German society through "swift acquisition of language and democratic values" matches the paradigm of intercultural pedagogy to teach for "modern citizenship" and "a democratic way of life." Common to both the inclusive and the intercultural paradigm is the refusal of assimilatory practices. However, inclusion and assimilation are two concepts that require careful reconciliation in a public education system that has the task of inducting youngsters into the democratic constitution of the state. Exemplary of this tension is the question of whether references from the Koran may be used in public classrooms to better connect to students' cultural backgrounds. In the U.S. context, Susan Baglieri, a scholar of disability studies, sees the intersection of multicultural education and inclusive education in the joint push to "reform White, Eurocentric, and ableist discourses that constitute the explicit and hidden curriculum."[549] In the German context, this means practitioners need to navigate students' individual needs and characteristics without trying to assimilate them into the majority society constructed along the lines of heteronormativity, ability, monolingualism, Christianity, etc. How can the "democratic way of life" remain the key principle of educational efforts without assuming a "deficit hypothesis" of students who take pride, self-esteem and knowledge from a different cultural and religious background? Considering the paradox, Pech argued that segregating the newcomers into all-refugee groups in otherwise inclusive schools shows that a common framework addressing the deficit hypothesis has not yet taken root, either in education theory or in practice.

6.1.3 Inclusive Education: "A UFO landed in Germany in 2009"[550]

In 2006, when the UN-CRPD was first introduced to the German policy scape, it was as if a UFO had landed, education researcher Hans Anand Pandt explained,

> *In Germany in 2006 a UFO landed, which is called UN-CRPD. First everyone only looked at it [the convention] and in 2008/2009 the parliament ratified it, which means it was integrated in federal legislation, and then it again took some years, depending*

---

[547] Transcript 1 Germany, Interview with Detlef Pech, May 31, 2018, l. 284.
[548] "die Idee da geht es ja auch tatsächlich um Integration. Das ist ja auch das, was gewollt ist, also deswegen wäre es ja auch gelogen, wenn man von Inklusion reden würde. Es geht ja im Kern um die Frage der Anpassung." Transcript 1 Germany, Interview with Detlef Pech, May 31, 2018, ll. 285-287.
[549] Baglieri, Susan (2016): Toward Unity in School Reform: What DisCrit Contributes. In: Connor, David J., Ferri, Beth A., Annamma, Subini A. (Eds.): *DisCrit: Disabiltiy Studies and Critical Race Theory in Education*. New York: Teachers College Press, pp. 167-182, p. 171.
[550] Taken from Transcript 2 Germany, Interview with Hans Anand Pandt, June 1, 2018, l. 121.

on the state [Bundesland], until they integrated the convention into their state education laws. In Berlin, for example, it took until 2010.[551]

The alien characteristic of the UN-CRPD becomes clear considering that disability and special educational needs in Germany have been largely a matter of specialized institutions and care until the UN-CRPD proclaimed equal access to primary and secondary education for all children. Shifting the view in all German states from the disabled individual to disabling barriers was a revolutionary change from deficit toward potential. Prior to the CRPD, the UN had released the 1994 Salamanca Statement and Framework for Action on Special Needs Education in which:

> *the international community as a whole reaffirmed its commitment to Education for All, recognizing the necessity and urgency of providing education for children, youth and adults with special educational needs within the regular education system.*[552]

That same year, Germany extended article 3.3 of the *Grundgesetz* (constitution) with the following sentence: "No one may be discriminated against on the basis of disability." However, the sphere of education remained unaffected by the Salamanca Statement or the amendment to the constitution. It is crucial to understand the historicity of the 1948 United Nations Universal Declaration of Human Rights, in whose legacy the CRPD stands to grasp the cause, spirit and ethical imperative in which these declarations have been written. Tony Booth and Mel Ainscow, authors of the Index for Inclusion, stress with reference to the experiences of the Holocaust survivor Primo Levi:

> *An inclusive approach to diversity involves understanding and opposing the profound destructive dangers in equating difference or strangeness with inferiority. When this happens and becomes deeply embedded in a culture, it can lead to profound discrimination or even genocide.*[553]

In the following, I turn to accounts that situate special pedagogy as the leading paradigm on educating students with educational needs and disabilities in Germany in a complex history. To understand the extent to which fascist ideology affected the teaching profession and special pedagogy in particular, I will first present historical accounts of the development and

---

[551] " In Deutschland ist 2006 ein UFO gelandet, das nennt sich UN-Behindertenkonvention. Dieses UFO haben erstmal alle angeguckt und 2008/2009 haben sie das im Bundestag dann ratifiziert, also in bundesweite Gesetzgebung überführt und dann hat es je nach Bundesland nochmal ein paar Jahre gedauert, bis die das in ihre jeweiligen Länderschulgesetze geschrieben haben, in Berlin zum Beispiel 2010." Transcript 2 Germany, Interview with Hans Anand Pandt, June 1, 2018, ll. 121-125.

[552] United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO) (1994): The Salamanca Statement and Framework for Action on Special Needs Education, accessed from http://www.unesco.org/education/pdf/SALAMA_E.PDF , on Nov. 28, 2018, p. viii.

[553] Anthony Booth and Mel Ainscow, *Index for Inclusion: Developing Learning and Participation in Schools* (Bristol: Centre for Studies on Inclusive Education, 2011, 3rd Edition), 23.

objectives of special pedagogy during the times of NS in Germany. Secondly, I will focus on continuities and ruptures of the special pedagogical grip on disability in education. Lastly, I want to introduce data on special school demographics that open up the discussion on the intersection of migrant background, multilingualism, gender, poverty and disability in education.

6.1.4 National Socialist Ideology and Special Pedagogy

On Jan. 30, 1933, Hitler was appointed the German chancellor. Within months, the Weimar Republic ceased to exist and the totalitarian Nazi dictatorship was established as the "Third Reich."[554] That July, a law was passed that targeted the *Prevention of Hereditary Defective Offspring*. Not only those who were ill or their legal representatives were held accountable for ensuring that this law was implemented effectively, but also dentists, nurses, medical practitioners and midwives. Doctors and the directors of mental and medical institutes were obliged to follow suit.[555] Victims of such measures as forced sterilizations were "the mentally ill, the impaired, orphans, the unemployed, alcoholics, prostitutes" and others deemed inferior by scientists and care workers.[556] In 1939, midwives and doctors were legally obliged to register infants born with malformations at the public health offices. Soon these children were institutionalized in children's care wards, where they were eventually killed. It is estimated that roughly 5,000 children with disabilities were murdered in this *Reichsaussschußaktion* (Action Waste of the Reich). [557]

In November 2016, during the University of Innsbruck lecture series titled *Inclusive Pedagogy*, Dagmar Hänsel presented her research on *Sonderpädagogik im NS* (Special Pedagogy in the time of National Socialism). According to Hänsel, special pedagogy was coined as *Sonderpädagogik* in the German legislation of the 1938 National Socialist education law *Allgemeine Anordnung für Hilfsschulen in Preußen* (General Decree for Help Schools in Prussia).[558] The education scholar Sieglind Ellger-Rüttgardt added:

> *Help schools had to fulfill three functions [...]: as a reservoir for hereditary defective students they should fulfill race-hygienic tasks, prepare the economic and völkisch usefulness of their students, relieve the primary school of 'unnecessary' ballast.*[559]

---

[554] United States Holocaust Memorial Museum: 1933-1938, accessed from https://www.ushmm.org/learn/timeline-of-events/1933-1938, on Oct. 5, 2018.

[555] Ralser et al. (1999): Humanities as Pillars of the „Extermination of Invalid Life": Biopolitics and Fascism exemplified by the Race Hygiene Institute in Innsbruck. In: *Erziehung heute*, pp. 1-12, p. 10

[556] Ibid.

[557] Ibid.; The term "Reichsausschuss" can be translated into English as "waste" or "junk" of the Reich.

[558] See: Hänsel, Dagmar (2012): Sourcs on NS-Times in the History of Special Pedagogy. In: *Zeitschrift für Pädagogik*, 58:2, pp. 242-261, p. 248

[559] "[...] sollte die Hilfsschule nunmehr drei Funktionen erfüller [...]: als Sammelbecken für erbkranke Schüler, rassenhygienische Aufgaben erfüllen, die ökonomische und völkische Brauchbarmachung ihrer Schüler

In September 1939, concurrent with the outbreak of World War II, the Chancellery of the Führer, headed by Philipp Bouhler, in cooperation with the Reich's Ministry *Abteilung Volksgesundheit,* (Department of People's Health) issued the first of the evaluation forms that would later be used for sentencing the allegedly impaired individuals, or *Ballastexistenzen*, to death. [560] A month later, Hitler secretly authorized Karl Brandt and Philipp Bouhler to murder sick patients. They set up "several undercover organizations that were combined under their address in Tiergartenstrasse 4 in Berlin as T4,"[561] the address at which evaluation forms were issued that were later used to sentence people with impairments and disabilities to death.[562] After the war, in both West and East Germany, educating children with disabilities was done through special schools. No disruption of the past was pursued even after "300,000 disabled people were killed in T4 and its aftermath."

As Henry Friedlander writes, "the Nazi genocide did not take place in vacuum"[563]; instead, it took place in the atmosphere of unethical testing and measuring hysteria championed by scientists in genetics, biology, psychology, and anthropology at both ends of the political spectrum.[564] The loyal cooperation of teachers at special schools, nurses and doctors at hospitals and psychiatric institutions, and bureaucrats in possession of statistics on health and socio-economic conditions was needed to fulfill the goal of "destruction of life unworthy of life," i.e., the handicapped, the ill, the "asocial" (prostitutes, criminals, alcoholics).[565] IQ testing advanced to become the preferred tool of sentencing individuals for sterilization or death.

Considering the role that educational facilities played in the mass sterilization or even murders of people with disabilities, Dagmar Hänsel stressed:

---

anbahnen, die Volksschule von ,unnötigem' Ballast entlasten." See: Ellger-Rüttgardt, Sieglind Luise (2008): History of Special Pedagogy. München: Ernst-Reinhardt GmbH & Co KG Publishing, p. 258

[560] See psychiatrist Alfred Hoche and jurisprudent Karl Binding's brochure from 1920, titled: "Die Freigabe der Vernichtung lebensunwerten Lebens" – "The Approval to Exterminate unworthy Life," in which terms, such as "mentally dead", "invalid life" ,"Ballastexistenz" and "biological inferiority" are shamelessly championed as admissible medical vocabulary to describe patients. See: Ralser et al. (1999): Humanities as Pillars of the „Extermination of Invalid Life": Biopolitics and Fascism exemplified by the Race Hygiene Institute in Innsbruck. In: Erziehung heute, pp. 1-12, p. 9. And: Czech, Herwig (2016): From the "Aktion T4" to "decentral euthanasia": The lower Austrian healing and care institutions Gugging, Mauer-Öhling and Yibbs. In: Documentation archive of the Austrian resistance (Eds.): Fanatics, Fulfillers of Duty, Resisters. Reichsgaue Niederdonau, Groß-Wien, Wien, pp. 219-266, pp. 222-223.

[561] Czech, Herwig (2016): From the "Aktion T4" to "decentral euthanasia.":The lower Austrian healing and care institutions Gugging, Mauer-Öhling and Yibbs. In: Documentation archive of the Austrian resistance (Eds.): *Fanatics, Fulfillers of Duty, Resisters. Reichsgaue Niederdonau, Groß-Wien, Wien*, pp. 219-266, p. 222.

[562] Ibid.

[563] Friedlander, Henry (1995): *The Origins of Nazi Genocide: From Euthanasia to the Final Solution*. Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, p. 1.

[564] Ibid., p. 20.

[565] Friedlander, Henry (1995): *The Origins of Nazi Genocide: From Euthanasia to the Final Solution*. Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, p. 22 ff.

it was often overlooked that the law of enforced sterilization of hereditary defective offspring affected not only patients of mental hospitals, but most prominently students of special schools.[566]

As Hänsel outlined, the NS law declared " 'congenital imbecility,' 'hereditary blindness,' 'hereditary deafness' and 'severe hereditary bodily deformity' as hereditary deficiencies so that all children in special schools were considered potentially hereditary-deficient and were therefore potentially fit for sterilization."[567] Among the sterilization victims, children who attended former help schools ranked particularly high in number. Hänsel explained that help-school children were almost always children from very poor families, and their impairment was based less on a diagnosis of physical or mental capabilities; instead, they were considered guilty of asocial or immoral charges.[568] It was the pedagogical task of teachers at special schools to convince their students that the German nation would reintegrate them as "silent heroes" if they agreed to be sterilized.[569] Indicative of this practice was the 1942 publication *Erbe und Schicksal* (*Heritage and Fate),* in which Karl Tornow and Karl Weinert, special teachers themselves, gave advice on how to elicit students' compliance with their own sterilization.

Kenny Fries writes that altogether "300,000 disabled people were killed in T4 and its aftermath."[570] According to the historian Herwig Czech, the "T4 Aktion" initiated six central killing institutions operated by Nazi officials in which more than 70,000 people were deemed unfit to live and consequently murdered from 1939 to 1941.[571] Castle Hartheim near Linz, Austria, was one of the six. It was the first institution in history that practiced production-line mass extermination, serving as a blueprint and harbinger for "Aktion Reinhard," the most atrocious period of the mass killing of Polish Jews in Nazi-occupied Poland.[572] In addition, Henry Friedlander writes:

The killers who learned their trade in the euthanasia killing centers of Brandenburg, Grafeneck, Hartheim, Sonnenstein, Bernburg and Hadamer also staffed the killing centers at Belzec, Sobibor and Treblinka.[573]

---

[566] Hänsel, Dagmar (2016): Special pedagogy in National Socialism. See: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5WCoWkNxh5U, minutes 14:22-14:41.
[567] Ibid., minutes 14:42-15:14.
[568] Ibid., minutes 16:46-17:30.
[569] Ibid, minutes 20:00-20:28.
[570] Fries, Kenny (2017): The Nazis' First Victims Were the Disabled. In: *The New York Times*, accessed from https://www.nytimes.com/2017/09/13/opinion/nazis-holocaust-disabled.html, on Sept. 29, 2018.
[571] Czech, Herwig (2016): From the "Aktion T4" to "decentral euthanasia.":The lower Austrian healing and care institutions Gugging, Mauer-Öhling and Yibbs. In: Documentation archive of the Austrian resistance (Eds.): *Fanatics, Fulfillers of Duty, Resisters. Reichsgaue Niederdonau, Groß-Wien, Wien*, pp. 219-266, p. 219.
[572] "Aktion T4 was the preliminary step to the Shoah. Techniques of killing, organizational experience and staff were used in anti-Jewish extermination politics." Ibid., p. 234
[573] Friedlander, Henry 1995, p. 22

6.1.5 Inclusive Education in Germany: Forward Pushes and Rollbacks

After World War II and the end of the NS regime, special schools seamlessly remained the place of education for students with special needs and disabilities in former East and West Germany. However, already in the late 1970s, the first inclusive pilot projects were initiated in West Germany. Under the academic supervision of Hans Wocken the *Hamburger Schulversuche*, the Hamburg pilot projects pushed educational boundaries and created "an alternative to education in special schools at primary level."[574] Wocken described how integrative kindergartens and primary schools admitted children with special needs, accompanied by great protests and resistance from teachers and other staff members.[575] Back then it was the parents' engagement for inclusion that allowed their children to be integrated in sample schools as early as 1982-83.[576]

Discussions of integrated/inclusive schooling have always been fierce in the German context, and so a broad agenda toward inclusive education across all German states was not met with consensus in a federal system in which, when it comes to education, most power lies with the states. The implementation of the inclusive educational reform in Germamy, a country of 80 million people, moved at various paces of the 16 states and their individual agendas of organizing schools, curriculum and educational choices. In *The Many Faces of Inclusion*, the sociologist and education scholar Jonna M. Blanck identifies "80 different variations of integration" across the 16 German states,[577] grouped into five types: "prevention, cooperation, special classes, integration in mainstream classes and focus schools."[578] If students received special educational support in mainstream facilities without being labeled with a status, it was prevention. Cooperation indicated joint educational projects between mainstream schools and special schools. If students with special educational needs were taught in the same building as students without special needs, but in isolated groups, this was type three, special classes. Type four allowed students with special needs to be integrated in regular classes, and type five identified mainstream schools with specific agendas of supporting a certain special educational needs status, such as visually impairment.

---

[574] Wocken, Hans (1987): Integrationsklassen in Hambug (Integration classes in Hamburg). In: Wocken, Hans, Antor, Georg (Eds.): *Integrationsklassen in Hamburg: Erfahrungen – Untersuchungen – Anregungen* (Integration classes in Hamburg: Experiences – Analyses – Encouragement). Solms: Jarick Oberbiel, accessed from http://www.hans-wocken.de/Werk/werk22.pdf, on Oct. 5, 2018.

[575] Ibid.

[576] Ibid.

[577] Blanck, Jonna M. (2015): Die vielen Gesichter der Inklusion: Wie SchülerInnen mit Behinderung unterrrichtet werden, unterscheidet sich innerhalb Deutschlands stark (The many faces of inclusion: How students with disabilities are taught, strongly differs within Germany). In: *WZBrief Bildung* (Education), No. 30, Wissenschaftszentrum Berlin für Sozialforschung (WZB) (Berlin Social Science Center), Berlin, pp. 1-8, p. 3.

[578] Ibid., p. 3 ff.

Considering inclusion as a process of desegregation, Blanck concluded that type one, prevention, was closest to the ideal of inclusive education. Type two, cooperation, diverted most strongly from this goal, since students continued to belong to special schools with only occasional experiences in inclusive settings.[579]

Blanck's analysis showed that the German education system most commonly regulated inclusive education outside segregated schooling facilities with the marker *Sonderpädagogischer Förderbedarf (SPF)*, the special educational needs status given to students who "cannot follow the general lesson without support because of impaired developmental and learning capabilities."[580] The SPF in Berlin, for example, can have eight different specifications: cognitive development, visually impairment, hearing and communication, autism, physical and motor development, learning, emotional and social development, and language.[581] However, *Education in Germany* noted that outcomes of the SPF assessments varied greatly across the country and over time. In Germany in the 2016-17 school year, 60 percent of the roughly half-million students with a special educational needs status were taught in segregated schools.[582] *Education in Germany* also noted an increase in recent years in the overall assessments of special educational needs status from 5.3 percent to 7.1 percent.[583] While a majority of students carried the status "learning," the number who received the status "emotional and social development" had doubled.[584] Between the former East and West Germany, the numbers varied drastically:

> *In Hessen (West), 5.6 percent of students are supported through a special educational needs status, while in Mecklenburg Vorpommern (East), it is 9.8 percent, nearly twice as many. This points to a very different practice of determining and classifying students who need support.[585]*

IQ testing continues to hold a firm place in organizing students' education in special schools or through specialized statuses in Germany. For example, the status of learning-disabled, given to a majority of children who have a special educational needs status (43.7 percent)[586],

---

[579] Ibid., p.5.

[580] *Bildung in Deutschland: Ein indikatorengestützter Bericht mit einer Analyse zu Wirkungen und Erträgen von Bildung. (Education in Germany: An indicator-based report with an analysis on the effects and returns of education.) Autorengruppe Bildungsbereicht (Author team education report), pp. 1-377, p.* 103.

[581] "Wir haben 8 sonderpädagogische Förderschwerpunkte: [...] geistig Entwicklung, Sehen, Hören und Kommunikation, Autismus und körperlich motorische Entwicklung, [...] Lernen, emotionale und soziale Entwicklung und Sprache." Transcript 9 Germany, Interview with Mario Dobe, July 12, 2018, ll. 150-155.

[582] Education in Germany, p. 104.

[583] Ibid.

[584] Ibid.

[585] "So werden in Hessen 5,6 % der Schülerinnen und Schüler, in MecklenburgVorpommern mit 9,8 % nahezu doppelt so viele sonderpädagogisch gefördert. Dies verweist auf eine sehr unterschiedliche Praxis der Feststellungs und Klassifizierungsverfahren förderbedürftiger Kinder." (Education in Germany, p. 104)

[586] Bertelsmann Stiftung (2015): *Inklusion in Deutschland. Daten und Fakten.* Prof. Dr. phil. Klaus Klemm im Auftrag der Bertelsmann Stiftung.

and the status of cognitive development depend substantially on IQ testing. In part, the increase in the number of students with special educational needs may be explained through the fact that testing is closely interlinked with the financial resources allocated to schools. Therefore, Berlin education administrators try to address this issue through implementing *verlässliche Grundausstattung*, reliable basic equipment for schools, instead of attaching financial resources to status of specific students. Mario Dobe explained the dilemma:

> *Especially the distinction between learning and cognitive development is very, very difficult in many instances. If you have three diagnosticians and one child [...] and they are asked to formulate a diagnosis along the line of learning or cognitively disabled, they would probably come up with three different results. It is like that. We have to live with that. In part, this is connected to allocating resources. [...] If I have three students with the special educational needs status of cognitive development, a school can pay for a whole teaching position [since each student has the right to eight hours a week of special educational teaching]. To fill a whole teaching position with students who have a different special educational needs status, I would need to have 11 or 12 children. That is a huge difference.[587]*

In essence, children were frequently mislabeled as cognitively disabled to increase the number of allocated hours of special pedagogues in a particular school. Dobe explained that Berlin realized that in practice, a narrow understanding of inclusion focusing only on disability and special educational needs was not helpful in responding to the diverse demographics in urban schools across the country. Dobe's initial task of implementing the UN-CRPD in schools quickly grew into a much broader agenda that placed the acknowledgement of diversity in schools at the heart of the inclusive education reform. No school was homogeneous when looking at all the different dimensions of heterogeneity, expressed along the lines of gender diversity, migrant experiences, multilingualism, disability and learning challenges, as well as students' socio-economic backgrounds. Dobe summarized:

> *We automatically have different dimensions of heterogeneity at our schools, and no school can claim that its student body was not heterogeneous [...] and so we see a close connection between democracy and inclusion and how heterogeneity is expressed through different dimensions of heterogeneity in our schools [...] we cannot leave anyone behind and must guide everyone to their best possible academic achievement. This also includes the matter of children whose mother tongue is not*

---

[587] "Also gerade die Trennung zwischen Lernen und geistiger Entwicklung. Die fällt an vielen Stellen sehr sehr schwer. Also wenn Sie drei Diagnostiker an ein Kind setzten würden und sollen alle eine Diagnostik machen in der Schnittstelle zwischen Lernen und geistiger Entwicklung würden wahrscheinlich alle drei zu unterschiedlichen Ergebnissen kommen. Das ist so, damit müssen wir leben. Es hat was... ein stückweit mit der Ressourcenvergabe zu tun. [...]Also im Grunde genommen, gebe ich, wenn ich dreieinhalb Schülerinnen und Schüler mit dem Förderschwerpunkt geistige Behinderung habe, kostet das eine ganze Lehrkräftestelle. Bei dem anderen muss ich schon zwischen 11 und 12 Kinder zusammen haben, um eine Lehrkräftestelle davon bezahlen zu müssen. Das ist ein riesen Unterschied." Transcript 9 Germany, Interview with Mario Dobe, July 12, 2018, ll. 301-346.

German, who do not speak any German and those who are highly talented and German-speaking.[588]

Inclusion, Dobe concluded, was no longer a matter of debate; "there is the UN-CRPD, and it tells us in article 24 several things that need to be implemented; we do not have a choice anymore, but we have to do it."[589] Looking at the whole of Germany, this view was not shared by states, such as North Rhine-Westphalia (NRW) or Baden-Wuerrttemberg, which currently roll back inclusive education toward focus schools, for example. In July 2018, the state government of North Rhine-Westphalia published a reorientation agenda for inclusive education, highlighting that there would be a "continuous choice of special schools [*Förderschule*] and inclusive learning [*gemeinsames lernen*]."[590] Limiting or eventually closing special schools was not a goal of the NRW government. Michael Feltern, a teacher educator and former math and arts teacher at the academic Gymnasium supported NRW's rollback on inclusive education in an article published in the critically acclaimed newspaper *Süddeutsche Zeitung*:

> *What works at privileged prototype school trials leads the cheap mass school model, the inclusive school, to catastrophe. Well-functioning special schools were closed, and special school teachers were sent to different mainstream schools. Those schools had to admit disabled students even though their facilities and expertise were not yet appropriate. [...] This led to the 'benevolent neglect of all' [...].*[591]

In 2015 the United Nations Committee on the Rights of Persons With Disabilities criticized the implementation of inclusive education in Germany on the grounds that it was

---

[588] "[...] dass wir diese Dimension von Heterogenität eben bei uns an den Schulen ganz automatisch haben und keine Schule sagen kann, bei uns ist die Schülerschaft nicht heterogen [...]Zusammenhang zwischen Demokratie und Inklusion und wie kennzeichnet sich Heterogenität bei uns an den Schulen, also die unterschiedlichen Dimensionen von Heterogenität [...]wir alle mitnehmen müssen und alle zu einem bestmöglichen Bildungsabschluss führen müssen und dazu gehört eben auch die Frage der Kinder, die mit nicht deutscher Herkunftssprache oder mit gar keiner deutschen Sprache in unsere Schule kommen bis zu denen, die hochbegabt sind beispielsweise und deutschsprachig sind." Transcript 9 Germany, Interview with Mario Dobe, July 12, 2018, ll. 108-119.

[589] "Umsetzung der UN Behindertenrechtskonvention ist jetzt keine Frage mehr von wollen, sondern es ist einfach eine Frage von müssen... es gibt diese UN Behindertenrechtskonvention und die schreibt uns im Artikel 24 bestimmte Dinge vor, die wir umsetzen müssen und da... wir haben keine Wahl mehr. Sondern wir müssen es tun." Transcript 9 Germany, Interview with Mario Dobe, July 12, 2018, ll. 86-89.

[590] "Gleichzeitig soll eine durchgehende Wahlmöglichkeit zwischen Förderschule und dem Gemeinsamen Lernen geschaffen werden." Ministry for School and Education of the State North Rhein-Westphalia: Bildungsportal des Landes Nordrhein Westfalen (Education forum of the state North Rhein-Westphalia), accessed from https://www.schulministerium.nrw.de/docs/Schulsystem/Inklusion/index.html, on Sept. 27, 2018.

[591] "Was in den privilegierten Prototypen funktionierte, führte im billigen Serienmodell Inklusionsschule binnen Kurzem zur Katastrophe. Bestens funktionierende Förderschulen ließ man auslaufen und schickte die Förderlehrer fortan stundenweise an verschiedene Regelschulen. Diese mussten behinderte Schüler auch dann aufnehmen, wenn Ausstattung und Expertise noch gar nicht stimmten. [...] Es kam zur 'wohlwollenden Vernachlässigung aller' [...]." Felten, Michael (July 31, 2018): Zurück zur Vernunft (Back to reasoning). In: Sueddeutsche Zeitung, accessed from https://www.sueddeutsche.de/bildung/inklusion-an-schulen-zurueck-zur-vernunft-1.4073255, on Sept. 27, 2018.

"concerned that the State party has an education system where the majority of students with disabilities attend segregated special-needs schools."[592] The U.N. committee recommended scaling down special schools and holding mainstream schools accountable for their legal responsibility to offer inclusive education options. This stands in stark contrast to North Rhine-Westphalia's reorientation agenda, which manifests special schools as legitimate school choices in the German education system instead of abolishing them.

6.1.6 Special Education at the Intersection of Race, Class, Gender, and Disability

Among German-speaking education scholars (Powell and Wagner 2002, Gomolla 2013, Kornmann 2013), the overrepresentation of students and migrant youths in special schools for the learning-disabled has been a crucial matter of concern. Based on data provided by Heike Diefenbach, Kornmann stressed that in 2002, foreign students (i.e., students without German citizenship) made up 9.75 percent of the student population in mainstream educational facilities; in special schools for the learning-disabled, they amounted to 17.66 percent.[593] To understand the overrepresentation of non-German mother tongue speakers in special facilities, Kornmann refers to an empirical study on school success and failure in primary education in West Germany from 1967:

> *Performance in the subject of German language was the most important criterion for assessing school success, and especially children from socially weaker families [...] had the biggest difficulties to meet this criterion.*[594]

German as a knock-out criterion for the socio-economically weak but also for multilingual students has been extensively analyzed by the intercultural education scholar Ingrid Gogolin. She argues there was a "monolingual habitus" of teachers that enshrined their power in a multilingual speech community.[595] Gogolin traces monolingualization back to the founding of the nation-state and contends: "Germany is one of the nations with this tradition of monolingualization of its people in the 19th century."[596] The monolingual habitus as a characteristic of German teachers and their practice is based on the assumption of

---

[592] United Nations (2015): *United Nations Committee on the Rights of Persons With Disabilities: Concluding observations on the initial report of Germany*, pp. 1-11, p. 8.

[593] Kornmann, Reimer (2013): Die Überrepräsentation ausländischer Kinder und Jugendlicher in Sonderschulen mit dem Schwerpunkt Lernen (The overrepresentation of foreign children and teeanagers in special school with the focus on learning). In: Auernheimer, Georg (Ed.): *Schieflagen im Bildungssystem:Die Benachteiligung der Migrantenkinder* (Imbalances in the education system: The disadvantage of migrant children). 5th Edition.Wiesbaden: Springer, pp. 71-86, p. 72.

[594] Ibid., p. 76.

[595] Gogolin, Ingrid (1994): The 'monolingual habitus' as the common feature in teaching in the language of the majority in different countries, accessed from http://perlinguam.journals.ac.za/pub/article/viewFile/187/298, on Oct. 6, 2018, pp. 38-49.

[596] Ibid., p. 41.

homeogeneity with regard to students' cultural, economic and linguistic backgrounds, whereby students' experiences, knowledge and realities in a multicultural and multilingual society are rendered invisible.[597] Building on Gogolin, Mechthild Gomolla analyzes direct and indirect discrimination against students with migration backgrounds at the school entry level. Gomolla's interview study showed that German language skills were coupled with assumptions about the disruptive behavior of students with migrant backgrounds, which served to justify their transfer to special schools or back to the kindergarten.[598] This way, Gomolla argues, "diagnostic practices that turned a lack of German language skills into insufficient school readiness or lack of the ability to attend regular school can be considered indirect discrimination."[599] Deficit attributions of this kind strongly affect school biographies of children with migrant backgrounds and can be regarded as partly explaining the high proportion of migrant students in special schools.

Furthermore, *Education in Germany* indicates a gender bias when it comes to the question of where boys and girls start their education. The federal report highlights that twice as many boys as girls begin their education in special schools. Bavaria and Baden-Württemberg have considerably higher numbers of school-starters in special schools, with roughly 4 percent of students, while Berlin, Schleswig-Holstein and Thüringen are below 2 percent. The former East German states, like Mecklenburg-Vorpommern and Sachsen Anhalt, are equal to Bavaria and Schleswig-Holstein. However, the eastern states have been able to reduce the share of students by 40 percent over eight years, while the numbers for Bavaria and Baden-Württemberg have been stable.[600]

Students who attend special schools graduate in alarmingly low numbers from these institutions, in particular boys with migrant backgrounds face systematic discrimination:

---

[597] Ibid., p. 40.

[598] Gomolla, Mechtild (2013): Fördern und Fordern allein genügt nicht! Mechanismen institutioneller Diskriminierung von Migrantenkindern und –jugendlichen im deutschen Schulsystem. (Supporting and challenging is not enough! Mechanisms of institutional discrimination against migrant children and adolescents in the German school system). In: Auernheimer, Georg (Ed.): *Schieflagen im Bildungssystem:Die Benachteiligung der Migrantenkinder* (Imbalances in the education system: The disadvantage of migrant children). 5th Edition.Wiesbaden: Springer, pp. 87-102, p. 92.

[599] Ibid.

[600] "Allerdings bestehen auch hier zwischen den Ländern Unterschiede. Den größten Anteil an direkten Einschulungen in die Förderschule weisen mit über 4% nach wie vor BadenWürttemberg und Bayern auf. Während jedoch andere Länder mit einem ähnlich hohen Ausgangsniveau, wie MecklenburgVorpommern und SachsenAnhalt, den Anteil innerhalb von 8 Jahren um über 40% reduzieren konnten, fiel der Rückgang in diesen Ländern vergleichsweise gering aus. Einen eher niedrigen Anteil an Direkteinschulungen in die Förderschule weisen mit jeweils unter 2% Schleswig Holstein, Thüringen und Berlin auf. Den geringsten Anteil hat Bremen, das die Förderschulen für einige Förderschwerpunkte teilweise aufgelöst hat, mit 0,5%. Keine Veränderungen zeigen sich bei den Geschlechterunterschieden: Noch immer werden doppelt so viele Jungen wie Mädchen direkt in eine Förderschule eingeschult." Education in Germany, p. 83.

> *The greatest number of students that leave education before graduation are students from special schools: "In 2016, 25,000 people, i.e. 71 percent of all students at special schools dropped out of school before graduation." [601]*

On the other hand, *Education in Germany* described that "students with a special educational status finished their education more often in inclusive settings than in special schools."[602] "Since the large majority of students with a special educational needs status are educated in inclusive settings and receive higher qualifications in states like Hamburg, Bremen and Schleswig-Holstein," *Education in Germany* states: "it can be said that inclusion does not at all worsen the chances of students with special educational needs to successfully graduate from school."[603]

6.1.7 Summary

Drawing on the preceding policy analysis, I want to highlight the following areas of concern. In Germany, the fourth strongest economic power in the world, one in three children are affected by poverty-endangering risk situations, and more children in one family as well as single-parent families are significantly endangered by poverty. In addition, more than 40 percent of students with migrant backgrounds achieved only the lowest PISA qualification step in reading, math and natural science, children with migrant experiences lag up to two academic years behind in the field of natural sciences and math in mainstream education, and male migrant students are strongly overrepresented in special schools. Despite a commitment to implementing the UN-CRPD, special pedagogical support is still given primarily in special schools, as *Education in Germany* concludes:

> *Germany-wide, the percentage of students taught in inclusive settings is 39 percent; only in four states are a majority of children and adolescents with*

---

[601] "Wenngleich Jugendliche ohne Hauptschulabschluss in der öffentlichen Diskussion häufig als Hauptschülerinnen bzw. schüler ohne Abschluss wahrgenommen werden, stammt der Großteil aus Förderschulen. 25.000 junge Menschen waren dies 2016 bzw. 71 % aller Schülerinnen und Schüler, die eine Förderschule verlassen haben." Education in Germany, p. 122.

[602] "Die außerhalb der Förderschulen erreichten Abschlüsse von Jugendlichen mit sonderpädagogischer Förderung zeigen, dass in allen betrachteten Ländern häufiger ein Hauptschul oder mittlerer Schulabschluss erreicht wird als an den Förderschulen." Education in Germany, p. 123.

[603] "Die außerhalb der Förderschulen erreichten Abschlüsse von Jugendlichen mit sonderpädagogischer Förderung zeigen, dass in allen betrachteten Ländern häufiger ein Hauptschul oder mittlerer Schulabschluss erreicht wird als an den Förderschulen. [...] Dass allerdings in Ländern wie Hamburg, Bremen und SchleswigHolstein inzwischen die große Mehrheit der sonderpädagogisch geförderten Schülerinnen und Schüler in sonstigen allgemeinbildenden Schularten unterrichtet wird (*D5*) und dort mehr (bzw. höherqualifizierende) Abschlüsse erreicht werden als an Förderschulen, deutet darauf hin, dass sich die Aussichten auf einen Schulabschluss durch die Inklusionsbemühungen zumindest keinesfalls verschlechtert haben." Education in Germany, p. 123.

special educational needs status taught in mainstream schools. The number of independent special institutions in many states and counties has barely changed.[604]

The lack of commitment to inclusive education understood as wider concept of responding to diversity in classrooms on a countrywide scale leads to paradoxical situations, such as the exclusion of refugee students from an otherwise inclusive school community. Hence, looking at the data presented above, a paradigmatic shift that turns away from the deficit hypothesis takes place only slowly.

6.2 A School at the Tipping Point

On the morning of Monday, April 9, 2018, I stepped out of the underground on one of the busiest streets of the city. My eye was caught by an Italian antiques store that displayed gold- and silver-covered decorative objects and kitschy furniture. There was a bakery on the street, and farther down, at the street corner, a large Starbucks drew tourists who visited the nearby sights. In the opposite direction from the Starbucks corner, where the yellow social housing complexes started, was the school campus. I walked past a police station, where several police cars were parked in front and a large Mercedes waited some distance from the station. Upon approaching my research site, I immediately noticed the large school garden, visible from the street. Through the fence, a grassy area and a play structure could be spotted. Unsure where the school entrance was, I followed a mother with four children who had walked with me along the street. She pushed one child in a stroller; the other three were about primary-school age and walked next to her. She kissed the children goodbye as they entered the campus and headed toward the building right in front. But nowhere could I make out a sign indicating where the official entrance to the school was. Indecisively, I stood in the middle of the yard, to my left the school garden and a large basketball field, to my right and in front gray buildings in strangely futuristic style. After some detours, I finally headed into the right entrance and knocked on the door of the school secretariat. While I waited in the foyer for the director, a little girl took the seat opposite mine. All children bustling in the foyer before they were allowed to head to their rooms at 8 a.m. had dark hair and brown eyes. At one of the tables I was joined by another mother with her two boys, dressed identically. As I sat and waited, the little girl opposite from me opened her lunchbox and said to herself, "I am hungry and I haven't eating anything yet." She wore a small leather jacket and a sparkling T-shirt covered with sequins of all colors. As she bit into her sandwich, I wished her: "Guten

---

[604] "Dabei fndet sonderpädagogische Förderung weiterhin überwiegend in Förderschulen statt Bundesweit liegt der Inklusionsanteil bei nunmehr 39 %, lediglich in 4 Ländern wird die Mehrheit der Schülerinnen und Schüler mit Förderbedarf in allgemeinen Schulen unterrichtet Das Angebot eigenständiger Förderschulstandorte hat sich in vielen Ländern und Kreisen kaum verändert." Education in Germany, p. 7.

Appetit!" (Good Appetite!/ Enjoy your meal!) She smiled and said, "Thank you." We started chatting, and I asked which class grade she attended. She described to me how to get to her classroom: "Well, you have to walk up the stairs and there is the classroom." I asked how old she was. After hesitating a moment, she replied: "7." "So you must be in first or second grade?" I replied. Shrugging her shoulders, she turned her attention back to the sandwich. Shortly after, the director approached us and apologized, saying he did not know where class 6x's head teacher was but she would surely arrive soon. While we waited, he greeted the children in the foyer and wished them a good morning. He also said hello to the parents who waited with their children. One girl came up to him; he greeted her with her first name and said: "Oh, you have a new baseball cap! Chic!" Excited, she turned around, lifted her foot and pointed at it. "Oh, and new shoes, too!" he said. Shortly after, an older girl walked me to the sixth graders' bungalow outside the main building, by the entrance to the campus. Because of renovations, the roughly 260 pupils were divided among several on-site buildings as a rather provisional solution to the missing school building, which had been under construction since 2015.

The school's social demographics had shifted over the decades, the director of the school informed me in our interview. Educated as a teacher of German and history in the former German Democratic Republic (GDR), he became director overnight when his predecessor left the school because of illness in 2010. When he started to work as a teacher at the primary school in 1992, the school was rather heterogeneous in terms of student background compared to what it is today. He remembered:

> *We used to have a different composition [of the student body]. When I started, we had half the pupils from – in inverted commas – "Purely German" families, so to speak, and the other half was divided into very many nations. There was almost no majority; maybe roughly a quarter of the pupils grew up multilingual, who were maybe German Turkish, but at least 75 were from different nations. We counted once with regard to a project; I think we had 40 to 45 different nationalities among our pupils. [...] The composition of the student body has definitely changed; the teacher body has also very, very clearly changed. In 1992 we had one colleague who came from South-East-Europe. That was very good because he spoke Hungarian and was able to [communicate] with some of the pupils from the former Yugoslavia. That helped [...] the student body was a little more colorful than today. [...] If you want to consider the pupils who grow up multilingual, with a Turkish or an Arab background, then those make up almost 90 percent, which means it is quite homogeneous, if we want to group them altogether in one category.[605]*

---

[605] "[...] wir hatten damals eine andere Mischung, wir hatten damals, als ich angefangen habe, war so in etwa die Hälfte der Schülerinnen und Schüler kamen aus in Anführungsstrichen „rein Deutschen" Familien sozusagen und die andere Hälfte teilte sich auf sehr sehr viele Nationen auf, es gab kaum so ein Übergewicht, also vielleicht

With a student population of a Turkish and Arab migrant background of over 90 percent, teachers and pedagogues say the school had tipped, meaning it had a large majority of non-native German-speakers who lacked language role models and exposure to diversity. The German teacher remarked:

> *The problem at our school is that the mixture tipped. With a migration background of 98 percent or maybe even more. There are no language role models here, except the teachers.*[606]

Drawing on Thomas C. Schelling's research on mechanisms of segregation, separation or sorting, introduced in the introduction to chapter 6, tipping was described by teachers and principal in the way that Schelling had defined the moment when "a recognizable new minority enters a neighborhood is sufficient numbers to cause the earlier residents to begin evacuating."[607] With regard to this defining characteristic of the school community that I researched, I call my research site the Tipping Point School.

The class teacher was born to Turkish parents who had immigrated to Germany as laborers and socialized in this city; she and her sibling went on to receive university educations. She criticized the lack of language stimuli, exposure to diverse concepts and ideas of living, and a fixation on the neighborhood that was not good for the children. She had grown up in a different part of town, where she experienced the opposite scenario as the only girl with darker features in her classroom community. She commented on her current school:

> *There is no diversity here at all. I think this is the main problem. You have a heavy load of kids with Arabic and Turkish roots in one class. They feel comfortable this way, which is nice, but here you are an outsider when you have blond hair and that is not okay. […] But because there is no mixture here at all, I think that you do not open up diversity. We try to build diversity through our ethics lessons. This is our focus*

---

waren es ganz... waren es so vielleicht ein Viertel der Schülerinnen und Schüler, die mehrsprachig aufgewachsen sind, waren vielleicht damals sind Türkisch Deutsch aufgewachsen und der... aber mindestens 75 haben sich auf ganz unterschiedliche Nationen... aufgeteilt, wir haben mal durchgezählt im Rahmen eines Projekts, da waren wir glaube ich 40 oder 45 unterschiedliche Nationen, die an der Schule versammelt waren und das war sehr sehr viel. [...] Die Zusammensetzung der Schülerschaft hat sich auf jeden Fall verändert, die Lehrerschaft hat sich ganz ganz deutlich verändert, wir hatten 1992 einen Kollegen, der kam aus Süd-Ost-Europa. Das war ganz schön, er konnte Ungarisch sprechen und konnte sich mit Einigen aus Ex-Jugoslawien [...] Die Schülerschaft das war tatsächlich damals ein bisschen bunter zusammengesetzt, als wir das eigentlich heute haben. Wenn man jetzt mehrsprachig aufgewachsene Schüler, mit Türkisch und Arabischem Hintergrund, dann sind wir schon fast bei 90%, das heißt, es ist ziemlich homogen, wenn wir die in eine Tüte jetzt mal machen." See: Transcript 7 Germany, Interview with Director, June 27, 2018, ll. 34-64.
[606] "Das Problem an unserer Schule ist, dass hier die Mischung gekippt ist. Mit einem Migrationsanteil von 98%, vielleicht sind es sogar noch mehr. Es gibt hier keine sprachlichen Vorbilder außer die Lehrer." See: Transcript 8 Germany, Interview with German Teacher, June 28, 2018, ll. 549-551.
[607] Schelling, Thomas C. (1971): Dynamic Models of Segregation. In: *Journal of Mathematical Sociology*, 1, pp. 143-186, p. 181.

because we know there is no mix, and we try to discuss different religions, different cultures, and, and, and.[608]

A consequence of the rather homogeneous school was, according to the class teacher of 6x that the pupils' German language levels were lagging two full class levels behind. This became especially apparent on a field trip the group took to one of the leisure centers of the city, where they met a group of pupils from a different district. The class teacher described the encounter through the eyes of her pupil:

Mel asked me which language the other pupils were speaking. She said:"What are they talking about, Miss? What language are they speaking? Is that German? Huh?" This was how they reacted. And I said: "And this, dear Mel, is reality, and you are stuck in a system in which you do not even realize what you do and how you talk." I find this dangerous.[609]

The special pedagogue shared with me that 12 to 13 percent of all the pupils, roughly 33 children, held a diagnosed special educational needs status, mostly with regard to learning, emotional-social development and language. In terms of the socio-economic status of the pupils, statistics spoke an even more drastic language. Assuming that the ratio was representative of the whole school community, 14 out of 19 children in class 6x received the city pass given to families who received unemployment benefits or whose incomes fell below a certain threshold. With the pass, families had to pay only 1€ for lunch a month and not 37€. Bearing in mind that every third child in Germany was endangered by poverty, this school exceeded the national average. When money was discussed during the second day of my research stay, children used such vocabulary as Jobcenter (the unemployment office), Hartz 4[610], health insurance, unemployment benefits. Asked what someone does when they do not

---

[608] "Es gibt hier überhaupt gar keine Durchmischung. Das ist das, glaube ich, das Hauptproblem. Ich finde das so wie es ist, eine geballte Ladung, voller, weiß ich nicht, arabisch-, türkischstämmiger Kinder in einer Klasse. Die fühlen sich wohl, ist auch schön, aber da ist man ein Außenseiter, weil man mal blonder Haare hat und das geht nicht. [...] Aber, dass es so eine überhaupt keine Durchmischung gibt, das finde ich, damit öffnest du nicht eine Vielseitigkeit. Wir versuchen durch unseren Ethikunterricht genau das aufzubauen. Das ist unser Schwerpunkt, weil wir wissen, es gibt keine Durchmischung und da versuchen wir verschiedene Religionen zu thematisieren, verschiedene Kulturen und, und, und." See: Transcript 5 Germany, Interview with Class Teacher, June 22, 2018, ll. 347-357.

[609] "[...] dass mich Mariam gefragt hat, auf welcher Sprache sie sich unterhalten? Sie sagt: „Was labern die? Frau XXX, was reden die? Ist das Deutsch? Was?" So haben die reagiert. Da habe ich gesagt: „Und das, liebe Mel, ist die Realität und du steckst in einem System fest, wo du überhaupt gar nicht siehst, was du eigentlich leistest und wie du sprichst." See: Transcript 5 Germany, Interview with Class Teacher, June 22, 2018, ll. 359-363.

[610] A welfare and unemployment reform termed after its author Peter Hartz introduced by the Social Democrats (SPD) in 2003 under former SPD chancellor Gerhard Schröder's Agenda 2010. Introduced as "A good day for Germany's unemployed," the agenda has received wide criticism as a severe attack on the German welfare state with detrimental effects to people in unemployment. "Hartz 4" has turned into a buzz word to express dire living conditions and is widely believed to be the reason for the drastic decline in popularity of the Social Democrats reflected in election results See: Zimmermann, Nils: German Issues in a Nutshell: Hartz 4, *Deutsche Welle* (June 6, 2017), accessed from https://www.dw.com/en/german-issues-in-a-nutshell-hartz-iv/a-39061709, on Aug. 15, 2018.

have any money, a girl raised her hand and answered: "They collect returnable bottles" (field notes Thursday, April 12, 2018). Living in a big city, the children had been exposed to the many people on the street who were homeless and made ends meet by collecting bottles to return at supermarkets. Seven cents for a glass bottle and 25 for a plastic bottle could add up to a meal.

Because of the drastic conditions of disadvantage at the school, the city had provided several grants to create a positive, engaging school environment. The school's leisure area had a fenced-off garden where chickens and one rooster inhabited a large cage; there was a small greenhouse, several fruit trees, and flower and vegetable plots. The play area was equipped with basketball hoops, soccer goals, volley balls, benches all around to rest under well-planted roofs and pergolas that encircled the play area. At least six adults wearing yellow vests patrolled the yard throughout the 20-minute-breaks that first to sixth graders spent together in this space. As the morning break came to an end on my first day, the English teacher called out: "Pausenende!" ("End of break!") The children trotted back to their classrooms. No automated bells signaled the rhythm of the day. After the previous director's unexpected death, the school had undergone a severe makeover. The school inspection had attested "Significant Developmental Needs," so a government initiative for school development had stepped in and helped reorganize the school from top to bottom. The school turned into a mature full-day school with a flexible starting point. Children had to be in their classrooms by 8 in the morning, and lessons started at 8:15. Every class unit was supplied with one head teacher and one pedagogue. Previously, pedagogues had been responsible only for after-school activities, but changes in the structure of the school day meant pedagogues and teachers had to grow into a team with shared responsibilities for learning and leisure time organization. Furthermore, the 40-minute model was established, which meant that 45-minute lessons were shortened by 5 minutes to create time for "Lernzeit," learning periods throughout the day when pupils could study for tests individually or in small groups, do homework, or catch up on extra work and projects. The top floor of the white bungalow had two classrooms for the sixth graders and two rooms that were opened up during "Lernzeit." The classrooms were equipped with smartboards; the learning period rooms had board games, a piano, a radio, couches and pillows to hang out. When pupils finished their work early, they were able to rest there. They could tend to their thoughts and worries that sometimes absorbed all their focus. Four years before, the pedagogue said, teaching was next to impossible in some classes. Parents were uncooperative, and communication among teachers and pedagogues was mostly poor. The class teacher of 6d explained that a situation had developed

in which few teachers cared about the pupils and their violent behavior toward each other, and pupils treated teachers without respect and dignity.[611] There were former pupils, the pedagogue remembered, whom she sometimes saw in the neighborhood, surprised that they had not yet joined the Jihad (Holy War). For some students, fanatical and inaccurate interpretations of Islam had become an anchor and channel for their frustration. The class teacher remembered that pupils had held extreme views and carried religious conflicts into arguments calling each other "You Jew!" as an insult.[612] At times violence was quite shocking, the German teacher remembered:

> *So there were almost daily accidents during break. I have seen children, first graders, who kicked another first grader with their feet against his head when he was already lying on the ground.[613]*

All this had changed, to some extent, for the better over recent years. The school's sixth graders had become the pride of so many of the teachers and pedagogues. The German teacher summarized:

> *I have never experienced pupils at this school who were this eager to learn. I have taught in many, many sixth grades. These children want to learn, and they are very grateful. I have never experienced pupils who were so grateful as the ones in this class.[614]*

Furthermore, their pedagogue explained that teachers and pedagogues had formed a tight net that the pupils could not outsmart. She explained that there was a basis of trust

---

[611] "But four years ago, when I started here, I just wanted to leave because the sixth graders walked around like machos and spoke to the teachers as if they were dogs. [...] These colleagues worked here, too, during a conflict in the school yard: two kids beat each other, a group was fighting, who just turned away and pretended they did not see what was happening and when you have colleagues like these – sure, that ruins everything. In the meantime, as I said, there is a comfortable atmosphere here, in my opinion." (Aber vor 4 Jahren als ich hier ankam, ich wollte einfach nur noch gehen, weil die 6. Klässler wie Machos durch die Gegend gelaufen sind und haben mit den Lehrern so gesprochen als ob sie Hunde wären. [...]Diese Kollegen gab es hier auch, die einfach mal in einem Konflikt auf dem Pausenhof: zwei Kinder prügeln sich, eine Gruppe prügelt sich, einfach sich umgereht haben und so getan haben, als ob sie nichts sehen und wenn du solche Kollegen hast an der Schule - klar das zieht alles runter. Mittlerweile ist es wie gesagt das ist eine angenehme Atmosphäre meiner Meinung nach.) See: Transcript 5 Germany, Interview with Class Teacher, June 22, 2018, ll. 227-241.

[612] "Früher hatten wir auch das Problem, was die Religion anging. Das war ein ganz, ganz großes ja ... Problem. Religion, der Islam und, und, und. Du Jude! Das war ein Ausdruck, den sie hier untereinander gesagt haben. Das hat wirklich ein ganz schwierigen Stand." ("We also used to have problems with religion. That was a really, really, yes… problem. Religion, Islam, and, and, and. You Jew! That was an expression/insult that they said to each other. It is a difficult situation." See: Transcript 5 Germany, Interview with Class Teacher, June 22, 2018, ll. 231-234.

[613] "Also es gab eigentlich fast jede Pause mindestens einen Unfall. Ich habe hier Kinder gesehen, Erstklässler, die haben einen anderen Erstklässler, der auf dem Boden lag mit Füßen gegen den Kopf getreten." See: Transcript 8 Germany, Interview with German Teacher, June 28, 2018, ll. 617-619.

[614] "Ich habe noch nie eine so lernwillige 6. Klasse erlebt hier an der Schule. Ich habe in vielen, vielen 6. Klassen unterrichtet. Die Kinder wollen lernen und die sind total dankbar. Also ich habe noch nie so dankbare Schüler erlebt, wie Kinder in dieser Klasse." See: Transcript 8 Germany, Interview with German Teacher, June 28, 2018, ll. 78-81.

between her and the class teacher of 6x, which meant that both agreed on the common goal of teaching, educating and disciplining their pupils. This way their collaboration signaled to the pupils a strength that was respected.[615] Despite largely positive developments, 6x was a class unit of children who had faced or continued to endure extraordinary challenges.

6.2.1 "The Conflicts of the world are reflected in our school"[616]

The group I observed had formed in fourth grade, in 2016, when several pupils from unconventional backgrounds joined the class. In 2016, also the pedagogue of 6d took over the role as primary pedagogue for the group, together with her male teacher college of Arabic heritage. She remembered that the twins had been moved into foster care in Germany. Without speaking the language and strongly traumatized, the girl, Rosa, joined 6d, the boy, Theo, joined 6e. The pedagogue summarized the fourth grade as a particularly challenging experience:

> *They [the twins] are not bad children, and you truly do not want to have gone through what they experienced. They really grew up on the street. [...] It became even more difficult when all the refugee children came. [...] That was tough because they did not speak at all. And here, their class teacher was a great asset because he spoke Arabic and could communicate with the children. So, well, yes, the fourth grade was tough.[617]*

The refugee children, Cagla and Nino did not only face the challenge of communication but also needed to cope with missing their families and their former homes. Both children were, in fact, about two to four years older than 12, the usual age of sixth graders in Germany. The school and guardians hoped that the refugee children could catch up on language and all other

---

[615] "I think that collaboration with teachers, when both parties work toward the same goal, then it works, and I think it works well here – the children cannot outsmart us – and it shows effects. For years now, this is the first sixth grade cohort that has not spread stress and terror. [...]Although we [the class teacher of 6x and pedagogue] have known each other for only a short time […], there is basic trust that the other is doing right, and I think it is very important that you convey the feeling 'You cannot outsmart us.' " (Also ich finde diese Zusammenarbeit mit Lehrern also wenn beide zusammen auch an einem Strang zieht und das klappt, finde ich, bei den vieren hier oben – die Kinder kommen überhaupt nicht an uns vorbei – dann kommt dabei auch was raus. Seit Jahren sind das die ersten beiden 6. Klassen, die hier keinen Stress machen, die kein Terror machen. [...] Obwohl wir uns so kurz nur kennen [...] da ist so ein Grundvertrauen, dass der andere das schon richtig gemacht hat und das ist glaube ich ganz wichtig, dass man ihnen das Gefühl gibt, ihr könnt uns hier nicht ausspielen." (See: Transcript 6 Germany, Interview with Pedagogue, June 25, 2018, ll. 265-302.

[616] "When there are conflicts wherever in the world, this has always been the case. We had many children from the former Yugoslavia because there was war, and this remains true: when there is war activity in Afghanistan, these children come here." (Wenn irgendwo Konflikte sind auf der Welt, war damals schon so, wir hatten ganz viele Kinder aus Exjugoslawien, Schülerinnen und Schüler und weil da damals der Krieg eben auch war und das zieht sich so durch, wenn Afghanistan die kriegerischen Aktivitäten stärker, dann kommen die Kinder eben auch an." See: Transcript 7 Germany, Interview with Director, June 27, 2018, ll. 45-48.

[617] "Die sind ja nicht böse und du möchtest das ja auch nicht erlebt haben, was sie erlebt haben. Die sind ja wirklich auf der Straße groß geworden [...] Schwieriger wurde es als dann auch noch die ganzen Flüchtlingskinder kamen [...] das war dann eher schwierig, weil die sprachen ja gar nicht. Und da war der Vorteil, dass [Lehrer] arabisch spricht und mit den Kindern in Kontakt treten konnte. Also das war, die vierte Klasse die war hart." See: Transcript 6 Germany, Interview with Pedagogue, June 25, 2018, ll. 661-669.

subjects, integrate, and become familiar with the new culture and school system before going on to secondary education. Whereas Cagla had come with her family and lived in a refugee shelter in the city, Nino had come to Germany alone as an unattended minor. Both had acquired remarkable German-language skills. Cagla was very shy about speaking in public; Nino only asked occasionally for words and chatted easily with his friends. All the pupils and pedagogical staff members were aware of the situation the children faced, as demonstrated in an episode I observed in late April.

Thursday, April 26, 2018

Nino hides his face in his hands. His neighbor asks, "What is up with you?" He answers: "I am sad." Two pupils put their hands on each of his shoulders and look up to the teacher. One boy says to the teacher, "Nino is sad." He barks at him to be quiet. The teacher asks, "Do you want to go and wash your face?" He answers yes, gets up and leaves the room. Classroom work continues.

In the sixth grade, the group was handed over to the class teacher I observed and interviewed. In the years before, she had taught the children math and knew the group very well. In their final year of primary school, these 19 pupils, nine boys and ten girls, were taught in several different learning arrangements. Most of the pupils in 6x, like those in 6y, exhibited strong features of disadvantage, such as a low socio-economic status, migrant background and refugee experience, and some even surviving abuse and trauma. Under these circumstances, the risk was high that pupils would enter conflict and escalate it by insulting one another verbally or reverting to violence. The special pedagogue regularly worked with four pupils when the rest of the group attended English and German class. One child had a special educational needs status of cognitive development. The twin girl showed signs of developmental delay, but she had not been tested for any classification. The other two were Cagla and Nino, who were given extra German classes or a lighter version of the English lessons by the special pedagogue.

Since these pupils were on the brink of puberty and had very different cognitive and emotional needs, their teachers and pedagogues had to act quickly to resolve tension and restore communication inside as well as outside the classroom. Therefore, their primary goal was that pupils in 6d and 6e form friendly bonds, which was achieved through many lessons taught in mixed groups. For example, on Monday mornings all the boys would be taught mathematics by the class teacher of 6d; the girls would be taught by the class teacher of 6e. The team of class teachers and pedagogues regularly discussed issues of content or social learning among themselves so that each of them could focus in their own work on what the

group or individuals needed most that week. To exemplify content and social learning; I want to show field notes from school days during which differentiated learning took place.

6.2.1.1 Tending to Different Needs

For the first three lessons every Thursday, all the sixth graders were divided into three performance groups during Naturwissenschaften (NAWI), or natural science. The topic was the same for each group – "The World of the Small" – but material and learning strategies differed. The teacher explained to me that she prepared one subject with differentiated tasks and texts for three performance levels. This was called outer differentiation, as opposed to inner differentiation, which tended to the different needs of pupils in the same group. The following field notes were taken during a lesson that was attended by pupils in 6x and 6y who had recently learned German or had trouble understanding complex tasks. Some pupils had special educational needs status. I want to draw attention to the language help that was given while working with the children on the content matter at hand and how focusing on language also helped to deepen the content that was taught.

Thursday May 31, 2018

08:15-10:20

This teacher is the English teacher of 6x and the class teacher of 6y. I sit at a girls' table with Rosa and Cagla. Theo, Nino and another pupil sit together, while two more pairs of girls from 6y sit at different tables across the room. Altogether nine pupils are taught by one teacher; the class pedagogue of 6y is also present.

The teacher leads the lesson: "There are animals and plants. Are humans animals or plants?" Rosa raises her hand and answers: "Plants."

On the board the teacher lists characteristics of a bug, a stone, a tree.

The word Nahrungsaufnahme (food consumption) is difficult for many pupils to pronounce. Everyone is asked to have a go at pronouncing the word. "Naahrungsaufnaaahme, loud and clear," the teacher requests. She continues with new vocabulary.

"Miii-krooo-skop (microscope) – "And again all of us together!" "Miiiikrooskooop," the pupils repeat after her.

The teacher writes the topic of the lesson on the board: "Die Welt des Kleinen" (The World of the Small). "What are cells?" she continues. "There are animal and plant cells." They go over the differences and the similarities of both kinds of cells with regard to their functions.

She reminds the pupils that in February they went to the Natural History Museum, where they did a "Mikroskopierschein," a "driver's license" for microscopes that certifies that they practiced using microscopes. On the table in front of her are several wooden boxes containing portable microscopes.

The pupils are asked to work in pairs on a worksheet that shows a large microscope and arrows pointing to its various parts. A box at the bottom of the worksheet contains the list of words the pupils need to match with these parts. This way, they repeat the vocabulary necessary to communicate about microscopy. Rosa and Cagla work together.

After a few minutes, the teacher lists the vocabulary of the microscope on the board in the order in which they appear on the worksheet. She writes: Okular, s (Ocular). 's' stands for the grammatical gender of the noun. [In German nouns can be male 'r,' female 'e,' and 's' for neutral.] Next, she writes: Objektivrevolver, r (nosepiece).

The group continues to talk about the word 'Blende' (blind). The blind regulates how much light falls onto the object, the teacher explains. One child puts up her hand. She says: "Don't you also say that you put make-up on?" The teacher answers: "Oh, yes, well 'to blend' means something else, actually. It means more like 'to mix.'

The pupils take a break.

[...] Rosa grabs the microscope from Cagla; she wants to be first. Cagla waits patiently for her turn.

Together with the pupils, the teacher develops the guiding question for the lesson: "So if there are animal and plant cells, what could be interesting for us to figure out with these microscopes?" One girl raises her hand. She answers: "How do they look?" "Very good," the teacher replies. [...]

Rosa wants to answer this question and shouts answers into the classroom. The rest of the children call her name: "Ro-o-osa!!" She turns around to Cagla and me, sitting with her at the table, and grins. She looks down at her paper and waits. [...]

The teacher asks for hypotheses that the pupils might have about the shape of cells. She asks them to go to the board and draw their "Vermutung, e"(hypothesis)."Hesitantly, some of them go to the board and draw a circle or a circle with a dot in the middle.

The pupils do not know what an object slide is. The teacher gives an example without explaining the meaning: "Der Objektträger trägt das Objekt." ("The object slide carries the object.") "So what does it mean that the object slide carries the object?" she asks. The pupils come to an agreement that the object slide is the place where the glass with the cell sample goes. The teacher smiles and moves on.

[...] The pedagogue of 6y sits with the boys' table and reminds them to stay on task.

I am working with Rosa and Cagla. We have to take spoons and scrape spit from the inside of our mouth to retrieve cells. Both do not want to do it and are shy at first. Then Cagla takes the spoon and scrapes the inside of her cheek. She places the spit on a glass platelet and trickles blue ink onto it to make the cells visible under the microscope. All three of us look through the microscope, but we can see hardly any structure. Nonetheless, both girls are focused on the task. We giggle a little, and the atmosphere is calm. One table has done a very good job, and we join them to look through their microscope. A fascinating image of an animal cell structure can be seen. The girls sketch the cell onto their worksheets.

The lesson is coming to an end. The teacher asks her pupils what they did today. They explain the steps of working with a microscope. Some use the new vocabulary they covered today. The teacher gives them a thumbs-up.

The class is dismissed.

The teacher was able to combine content learning and language work. Her experience as a German as a Second Language (GSL) teacher served her very well in preparing the lessons. Before she entered teacher training, she had lived for many years in the Czech Republic, where she taught German in language schools and companies. The skills acquired in her previous job were her biggest assets when she arrived at this school, she explained:

> *The only thing I noticed from the beginning was that I was very good at was German as a Second Language because here I constantly teach German as a Second Language, and not only in German class but in all other classes as well. When I started here, I taught German in the sixth grade, and I thought, wow, this is exactly what I did in the Czech Republic, also in terms of the topics.*[618]

As can be seen from my field notes, the teacher started her lesson with vocabulary work to provide her pupils with the language necessary to describe a microscope and what it can do. She gave the grammatical genders of the nouns for the pupils to train them on the correct use of grammatical structures. It was important to her that pupils learn "rather real, proper German than such a strange … such a …"[619] I assume she feared that they would develop a sort of Creole variety of German that could be heard from some of the migrant youths in the city. Throughout the lesson, the teacher encouraged pupils to use the terms they had learned, which many were able to do at the end of the period when they summarized the steps of using the microscope. Moreover, she practiced pronunciation with them. She did not directly define words for them but played a word back with the help of a sentence that used the word in question. Language work was as important to the teacher as content work. It was her belief that without language, no cognitive work could be truly successful.

Outer differentiation in three performance levels but with pupils from both classes meant that pupils studied together while working on challenges that matched their skills sets. However, the teacher was not content that this was a successful way to realize inclusion. She wondered: "Is it inclusion, if pupils learned in separate groups?"[620] Students were highly heterogeneous; some were on the level of the second primary school grade, while others

---

[618] "Das Einzige, wo ich am Anfang, wo ich gemerkt habe, gut, da bringe ich was mit, das war Deutsch als Fremdsprache, weil wir hier Deutsch als Fremdsprache mach die ganze Zeit und zwar nicht nur im Deutschunterricht, sondern auch in allen anderen Fächern. Und ich hatte aber, als ich hier angefangen hab, eine sechste Klasse übernommen zum Halbjahr hin. [...] Und da habe ich Deutsch unterrichtet und da dachte ich mir; krass, das ist ja genau das, was ich in Tschechen auch gemacht habe von den Themen her." See: Transcript 3 Germany, Interview with English Teacher, June 20, 2018, ll. 46-52.

[619] "Lieber richtig ordentlich Deutsch als dann so ein komisches... so..." See: Transcript 3 Germany, Interview with English Teacher, June 20, 2018, ll.431-432.

[620] Field notes from May 31, 2018

achieved sixth grade performances.[621] Providing adequate material for her pupils required highly intensive preparation. Furthermore, the number of staff members present at some lessons was remarkable when nine pupils were supervised by one teacher, one pedagogue and one school helper. Pupils simply needed the attention, she explained:

> *There are children here like Theo, for example, who need someone next to them for the entire time. Not because they are stupid, but because they need someone who cares for them because they carry such a burden within themselves.[622]*

Hence, on Thursdays, time was given to pupils studying in performance levels, which meant that those who could be challenged on a more complex level studied on the sixth grade level and those who needed more time to learn and understand studied at the fourth grade level. Detlef Pech, head of Humboldt University's School of Education, deemed outer differentiation of this kind a possible way to realize inclusion. In my interview with him, he commented:

> *The key of inclusion or what it is actually about is participation. I would truly place participation at the heart of inclusion. [...] For me... if I truly design schooling inclusively, there is no situation in which a child can be denied participation. That is the baseline of inclusion. However, the conditions of participation in learning situations have to be set. If I take the example of Latin classes and there is a child who, because of whatever kind of impairment, does not have a command of conventional language use in the way it is required in lessons, which means it is non-verbal, does not write, then participation in the subject of Latin is not possible. There is a core of what of can be described as the basis for participation. However, this does not mean a child has to be excluded from the situation of the Latin class. [...] Therefore, I think it is acceptable to split groups when the subject-specific requirements for participation in the lesson are not fulfilled. Otherwise we cannot design lessons. But this cannot lead to excluding a child from the situation.[623]*

---

[621] "die [Kinder] eben sehr heterogen sind und ich da einfach Kinder drin habe, die teilweise vom Niveau zweite dritte Klasse haben und dann wiederum Kinder, die ganz normal sechste Klasse...[...] Und das ist aber eine Vorbereitung und Nachbereitung, die es in sich hat." ("The children are very heterogeneous, and sometimes I have kids in the group that are on the level of the second or the third grade and others totally normal on the sixth grade level... [...] And the preparation and follow-up work that is highly intense." See: Transcript 3 Germany, Interview with English Teacher, June 20, 2018, ll. 264-269.

[622] "Es gibt ja Kinder hier, wie Gonzalo zum Beispiel, die eigentlich die ganze Zeit jemanden   neben sich brauchen. Nicht, weil sie blöd sind, sondern weil sie einfach eine Bezugsperson brauchen, weil sie so ein Päckchen mit sich rumschleppen." See: Transcript 3 Germany, Interview with English Teacher, June 20, 2018, ll. 304-306.

[623] "der Schlüssel von Inklusion oder das, worum es eigentlich geht, ist Teilhabe. Also ich würde tatsächlich ins Zentrum der Inklusion den Partizipationsbegriff stellen. [...]Für mich... wenn ich tatsächlich Schule inklusiv gestalte, gibt es keine Situation, in der ich irgendeinem Kind eine Teilhabe an der Situation verwehren kann. Das ist... wäre für mich ein Grundsatz von Inklusion. Daneben gibt es aber [...] so etwas geben wie die Möglichkeit eine fachliche Teilhabe für Lernsituationen irgendwie beschreiben zu können. Wenn ich jetzt... ich nehme irgendwas Doofes, wenn ich den Latein Unterricht nehme und es geht um ein Kind, das keinen aufgrund von Beeinträchtigung... keinen Umgang mit Sprache in dem unterrichtlichen Sinne haben kann. Das heißt nicht sich verbalisieren, noch mit Schrift umgehen kann, dann kann ich, dann müssen wir das glaube ich meines Erachtens nach so denken, dann ist eine Teilhabe am Fach, an dem fachlichen Teil des Faches Latein nicht möglich. Ja, es

Because of the teacher's diligent language work, pupils were not excluded from the situation of learning how to use a microscope and what an animal cell looked like, even though they were separated from their higher-performing classmates. In addition, Hans Anan Pandt of Humboldt University approached the question of language with regard to successful learning concepts in highly diverse schools.

> *[...] the crucial question would be, for me, how does the school respond to this [migrant population of over 90 percent]? When the school recognizes this situation, does it have adequate measures, concepts for language development and facilitation? Does it offer language-sensitive teaching and so on ... Are concepts implemented? Or is everything relatively randomly placed into the responsibility of the teacher?* [624]

Asked whether the school had a language development concept for its pupils , the director replied:

> *Terminology... yes, for two years we have set the expectation to develop terminology in the science classes and the crafts classes, to make it more tangible for pupils, yes? To be able to fall back on certain vocabulary, and I know that this is difficult to maintain.*[625]

Hence, an overarching language concept was missing. The director spoke of trouble implementing such a concept and holding teachers accountable for using the resources the school offered. From my classroom observations, the school had taken a piecemeal approach. Some teachers did extensive work on language. Others focused less on the grammatical gender of a noun and instead directed their attention to explaining vocabulary or tying subject matter to the pupils' experiences and making it emotionally accessible to them. An adequate response to the school's pupils seemed to require interventions on very many levels. Considering the data presented in the policy analysis, these field notes illuminate to some extent the great performance gaps that students with migrant backgrounds showed in the 2009

---

gibt sozusagen einen Kern dessen, der... den ich fachlich beschreiben kann als Grundlage zur Teilhabe. Das heißt aber noch lange nicht, dass ich dieses Kind aus der Situation des Lateinunterrichts ausschließen darf. Ja, also dieses Verhältnis zueinander hinzubekommen, wenn ich dann quasi eine Gruppe trenne und sage, das würde ich ähnlich so setzen an dieser Stelle zu sagen, okay, wir machen jetzt fachlich eine Stelle, an der gibt es eine Voraussetzung zur Teilhabe, ohne die das nicht funktioniert, dann würde ich es als zulässig empfinden, die zu setzten. Anders können wir sonst nicht Unterricht gestalten. Aber es darf keinen... sozusagen nicht dazu führen, dass ein Kind aus der Situation ausgeschlossen wird." See: Transcript 1 Germany, Interview with Detlef Pech, May 31, 2018, ll. 100-132.

[624] "[...] die entscheidende Frage wäre für mich: wie reagiert die Schule darauf? Also wenn sie das feststellt, hat sie geeignete Maßnahmen, Konzepte der Sprachförderung, eine durchgängige Sprachförderungen? Hat sie sprachsensiblen Unterricht und und und... Sind da Konzepte vorhanden? Oder wird das alles jetzt in die mehr oder weniger in die zufällige Zuständigkeit eines Lehrers oder einer Lehrerin gelegt?"See: Transcript 2 Germany, Interview with Hans Anand Pandt, June 1, 2018, ll. 320-324.

[625] "[...] Fachwortschatz... da ist es eben in den letzten zwei Jahren war es der Anspruch auch, was die Natur- und Werkpädagogik betrifft, dass da der Fachwortschatz in den Klassen greifbar ist, da ist, ja? Um einfach auch mal zurückgreifen zu können und da weiß ich oft, wie schwierig das ist, das einzupflegen." See: Transcript 7 Germany, Interview with Director, June 27, 2018, ll. 425-428.

PISA results (see 2.2). Based on the PISA results, the KMK pointed out that "in the fields of mathematics and natural sciences, students with migrant backgrounds lagged more than two academic years behind." As my field notes show before content learning can take place multilingual students need to be in command of language skills that allow them to understand the tasks they are asked to perform, the terms they need to use, and the grammatical structures to combine both. The matter of language remained a recurring theme in my field notes and conversations with teachers and pedagogues of the sixth grade.

6.2.1.2 Conflict resolution: The Class Council

Every week I spent with 6d, at least one class council took place. The class council was a democratically-organized meeting of students where everyone was allowed to speak on matters that bothered them until the group would come up with a solution to the problem. Sometimes class councils were held only for the girls of the sixth grade, sometimes for all the pupils. The first class council I witnessed took place in my first week of observation. Subtle aggressions in anticipation of the basketball tournament had led to seething hostility among most of the sixth graders. Through addressing the micro aggressions the teachers had overheard and witnessed in the schoolyard and during lessons, larger outbursts of violence could be avoided, and the winning team adhered to its own promise not to mock the losing team.

Another class council was held a few weeks later. I share the notes I took during this council, since it demonstrated very valuable features that the discussions sparked and nurtured. Only the boys of the sixth grade were summoned, since the teacher had noticed tensions she wanted to resolve before they all went on their weeklong class trip together. In addition, also the ethics teacher who, together with the Islam teacher organized interfaith learning activities, such as the visit to the Muslim, Jewish and Christian houses of prayer, attended the council. While they were at the meeting, the girls worked with the pedagogues on subject-related matters.

Thursday, April 26, 2018

Class council of all male sixth graders sitting in a circle of chairs.

The class teacher reminds the group, "We want to go together on our class trip and have a good time."

One of the boys shouts: "Yay!!!" and strikes a pose.

"However, I know, " the teacher says, "you need to talk."

One boy says that Theo always challenges everyone for a fight.

The kids feel attacked by him. "You don't even understand him," another one says in a frustrated tone. The class teacher says, "Exactly, and I have been telling you this all along. You have acquired your own language. When you attend secondary school after the summer, everyone will laugh at you. You are smart, but nobody will take you seriously with a language such as this. One child shouts a name. The boy turns around and yells: "You are a candidate like that, too! Just so you know." The teacher faces the group and says; "I want you to promise me to stop talking like that."

Another boy raises his hand and shares what annoys to him. Downstairs in the entry hall is a picture of him from a school trip. In the picture his thumbs are raised and he has a broad smile. The face had been painted over with a red marker, he says, and now he looks like the devil. It bothers him immensely. "The pedagogue said I had to put up with it," he says, "but"I can't take it anymore. It is too much." The class teacher says: "I understand. Who else can?" All the boys raise their hands. Another boy puts his hand on the shoulder of the boy who feels teased. Apparently the boy is bullied by a lot of other kids for posing with his two thumbs up. A third boy realizes, "That's almost bullying." The teacher says, "I don't want even a single child to be treated like this. From now on, teasing someone in this manner is forbidden. I will order your parents to come to school if this doesn't stop. I am telling you, and you know I am serious."

Total silence in the room.

Peter, who sits slightly outside the circle of chairs behind some other boys, takes a pillow and places it on his lap. He hugs it with both arms.

Another boy raises his hand and shares: "I have another problem. Sometimes the boys say that I love [a girl's name]." He names all the boys who have teased him about this. The first one says: "OK, I admit it. I am sorry." The boy who was upset about being bullied for his picture adds: "I admit it and I apologize. I do say that a lot. I will not say it anymore, I promise." Another boy says: "You caught me, I admit it." He continues: "Yesterday, I saw a book with two people who didn't even kiss and said [the names of the boy and the girl]. Is that so bad?"

The group discusses the problem for some time longer to end on the promise not to tease the boy anymore about being in love with another girl.

Another boy says, "Whenever I have a problem, Theo comes and adds to the trouble."

Theo wiggles around in his chair. He grins, holds his hands in front of his mouth, rubs his eyes, squeezes them together, rocks back and forth on his chair, looks up to the ceiling, down again to the group, avoids eye contact, grimaces. The teacher asks him to take the seat next to her. He gets up and sits in that chair. There he wobbles; his legs twitch nervously. She asks him to please go outside for a run -- just one big loop so he can calm himself down. He remains seated. The other kids say, "Just do what she says." So, he gets up and jogs out of the room into the hall. As the door closes shut, she turns back to the boys: "As you know,

Theo does not have it easy. Can't we help him somehow?" "But how?" another boy asks. "But how?" she repeats. "What if we just let him talk and do not let us be provoked by him? Try to help him." Nino says: "Oh, I know why he is like that. Is it because he is without his parents?" he asks in a hushed voice. She nods and says: "Probably. You know what that is like, don't you?" He says: "Yes, then I understand him very well."

Theo comes back into the classroom. The teacher directs the group's attention to another pupil. "You have not said anything yet. I thought you had something you wanted to share with us?" He answers in a quiet tone that he does not need to talk about anything anymore. The kids are dismissed for a break.

As the field notes show, roughly 20 boys were able to sit down and discuss issues that mattered to them under their teacher's guidance. They expressed their frustration with being called names, with their classmates' undoubtedly difficult behavior, with being bullied. They could learn of how problems look from their classmates' perspectives, and through empathy they were able to come to apologize. When the teacher gave them space, they could use it. Most remarkable to me was the episode during which Theo left the classroom and his classmates discussed what could be done to help him. Theo, who regularly exhibited anxious behavior through tics that came out as obsessive repetitions of single words or sounds, such as "Skkkkrrrrrrp," alienated his friends and classmates. Nonetheless, everyone understood that his behavior was not entirely his own fault. Many conversations had been initiated to build tolerance. Nino, who had not seen his parents in years, related to Theo's behavior so that both boys knew the source of their distress without explicitly naming it. At times, patience with Theo ran thin when he bullied and attacked first-graders. Theo made uncontrollable sounds and giggles during class; his behavior was at times inexplicable to the outside world, such as stomping his feet, clapping one hand on the other, grimacing and shouting. For his classmates, it was important to voice their confusion again and again over his ways and to work through the frustration so that momentary disturbances did not get in the way of valuing moments when everyone played basketball together or engaged in a shared activity. As one of Theo's classmates said at a class council: "Are we not a family as a class? And when somebody has a problem, you get involved, don't you?" (field notes from April 12, 2018). He did not exclude Theo from this group and referred wholeheartedly to the entire class. This does not mean I did not see pupils students facing each other with scissors in their hands, ready to take a stab (field notes from May 30, 2018), but it meant that the pupils had taken to a way of addressing issues when they developed so that early intervention was possible. It seemed that the class council provided the valve through which the various pressures of the sixth grade community could be released. The class teacher stressed the importance of social learning for the pupils

of this school. However, establishing the grounds on which debating, arguing and conflict resolution could take place was a process that needed daily work. She explained:

> *How do I develop social learning? First of all, it is tightly integrated in our school's program that each class unit is obliged to do social learning. That is a duty. [...] You cannot do social learning in an hour a week by talking about some kind of examples. It is a process. You have to train again and again; it is a daily task. You have to bring it up again and again. The children have to learn how to deal with conflicts. And, as I said, it is a process.[626]*

For the sake of social learning, she spent many hours a week on communication. This time could have been used to do another worksheet on a math problem or German grammar. However, the director thought that what these pupils really needed were tools to manage everyday situations and create experiences that they usually did not have. Therefore, the director encouraged his staff:

> *Guys, go out! Teaching is one thing, and teaching is very important. But go out, go into the city and do something different. Cook a meal together, go to the planetarium, go to the zoo or go swimming three times in one week. A lot of the things we do at this school, for whatever reason, pupils are doing for the very first time. And that's why it is so important because I think we have pupils here who fail. It is not many, but I think they fail because of soft skills… I can catch up with math when I see that I didn't learn this in primary school. The teacher could have been sick or something. But it is difficult to catch up with never having gone to the zoo or the museum […] when you have never gone farther than the two underground stops in your neighborhood.[627]*

Tying the concept of inclusion back to an understanding of participation in society, the director encouraged his pedagogical team to open up opportunities for their pupils to experience city life and the cultural benefits their hometown had to offer. In this sense, school meant more to the director than a place of teaching and learning. What happened outside the classroom, such as taking care of the chickens and the rooster in the school garden, attending a choral performance, trying out an instrument and other seemingly school-unrelated activities

---

[626] "Wie erarbeite ich das Soziale Lernen? Vor allem, das ist ja auch fest in unserem Schulprogamm integriert, dass jede Klasse verpflichtend eine Stunde Soziales Lernen, das ist in jeder Klasse hier. Das ist eine Pflicht. [...] Du kannst soziales Lernen nicht innerhalb also eine Stunde in der Woche irgendwelche Beispiele, das kannst du nicht machen. Das ist ein Prozess. Das musst du immer wieder... das ist täglich. Das musst du immer wieder thematisieren. Die Kinder müssen lernen, wie man mit Konflikten umgeht. Und das ist, wie gesagt, ein Prozess." See: Transcript 5 Germany, Interview with Class Teacher, June 22, 2018, ll. 271-281.

[627] "Unterricht ist das eine, es ist gut, Unterricht ist ganz wichtig. Aber geht raus, geht in die Stad heraus, macht mal was andres, kocht mal oder geht ins Planetarium, geht unbedingt in den Zoo oder geht auch mal drei mal hintereinander auch mal schwimmen. Vieles, was wir hier an der Schule machen, aus welchen Gründen auch immer, machen Schüler das das erste mal, ja? Und deshalb, also das ist ganz wichtig, weil ich glaube, dass wir hier auch dass Schülerinnen und Schüler bei uns nicht nur... es gibt Schülerinnen und Schüler, die scheitern. [...] dass sie eher an solchen Softskills einfach scheitern, dass sie bestimmte Dinge... Mathe kann ich nachholen, wenn ich weiß, ich habe es nicht gehabt in der Grundschule, gut, dann muss ich es nachholen. Da kann ja auch der Lehrer krank geworden sein oder irgendwas Anderes. Aber schwer nachholen kann ich, wenn ich nie im Zoo war oder im Museum [...] wie sieht denn mein Kiez außerhalb von zwei U-Bahn-Stationen." See: Transcript Germany, Interview with Director, June 27, 2018, ll. 322-366.

were, according to him, "the things, I think, that are absolutely crucial and make up a school. I am deeply convinced of that."[628]

6.2.1.3 Discussion: Grappling with Heterogeneity

Scholar of education and ethics Wolfgang Edelstein described school as "the only institution that can provide the appropriate opportunities to cultivate democratic experience – not for elite groups, but for all children and youths."[629] However, a school that was true to the concept of accepting each and every child needed strategies that responded to heterogeneity through experiences of social learning and of being with each other peacefully. But to foster a community requires deliberate activity, as Alfie Kohn remarks.[630] The preferred practice of peaceful and democratic problem-solving by teachers and pedagogues of the Tipping Point School was the class council. Education scholars Jürgen Budde and Nora Weuster explain:

> *The class council's main objective is to shape students' personalities in the sense of developing and improving skills regarding conflict management, communication and reflectivity. It aims to strengthen students' democratic competencies through direct and authentic experiences of participation. The main idea is to provide a platform or opportunities for students to solve conflicts within their peer group.[631]*

Budde and Weuster traced the class council back to German democracy pedagogy that developed in West Germany after World War II and the Holocaust. The American "re-education" program tried to lead Germans back to a democratic renewal of society through pedagogical interventions that fostered communication, reflection, and emancipation.[632] Initially, the class council was developed as a pedagogical tool to achieve "character education," meaning education for moral values.[633] Hijacked today by neoliberal discourses, character-building has been interpreted as "producing smart and good citizens that will be the

---

[628] "[…]ein Instrument lernen. Also dass man mit solchen Sachen Chor, also den Chor gestern, war ein großer Auftritt und das... das sind die Sachen, die wichtig sind. [...] oder in den Garten, dass sie mal Hühner gepflegt haben [...] also das sind die Dinge, die glaube ich wirklich absolut wichtig sind und die auch eine Schule ausmachen. Also das ist wirklich meine tiefste Überzeugung." See: Transcript 7 Germany, Interview with Director, June 27, 2018, ll. 337-245.

[629] Edelstein, Wolfgang (2011): Education for Democracy: reasons and strategies. In: *European Journal of Education*, 46:1, part II, pp. 127- 137, p. 128.

[630] Kohn, Alfie (1996): *Beyond Discipline: From Compliance to Community. Alexandria: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development*, p. 109.

[631] Budde, Jürgen and Nora Weuster (2017): Class Council between Democracy Learning and Character Education. In: *Journal of Social Science Education*, 16:3, pp. 52-61, p. 54.

[632] Himmelmann, Gerhard (2004): Demokratie-Lernen: Was? Warum? Wozu? (Democracy-Learning: What? Why? What for?). In: Edelstein, Wolfgang, Fauser, Peter (Eds.): *Beiträge zur Demokratiepädagogik. Eine Schriftenreihe des BLK-Programms "Demokratie lernen & leben,"*(Contributions to Democracy Pedagogy. A Series of the Federal-State-Programms "Democracy learning & living"), p.3.

[633] Budde, Jürgen and Nora Weuster (2017): Class Council between Democracy Learning and Character Education. In: *Journal of Social Science Education*, 16:3, pp. 52-61, p. 53.

ethical and productive citizens of tomorrow,"[634] Budde and Weuster criticize. In their own ethnographic study, the scholars observed "simulated participation,"[635] i.e. often times, the class council was only used as a sort of mock action, instead of opening space for negotiation and genuine exchange.[636]

Extensive elaborations on the didactics of the class council have been presented by Hans Wocken in his manual on class council work.[637] Despite the fact that the class council of the Tipping Point School did not adhere to several of Wocken's recommendations since there was no fixed date of assembly, protocol, or specific phases, the pupils profited greatly from the meetings they considered *Klassenrat*, class council. The class teacher usually remained the host of the council, summoning the group whenever necessary, and solutions were found on the spot. She insisted that her pupils needed to learn how to deal with conflicts peacefully and the class council was the perfect way to practice with them. Teachers and pedagogues responded to their pupils' need to communicate by taking time out of the schedule and making their concerns top priority. Class councils were learning situations from which nobody was excluded and in which reconciliation could take place. To me space- and time-making for experiencing learning together in this way, was an essential key to the generally calm atmosphere and mostly respectful tone among the sixth graders. The class council built their potential for future negotiating skills, which, as Bernstein highlighted, remained crucial for a peaceful society:

> *Without the experience of democratic and inclusive ways of dealing with conflict and solving problems cooperatively, violent responses to increasing complexity and the collateral loss of control may again be the order of the day.[638]*

6.2.2 "We can do whatever we want, but we cannot catch up."[639]

In my preceding policy analysis, I introduced data by the federal report *Education in Germany* which indicated that students with migrant backgrounds and with lower socio-

---

[634] Ibid.
[635] Ibid., p. 54.
[636] Ibid., p. 58.
[637] See: Wocken, Hans (n.a): *Demokratie lernen und leben im Klassenrat/ Learning and Living Democracy in the Class Council*, accessed from http://www.hans-wocken.de/Texte/HW-Klassenrat.pdf, Aug. 23, 2018.
[638] Edelstein, Wolfgang (2011): Education for Democracy: reasons and strategies. In: *European Journal of Education* 46:1, part II, pp. 127- 137, p. 128.
[639] "Was mich traurig macht, ist wirklich, dass ich hier merke, dass Bildungschancen größer sind, wenn du ein anderes Elternhaus hast, wenn du ein bildungsorientiertes Elternhaus hast, dann hast du mehr Chancen und ich merke wir können hier machen, was wir wollen, wir holen das einfach nicht auf. Und das macht mich betroffen." „What makes me truly sad is that I notice that educational opportunities are larger when you have a different home, when you have a home that is interested in education then you have better chances and I notice that we can do here whatever we want, we will not catch up. And that saddens me." See: Transcript 6 Germany, Interview with Pedagogue, June 25, 2018, ll.310-313.

economic status showed significant educational gaps when it came to demonstrating knowledge on international testing formats. This gap amounted up to one or even two full academic years (see 2.1 and 2.2). In many cases, the students of the Tipping Point School confirmed the statistical facts and gave them a face and a school biography. During my research in several classroom interactions, frustration among the teachers became visible as they urged their pupils to take their work seriously. Pupils were aware that they needed to improve, although they did not know the standard against which they were measured. In the following field notes, I illuminate educational disadvantage through the observations I collected at the Tipping Point School. First, I want to show how the educational gap surfaced in everyday school incidents and how students tried to grapple with the insurmountable weaknesses they had with regard to the expectations that teachers and national curriculum set for them. Second, I want to shed light on the special educational needs status and the tendency of placing students with migrant experiences in special educational tracking. I observed that the refugee children were taught, regardless of their content knowledge, together with the pupils who demonstrated cognitive delay. The principle of the school strictly avoided this practice, yet Nino and Cagla continued to study with the special-needs group.

6.2.2.1 Facing the Education Gap

In the following field notes, I captured a lesson episode during which pupils struggled to find the words for the mathematical operations they were asked to do. Not being able to communicate which steps they took to get to a certain result affected their ability to process knowledge and share it with their classmates. Whereas some pupils could pick up on the teacher's cues by using her sentence scaffold, others simply did not understand the operational meaning behind the words used. Some pupils could not perform calculations they had been practicing since the fifth grade, since they did not understand the task. This was not necessarily an issue of cognitive ability but more a problem of structural language buildup that had not yet become routinized in the pupils' use of language. Some sensed their teacher's despair over their lack of vocabulary. As was often the case, Mel was the spokesperson who communicated back to the group what the teachers expressed with their body language. She understood that the class teacher was deeply worried about her pupils' performance, especially with regard to the secondary school deferments approaching after the summer. Mel's sensitivity picked up on the gravity of the situation when she passed her anger on to her classmates, who preferred to spend extra lessons on drama classes than math exercises. The episode concluded with a statement by the English teacher that perfectly captured the hopelessness of fighting the education gap.

Friday, April 27, 2018

The class teacher is angry: "Guys! I can't let you go to secondary school like that. Every one of you has to be able to do this."

One girl with curly hair offers to turn 3/24 into 1/8. The teacher says: "Correct. What did you do? What is it called that you did?" The girl waits, shrugs her shoulders; she doesn't know how to describe what she did. A boy raises his hand. He says: "Kürzen."["Reduce the fraction"].

The teacher hands out a mock exam. She threatens the pupils with a test on Wednesday if they continue to give her such poor answers.

Complete silence.

Mel is annoyed. She complains to the kids at her table and says: "I told you all we should be doing math, but no, you all wanted to do that play in German class! That's your fault !!"

The teacher writes math problems on the board. She writes Kürzen [reducing fractions] and asks: "What does reducing a fraction mean?"

The pupils guess possible explanations. "You don't understand my question! That is the worst," she says.

"I can't explain what I am doing," another pupil says. "Yes!! Exactly!!!" the teacher shouts. "And this is your weak spot. "Pupils are supposed to expand fractions with an expansion number. Another pupil gives it a go: "Above, you have to do something, too." "Yes! But what does that actually mean?" the teacher shouts with despair in her voice. She waits, then calls out: "You have to muuuuuultiplyyy the numerator with the expansion number 5!"

She writes on the board: 4/28. "There you go." The teacher steps to the window and looks out. Mel says: "Calm down." The teacher turns back to the class, walks into the center of the room and says, "I feel dizzy listening to you." She asks a boy to give the answer. He says, "You have to multiply the numerator with the expansion number 7." She says to the class: "Applause for [the boy]!" The whole class applauds.

"We started learning this in fifth grade," she says. She writes on the board:

KÜRZEN/ Reducing fractions

6/12 =
12/6 =

"What do we do now?" she asks the group. She calls the name of a boy in the front row. He answers: "Erweitern"("Expanding fractions")." She shouts through the class: "OPEN YOUR EYES!!! On the board it says in big letters: KÜRZEN, REDUCING FRACTIONS. Guys, you have to watch out like a fox. Be engaged! Don't hang in your chairs like that."

"You guys can't calculate," she says to the class. "You have to practice, practice, practice. I will call the German teacher and tell her she can stay home and the English teacher will stay with her group. We have to do more math."

She writes: 4/12. "Who can reducethis fraction?" A boy answers, "3." She goes back to a previous pupil, and he answers, "1/3."

She says to the class: "You are all getting detention. You have to solve all the problems on the worksheet and finish them at home." Not a single pupil protests. It is quiet in the classroom.

The English teacher enters the room. The class teacher turns around to her and says: "We have to do a lot of math. All class trips are canceled."

The English teacher nods and says: "Oh, yes. You will not stay at school until 4 p.m. but until 6 p.m., or even 8 p.m. – or even better, we'll sleep over here."

The field notes end when the English teacher humorously suggested that all pupils should not stay just a few hours longer, but overnight. In fact, according to statistics from *Education in Germany* many of these pupils would have to stay after school for two years to reach the same level of academic performance as those their age in other neighborhood schools. It was a bitter realization. Furthermore, the pupils knew they had great deficits and needed to work harder if they wanted to stand a chance in secondary school. Mel expressed her frustration clearly when she bawled out her classmates for choosing extra drama classes instead of math classes. Despite short attention spans and regular outbursts of chaos among the pupils, their will to learn was very palpable. I admired the projects, such as the theater play they were rehearsing. It was later shot on video at the nearby film studios in a very professional manner. Cooking and the photography workshops were also wonderful opportunities for learning outside the classroom: they practiced reading, measuring, communicating. Nonetheless, I feared that time was so precious in light of the overwhelming shortcomings some pupils showed. Did they acquire an operational understanding of language, which they needed for complex tasks and abstract thinking? Their vocabulary needed to be trained to become functional as they communicated with simple vocabulary, sometimes in slang. By no means did this apply to everyone. However, language use was left much to the pupils' intuition, and some had mastered it better than others. When the class teacher asked her pupils whether they had received their acceptance letters from the secondary schools, one answered: "Ich bin jetzt gerade bei andere Haus!" ("I am now at other house"), probably meaning he was living temporarily somewhere else and could not check his mailbox (field notes from May 28, 2018).

Teachers had reduced core curriculum teaching to train competences, such as how to summarize a text by underlining key words, finding subheadings for paragraphs and pulling the most important information together into a shorter text. This was a necessary step, they explained, to stick somehow to the expectations of the given grade level. The class teacher stated:

> *[...] regarding the competences of the children, I try what it possible; I try everything. [...] However, I had to let go of trying to teach the whole core curriculum and all of the content matter. I broke away from that. I can't do that; I can, when I notice that a child has gaps and weaknesses, I am not able to, I will not force myself to put pressure on the child ... that does not help anyone. I have given up on doing that.*[640]

Besides, the teacher remarked that the school building had already been under construction for six years. She was frustrated that it used to have two gyms, but nowadays the pupils had to use the gyms of nearby schools in the winter. They did not have subject rooms, such as a natural science room with equipment or a music room with a piano. Everything had to be brought into the sixth grade classrooms. Resigned, she said:

> *The city council does not give money for finishing this school's renovation, and it has been years. How is this possible? How is it possible, I really ask myself sometimes, I am sorry, but yes, not only do we not have a mixture of pupils here, but have people maybe already given up on us, and do they say: "What should become of these children anyway?" That's the attitude, and these children are not even given a chance, not even we teachers are given the chance to unfold/expand these children.*[641]

It was a troublesome dynamic that the accumulation of education gaps and school resources produced. Certainly most pupils received government support for their lunches, class trips and projects, and the pupil-teacher/pedagogue/school helper ratio was luxurious compared to many other schools in the city. Nonetheless, the all-day school was not able to reduce the gaps many of the Tipping Point School pupils had. The very harsh life trajectories of many pupils accumulated in this school and could not be balanced out by

---

[640] "[...] was die Kompetenzen der Kinder sind, ich geb da was das angeht, versuche ich alles zu geben [...] den ganzen Rahmenlehrplan, die ganzen Stoffinhalte reinzupauken von dem habe ich mich gelöst. Ich kann das nicht, ich kann, wenn ich merke, ein Kind hat diese Lücken und Schwächen, daran arbeite ich schaffe es nicht oder ich werde mich nicht dazu zwingen, den Kinder das sozusagen, sie so unter Druck zu setzen, dass sie auch das... das bringt nichts. Damit habe ich aufgegeben." See: Transcript 5 Germany, Interview with Class Teacher, June 22, 2018, ll. 304-311.

[641] "der Senat dafür kein Geld gibt, dass die Schule fertig wird und das schon seit Jahren. Wie kann so etwas sein? Wie kann es sein, dass man und ich frage mich manchmal also dadurch, tut mir leid, [...] nicht nur, dass man keine Durchmischung hat, sondern dass man auch eigentlich vielleicht schon aufgibt und sagt, was soll denn aus diesen Kindern? Naja, ob die nun in einem engen Raum arbeiten oder nicht – das spricht doch gar keine Rolle. [...] Und diese Einstellung, man gibt den Kindern ja nicht mal die Chance, nicht mal uns Lehrer, diese Kinder zu entfalten." See: Transcript 5 Germany, Interview with Class Teacher, June 22, 2018, ll. 408-415.

teachers or classmates. At times the school projects, such as cooking, drama, etc., struck me as a way to keep pupils busy and involved in positive activities. While this is nothing to be condemned, I wondered whether they were valuable to the overall development of knowledge and skills against which they would be measured on their future paths. Furthermore, I wondered whether the city had accepted the dire conditions under which the Tipping Point School operated, since money was provided for positive interventions but it remained under construction and continued to be a de facto segregated all migrant school.

6.2.2.2 Becoming Disabled

The special pedagogue regularly visited the sixth grade class to work with one girl, Rima, who had been certified with the special education needs status of "cognitive development." This status was supported by the special pedagogue with eight hours a week of contact time. The special pedagogue spent some of this time entirely alone with Rima; some she spent with a group of a fixed group of sixth graders, including Rima, Rosa, Nino and Cagla. In the sessions she organized, the students practiced basic English language skills, while the other pupils of 6x participated in the regular English lessons. The special pedagogue who began her teaching practice in the late 1980s had extensive experience in special education. She had gone through an impressive variety of educational settings for pupils and students with special educational needs before starting to work at the Tipping Point School in 2010. She had always worked in special schools, where she carried full responsibility for a fixed group of students. Some of the special schools achieved very successful cooperation with their hometowns so that students were integrated into social life and had opportunities for further training and maybe even employment. In other schools, she was shocked by the false pedagogy of military discipline through which students were controlled rather than educated. She witnessed how they lost all sense of self-esteem and described themselves as "on sale," since they were "so special" in the sense of cheap and unworthy. When she moved to the city where the Tipping Point School was located, she worked in a neighborhood where second graders lagged behind the cognitive and social development of the 2-year-olds she used to take care of in a nursery. The special pedagogue explained to me that some had been disabled simply by the lack of stimulus to which they were exposed in the initial years of their lives. To her, the varieties of disability and special educational need could be explained as follows:

> *A special school student is a child who has had special experiences. Or who has special challenges that cannot be helped within the frame of regular pedagogical interventions and measures. Of course, there are many differences. One has to assume that children with the special educational needs status of 'learning' especially have*

difficulties learning or working in accordance with the regular curriculum. That is also different with children who have a physical-motoric disability. [...] These children can be of average intelligence or even beyond. But children with the special educational needs status of learning, which is quite frequent at this school, as well as the special pedagogical needs status of language is not tied to intellectual impairment, although it very often goes hand in hand. But it is separate. An IQ test has to distinguish here [between an intellectual impairment or just a language issue]. And independent of that there are children with the special educational needs status of cognitive development. Here one needs to distinguish again. There are children with the congenital, so to speak, defect where it is very unambiguous, like Down syndrome, for example. With these children, you know very well, you can support them; they progress and they have the potential for development, but this potential is limited. And then there are children –and we get those here at our school – who have such strong developmental regression that they are considered "cognitively disabled." These children cannot be educated in integration or at an inclusive school. It is too difficult. The conditions for that are not given.[642]

According to the special pedagogue some students have developmental potential; others do not within the frame of the regular school. At the Tipping Point School, 33 pupils out of 257 received a special educational needs status. These statuses ranged from "language" (16 students), "learning" (8 students), "emotional and social development" (7 students), to "cognitive development" (3 students). Based on her experiences, the special pedagogue shared that some pupils "become disabled" in households in which children are not exposed to stimuli or care at crucial points of their development.

In the following section, I want to focus on each of the pupils that belonged to the special-needs group and the very different reasons for their placement. In this way, I want to address how the special educational need status functions in practice in mainstream education

---

[642] "Ein Sonderschüler ist ein Kind, was besondere Erfahrungen gemacht hat. Oder was besondere Schwierigkeiten hat, die sich nicht im Rahmen eines allgemeinen pädagogischen oder einer allgemeinen pädagogischen Maßnahme lösen lassen. [...] da gibt es natürlich auch noch ganz große Unterschiede. Man muss halt davon ausgehen, dass Kinder mit dem Förderschwerpunkt Lernen besondere Schwierigkeiten haben zu lernen oder nach dem Regelplan [...] zu arbeiten und zu lernen. Das ist nochmal etwas Anderes als Kinder, die eine körperlich-motorische Behinderung haben. [...] Die Kinder können durchaus ja normal intelligent sein oder auch höher intelligent. Aber die Kinder mit dem Förderschwerpunkt Lernen, dieser Förderschwerpunkt ist ja hier an der Schule relativ häufig vertreten. Genauso wie der Förderschwerpunkt Sprache. Der Förderschwerpunkt Sprache ist jetzt nicht gekoppelt an eine also intelektuelle Verminderung oder ... also intelekutelle Beeinträchtigung obwohl es oftmals einher geht. Aber es wird schon getrennt. Also da muss dann eben immer ein Intelligenztest gemacht werden, um das auszuschließen. Und davon unabhängig sind nochmal die Kinder mit dem Förderschwerpunkt: Geistige Entwicklung. Und die, da muss man auch wieder unterscheiden. Es gibt ja die Kinder mit dem angeborenen sozusagen Defekt wo das dann ganz eindeutig ist, wie Trisomie 21, zum Beispiel. Und diese Kinder, wo man ganz genau weiß, dass sie, man kann sie fördern, sie kommen auch weiter und sie haben auch ein Entwicklungspotential, aber das wird begrenzt sein. Und dann gibt es Kinder und diese Kinder haben wie hier an der Schule die solche Entwicklungsrückschritte haben, dass sie als Geistig Behindert gelten. Und das ist es mittlerweile so, dass dort diese Kinder, wenn wir so einen Antrag stellen, und dann der Gutachter, das sind die Kollegen, die von der Gustav Weil Schule kommen, das ist ein Förderzentrum, die also geistig Behinderte betreuen und schwerstmehrfach behindert. Mehrfach behinderte und schwerstmehrfach Behinderte. Also die auch in der Integration oder in der inklusiven Schule also nicht beschult werden können. Das ist einfach zu schwierig. Die Bedingungen sind einfach so nicht gegeben. Transcript 4 Germany, Interview with Special Pedagogue, June 21, 2018, ll. 4-32.

and question the usefulness of the mechanisms in place. I pay attention in particular to responses that the pupils themselves offer with regard to being placed in special group activities.

Tuesday, April 10, 2018
It is 1:10 p.m. Nino and I wait for the special pedagogue to come and work with him. He opens his exercise book and starts doing tasks. He says he can do all the tasks in this book and would like to join the other kids in their English lessons, but the English teacher said it was better if he did not work with the other kids for now.

Wednesday, April 25 2018

English class with the special pedagogue: Rosa, Cagla, Rima and Nino.

Nino is impatient. He wants to do a harder task, but the teacher says it is not possible. He should be patient, she tells him. She repeats to the children in English: "How are you?" "I am fine, thanks, and you?" They repeat this exchange four, five times until everyone has said the exact same question and answer. Nino looks out the window. Then the teacher asks, "How is the weather?" Nino says he doesn't always want to do the same thing. He protests without words: he doesn't raise his hand, stares detached into the distance. He gets up from his seat and lies down on one of the couches in the back.

The special pedagogue does not intervene. Rosa works very eagerly. With each question that comes, her arm shoots up and she shouts: "Aaaah, me, me, me, please." Cagla concentrates and works silently on her worksheet. The first 30 minutes of the double lesson are over. Nino asks whether I can teach him something individually. However, I want to observe the lesson of the special pedagogue so I say no.

Rosa is very bossy today. She decides that I will work with her on the worksheet while Cagla and Rima work together on theirs. We listen to a task on tape and fill missing answers into gaps. There is no vocabulary help, no scaffolding, no preparation for the listening activity. Nino slouches on the couch. He is silent, does not protest.

Friday, April 27, 2018

I sit on a bench by the side of the sports field. The kids have gym class in the school yard. As I watch the kids race each other, Cagla approaches me. "You asked me yesterday whether I would rather have English class with the special pedagogue or with the other kids." I answer: "I did. And? How did you decide?" "The English teacher." I ask her why, and she answers, "Because I want to learn new words." She turns around and walks back to the other pupils.

Wednesday, May 30, 2018

The group (Nino, Rima, Cagla and Rosa) watch a series of videos called "Red and David," produced by the channel Planet School. With excitement and great interest, the four follow the events onscreen. Each video takes about seven minutes and is introduced with a short

summary of the plot in German. The students are allowed to read the teaser aloud. All four raise their hands to read. Rima reds the first teaser, Rosa the second. Nino is disappointed, crosses his arms, takes a deep breath.

Nino and Cagla were not diagnosed with any learning difficulties or impairments. They joined the group because they needed to catch up on vocabulary they had not yet acquired. Their English teacher explained why the refugee children did not join her English classes but instead stayed with the special pedagogue, where they initially did some German language tasks:

> *[...] if they [Cagla and Nino] don't know any German, they will not be able to follow in the other subject classes. But it is more important that they study German as a Foreign Language instead of English class, which is not helpful to them anyway because we also translate from English into German.*[643]

However, Nino and Cagla would also need English language skills to pass secondary school successfully. In the small group with the special pedagogue, Cagla felt she was not learning enough, and Nino said he did not want to do the same routine every meeting. He, too, wanted to learn more. Nino expressed his frustration with disobedience and disengagement, which the special pedagogue tolerated as long as he did not disturb the other pupils. Asked why the special pedagogue did not allow Cagla and Nino to read out the little teaser texts for the clips the pupils enjoyed watching, she replied that she needed to make sure that Rima and Rosa understood what was happening. Cagla would need to listen to a text only twice to understand what it was about. Nino and Cagla were simply not the special pedagogue's priority, since they did not hold a special needs status according to the eight categories. It was Rima after all who received eight hours of support because of her status (cognitive development). Hence, the special pedagogue's attention was to be directed primarily to her. This led to the very unfortunate situation that Cagla and Nino could neither learn as much English as they needed for secondary school nor improve their German language skills.

Rima fit the descriptions of both "learning disabled" and "cognitive development." However, the former was only supported with three hours a week, whereas the latter was supported with eight hours. Drawing on German academia with regard to the special education landscape, scholars Ulrich Bleidick and colleagues named this situation the labelling-resources-dilemma (see 2.3.2) already in 1995 that continues to play out in the

---

[643] "[...] wenn die kein Deutsch können, dann kommen die auch in allen anderen Fächern nicht mit. Da ist es wichtiger, dass sie eben nochmal Deutsch als Fremdsprache richtig diesen Unterricht haben, als Englisch, womit sie sowieso nichts anfangen können, weil ja auch von Englisch ins Deutsche gelernt wird, [...]." See: Transcript 3 Germany, Interview with English Teacher, June 20, 2018, ll. 411-414.

labeling dynamics at my research site to this day. Rima's status of cognitive development allowed for the special pedagogue and the pupil to have enough time to develop a close bond that was very fruitful. When Rima was still unable to read in the fourth grade, the special pedagogue organized intensive collaboration between teachers, pedagogue, classmates and Rima during lessons and in the free learning periods. Rima finally learned how to read, and a "reading party" was organized for her. The class pedagogue remembered:

> *We thought she would not learn it any more. And there was such strong cooperation and support. [...] And then we both, the special pedagogue and I, said, she has to learn it [reading]. Then I said maybe in the afternoons with the lady from the library, Rima and another pupil, and when Rima learns it, we promise her to have a reading party. I don't know what of the things we proposed worked, but it did. And the special pedagogue read a lot with her in their hours together, and I don't know what made it possible in the end, but Rima learned how to read, and we celebrated a really great reading party for Rima last year in July. Everyone was happy that she had made it. Everyone who helped her came. Rima wrote invitation letters with me for everyone who supported her – all her classmates, her family, her teacher – and it was beautiful. The children all brought something for her, but they wouldn't have needed to do that because Rima's parents provided a big buffet. There were dances and games, and every teacher who supported Rima to learn reading gave her a book. I still get goosebumps[thinking about it].*[644]

The pedagogue recounted that Rima's older sister was diagnosed with a learning disability, and her younger brother attended a school project for children who could not follow the schedule of a regular school. With four children in the family and a fifth on the way, Rima lived in very crowded conditions. Nonetheless, she was strongly admired for her emotional intelligence by teachers and classmates. In a class council on April 13, 2018, she was named the most trusted person in the class, who did not take sides and comforted others. No one questioned that it was a reason to celebrate when Rima achieved the reading skill that most children had learned years before.

---

[644] "Wir haben gedacht sie kann das nicht mehr. Und das war und da ist so eine Zusammenarbeit ist schon eine Unterstützung da. [...] Und dann haben wir beide uns überlegt, die Sonderpädagogin und ich, die muss das lernen. Dann habe ich gesagt, vielleicht am Nachmittag mit der Frau in der Bücherei, mit [anderes Mädchen] und wenn Rima das schafft, dann haben wir eine Party in Aussicht gestellt und ich weiß nicht, was davon gezogen hat. Und [die Sonderpädagogin] hat ganz viel mit ihr gelesen in ihren Stunden und ich weiß nicht, was es letztendlich gemacht hat, aber Rima hat lesen gelernt und wir haben letztes Jahr dann im Juli eine richtig tolle Leseparty für Rima gefeiert. Alle haben sich auch gefreut, dass Rima das geschafft hat. Dann kamen alle, die ihr geholfen haben. Rima hat mit mir zusammen Einladungskarten geschrieben für alle, die sie unterstützt haben also für ihre Klasse, für ihre Familie, für die Lehrer, die ihr dabei geholfen haben und das war so schön. Die Kinder haben auch alle was mitgebracht, aber brauchten wir gar nicht, weil Rimas Familie hat ein Buffett aufgefahren.[...] Es gab Tänze, es gab Spiele und jeder Lehrer, der Rima unterstützt hat beim Lesen hat ihr ein Buch mitgebracht. Ich kriege heute noch Gänsehaut." Transcript 6 Germany, Interview with Pedagogue, June 25, 2018, ll. 447-463.

Rosa also attended the group led by the special pedagogue. Her mother's alcohol consumption during pregnancy and her early childhood years, during which Rosa was deprived of basic care, affected her ability to interact with others, communicate and learn. Rosa was also a second-language learner. She had been seen by a psychologist but was not tested for a special educational needs status. The class teacher explained to me in an informal conversation, noted in my field notes of April 13, 2018, that it did not matter to her if Rosa had any kind of cognitive impairment. To her mind, Rosa needed to follow the class instructions as well as possible; she needed to feel she belonged to the class. That was most important. "I want her to have the best time at school she can possibly still have," the teacher added. What good did it do Rosa if she received further testing and her foster parents had extra tasks and obligations? As the class teacher, it was her priority that the class grew into a community and everyone felt respected. Taking Rosa into the special-needs group was therefore a decision based on the common understanding of the girl's need for extra attention and more time to solve tasks and learn.

6.2.2.3 Discussion: From Disadvantage to Disability?

The phrase "We can do whatever we want, but we cannot catch up," captures the frustration that teachers and pedagogues felt in light of intervention and teaching that did not seem to generate adequate results. School excursions, field trips, projects and lessons did not sufficiently reduce the educational gap that a majority of their pupils showed. Lack of appropriate language sabotaged efforts to shine, even for those pupils who with a little help demonstrated competences and skills. Measured against the average pupil, the Tipping Point School kids were still falling short when they expressed themselves.

The pupils of the special-needs group touched on many issues that the policy analysis brought to light with regard to the overlap of poverty, disability and migration in education. Rima's case was exemplary of the labeling-resources dilemma as the status of cognitive development allowed her eight contact hours with the special pedagogue instead of three hours through the status of being learning disabled (discussed in 2.3.2). Furthermore, her family with four children was by 33 percent more likely to be endangered by poverty, according to the calculations of *Education in Germany* (see 2.1). Hence, a low socio-economic background intersected with cognitive impairments rendering Rima highly vulnerable to school failure. However, against the odds and through extraordinary support by the special pedagogue and the class community Rima learned how to read. Nino and Cagla's situation illuminated how children language skills and disability overlapped in special educational tracking. Since they missed out on regular English classes, their chances at

passing secondary education were severely limited. The practice of placing them in the special-needs group rather resembled *Ausländerpädagogik* than intercultural or inclusive pedagogy since the assumption of students' deficit silenced their wish for general education. Also Nino's increasing frustration over the situation put him, I argue, at risk to be placed into the special needs status of emotional and social development. His case illuminated statistical evidence on the overrepresentation of students with migrant backgrounds in categories of learning disabled and emotional and social development (see 2.3.3).

Language was a key tool for special pedagogical testing, through which intelligence was made visible, measurable, and comparable. Sensitive to the fact that language competence did not allow for passing judgment on their pupils' capabilities, the sixth grade teachers mostly abstained from testing and believed that a special educational needs status would not improve performance. Instead, they chose a flexible model for all pupils. Teachers grouped their pupils into performance levels when natural science and history was taught on a differentiated basis, most other classes were taught together as one group with occasional pull-out episodes, supported by the special pedagogue.

In the context of this subchapter, I want to discuss the notion of "the least dangerous assumption," introduced by Anne Donnellan in 1984.[645] Donnellan advocates for assuming competence rather than judgment, deficit or inability when encountering a person who might communicate in alternative ways. Robin M. Smith builds on this notion and explains, "Without accepting behavior as meaningful language (presumed competence), we are left with the conclusion that behaviors we do not understand are either meaningless or malevolent."[646] This is also a crucial implication for behavior based on cultural or linguistic traditions that might be inaccessible to a teacher at first glance. Diana Lawrence-Brown, co-editor of *Condition Critical*, a collection of foundational texts on inclusive education, discusses equity and excellence in education. In her article, Lawrence-Brown gives voice to a special-education teacher describes a pupil with multiple disabilities. This pupil was able to learn reading and writing within the framework of the general classroom. She named this learning environment "the least restrictive environment"[647] for the student. When the child was moved to a self-contained classroom based on an ill-informed decision by the school

---

[645] See: Donnellan, Anne (1984): The criterion of the least dangerous assumption. In: *Behavioral Disorders*, 9, pp. 141-150.

[646] Smith, Robin M. (2014): Considering Behavior as Meaningful Communication. In: Lawrence-Brown. Diana, Sapon-Sevin, Mara (Eds.): *Condition Critical: Key Principles for Equitable and Inclusive Education*. New York: Teachers College Press, pp. 154-168, p. 154.

[647] Lawrence-Brown, Diana (2014): Understanding Critical Perspective- Who Benefits? In: Lawrence-Brown-Diana, and Sapon-Sevin, Mara (Eds.): *Condition Critical: Key Principles for Equitable and Inclusive Education*. New York: Teachers College Press, pp. 33-50, p. 49.

principal, she entered the "more restrictive environment,"[648] as she was cut off from the opportunity to learn inclusively. Considering Cagla, Nino, Rosa and Rima, I find the question of what was the least restrictive environment, based on the least dangerous assumption, useful in analyzing the potential value or damage the special-needs group posed to the pupils. Whereas Rosa and Rima enjoyed the attention and were able to achieve positive results in learning interactions with the special pedagogue, Cagla and Nino were asked to wait their turn. They completed tasks to satisfy the special pedagogue, but not always to push their own learning forward. This situation was criticized by Nino, who mostly showed his discontent nonverbally, and by Cagla, who complied throughout the lessons but when asked, expressed her wish to learn with her classmates in general education. Working with the least restrictive environment would have allowed Nino and Cagla to reintegrate into English class and catch up with their classmates to some extent. Looking at the special pedagogue's career as a special school educator who had formerly held responsibility for her own classes, a wish to have her own group with which she could work and bond with was understandable. However, inclusive schools need to find ways for special pedagogues to be agents of their own professional identity without curbing pupils' learning opportunities and inclusive experiences.

6.2.3 The Hardest Split: "Juggling Two Worlds"[649]

The final theme is captured through the observation of one of the sixth grade teachers, who explained to me that her pupils constantly had to navigate between the worlds of home and school. From her experience, some matters, such as sex education, stayed strictly in the sphere of school:

> *There are matters that stay in one world. I think that there are many pupils at our school who do not take certain things home with them, but who are also happy that these matters are talked about here – that they learn about these matters here, but at home this is not talked about at all. Well, sex education is one of these matters. We do projects and workshops on this topic. Children always also receive a lot of material, but most of them don't take this material home. […] Exactly, they leave this material in their cubbies at school, and many do not talk about these things at home. Children quickly develop an understanding for what belongs to one world and what belongs to the other.[650]*

---

[648] Ibid.

[649] "Und unsere Kinder sowieso so einen riesigen Spagat machen müssen. Also die müssen zwischen zwei Welten jonglieren und die müssen ständig switchen."/ „And our children anyways need to perform a huge split. Well they need to juggle between two worlds and have to switch [between them] constantly." Transcript 8 Germany, Interview with German teacher, June 28, 2018, ll. 421-423.

[650] Es gibt Bereiche, die bleiben auch in einer Welt. Ich glaube, dass es viele Schüler und Schülerinnen an unserer Schule gibt, die manche Dinge überhaupt nicht nach hause tragen, die aber auch froh sind, dass es die hier gibt, dass sie das hier lernen, aber das wird zuhause überhaupt nicht angesprochen. Also Sexualkunde das ist so eine Sache. Dann machen wir dazu ein bisschen Projekttage oder Workshops. Dann kriegen die Kinder auch

The teacher pointed out the importance of bringing the two worlds together so that communication between them was possible. If they could not meet during the time of primary education, she asked, when would they ever?

> *That's why I think that it is very, very important that there are elements again and again that show them [the pupils] that the worlds can also… that there is a togetherness. And if there is a woman in school wearing the hijab in our lesson and she talks about something and they have the feeling that, for example, or she and another teacher work together and share the same opinion and have the same goal then, I think, that is very good for the children to see that these worlds can connect. If this does not succeed in school, when can it ever? Otherwise we will just separate more and more from one another, and soon we will have real ghettos in [this city].[651]*

The divide was disrupted when a teacher trainee wearing a hijab taught at the Tipping Point School. German education law forbids religious expressions such as a crucifix on the wall or a hijab covering women's hair. However, student teachers and training teachers were allowed to complete their education in any government facility. The trainee's placement at the Tipping Point School was encouraged by the principal but strongly contested among teaching and pedagogical staff members. Some feared she would encourage religiously oriented-students to be more outspoken on the rules of the Koran, calling their classmates' behavior "haram" – "forbidden," whereas other colleagues saw no problem at all with her appearance. The Tipping Point School needed to navigate a sensitive relationship between teachers and students. Whereas the sixth graders were excited about the public swimming pool where teachers and pedagogues took them in the heat of the summer afternoons, official swimming classes were often the subject of heated debates. The girls refused to take off their clothes in the mass showers before entering the pool. When they expressed condemnation of students from other schools who would shower naked without hesitation, the special pedagogue considered their behavior worrisome:

> *And then they said eeeeew and I said, excuse me? Eeeeew? What is eeeew about that? That [undressing to shower in a public pool] is totally normal. You say eeeew? If you find this eeeeew, but it is like that here in Germany. I was really very angry. And then*

immer sehr viel Material und die meisten nehmen das nicht mit nach hause. [...]Genau, die lassen das in ihren Fächern und viele erzählen das auch gar nicht zuhause. Also die Kinder haben ganz schnell ein sehr gutes Gespür dafür, was gehört zu der einen und was gehört zu der anderen Welt. Transcript 8 Germany, Interview with German teacher, June 28, 2018, ll. 423-434.

[651] "Deswegen ist das, glaube ich, ganz, ganz wichtig, dass es immer wieder Elemente gibt, die ihnen zeigen, diese Welten können auch, es gibt auch ein Zusammen. Und wenn eben ja eine Frau mit Kopftuch in den Unterricht kommt und etwas erzählt und sie auf ein Mal das Gefühl haben, dass jetzt zum Beispiel, sie und ein Lehrer oder eine Lehrerin, das auch zusammen machen und einer Meinung sind und das selbe Ziel haben, dann ist das glaube ich für die Kinder auch, ja auch gut zu sehen, dass sich diese Welten eben auch verbinden können. Wenn das nicht gelingt in der Schule, wann sonst? Dann werden wir uns noch weiter voneinander separiern von einander und, ich glaube, dann gibt es in [dieser Stadt] bald richtige Ghettos." Transcript 8 Germany, Interview with German teacher, June 28, 2018, ll. 434-442.

I said, OK. We can be naked here and they can be naked here, too; that is totally self-evident and it has always been like that here. We never had problems with that and we do not have war here anymore. And then the girls were totally silent. Because of course, they come from countries of war. But there is no war here anymore. And they have to accept this. [...] If it is so important to them [children's parents], they can send their children to the Islamic school. Or if they are too many, they can advocate for opening another Islamic school. They are welcome to do that. But here we are a public school.[652]

In the eyes of the special pedagogue, these debates boiled down, at times, to questions of upholding and defending democratic principles in a public institution like the school. Hence, the Tipping Point School operated in a sometimes volatile atmosphere, itself juggling religious neutrality on the one hand, and providing engaging educational practice that reached the pupils and their daily experiences, on the other hand.

In my ethnographic field work I paid attention to how the pupils navigated between the two worlds that placed different expectations on the children. The Tipping Point School kids entertained multiple layers of loyalty to family, religion, and sometimes very distant countries of origin while at the same time striving to succeed in a school culture with which they were more familiar than their parents. Furthermore, I also want to show the limitations of the dichotomy of the two worlds, the traditional-religious and the modern-secular, since they were also, to some extent, constructed entities. Whereas most of the sixth graders identified as Muslim, their cultural and ethnic backgrounds varied greatly. Drawing from ethnographer and education scholar Thea Abu El-Haj and her work *Unsettled Belonging*, "Muslim" is a complex signifier that had been strongly shaped through the lens of Western imperialism. Though she applies her research to the U.S. context, Germany, too, shares facets of this history of imperialism:

If Arabs occupy an ambiguous position within U.S. racial formations, Muslims are even harder to locate. On the one hand, as a highly racially/ethnically diverse religious group, Muslims have never been considered a 'race.' Nevertheless, in Western imperial imaginaries, there is a long history through which Muslims have been racialized. They have been discursively constructed, not only as a religious

---

[652] "Und dann haben sie iiiiiiii ja iiiiiiiiiiii sozusagen und dann habe ich gesagt wie bitte iiiiiiiiii? Was ist denn daran iiiiiiiiiiii? Das ist doch ganz normal. Da sagt ihr iiiiii? Ja wenn du das iiiiiiii findest, aber das ist hier in Deutschland so. Da war ich wirklich richtig ärgerlich. Dann habe ich gesagt, ok. Wir gehen hier nackt, sie können hier nackt gehen, das ist ganz selbstverständlich, das war hier schon immer so. Wir hatten noch nie Probleme so, aber wir haben hier keinen Krieg mehr. Und da war das Mädchen total still. Weil natürlich sie kommen ja, sie sind, sie kommen ja aus Kriegsländern. Aber hier haben wir keinen Krieg. Also und dann müssen sie das auch akzeptieren.[...] Wenn sie nun so einen Wert drauflegen und wenn das so wichtig ist, dann können sie ihre Kinder auch zur islamischen Schule schicken. Auch das. Oder wenn es so viele gibt oder wenn es dann können sie sich dafür einsetzen, dass es noch eine weitere islamische Schule gibt. Können sie gerne machen. Wir sind hier aber eine öffentliche Schule." Transcript 4 Germany, Interview with Special Pedagoge, June 21, 2018, ll. 725-748.

group, but as fundamentally Other – ascribed essentialized characteristics – through processes of racialization (Joseph and D'Harlingue 2008; Naber 2008; Rana 2011; Said 1978).[653]

The sixth graders indicated that they had roots in Iran, Iraq, Lebanon, Palestine, Turkey and Syria, and even within these countries Muslim faith was expressed through different interpretations. During a classroom conversation on Monday, May 28, 2018, the Islam teacher named various mosques in the city. When the teacher mentioned one mosque, a girl of Iraqi origin said, "There are only Turks there!" This comment immediately set off two boys, who turned to her and shouted, "Hey!" Surprised and slightly embarrassed, she responded: "Hey! You don't understand me." Mindful of the complexities that exist within any cultural or religious group, I, too, want to abstain in this text from generalizations about "Muslims." The sixth graders discussed among themselves whether they wanted to wear the hijab, how they wanted to observe fasting during the Ramadan and how they imagined their future occupations that exceeded traditional gender roles.

I will now build on my ethnographic field notes to illustrate the juggling that took place between the two worlds when children made decisions on religious practices, on the one hand, while pushing for their own identity as pupils and citizens of their home town, on the other hand.

6.2.3.1 "I fast." Religious Practices at School

Exemplary of religious practices that were observed at the Tipping Point School, I illuminate how the school prepared for the month of Ramadan, and how pupils, teachers, and pedagogues positioned themselves to the topic of fasting. I start with a letter that is published in German at the bulletin of the school. It communicates the official standpoint of the school on fasting to the families.

Dear Parents,   *May 7, 2018*

During the month of Ramadan I would like to let you know in advance what the position of our schools is on the matter.

If it is noticed that students fast and cannot follow, for whatever reason, lessons and/or leisure activities, you will be informed by us and your child has to go home or has to be picked up by you.

Please consider that in this case your child will miss lesson content and that school performance may be reduced. Performance evaluation will not be put on halt.

---

[653] Abu El-Haj, Thea Renda (2015): *Unsettled Belonging: Educating Palestinian American Youth after 9/11*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, p. 11.

In Islam religious class, further behavioral measures during Ramadan will be discussed – for example, appreciative behavior toward everyone as well as the possibility of restricted fasting and renouncement thereof.

Kind regards,

The Principal of the School

The school's standpoint was that children who could not participate in school activities because they fasted were sent home while grading continued. This way fasting was tolerated by the school as long as it did not interfere with pupils' performance. A second handout on the bulletin listed further information by the city council regarding "School and Islam." It read that schools were encouraged to address the topic of fasting in an appreciative, non-discriminatory, reflective manner that did not stigmatize or bully those who did not fast or found their own way of honoring Ramadan.

At the end of April, the sixth graders touched on the topic of Ramadan for the first time while I was visiting them. Mel stated: "I fast." From my field notes of Thursday, April 26, 2018, the following speech by the class teacher was directed to the group. Wearing a necklace with a delicate calligraphy hanger that said "Allah," she stood wholeheartedly behind the school's standpoint and stressed that the class would follow through with lesson material as planned, with no excuses. She warned:

> *I don't want to hear any whining, like "My mouth is dry," "I feel so weak." No! The same as always applies to the schooldays when you fast. Fasting is something that you do for yourselves. I also don't want to hear in the school yard: "You fast," "You don't," "You are a bad Muslim." As I said, age 13, guys. Are we clear on that?*

In response, some pupils replied, "I fast." "Me, too." With regard to the one-week class trip all the sixth graders were taking during the Ramadan, the teacher told her pupils:

> *You can fast, no problem, but we cannot be arriving there and say, "Eeeh my mouth is dry," "we want to eat in the evening." Then you have to save what's for lunch and eat it later.*

No further discussion on the topic was needed by the students who understood that they were allowed to fast but needed to follow the rules that applied to every usual school day. At the end of May, when temperatures in the city regularly went over 30 degrees, Ramadan was in full swing. The following field notes illuminate how pupils and teachers dealt with fasting on a day-to-day basis.

Wednesday, May 30, 2018

They had a lot of fun in the public pool yesterday, Rosa tells me. Nino also daydreams about it. "It was totally great."

Rosa is excited that her best friend is back at school after injuring her leg. Two boys are not in school today.

German lesson 10:00 a.m.

Complete silence.

There are sentences on the board. The kids are asked to turn them into indirect speech. No one talks with their neighbor; full attention is focused on the task ahead.

Nino is fasting, Rima as well. When the pupils have a break, I ask Nino how he is holding up in the pool yesterday even though he is fasting. All the playing and running around. He answers: "No, yesterday I did not fast. But today I am trying again." Rima agrees and says she took a break from fasting yesterday, too. The kids take turns converting sentences into indirect speech at the board.

[...]
The pupils are allowed to spread out into different rooms to practice individually. It is 30 degrees in the classrooms, a thermometer near the window shows. One boy cries because he received a bad grade. Another boy places his arm around the crying boy's shoulders and tries to console him.

Two boys start teasing each other. One shouts at the only blond boy in the classroom: "Be quiet, yellowy!" Offended, the blond boy gets up and pushes the other pupil. A third boy jumps from his seat and shouts, "Here comes the Arab!" All three turn their heads to the door, as their teacher must be returning back through the door any second. The fight quickly dissolves; they head back to their seats.

[...] Nino is thirsty. He gets up from his seat and says he has to get something to drink. Another boy follows him: "Me, too. It is too hot to fast. "Another boy from their table says he is glad his mom did not allow him to fast today. He has red eyes and sneezes. I ask him. whether he is OK. He nods; he is allergic to pollen.

Thursday, May 31, 2018

The pedagogue of 6y sits with Nino and a friend of his during science class. Nino is very quiet. Between lessons his teacher sits down with Nino. She reminds him that they have an agreement: Who fasts and does not work during class is sent home. He replies that he does work. She tells him to get up and go for a walk in the schoolyard to pump up his blood pressure. She also asks Cagla to do so. Both leave the classroom and come back shortly after.

Fasting from daybreak until sunset as it is the custom during Ramadan, the ninth month of the Islamic calendar, was accepted by teachers and pedagogues of the sixth grade with whom I spoke. The class teacher, who shared the Muslim faith with her pupils, approached the topic pragmatically. Students were allowed to fast as long as they continued their usual performance in school. Together with the Islam teacher, the school was careful to mediate between pupils who would bully classmates for breaking fast before sundown. As the class teacher had explained to me in earlier conversations, for some pupils their faith went to

extreme levels. However, she had been able to communicate to her pupils that they did not need to be defensive about fasting. When Ramadan came to an end, the sixth graders were on their class trip. The pedagogue explained that she knew about the Bayram celebration that concluded Ramadan and she organized a special breakfast together with the non-Muslim pupils for the whole class and her colleague:

> *What I find very exciting is that in recent years we have had many colleagues who have a migration background like [the class teacher] who can explain to you certain things in a very different way, who says to you: they want to fast, leave them in peace. Let them fast. We set the rules, what they cannot do or whatever is the context, but leave them in peace. If they want to fast during the class trip, let them." If they can organize this for themselves, which of course they did not manage. Or this beautiful breakfast, right? That you really do get a feeling that this is something for the kids that is like Christmas, and that you then, well… The other pedagogue and the non-Muslim kids like Theo and Rosa, and I, we prepared the table for the others so that the Muslim children and, of course, Miss [class teacher], would have a beautifully set and decorated table for their Bayram celebrations.[654]*

Most of the sixth graders were 12 or 13. They had just entered puberty, and fasting seemed to be a ritual to them that marked maturity. Asked if they would fast, most would feel strongly about their decision to do so. However, in day-to-day life, they acted pragmatically. They broke fasting on days when they were very active or when they were too thirsty to concentrate. Nobody wanted to miss out on a fun afternoon at the public pool because of feeling too weak. During classes they did not call one another out when they went for water. Ramadan did not turn into a matter that divided pupils from teachers. I see two reasons for this: Pupils were trusted to observe fasting responsibly with regard to their health and their performance in school; they were treated as young adults who had to make good choices for themselves. Furthermore, they enjoyed support and assurance from their teachers and pedagogues so that fasting did not turn into an issue through which pupils could act out resistance or struggle against their educators. The juggle of observing religious traditions without losing performance and the sense of belonging to the class community was achieved

---

[654] "Und was ich total spannend finde, dass wir in den letzten Jahren ganz viele Kollegen gekriegt haben, die auch Migrationshintergrund haben also sowas wie [Klassenlehrerin], die dir bestimmte Sachen einfach nochmal ganz anders erklärt, die zu dir sagt, also [Pedagogin], wenn die fasten wollen, lass die doch in Ruhe. Lass die doch fasten. Wir stellen Regeln auf, was sie nicht dürfen bzw. was hier der Kontext ist, aber lass die doch in Ruhe. Wenn die auf der Klassenfahrt fasten wollen, lass die doch. Wenn sie das organisieren, haben sie natürlich nicht. Oder auch dieses schöne Frühstück, ne? Dass man also wirklich ein Gefühl dafür kriegt, dass das für die Kinder, wie Weihnachten ist, und dass man dann da auch. Als ich habe dann mit Martina und den nicht-muslimischen Kindern also mit Goncalo und Lisa, wir haben, dann ganz schön den Tisch gedeckt für die anderen, damit die muslimischen Kindern an ihrem Bayriamfesttag und Frau XXX natürlich auch, an einen ganz schön gedeckten Tisch setzen können." Transcript 6 Germany, Interview with pedagogue, June 25, 2018, ll. 778-789.

in a school system in which this tradition did not belong to the cultural canon. Students were not asked to trade one for the other; it was possible to belong to both worlds.

6.2.3.2 Backgrounding or Foregrounding Muslim Identities?

Throughout my research stay at the Tipping Point School, references to Islam surfaced in classroom discussions, either introduced by the pupils themselves or through their teachers. Exemplary of these incidents, I want to present three field note entries. As I wrote these entries, I asked myself whether secularity was safeguarded in these incidents and how pupils felt who did not share a Muslim identity with their classmates.

Thursday, April 12, 2018 (08:05 to 16:00)

I enter the classroom. The pupils are taught in three different rooms during science class. The teacher trainee, a woman wearing a hijab, goes over some of the content she taught the students in their previous lesson. She talks about the phases of the moon. She explains what an ascending moon is and what a descending moon is. She continues to explain that "for the Muslims, for example, one observes and follows the moon. The class teacher is present as well and adds that this is the same for Christians, and that also gardeners pay attention to the phases of the moon when they cut flowers. The lesson continues, and the teacher takes over while the trainee prepares an exercise.

Friday, April 13, 2018

10:50 – Class council

The teacher asks the girls "How are you feeling? Are you happy?" Nobody answers. The teacher asks different girls: "Cagla, do you feel disrupted?" She answers "Yes, by Rosa." Rosa answers, "You disrupt me, too." Cagla explains that she does want to talk to Rosa when the teacher is finished announcing a task in class, not while the teacher is speaking. The teacher turns to Rosa and says: "Do you understand, Rosa? Cagla wants to help you but you have to stop disturbing her. If you didn't have Cagla, who always helps you, it would be very difficult for you." Rosa nods. More girls start talking about what annoys them. Two girls start fighting. They accuse each other of talking badly about the other behind her back. "Defaming," the teacher says, "is something very, very bad. If we follow the Muslim faith, then this is one of the worst sins." The children are quiet.

The class council continues some time longer.

Monday, June 18, 2018

All the sixth graders sit together in a large circle of chairs. They sing "Happy Birthday" for a classmate. They quickly cover some of the highlights of the class trip from which they returned last Friday. It was great, the group concludes.

Then today's topic is announced: "Being different." The kids are asked to come up with thoughts on why and how someone can be different.

-"Everyone experiences something differently," one student says.

-"Everyone is an individual," another one shares.

-"Many come from different countries." Someone interrupts and shouts, "Ausländer!("Foreigner!")

-"Everyone has a different religion."

-"Everyone has a different belief."

-"Our skin colors are different."

Present are the sixth-grade class teachers, the special pedagogue and two school helpers.

The teacher continues: "During the class trip, did somebody notice that someone was different?"

"At the Olympics," someone says, "everyone had different strengths and weaknesses."

"The other kids insulted us as 'foreigners.' "They were from a different school and also lived in the resort, a student explains for those of us who were not there. "We played volleyball. Although we have become Germans. German passport!"

The teacher asks: "What if someone is different because of their body? What if that person grows a lot of hair like Tiger Girl in the movie 'Wonder'?"

A pupil answers: "I would let my hair grow because it is the work of God. I do not need to feel ashamed of that."

"And what about tattoos?" the teacher asks. "In Islam it says that you are not allowed to change your body. That's why tattooing is sin. It is haram."

Another pupil raises his hand. He says, "But we only add something to the body."

The teacher discusses more examples.

She says: "What if I walk down the street with my brother? In front of us there are two men, they hold hands and kiss." A boy shouts, "Schwuletten." ("Faggots.") The pupil who responded to the question of letting hair grow says, "I don't think that is a good thing, but I accept it because in my religion it says to accept every human being."

The field notes illuminate moments in class discussions when teachers or pupils drew on the common religion for many pupils at the school to clarify a point or to judge a situation. In my third example from June 18, 2018, the sixth grade class teacher responded to her pupils' references to Islam and probed further what this belief meant for different situations. When I enquired about this moment in class, she explained:

> *I try to use it [Islam] positively. […] Sometimes I have the opinion that Islam and, social learning can be integrated very well so that one, well, you have to have an*

instrument to reach the children, and I know exactly that on Monday when we discussed the topic of 'being different,' Islam was also mentioned. When [the boy] said that my religion prohibits this, or I said, "Well, what about the ban on tattooing in Islam? It is a modification of the body," and so on. And these topics I use in that moment because I know exactly that they will respond to this. But not only me. My colleague [the German teacher] does that as well. This does not depend on whether I share this religion, but simply on how can I get to the children? And most often, you can get to kids by their, so to speak, religion, their origin, whatever.[655]

She clarified that she used references to Islam as a moral framework and as a way to draw her pupils' attention to the matters being discussed in class. She knew that her pupils' value system and judgment were routed in the teachings on Islam. She was able to value her students' knowledge on the Koran and gave them the feeling of authority over the specific knowledge that they possessed. Whether she shared the faith of her pupils did not matter to her. She was interested in their religious belief because it caught their attention and made them focus on a task that triggered their learning. Also, the German teacher explained that knowledge of Islam was helpful to create a bond between pupils, parents and teacher at this school:

> *I think you cannot work at this school and not know anything about this religion. Simply to better deal with difficulties and conflicts, because the more you know, the better you can react to the specific situation and the better one can talk to the parents. And yes, it makes the job easier because one can understand many, many, many things better. And therefore, I think, some kind of cultural education for the pedagogues of this school would be very, very important.*[656]

References to Islam were treated as cultural reference points that teachers worked with pragmatically to reach their students, communicate with parents and simply understand the world that their students came from. When I discussed these practices of drawing on Islam during lessons, Mario Dobe and Detlef Pech disagreed. Dobe who had previously held the

---

[655] "Ich versuche es positiv zu nutzen. [...] Ich bin manchmal der Meinung, dass man den Islam oder Soziales Lernen kann man ganz gut integrieren, dass man...man muss ja immer ein Instrument haben, wie man die Kinder kriegt und ich weiß ganz genau, das habe ich auch am Montag als wir dieses Anders sein Thema hatten, da wurde auch der Islam mit reingebracht. Wo [ein Schüler] gesagt hat, meine Religion verbietet das oder ich gesagt habe, naja wie sieht's eigentlich aus im Islam ist es verboten sich tätowieren zu lassen. Es ist eine Veränderung des Körpers, und und und. Und solche Themen nutze ich in dem Moment, weil ich ganz genau weiß, dass sie auf das anders reagieren. So. Aber nicht nur ich, sondern ich mein [Deutschlehrerin], die macht das auch. Die kennt den Koran und weiß, was eine Sünde ist und was nicht und die thematisiert das auch. Also das hat nichts damit zu tun, dass ich der Religion also dass das auch meine Religion ist, sondern es ist einfach nur, wie kriegt man die Kinder? Und meistens kannst du die Kinder kriegen in ihrem quasi in ihrer Religion, in ihrer Herkunft wie auch immer." Transcript 5 Germany, Interview with Class teacher, June 22, 2018, ll. 656-672.
[656] "Ich finde man kann nicht hier an so einer Schule arbeiten und überhaupt nichts über die Religion wissen. Also schon allein um mit Schwierigkeiten und Konflikten um besser umzugehen, weil je besser man sich auskennt, desto besser kann man auf bestimmte Sache reagieren und auch man kann auch besser mit den Eltern sprechen. Und ja. Also es macht die Arbeit einfacher, weil man einfach viele Sachen, viel, viel besser verstehen kann. Und deswegen glaube ich, dass so eine kulturelle Schulung für die Pädagogen hier an der Schule ganz, ganz wichtig wäre." Transcript 8 Germany, Interview with German teacher, June 28, 2018, ll. 534-541.

position of principal at a school that shared similar demographics as the Tipping Point School argued:

> *In my practice I never made any references to the religious affiliation of my students, and I had kids in my classroom who were Muslim; there were children who were Protestant, Catholic or did not belong to any religion. I never made any references because I think that religion is one thing and culture is another. Now in Germany or in many Islamic states, culture and religion are closely connected historically, and that's why I think it is most important that we know about the cultural backgrounds of our students. If there is a German-Turkish teacher at that school, then that is a competence that this teacher brings to her teaching staff by educating about the cultural backgrounds of the students of Turkish origin. She cannot say much about the background of Arabic students or students from Syria or Lebanon or from somewhere else, which are very different, which means that they do not all share the same culture. [...] But I don't think it is right if I, for example ..., –I don't belong to any religious orientation – if I point out to children that their behavior is wrong behavior in their religion. Either behavior is wrong in our culture or it is not wrong behavior. I would never make a reference to religion. Instead, there are rules of human interaction, and these rules of interaction need to be adhered to. We need them so that we do not argue about everything, beat, hit, but deal peacefully with each other, and that's what it is about. I don't care whether someone has an Islamic background, or a Protestant, or Catholic or no religious background at all. I don't care.[657]*

Dobe defended a position of neutrality in schools which did not allow for any religious references. However, he suggested to bond with students over their cultural backgrounds. Matters of morality and ethics should be generated from reason, not from religion, he stated. Detlef Pech of Humboldt University responded differently to the question of religion as a reference point in school. He said it was paradoxical that teacher students at university always spoke about making teaching relevant to the true experiences of their students and their

---

[657] "Also ich habe in meiner Praxis niemals auf die Religionszugehörigkeit von Schülerinnen und Schülern irgendeinen Bezug genommen und ich hatte in meinen Klassen Kinder, die waren islamisch, es waren Kinder, die waren evangelisch, katholisch oder gehörten gar keiner Religion an. Ich habe darauf keinen Bezug genommen, weil ich denke, die Religion ist das eine, die Kultur ist das andere. Jetzt hat in Deutschland oder in islamischen Staaten natürlich die Kultur auch ganz viel mit Religion zu tun aus der Historie und deswegen war es, denke ich, dass es vor allen Dingen wichtig ist, dass wir die kulturellen Hintergründe kennen und dafür finde ich es gut, wenn es an den Schulen Menschen gibt, von denen ich etwas über die kulturellen Hintergründe der Schülerinnen und Schüler erfahren kann. Also. Wenn es an der Schule eine deutschtürkische Lehrerin gab, dann ist das eine der Kompetenzen, die diese Lehrerin in das Kollegium einbringen kann, nämlich, aufzuklären über die kulturellen Hintergründe der türkisch stämmigen Schülerinnen und Schüler. Da hat sie noch nicht die Hintergründe der arabischen Schülerinnen und Schüler aus Syrien oder aus dem Libanon oder von wo anders her, die sind ja nochmal unterschiedlich dazu, das heißt ja nicht, dass das alles die gleiche Kultur, [...] ich finde es nicht richtig, wenn ich zum Beispiel als... ich gehöre keiner Religionsgemeinschaft an, jetzt Kinder darauf hinweise, dass ihre Verhaltensweise in ihrer Religion eine falsche Verhaltensweise ist. Entweder ist das eine falsche Verhaltensweise in unserer Kultur oder es ist keine falsche Verhaltensweise, ich würde niemals einen Bezug zur Religion herstellen. Sondern es gibt bestimmte Regeln des menschlichen Miteinanders und diese Regeln des Miteinanders sind einzuhalten. Die brauchen wir, damit wir uns nicht über alles streiten, schlagen, prügeln, sondern damit wir friedlich miteinander umgehen und darum geht es letztendlich und da ist es mir Wurst, ob jemand islamischen Hintergrund hat oder evangelischen oder katholischen oder gar keinen religiösen Hintergrund, das ist mir egal." Transcript 9 Germany, Interview with Mario Dobe, July 12, 2018, ll. 855-880.

individual contexts but they strictly avoided the matter of religion. He echoed them and stated:

> *"Oh, the kids have a religious background. No, that has no place here, we cannot reference that." This does not work. It totally has potential for conflict. Yes, of course. But still, it does not work like that. I think what we really urgently need to learn is, if we do not come from families that have a story of migration somewhere in their family background, we do not have any access to what this means.[658]*

Pech stressed that school was the place to bring religion in to discuss extreme views and to teach students sensibly about their own religions, but also about worldviews and how to negotiate between different concepts and ideas. If Islam mattered to students then why not work with religious references when doing math exercises, natural science projects, storytelling, etc.? The Tipping Point School illustrated the pedagogical dilemma of foregrounding individual contexts in teaching but backgrounding Muslim identities.

6.2.3.3 Discussion: Facilitating the Juggle

In the afternoon of Thursday, April 12, 2018, the pedagogue of 6x and I discussed whether her pupils felt included into German society. Drawing on Thea R. Abu El-Haj's ethnographic work on Palestinian American teenagers as they navigate and construct identities as American citizens, I too posed the question of whether the Tipping Point School children felt German.[659] The pedagogue spoke about the terrorist attacks that took place in France in November 2015.[660] In the aftermath of the attacks, she said, she realized for the first time how hostile other people reacted to her pupils. Together with her Arabic teacher colleague and the pupils, she had gone to the French embassy with flowers and handmade signs and letters expressing their condolences. She remembered:

> *The other people who were there as well looked at the kids as if they were the terrorists themselves. One of them also said, "look at all these black heads!" When they noticed that the kids were actually very nice, they said to me that I had done a good job raising these kids. To this I responded, no, it was their parents who had done a good job.*

---

[658] "Ach die Kinder haben einen religiösen Hintergrund. Ne, das hat da nichts verloren, daran dürfen wir uns nicht orientieren", das geht nicht. Das geht nicht. Das hat totales Konfliktpotential. Ja, natürlich. Aber nichtsdestotrotz es funktioniert ja nicht an der Stelle. Und der Teil, den wir glaube ich unglaublich dringend lernen müssen, ist sozusagen, also wenn wir nicht aus Familien kommen, die eine Einwanderungsgeschichte irgendwo im Hintergrund haben, ist sozusagen den Zugriff darauf überhaupt zu finden" Transcript 1 Germany, Interview with Detlef Pech, May 31, 2018, ll. 543-548.

[659] Abu El-Haj, Thea Renda (2015): *Unsettled Belonging: Educating Palestinian American Youth after 9/11.* Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, p. 77.

[660] The terrorist organization Islamic State in Iraq and Syria (ISIS) had claimed responsibility for attacks at six different locations in Paris, taking more than 130 lives on Nov. 13, 2015. See: 2015 Paris Terrorist Attacks Fast Facts, CNN, accessed from https://edition.cnn.com/2015/12/08/europe/2015-paris-terror-attacks-fast-facts/index.html, on Sept. 8, 2018.

Stereotyping was something that the sixth graders had already experienced on different occasions. Their religion was not only a private matter but had also come under fire in German politics and the media in the years that followed the terrorist attacks in 2015. In March 2018, the Minister of the Interior, Horst Seehofer, officially excluded Islam as a religion that belonged to Germany, insulting German Muslims as second-class citizens.[661] To ask students to leave their religious backgrounds, which were highly contested and even defamed in the society in which they lived, upon entering the school, seemed once more hypocritical.

When I entered the classroom in the mornings and the sixth graders would joke about an Arabic television series, I experienced my own ignorance. This was a difficult feeling. The same feelings occurred in the light of religious knowledge about which the sixth graders educated me. The Tipping Point School was about facing unfamiliarity, for the pupils as well as the teachers. I admired educators who shared the pupils' cultural background because they could communicate with them from an insider perspective that I lagged. It was a powerful moment when students demonstrated knowledge and experience over a sphere of life that the teacher did not know or have access to. Returning to Thea Abu El-Haj,

> *much public political debate about immigration in multicultural democracies centers on the question of new im/migrant communities' willingness to let go of affiliations to their homeland. In the United States and many other Western states, these political anxieties have focused increasingly on Muslims, who are regarded as potentially dangerous to the extent that they do not view themselves as wholly "American" or "British" or "French" and so forth.[662]*

The pupils of my research site were already well-attuned to the paradoxes of their own identity. They sometimes referred to themselves mockingly as *Ausländer*, (foreigners), they were tied into the intra-religious quarrels centering on which mosque to attend, while singing along to the lyrics of "Yallah Habibi" by the rapper duo Sido and Mohamed Chaouki during the end end-of-semester party. The pupils had strictly forbidden that their siblings or parents attended the party. When the party was in full flow the pupils of 6d and 6e loudly chanted along "yallah, yallah habibi – Ich hab nur Bilder von dir in meinem Kopf" ("Come on Darling - I only have pictures of you in my head").[663] The Tipping Point School kids were teenagers who juggled expectations from home and the city's exposures to Western images and

---

[661] Tagesschau (March 16, 2018): "Der Islam gehört nicht zu Deutschland." (Islam does not belong to Germany), accessed from https://www.tagesschau.de/inland/seehofer-islam-101.html, on Oct. 11, 2018.
[662] Abu El-Haj, Thea Renda (2015): *Unsettled Belonging: Educating Palestinian American Youth after 9/11.* Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, p. 31.
[663] Ibid., p. 41.

lifestyles that naturally intrigued them. Again, I find Thea Abu El-Haj's observations very suitable with regard to children who belonged to more than one national community:

> *These young people's sense of belonging to a Palestinian national community calls into question the normative assumption that one-way social incorporation into the United States (or other receiving nations) is, or should be, the goal for youth from transnational communities.*[664]

The one-way social incorporation, mentioned by Abu El-Haj, resembles the practices of *Ausländerpädagogik* in the German context that has aimed at containing students' multicultural heritage in linguistic and religious subject classes. Considering the preceding policy analysis that brought to light that "migrants were the great losers of the German education system," the traditional strategy is in need of fundamental revision. In our interview, Mario Dobe highlighted that the paradigm of inclusive pedagogy pushed by the ratification of the UN-CRPD required a broad approach to heterogeneity. He had observed that local government appreciated multiculturalism as an asset to society. Therefore he and his colleagues promoted the UN-CRPD in schools also with regard to limiting barriers to participating into society's goods for students with migrant identities. The Tipping Point School illuminated how school cultures may foster practices and discourses that abstain from assimilation strategies. Maybe it was even this approach to the students' cultural backgrounds that allowed them to perform the juggle between two worlds.

6.3 Conclusion: The *Grundschule* – A School for Whom?

The school community at the Tipping Point School was in many regards unique. It tried to beat the odds on an almost daily basis. The pupils who were part of this research study held identity markers that played out dramatically in the German education system. As "the great losers of the German education system" (Boston Consulting Group), a statistically overproportional number of migrants experienced tracking into low-performing school branches and special schools, promoted through decades of special and foreigner pedagogy. As Muslim migrants from lower socio-economic backgrounds, the pupils at the Tipping Point School needed to bridge language barriers and grappled with curriculum that was not responsive to the knowledge they brought to school. One-third of the students held diagnosed special educational needs status, which spoke to the close overlap of race and disability described in the literature. Over the decades the school had become racially segregated, changing from a once-multicultural community to an almost all-Muslim student population. By shining a light on the city's housing and migration policies, I tried to show the

---

[664] Ibid., pp. 42-43.

implications that neighborhood segregation has had for education in schools. Teachers and pedagogues were fond of their students and their work. However, in several conversations, I encountered the verdict that one pedagogue expressed so poignantly in our interview that her school should not exist:

> *What I really wish from this Germany is that a school like ours did not exist. And also that the school that my children went to [in a district without migrant students] did not exist. I wish that we would become more mixed. And I believe that a lot would come of this because one can learn so very much from one another.*[665]

The faculty knew that the school was not representative of German society. Here were pupils who understood one another's religion, cultural customs and maybe even mother tongues. However, their participation in overall society was not granted through the experience of being a student at the Tipping Point School.

Actually, it almost seemed as if the Tipping Point students were contained in this one school as to not interfere with others in the neighborhood. As teachers, pedagogues and principal tried to engage students in the social life of the country where they were growing up, students found their own ways of navigating cultural traditions and teenage life. It was an extraordinary experience to see students as young as 12 considering choices and decisions about their own identity that others make in adulthood. The Tipping Point School gathered students who were growing up under dramatic conditions. Violence and aggression bubbled up frequently, but even so, witnessing he dedication to a pedagogical way of being together, of working through situations that were not immediately changeable -- loss of parents, loss of home, poverty, disability, etc. -- was an extraordinary experience for me. This Grundschule, which operated under such grim conditions, was a school that attempted a language of hope and possibility for its students that I had never encountered before. Although a segregated, all-Muslim, all-migrant school should not exist in Germany, everyday life in this school demonstrated how faculty members and students found ways to make learning possible in a system that has failed students with migrant identities and disabilities for decades.

Sadly, though unique in some respects, the Tipping Point School is not alone. Considering that the German economy observed the "highest number of employees and the

---

[665] "Was ich, was mir, was ich mir von diesem Deutschland wirklich wünschen würde, ist dass es sowas wie diese Schule eigentlich gar nicht gibt. Und dass es so eine Schule, wo meine Kinder waren in [XXX] auch nicht gibt. Ich würde mir wünschen, dass es wirklich mehr gemischt wird. Und ich glaube auch dann würde ganz viel dabei rauskommen, weil man ganz viel von einander lernen kann." Transcript 6 Germany, Interview With Pedagogue, May 25, 2018, ll. 820-825.

lowest unemployment rate since reunification"[666] in 1989, children who grew up in poverty and with migrant backgrounds lagged by nearly two years in knowledge of math and natural science. However, the drastic gap between rich and poor was also noticeable in other parts of the world. In June 2018, in a four-part series in The Los Angeles Times, Steve Lopez reported on child poverty in Los Angeles, which had the fifth-largest economy in the world. Lopez cuts to the point: "when you break those numbers down, it means there are about 2 million children in California living in poverty … there are a couple of schools where nearly a quarter of the student body was homeless."[667] Homelessness meant living in garages, motels, shelters and overcrowded accommodations on an ad-hoc basis, causing extreme instability to the families and their children, Lopez explained. Nutritious food, homework, basic security came in second or third as families struggled to maintain a roof over their heads. Through school visits and interviews with educators and the principal, Lopez illuminated how the families' burdens were transferred to the schools and their teachers. His heartfelt accounts of the ethnographic observations he collected for his series reminded me of the many challenges the Tipping Point educators faced. Because of malnutrition and stress, students at primary school level already showed signs of depression and grave obstacles to learning. Lopez summarized:

> *They find irritability; they find mood disorders, high rates of depression, even among elementary school students. And the thing that's of even greater concern is all of this recent research about adverse childhood experiences. And the more of these that you're exposed to, including unstable housing situations and broken families and not enough of an income to get you to school regularly or to put food on the table, you have not just physical and mental challenges and ailments as a child, but they're finding, researchers are, that these are lasting into adulthood -- something like twice the normal rate of heart disease if you're exposed to four or more of these adverse childhood experience. So this is not just a problem in K through 5 for these kids.[668]*

Lopez showed clearly how poverty affected children's health and their ability to learn and take advantage of their cognitive abilities. These effects are very similar at the Tipping Point School, where many children grappled with personal trauma and living conditions that a whole team of social workers could address individually, but in reality "the only person that's

---

[666] Bundesministerium für Arbeit und Soziales: Der Fünfte Armuts- und Reichtumsbericht der Bundesregierung: Lebenslagen in Deutschland, Armuts-und Reichtumsberichterstattung der Bundesregierung (Kurzfassung), pp. 1-48, p. 5, accessed from http://www.bmas.de/SharedDocs/Downloads/DE/PDF-Pressemitteilungen/2017/5-arb-kurzfassung.pdf?__blob=publicationFile&v=2, on Sept. 12, 2018.
[667] LA Times Columnist Steve Lopez on Child Poverty in LA (June 12, 2018), PBS accessed from https://www.pbs.org/wnet/amanpour-and-company/video/la-times-columnist-steve-lopez-on-child-poverty-in-la/, on Dec. 12, 2018.
[668] Ibid.

going to have to face this for 15 or 20 kids in her or his classroom is that teacher."[669] The Tipping Point teachers and pedagogues went beyond the call of duty as they did home visits to check on children's current situations and well-being, or threw a party to reward an individual student for her accomplishment of finally learning to read. During Lopez's interview, another essential truth about pupils and their performances at schools like Tipping Point or Los Angeles' Telfair Elementary School, was stressed:

> *You know, one of the things that your stories also point out is that if we just looked at the test scores, we'd miss the nuance that you're describing here. We wouldn't see the inspirational, and I think one of the people in the story had said the test scores really are much more of a measure of poverty, not necessarily of their potential.[670]*

This comment resonated deeply with my observations. The sixth graders were eager to learn and pushed one another to be quiet or pay attention despite the many moments when their concentration broke and the teacher used too much vocabulary that they simply could not follow. Using the language of hope and possibility, I would like to frame the Tipping Point School not as a high-risk school, but a high-potential school where educators accomplished the extraordinary goal of maintaining a sense of ambition within their pupils.

7. Discussion

Education is always about what kind of persons we are going to be.[671]

In this discussion, I want to map my path from teacher trainee to researcher of teaching practice. It is the ethnographer's question to ask, "What does it mean?" as Katherine Schultz, the anthropologist of education and teacher educator, pointed out in her keynote speech *Distrust and Educational Change: Responding as Educators to Our Current Times* during the 2017 EDiTE summer school, organized by the University of Lower Silesia in Wroclaw. Therefore, I want to go back to the dilemmas I faced as a teacher in training and the many times I asked myself why things are the way they are and what they mean. I want to open this concluding chapter of my dissertation by answering the research questions I posed at the beginning of this study with reference to the framework of the EDiTE network. I will then address the limitations of this study and close the dissertation with a new opening.

---

[669] Ibid.
[670] Ibid.
[671] Abu-El Haj, Thea R. (Nov. 16, 2018): Council on Anthropology and Education (CAE): Past President's Distinguished Lecture, American Anthropological Association 2018, San Jose, Calif.

7.1 "What Does It Mean?": The Ethnographer's Question

I first raised the questions that guided my doctoral research on the purpose and the conditions of inclusive and equitable schooling during my practical, in-service teacher education at a mass public secondary school in Germany. The school's integrative concept was based on a tracking system that grouped students of the same cohort into top- and low-performing sets. Grouping depended on students' grades at the end of primary school as they transitioned into secondary education. At this school, I mostly taught students at the top of the performance hierarchy. Teaching my generally ambitious students was an engaging, thrilling, often satisfying experience for me as a novice teacher. Students generally showed interest in the lessons I prepared for them, did their homework, wore clean clothes and brought lunches from home. Between us a bond could grow through which I learned of their interests and strengths so that I could offer them meaningful lessons. On a voluntary basis, I helped them redecorate their classroom; I joined them during field and class trips. I wanted to spend time with them.

Teaching students in the low-performing set was a very different experience. Back then, it was difficult for me to make out exactly what distinguished these students from the top set, apart from their grades. I noticed only that teaching and learning conditions changed drastically when I entered the bottom-set classrooms as a substitute teacher. But I understood that a whole different schooling experience was in store for these students. Once, I entered a classroom and my eyes were met with a large hole in the wall next to the blackboard that looked as if it had been punched by a fist. Students were waiting for me to begin the lesson, but I could not divert my gaze from the hole and its implications of violence. Even more puzzling to me was the fact that no one had tried to fix the wall, or even tried to cover the hole with a piece of paper. The brutally ripped shape of the punch spoke to the tension I experienced in this class, during which I could hardly maintain peace among the students. Time and again, insults flew through the room; students threatened to beat each other up after class. However, once the class was over and my heart stopped racing, I did wonder how I could ask them to be respectful to one another, when they were forced to sit and learn in a space marked by anger and violence.

On a different occasion, I supported two teachers, together with a special pedagogue and an undergraduate intern, in a class of roughly ten 14-year-old boys who all had special educational needs status and/or spoke German as a second language. Despite our greatest efforts, we could not control the classroom. The lesson was a complete waste of time, since

students boycotted any tasks or initiatives and the teachers and pedagogues reverted to disciplinary measures that had no educational value. Even when we tried working on a two-to-one basis, we still could not engage students in a meaningful activity. My frustration grew; I felt exhausted; I stared at my watch, hoping to be able to leave this class soon. Later, in the faculty room, my colleague commented that she did not blame the students; why would they even bother to pay attention, since they knew that they had no chance of finding jobs once they left this school? I started to question a grouping system of such negative implications for everyone involved. Neither students nor teachers wanted to spend time in classes in which everyone was headed toward failure. The conditions under which learning took place in the bottom set had detrimental effects on the ways teachers viewed their students. Although at our school students with migrant experiences accomplished outstanding matura exam results, in the bottom set migrant experiences overlapped almost one hundred percent with a special educational needs status of learning, emotional and social development, cognitive delay or language. Deficit was the defining quality that these bottom-set students shared along the lines of race, poverty, disability and gender. In this atmosphere, the pathologization of migrant families appeared among many of my colleagues.

The divide between top- and bottom-set students had serious implications for the entire school community. Not only students were grouped and judged, but the faculty was also divided into those who could deal with the "tough cases" and those who taught only the "easy classes." Teachers who worked primarily with the bottom-set classes had made their teaching routine specific to the lowest achievers with special materials and lots of help from the pedagogues. Some colleagues developed fascinating pedagogical expertise to reach their students; others applied a rough regimen of control and punishment. However, no matter how hard they tried to accommodate student learning, teachers almost always battled the hopelessness of their students as they failed another exam. At the same time, those who worked mostly with top-set classes could engage in academically stimulating lessons and congratulate themselves on the excellent results their students received in centralized testing exams.

I want to return to the quotation that opens this chapter: "Education is always about what kinds of persons we are going to be." Concurring with Thea Abu-El Haj, I want to add that this applies to both students and, to some extent, their educators. The educational experience of students in the top and bottom sets varied greatly. Within some, the promise of success and achievement was instilled through practices, artifacts and language; within others,

no aspirations for the future were planted. In a very similar vein, teachers understood their profession as one that either increases academic potential or takes over responsibilities of a social worker with regard to teaching care and life skills.

Throughout my doctoral work, I returned to the question that inspired me to set out on this study. Would I now be able to face that school and teach all classes? I cannot say for sure. What I have learned through my doctoral work is the language of critique and a methodology that allows me to dissect the conditions under which education takes place. Not knowing how to name my unease as a teacher trainee, I can now pinpoint the different aspects that help me interpret a school culture and whether that culture observes principles of inclusive education through language and practices. I can see myself not as an individual practitioner, but as a member of a school community that has as much impact on what happens inside the classroom as my teaching does. I pay attention to the ways a school is set within the context of its immediate neighborhood, as well as larger socio-political events and how these events in turn affect the significance of some differences and the neglect of others. From the episodes above, it becomes clear that the label of integration/inclusion that a school might carry and the placement of students with and without disabilities and special educational needs under one roof say nothing about the quality of inclusion. The highly discriminating tracking system can occur in integrated settings. In the following, I want to engage with what I have come to understand and realize by drawing on my three research sites and setting my understanding within the EDiTE framework.

7.2 Answering the Research Questions under the EDiTE Framework

In 2015, five European partner universities, together with the European Network in Teacher Education Policies (ENTEP), initiated the European Doctorate in Teacher Education "with the aim of developing into a 'leading network for innovation in teacher education, accessible to academics, practitioners, and policy makers.'"[672] While still in teacher training, I applied to the University of Lower Silesia to become an early-stage researcher within the EDiTE community. At the end of February 2016, I moved to Wroclaw and started my fellowship. I was not interested only in exploring and questioning my teaching practice on more theoretical grounds; I was drawn to the network because of its deeply European, cross-cultural dimension. It was a requirement of employment to move to Poland, as well as to join at least one other partner institution for a secondment period. It was clear from the beginning

---

[672] Symeonidis, Vasileios (2018): Revisiting the European Teacher Education Area: The Transformation of Teacher Education Policies and Practices in Europe. In: *CEPS Journal*, 8:3, pp. 13-34, p. 28.

that my research would bring to light multiple European perspectives on the topic of inclusive education.

Throughout the last three years, I sought to understand and contribute to the EDiTE framework – *Transformative Teacher Learning for Better Student Learning Within an Emerging European Context* – through a rigorous qualitative research study. Building on the tradition of educational anthropology, I was able to stay close to the ground of classrooms and schools with the goal of mapping how inclusive policy had entered into practices and language of the specific contexts. I explored the intricate historical and political background within which my research sites were set. As a European Union-funded scholar I felt a particular ethical responsibility to represent the EU as an organization based on democratic principles. I considered my research on the educational political landscapes of Poland, Austria and Germany a contribution to holding the European Union accountable for its promises of social justice and equal opportunities for its citizens. In this way, I probed uncomfortable truths of structural discrimination in education through, for example, early tracking systems (in Germany and Austria) and misallocation of funds for students with disabilities (in Poland). I highlighted local stigma, created through housing policies that led to segregation along the lines of race and poverty (in Germany and Austria), and current discourses on foreigners and the (disabled) Other (in Poland) that impacted teaching and learning.

As Thea R. Abu-El Haj notes, "Across the world, educational policies promise us a dream world in which equal educational opportunity plus accountability will miraculously produce bright futures for the children and their countries."[673] Hence, I balanced the language of educational policy on inclusion and social justice with national reports (*Tyrol Monitoring Report* or *Education in Germany*) and international monitoring accounts on the state of educational justice and the rights of people with disabilities presented by the UN, the OECD and the EU.

At the 2018 Summer School, hosted by ELTE University in Budapest, the project director Professor Michael Schratz commented: "We think there will be a treasure of new knowledge which can be used for transnational research within an emergent future perspective linking teacher transformation with better student learning."[674] In a similar vein, Luis Tinoca, head of the EDiTE program at the University of Lisbon, stated: "It is very

---

[673] Abu-El Haj, Thea R. (Nov. 16, 2018): Council on Anthropology and Education (CAE): Past President's Distinguished Lecture, American Anthropological Association 2018, San Jose, Calif.

[674] EDiTE Project, accessed from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BbD3kU07EEY, on Dec. 9, 2018, minutes 1:34-1:47.

interesting that we have the opportunity of enlarging the network and building new bridges with other countries, with other researchers, and also new research avenues that can be explored in the future."[675] Hana Cervinkova, EDiTE program director at the University of Lower Silesia, stressed: "For the EDiTE researchers, education and teacher education is going to be always a transnational, European, international project. I think that is the most important thing."[676] All three perspectives emphasize the transnational dimension of research in education: transformative teacher education for better student learning through functional methodologies for addressing current obstacles to social justice and future challenges. Drawing on these visions for the EDiTE network, I will now highlight the contributions this dissertation offers.

In all three studies, I showed how teachers were at the forefront of changes in education politics. Teachers worked in classrooms attended by refugee children from war-torn regions, traumatized and sometimes without their families (Germany). Teachers worked in multicultural classrooms in which "intimate enemies" were expected to collaborate and learn together (in Austria). Teachers encountered pupils with medical conditions and special needs that sometimes sparked violent, aggressive behavior (in Poland). As much as teachers may consider themselves subject specialists only, they are involved with their students in a deeply pedagogical and ethical relationship. I want to stress that teachers' bodies physically and mentally carry the mark of extreme situations, as well as everyday problems in which they stop violence, counter abuse and bullying, and give care and first aid. Returning to the theoretical underpinnings of my dissertation, I have shown in my three studies that learning was in fact social; education was political and, as such, always potentially transformative.

While conducting school-based research from September 2016 until the summer of 2018, I observed how the push for inclusive education started to take shape in everyday classroom situations. Though some teachers surely experienced certain challenges for the first time, such as racist bullying of students (in Austria), students with anti-depressant medication (in Poland) and interreligious quarrels (in Germany), students with disabilities and migrant experiences were not novelties in these education systems. However, it was the space these students and their families claimed at the center of society, within mainstream education, that has changed. The fact that more students with migrant backgrounds attend special schooling than mainstream education in Austria and Germany means that differences have been neatly

---

[675] Ibid., minutes 1:16-1:32.
[676] Ibid., minutes 1:05-1:16.

stored away from the mainstream in special schools, special classes or special rooms. I argue that there is nothing new about diversity in education. What is new is the confident advocacy with which discriminatory practices, such as sorting into tracks and specialized institutions are called out. As I have shown, parents like Agnieszka Kossowska and her husband protest when school after school turns away their son or admits him only under the premise of using the funding the Polish government has allotted to his support during classes to pay for the school's rent or electricity bills (Chapter 4). Teachers with migrant experiences, still a novelty but a growing percentage of faculty members in large German cities, turn to the neighborhoods where they want to be role models for children with similar identities (Chapter 5). In Tyrol, Austria, an example stands out: two principals (special school and mainstream school) formed an alliance to merge into one school community that was accessible for everyone, while elsewhere new special schools were built and continue to recruit students with disabilities and special needs (Chapter 6). In several interviews, teachers and pedagogues expressed worries about the changing expectations of their profession, as well as the lack of a common ground from which all faculty members, teachers, pedagogues and special pedagogues could realize together the paradigm of inclusivity (in Austria and Poland). In these instances, it became clear that inclusion had not been fostered as a **principled approach to education,** but was seen rather as a bureaucratic order from above that needed to be installed.

Drawing on Thea R. Abu El-Haj's concept of **a relational view of differences**, in the Polish study I focused on describing how the school, daily classroom routines and the perspectives of teachers and pedagogues contributed to the construction of a student who did not fit into mainstream education. Recognizing Sim's violent behavior toward classmates and faculty members, I showed how classroom practices and schooling structures geared toward performance and homogeneity perpetuated Sim's deviance. Sim's needs could not be satisfied through the afternoon shadow schedule of therapeutic classes that the school offered for students with special educational challenges. Sim and the fifth grade class unit to which the student belonged were in strong need of **social learning** techniques that would facilitate community-building. From my highly contextualized observations, I concluded that the medical approach to students prevailed and that disability and its corresponding concept of inclusion were enacted next to regular mainstream schooling. Inclusion took place as a parallel concept, while regular education remained uncontested. I recommend deconstructing the perspective on students as a homogenous mass that can be brought to peak performance through subject drill and discipline. Students must engage in social learning activities to build

empathy and understanding for one another. In addition, I consider it a severe violation of human rights to segregate students from their peers through individual lessons at home. In this way, students miss a significant number of classes, which disables them in their learning on top of their impairment. Individual teaching was meant to be applied only to students who could not attend classes because of a broken leg or a severe illness. However, this "inclusive measure" has become a way to channel students out of mainstream education, prolonging the need for schools to come up with new concepts and resources that enable them to build places where every child can learn. Currently, Polish teachers are suffering from enormous salary cuts.[677] In this dissertation, I have highlighted how educators involved in crisis situations must receive appropriate payment.

Similarly, in my Austrian study I paid attention to the special pedagogical support system the primary school has built. I asked who profited from the special pedagogue's services and who went unnoticed and unsupported. In this highly multicultural school community, roughly six students in the class I observed received German-language support. Special pedagogical lessons were given to exactly three children in a school attended by more than 200. In my analysis, I concluded that inclusive measures hinged on cultural and financial capital that parents needed to be able to mobilize on behalf of their children; otherwise they would not be able to profit from the support available at school. Looking at Ceren, a Kurdish girl with a hearing impairment, I argued that the **deficit perspective** on her identity as a student with migrant experiences stood in the way of recognizing her school failure on the grounds of a hearing impairment instead of intellectual or cognitive weaknesses. I recommend finding flexible ways of access to the support systems schools are starting to build. I also advise paying more attention to building strong ties between the surrounding neighborhood and the school itself to reduce the stigma that hovered over the students and affected teachers' expectations of success and future aspirations for them.

Finally, in the German example, I focused on the question of how it was possible that the Tipping Point School turned into an almost all-Muslim migrant community. I analyzed housing and district policies combined with racist pedagogical ideologies that had gradually contributed to a school that was completely segregated. Although some parents and their children enjoyed the familiarity this school offered when nearly everyone fasted during

---

[677] Gazetta Wyborcza (Dec. 10, 2018): Nasz zawód to nie jest wolontariat. Nauczyciele pokazują paski z wynagrodzeniami i chcą dymisji Zalewskiej, accessed from http://szczecin.wyborcza.pl/szczecin/7,34939,24261811,nasz-zawod-to-nie-wolontariat-zwiazkowcy-z-solidarnosci-pokazuja.html, on Dec. 11, 2018.

Ramadan, for example, teachers unanimously understood that their students were actually attending school outside German mainstream society. In their school, native German-speakers were missing, so no intercultural friendships or bonds could grow. Considering statistics on education, such factors as poverty and migrant background could amount to up to two years of academic delay. At the tipping point school, two-thirds of students received government support for school lunches and class trips; one-third had special pedagogical needs status. The intersection of race, class and disability was strongly tangible in this community, where many students studied on grade-level material for class four instead of six. Nonetheless, the school built confidence in the students through social learning activities and working hard at **abolishing the deficit perspective.** The collaboration between teachers and pedagogues was remarkable. Somehow, outside the mainstream, this school allowed glimpses into how an inclusive community could be built through mutual respect, plenty of time and space for working together, and talking things through. Nonetheless, it must be clearly stated that racial segregation cannot be tolerated and that inclusive education is first and foremost a paradigm that stresses the encounter of meeting each Other. At times the accumulation of disadvantage at this school was overwhelming. Even though some children succeeded in receiving recommendations for the academic gymnasium, the tipping point school operated under strong systemic pressures and limited students' opportunities for academic growth and success.[678]

Through the methodological framework of educational anthropology, I was able to pick up on the "everyday dilemmas of practice that arise from the conflicting ideas about difference and justice embedded in policy, curriculum, and pedagogy."[679] Drawing on Hana Cervinkova's work, I build on "the opportunities for anthropologically-inspired pedagogies to help ground pre- and in-service teacher education in critical understanding of diversity and social justice."[680] The ethnographic way of seeing, fostered through the premise of making the strange familiar and the familiar strange (Spindler and Spindler, 2000), holds the potential to transform teachers' perspectives on their students from deficit toward recognizing the humanity of each and every one. Cervinkova summarizes: "The making of the strange

---

[678] Gerald, Casey (Dec. 8, 2018): T.M. Landry and the Tragedy of Viral Success Stories: We focus on outliers and ignore systemic injustice. New York Times, accessed from https://www.nytimes.com/2018/12/08/opinion/sunday/tm-landry-louisiana-school-abuse.html, on Dec. 11, 2018.
[679] Abu El-Haj, Thea Renda (2006): *Elusive Justice: Wrestling with difference and educational equity in everyday practice*. New York: Routledge, p. 3.
[680] Cervinkova, Hana (2018): Nauczanie i uczenie sie antropologii w edukacji nauczieli (Discursive Cultural Therapy Toward Inclusive Teacher Imaginaries: Anthropology and Teacher Education in Poland). In: Cervinkova, Hana (Ed.): *Antropologia i Edukacja* (Anthropology and Education). Wroclaw: Wydawnictwo Naukowe Dolnoslaskiej Szkoly Wyzszej, pp. 11-32.

familiar and the familiar strange is one of the most distinctive features of anthropological research; it is the capacity of contextualized ethnographic seeing and translating of cultural differences as features of the same humanity."[681] Through the ethnographic lens, I want to inform the inclusive maxim that Thea Abu El-Haj shared during her speech at the American Anthropological Association: "Everyone in the forest is the forest."[682] Building on Cervinkova, I stress that practitioner research is an essential dimension of teacher professionalism. Questioning and transforming one's own practice is a crucial quality of the trade. As "anthropologists of education deconstruct the binary between theory and practice, engagement and scientific distancing," transformative teacher learning means to ground practice into research and research in practice. Better student learning rests on the space, time and techniques that teachers make available for engaging with the world, and with one another.

7.3 Limitations

The strongest limitation of my dissertation must certainly arise from the very ambitious timeline in which I pursued my research. In each of the three studies, I gave myself only six months to complete fieldwork, analysis and writing. From the time I started my doctoral work in March 2016, until I completed my dissertation in December 2018, I did not leave much time to question my assumptions or revise my research strategies. Everything I did, I adjusted or learned during the process. Therefore, I found my research skills more advanced in the last study than they were when I first set out into the Polish field. However, because I lived in Poland for most of my doctoral work, I was able to return to my research site and engage more perspectives of experts after I came back from my secondment period in Austria. The Austrian study profited from the mistakes I made in Poland with regard to the way I approached teachers, and from the ethnographic way of seeing I had started to acquire during my first research stay. In addition, the language barrier in my Polish study limited the possibilities of engagement with teachers and students. I wish I could have spoken as comfortably with my research participants as I did in the German-speaking contexts. However, I also faced challenges in Austria, where I was not formally inducted into the research field in the same way as I was in Poland. Therefore, it was more difficult to gain the school principal's trust and engage in meaningful reflections on my research experiences. The German study profited most from the development of my research skills. By then I knew how

---

[681] Ibid.
[682] Abu-El Haj, Thea R. (Nov. 16, 2018): Council on Anthropology and Education (CAE): Past President's Distinguished Lecture, American Anthropological Association 2018, San Jose, Calif.

to take field notes of adequate use for the later data analysis. I was aware of the significance that atmosphere and space carry for interviews with practitioners and experts. Most of all, I knew what to ask and how to obtain valuable information that would help me contextualize my observations. The process of data analysis and interpretation also took much longer in the Polish study than in the later German one. I organized chapters through quotations and vignettes. Only over time did I realize the power of the spoken word as it appeared in the field, and how to show its significance through multiple perspectives from literature and interview material. In addition, I have come to realize that my descriptions were at times biased and superficial.

7.4 Concluding Remarks

This final chapter of my dissertation does not stand as closure, but as an invitation to continue the debate on how to achieve inclusive education as a paradigm for educational justice within the European context. With this dissertation I hope to provide points of entry into a conversation on a local, school-based level, as well as on a national/ European, education-policy level. As all three country studies show, inclusive education is grounded in local activism as well as international human rights legislation. In each, I moved from the broader educational policy context to a specific school context, and back to the national level to show how striving for greater inclusivity in education collides with traditional structures of education, such as the early-tracking systems of Germany and Austria, and education political tendencies, such as homogeneity and a relentless push for performance in Poland. It is a complex endeavor to describe the impact of policies on the ground and, in return, the local appropriation of top-to-bottom legislation. Nonetheless, I remained faithful to a deeply qualitative commitment to education research, as I believe that knowledge production about schools should take place substantially in collaboration with the perspectives of educators and students. For the sake of continuing the conversation and action on creating more inclusive and equitable ways to educate children, I hope I have illuminated daily life in European schools and the structural, historical and local conditions in which they are embedded.

Streszczenie

W mojej dysertacji przedstawiam wielostanowiskowe badania etnograficzne w środowisku szkolnym (Marcus, 1995), które ukazują, jak kultury szkolne w Polsce, Austrii i Niemczech borykają się z wdrażaniem polityki i praktyk inkluzyjności. Między innymi, dysertacja moja porusza perspektywę rodziców pragnących, aby ich dzieci ze specjalnymi potrzebami kształciły się w zwykłych szkołach publicznych. Ukazuje ona również perspektywę pedagogów specjalnych, którym trudno jest działać działaniach w środowisku edukacji powszechnej, w którym inni nauczyciele praktykujący inkluzję w klasach, jednocześnie uprawiają segregację w pokoju nauczycielskim. Bada ona również, jak nauczyciele usiłują znaleźć sposoby na zniwelowanie rozziewu między uczniami z niepełnosprawnościami a pełnosprawnymi uczniami, obcymi uczniami a uczniami znajomymi, oraz uczniami ochranianymi a uczniami słabymi w swoich szkołach. Wszystkie te dane zebrane w toku badań terenowych dotyczą kwestii przezwyciężania struktur obecnych w edukacji, które zamiast sprzyjać próbom budowania wspólnoty, promują dzielenie dzieci pod względem, na przykład, ich języków rodzimych, ich sprawności poznawczej lub ruchowo-fizycznej, czy też zawodów wykonywanych przez ich rodziców.

W niniejszej dysertacji posługuję się pojęciem edukacji inkluzyjnej, która stanowi w moich oczach koncepcję głęboko etyczną umożliwiającą uczestnictwo wszystkim uczniom, a dzięki temu obracającą szkoły w przyczółki przeciwdziałania dyskryminacji (Booth, 2005). Według Anthony'ego Bootha and Mela Ainscowa, autorów Indeksu Inkluzji (*Index for Inclusion*), "[i]nkluzyjne podejście do różnorodności zasadza się na zrozumieniu i zwalczaniu niezwykle destrukcyjnych zagrożeń kryjących się w zrównywaniu różnicy lub inności z poślednością. Gdy zjawisko to zachodzi i wrasta w kulturę, może doprowadzić ono do rażącej dyskryminacji, a nawet do ludobójstwa" (Booth i Ainscow, 2011: 23). Naukowcy ci odwołują się do dziedzictwa Holokaustu, masowej eksterminacji Żydów, Romów i osób niepełnosprawnych, a także homoseksualistów oraz społecznych „degeneratów" przez nazistowskie Niemcy, co odcisnęło niezatarte piętno na gruncie i społecznej tkance Europy. To właśnie pamięć o Holokauście stanowiła przesłankę stworzenia Unii Europejskiej, która łączy swoich członków w pokojowym sojuszu opartym na wspólnych zasadach prawnych i etycznych stojących na straży sprawiedliwości społecznej i gospodarczego dobrobytu. Jak zauważa Tony Judt, badacz historii Europy, tożsamość europejska zasadza się na świadomości owych dawnych okrucieństw, od której zależy przystąpienie do Unii (2010: 804). Mając na uwadze takie tło historyczne, rozpatruję jak formuje się postawa dostrzegania i cenienia różnorodności w szkołach w Polsce, Austrii i Niemczech, trzech krajach głęboko

naznaczonych przez Holokaust. W mojej dysertacji omawiam okres kształtowania się *Sonderpädagogik* (pedagogiki specjalnej) w czasach nazizmu i to, jak jej terminologia i praktyki, które niegdyś służyły do uzasadniania masowej sterylizacji i mordowania dzieci i dorosłych z niepełnosprawnościami, nadal odciskają się na edukacji uczniów ze specjalnymi potrzebami edukacyjnymi i niepełnosprawnościami (Hänsel, 2005; Moser, 2012; Pfahl, 2011; Ellger-Rüttgardt, 2004). Będąc dyscypliną o długiej tradycji, pedagogika specjalna ciągle ściśle kontroluje niepełnosprawne ciało i z powodzeniem utrzymuje oddzielne szkoły specjalne, które są *de facto* nielegalne w świetle Konwencji ONZ o Prawach Osób Niepełnosprawnych, a zwłaszcza jej zapisu o prawie wszystkich uczniów do bezpłatnej, pełnowartościowej edukacji podstawowej i średniej na dobrym poziomie (Art. 24.2b). Unia Europejska, która uznaje społeczną kohezję za jeden ze swoich głównych celów, ponagla państwa członkowskie do wdrażania edukacji inkluzyjnej (2018/C 194/01). W zgodzie ze wspomnianą Konwencją ONZ UE stoi na stanowisku, że edukacja inkluzyjna to szerokie wachlarz działań, które odpowiadają również na wyzwania wielokulturowości i migracji, nierówności społecznych oraz doświadczenia niepełnosprawności. Lokalne inicjatywy rodziców i aktywistów działających na rzecz praw osób z niepełnosprawnościami oraz międzynarodowa kampania obejmująca Konwencję i prawodawstwo UE pokazują, że koncepcję inkluzji należy badać zarówno z perspektywy globalnej jak i z konkretnie skontekstualizowanych punktów widzenia (Carney, 2008). To, jak koncepcja edukacji inkluzyjnej przekłada się na rzeczywistą praktykę, można owocnie prześledzić tylko w paradygmacie badawczym, który dysponuje narzędziami pozwalającymi analizować procesy zachodzące na najniższym szczeblu – w klasach, szkołach i dzielnicach, paradygmacie, który bierze pod uwagę historyczną i lokalną wiedzę właściwą dla badanych miejsc, a także wyjaśnia jak „w jakiej relacji do szerszych wzorców społecznego działania i struktury społecznej pozostają poszczególne działania i znaczenia" (Eisenhart, 2001: 209). Aby znaleźć odpowiedź na moje zasadnicze pytania badawcze – a mianowicie: Jaki wpływ na kultury szkolne ma wdrażanie edukacji inkluzyjnej? oraz Jak szkoły borykają się z i reagują na wymóg uznania ludzkiej różnorodności i tworzenia inkluzyjnego środowiska uczenia się i nauczania? – posługuję się metodologią etnografii edukacyjnej (Spindler, 2000; Erickson, 1986, 1982).

Stosując obserwację uczestniczącą i poszerzone wywiady analizuję, jak paradygmat edukacji inkluzyjnej wpływa na lokalne środowisko, w którym się pojawia. W ciągu ostatnich trzech lat przeprowadziłam badania etnograficzne w szkołach podstawowych po kolei w Polsce, Austrii i Niemczech. Jako uczestnicząca obserwatorka spędziłam co najmniej sto

godzin w każdym z tych trzech terenów badawczych. Łącznie przeprowadziłam wywiady z osiemnastoma osobami, w tym nauczycielami, pedagogami, pedagogami specjalnymi i dyrektorami lub wicedyrektorami szkół, w których prowadziłam badania. Aby lepiej skontekstualizować moje osobiste obserwacje, przeprowadziłam również analizę polityki oraz dwanaście wywiadów z ekspertami ze środowiska akademickiego oraz władz oświatowych w poszczególnych krajach.

Moja dysertacja składa się z siedmiu rozdziałów. Po wprowadzeniu omawiam paradygmat edukacji inkluzyjnej z teoretycznej perspektywy pedagogiki krytycznej i w kontraście do epistemologicznych założeń pedagogiki specjalnej. Jednocześnie kreślę ontologiczną debatę na temat natury niepełnosprawności, wskazując na napięcie wynikające z rozdźwięku między definicją niepełnosprawności a pojęciem inkluzji. Wprowadzam także koncepcję różnic relacyjnych (*relational differences*) zaproponowaną przez Theę R. Abu El-Haj (2006) i przy jej użyciu badam, jak tradycyjne systemy edukacyjne zderzają się koncepcją inkluzji w obliczu różnic, z których część – zwłaszcza tożsamość migranta muzułmanina, ubóstwo, kapitał kulturowy, itp. – wyraźnie działa na niekorzyść jednostek, podczas gdy inne pozostają niezauważone. Uwypuklam również intersekcjonalne, społeczno-kulturowe rozumienie niepełnosprawności, w którym podkreśla się znoszenie barier utrudniających uczestnictwo, a nie uwyraźnia jedynie jednostkowych niedociągnięć czy braków uczniów (Oliver, 1999; Varenne i McDermott, 1995). Z tych założeń wyprowadzam kluczowe zasady edukacji inkluzyjnej jako zasadniczego modelu, który dąży do odrzucenia myślenia w kategoriach deficytu, do zrozumienia różnic relacyjnych, oraz do krzewienia społecznego uczenia się. Następnie, jako „obca na trzech terenach", skupiam się na sprecyzowaniu podstaw moich wielostanowiskowych, międzykulturowych badań etnograficznych. Moje podejście do badań w klasie szkolnej podbudowane jest spostrzeżeniami George'a Marcusa i Fredericka Ericksona, a także George'a i Louise Spindlerów, Roberta Biklena i Sari K. Bogdana, Ellen Brantlinger i współpracowników, a także innych badaczy. W następnych trzech rozdziałach przedstawiam badania prowadzone w poszczególnych krajach, na które składają się dokładna analiza polityki i następujący po niej wgląd w praktykę, który prezentuję w postaci ilustracji o funkcji „retorycznej, analitycznej i dowodowej" (Erickson, 1986: 150). W Austrii do szkół specjalnych uczęszcza więcej dzieci, których pierwszym językiem nie jest niemiecki (a np. turecki, bośniacki/serbski/chorwacki), niż do zwykłych szkół podstawowych, co wskazuje na rolę, jaką segregacyjne szkolnictwo odgrywa w utrwalaniu barier hamujących postęp sprawiedliwości społecznej i rasowej w społeczeństwie austriackim. W wielokulturowej klasie czwartej szkoły podstawowej zaobserwowałam, jak

niepowodzenia ucznia przypisuje się barierom językowym, zamiast wadzie słuchu, przy czym kategorie rasy i niepełnosprawności znamiennie się na siebie nakładały. W Polsce administracyjna polityka transformacji postkomunistycznej prowadzi do brzemiennego w skutki, niewłaściwego wykorzystania funduszy, które powinny służyć inkluzji dzieci z niepełnosprawnościami w szkołach publicznych. W piątej klasie szkoły podstawowej byłam świadkiem, jak niepodważane przez nikogo narzędzia diagnostyczne ściśle związane z pedagogiką specjalną prowadziły do sytuacji, w których eksponowany był status ucznia jako „niepełnosprawnego", a prawa do edukacji odmawiano stosując indywidualne nauczanie domowe. W Niemczech doświadczenia migracji i ubóstwo mają największy wpływ na osiągniecia uczniów. W klasie szóstej szkoły podstawowej, w której uczą tylko migranci, zaobserwowałam wyzwania, z którymi boryka się kadra starając się przezwyciężyć rozziew za pomocą społecznego uczenia się i praktyk inkluzyjnych. We wnioskach przedstawiam odpowiedzi na moje pytania badawcze i zalecenia regulacji instytucjonalnych oraz działań praktycznych.

Summary

In this dissertation I present a multi-sited, school-based ethnographic study (Marcus, 1995) that illuminates how school cultures in Poland, Austria and Germany grapple with the implementation of inclusive policy and practices. For example, this dissertation touches on the perspectives of parents who want their children with special needs to be educated in mainstream public schools. It brings to light the perspective of special educators who struggle to navigate general education with teacher colleagues who practice inclusion in the classroom and segregation in the staff room. It explores how faculties try to find ways of bridging the gap between the disabled and abled, foreign and familiar, protected and vulnerable students of their school. All these accounts from the field touch on the question of how to overcome structures in education that focus on what divides children – i.e., their mother tongues, their cognitive or motor-physical abilities, their beliefs, their countries of origin, their parents' occupations – instead of focusing on how to build a community.

In this dissertation, I draw on inclusive education as a deeply ethical concept that promotes schools as strongholds against discrimination by granting participation to all students (Booth, 2005). Following Anthony Booth and Mel Ainscow, authors of the Index for Inclusion: "An inclusive approach to diversity involves understanding and opposing the profound destructive dangers in equating difference or strangeness with inferiority. When this happens and becomes deeply embedded in a culture, it can lead to profound discrimination or even genocide." (Booth and Ainscow, 2011: 23) The scholars draw on the legacy of the Holocaust, the mass extermination of Jews, the disabled and the Roma, as well as homosexuals and the socially "deviant," through Nazi Germany, which is engrained in the soil and social fabric of Europe. The European Union was founded on this legacy and binds its members into a peaceful alliance with a shared legal and ethical framework committed to social justice and economic prosperity. As Tony Judt, the historian of European history, observes, the European identity is defined by the recognition of these past atrocities on which accession into the union hinges (2010: 804). Against this historical backdrop, I explore how the commitment to recognizing and valuing diversity in schools takes shape in Poland, Austria and Germany, three countries deeply affected by the Holocaust. I pay attention to the formative years of *Sonderpädagogik* (special pedagogy) under Nazism, and how its terminologies and practices, which once served to justify mass sterilization and the murder of children and adults with disabilities, continue to affect the education of students with special educational needs and disabilities (Hänsel, 2005; Moser, 2012; Pfahl, 2011; Ellger-Rüttgardt, 2004). As a discipline

with long tradition, special pedagogy continues to hold a firm grip on the disabled body and successfully upholds segregated special-school facilities that are *de facto* illegal under the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (UN-CRPD) and the right to free, quality primary and secondary education for all students (Art. 24.2b). Committed to achieving social cohesion, the European Union urges its member countries to implement inclusive education ((2018/C 194/01). Drawing on the UN-CRPD, the EU envisions inclusive education as a broad agenda that also answers the challenges of multiculturalism and migration, socioeconomic inequalities and the experience of disability. The local initiative through parents and disability rights' activism and the international push through UN-CRPD and EU legislation shows that the concept of inclusion must be researched from a deeply contextualized perspective as well as a global one (Carney, 2008). The way the concept of inclusive education takes shape in practice may be explored only through a research paradigm that has the tools to investigate what happens close to the ground, within classrooms, schools and neighborhoods; that takes into view the historical and local knowledge that weighs in on the research sites; and that illuminates how "actions and meanings relate to large-scale patterns of social action and structure" (Eisenhart, 2001: 209). To answer the research questions of how schooling cultures are affected by the implementation of inclusive education, and how schools grapple and respond to the call for acknowledging human diversity and creating inclusive settings for learning and teaching, I apply the methodology of educational ethnography (Spindler, 2000; Erickson, 1986, 1982).

Through participant observations in schools and extensive interviews, I explore how the paradigm of inclusive education affects the local settings it enters. Over the last three years, I consecutively conducted school-based ethnographic research in primary schools in Poland, Austria and Germany. As a participant observer, I spent at least 100 hours in each of the three research fields. Altogether, I interviewed 18 faculty members, including teachers, pedagogues, special pedagogues, and principals or vice-principals at my research sites. To better contextualize my very personal observations, I conducted policy analyses and, in all 12, interviews with experts from academia and school administrators in the given country contexts.

This dissertation consists of seven chapters. After the introduction, I situate the paradigm of inclusive education within the theoretical perspective of critical pedagogy in opposition to the epistemological foundations of special pedagogy. In doing so, I also map out the ontological debate on the nature of disability, which creates tensions of mismatch between the definition

of disability and the corresponding notion of inclusion. I introduce Thea R. Abu El-Haj's concept of relational differences (2006) to examine how traditional education systems clash with the concept of inclusion as some differences – especially Muslim migrant identities, poverty, cultural capital, etc. – play out to significant disadvantage while others go unnoticed. Finally, I emphasize an intersectional, socio-cultural understanding of disability that focuses on breaking down barriers to participation in education rather than merely on students' individual shortcomings and impairments (Oliver, 1999; Varenne and McDermott, 1995). From this perspective, I then derive key principles of inclusive education as a principled approach to education that builds on abolishing the deficit orientation, understanding relational differences and promoting social learning. Next, as a "Stranger in Three Fields," I focus on setting out the foundations for my multisited, cross-cultural ethnographic research. To support my approach to classroom research, I draw on the works of George Marcus and Frederick Erickson, as well as George and Louise Spindler, Biklen and Bogdan, Brantlinger and colleagues, to name just a few. In the three chapters that follow, I present the country studies that build on a thorough policy analysis, followed by a window into practice, which I present through vignettes of "rhetorical, analytic and evidentiary" function (Erickson, 1986: 150). In the Austrian context, special schools are attended by more children whose first language is not German (Turkish, Bosnian/Serbian/Croatian) than mainstream primary schools, pointing to the role of segregated schooling in the maintenance of barriers to social and racial justice in Austrian society. In the multi-cultural fourth grade of a primary school, I observed how school failure of a student is attributed to language barriers, instead of a hearing impairment, whereby categories of race and disability crucially overlap. In Poland, administrative policies of the post-Communist transition period play out in crucial misallocations of funding that should benefit the inclusion of children with disabilities in public schools. In the fifth grade of a primary school, I witnessed how uncontested, strictly special pedagogical tools of diagnosis lead to situations in which his/ her status as "the disabled" are manifested and the student's right to education is denied through individual home based schooling. In Germany, migration experiences and poverty have the strongest impact on student achievement. In the sixth grade of an all-migrant primary school, I observed the challenges that faculty face to overcome educational gaps through social learning and inclusive practices. In a concluding discussion, I give answers to the research questions and offer recommendations for policy and practice.

Zusammenfassung

In meiner Dissertation präsentiere ich schulethnografische Forschung, die ich an mehrern Standorten durchgeführt habe und im englischsprachigen Raum unter dem Begriff multi-sited ethnography (Marcus, 1995) bekannt ist. Durch meine Forschung zeige ich, wie Schulkulturen in Polen, Österreich und Deutschland mit der Umsetzung von Inklusionsstrategien und -praktiken kämpfen. Dabei beleuchte ich beispielsweise die Perspektive von Eltern, die sich wünschen, dass ihr Kind mit sonderpädagogischen Förderbedürfnissen bzw. Behinderungen auf eine öffentliche Grundschule gehen darf. Ich zeige auch Perspektiven von SonderpädagogInnen auf, denen es schwer fällt schulische Inklusion umzusetzen, während ihre LehrerkollegInnen weiterhin auf hierarchische Unterschiede unter PädagogInnen beharren und Kooperation erschweren. Außerdem befasst sich die Dissertation damit, welche Wege PraktikerInnen finden, um die Kluft zwischen SchülerInnen mit und ohne Behinderungen, Kindern mit Migrationshintergrund und ohne, sowie Kindern, die unter geschützten bzw. herausfordernden Bedingungen aufwachsen, zu überwinden. Die im Rahmen der Feldforschung gesammelten Daten versuchen Antwort darauf zu geben, wie Strukturen im Bildungssystem überwunden werden können, die darauf abzielen, die Unterschiede von Kindern hervorzuheben, wie unterschiedliche Muttersprachen, kognitive und körperliche Fähigkeiten, Elternhaushalte, etc., anstatt den Aufbau einer Gemeinschaft zu fördern.

In dieser Dissertation arbeite ich mit dem Konzept der inklusiven Pädagogik, das in meinen Augen ein zutiefst ethisches Konzept ist, in dem es allen SchülerInnen die Teilnahme an der allgemeinbildenden Schule ermöglicht, mit dem Ziel Diskriminierung vorzubeugen (Booth, 2005). Anthony Booth und Mel Ainscow, die AutorInnen des Index for Inclusion beschreiben folgendes: „Der inklusive Ansatz im Umgang mit Diversität beinhaltet das Verständnis von und das Entgegentreten gegen die tiefgreifenden, zerstörerischen Gefahren, die daraus erwachsen Unterschiedlichkeit oder Fremd sein mit Minderwertigkeit gleichzusetzen. Wenn das passiert und sich tief in einer Kultur verankert, dann kann das zu schwerwiegender Diskriminierung oder gar Genozid führen." (Booth und Ainscow, 2011, p. 23). Beide ForscherInnen beziehen sich hier auf das schwere Erbe des Holocaust, die Massenvernichtung der Juden, der Roma und der Behinderten sowie der Homosexuellen und sozial "Entarteten" durch Nazi-Deutschland. Verbrechen, die auf dem Boden und in dem sozialen Gefüge Europas unauslöschliche Spuren hinterlassen haben.

Die Europäische Union wurde auf den Trümmern des Zweiten Weltkriegs gegründet, die ihre Mitglieder in einem friedlichen Bündnis vereint, das auf gemeinsamen Grundsätzen beruht,

um soziale Gerechtigkeit und wirtschaftlichen Wohlstand zu gewährleisten. Wie Tony Judt, Historiker für europäische Geschichte, feststellt, beruht die europäische Identität auf dem Bewusstsein dieser früheren Gräueltaten. Der Beitritt in die Union hängt unter anderem von der Anerkennung dieser Verbrechen ab (Judt, 2010, p. 804). Angesichts dieses historischen Hintergrunds befasse ich mich damit, wie sich der Umgang mit Vielfalt in Polen, Österreich und Deutschland, drei zutiefst von der Historie des Holocaust geprägte Länder, gestaltet.

In meiner Dissertation diskutiere ich, wie sich die prägenden Jahre des Nationalsozialismus auf die Sonderpädagogik, ihre Terminologien und Praktiken, die einst die Massensterilisation und Ermordung von Kindern und Erwachsenen mit Behinderungen rechtfertigten, auf die Bildung von SchülerInnen mit besonderen pädagogischen Bedürfnissen bzw. Behinderungen auswirken (Hänsel, 2005, Moser, 2012, Pfahl, 2011, Ellger-Rüttgardt, 2004). Als Disziplin mit langer Tradition kontrolliert die Sonderpädagogik immernoch stark den Behinderungsbegriff und hält erfolgreich Sonderschulen aufrecht, die im Licht der UN-Behindertenrechtskonvention de facto rechtswidrig sind. Dies gilt insbesondere für das Recht auf qualitativ hochwertige, kostenlose, umfassende Grund- und Sekundarschulbildung für alle Kinder (UN-BRK, Artikel 24.2b). Die Europäische Union, die den sozialen Zusammenhalt als eines ihrer Hauptziele anerkennt, fordert ihre Mitgliedstaaten nachdrücklich auf, inklusive Bildung zu schaffen (2018 / C 194/01). Aufbauend auf der UN-Konvention vertritt die EU die Auffassung, dass inklusiver Unterricht ein breites Spektrum von Aktivitäten ist, der auch auf die Herausforderungen von Multikulturalismus und Migration, sozialer Ungleichheit und Erfahrung mit Behinderungen eingeht. In meiner Dissertation beschreibe ich, wie lokale Initiativen von Eltern und AktivistInnen für die Rechte von Menschen mit Behinderungen eintreten. Ebenso treiben internationale Kampagnen, einschließlich EU und UN Rechtsvorschriften das Konzept der Inklusion voran. Somit lässt sich diese pädagogische Paradigma nur sowohl aus globaler Perspektive als auch aus spezifisch kontextualisierten Gesichtspunkten erforschen (Carney, 2008). Ich erforsche, wie das Konzept der inklusiven Bildung in die Praxis umgesetzt wird unter Bezug auf ein Forschungsparadigma, das sensibel für Prozesse ist, die auf lokaler Ebene ablaufen - in Klassen, Schulen und Stadtteilen, das historisches und lokales Wissen berücksichtigt und erläutert, "in welcher Beziehung zu den breiteren Mustern des sozialen Handelns und der sozialen Struktur individuelle Handlungen und Bedeutungen stehen" (Eisenhart, 2001: 209). Die Antwort auf meine grundlegenden Forschungsfragen: Welchen Einfluss hat die Umsetzung von inklusiver Bildung auf Schulkulturen? und wie kämpfen Schulen mit der Anforderung, die menschliche Vielfalt zu erkennen und ein inklusives Lern- und Unterrichtsumfeld zu schaffen? – erforsche ich deshalb

unter Bezugnahme auf die Methodologie der Bildungsethnographie (Spindler, 2000, Erickson, 1986, 1982).

Mit Hilfe von teilnehmenden Beobachtung und umfangreichen Interviewstudien erforsche ich, welche Wechselwirkungen die inklusive Pädagogik mit dem lokalen Bildungsumfeld der jeweiligen Schule eingeht. Im Verlauf der vergangenen drei Jahre habe ich in Polen, Österreich und Deutschland ethnographische Untersuchungen an Grundschulen durchgeführt. Als teilnehmende Beobachterin verbrachte ich mindestens 100 Stunden an jedem dieser drei Forschungsstandorte. Insgesamt befragte ich achtzehn Personen, darunter LehrerInnen, PädagogInnen, SonderpädagogInnen und DirektorInnen oder stellvertretende SchulleiterInnen. Um meine persönlichen Beobachtungen besser kontextualisieren zu können, führte ich eine umfangreiche Policy Analyse durch und insgesamt zwölf Interviews mit ExpertInnen aus Bildungswissenschaft und Administration der einzelnen Ländern.

Meine Dissertation besteht aus sieben Kapiteln. Nach der Einleitung führe ich die Grundlagen der inklusiven Bildung auf, die stark geprägt sind durch die Schriften der kritischen Pädagogik und in klarer Abgrenzung zu den erkenntnistheoretischen Annahmen der Sonderpädagogik stehen. Des Weiteren fasse ich die ontologische Debatte um den Behinderungsbegriff zusammen. Hier eröffnet sich ein Spannungsfeld, das auf der Diskrepanz und der mangelnden Passfähigkeit zwischen theoretischem Behinderungbegriff und praktischem Inklusionsverständnis resultiert. Dabei führe ich das von Thea R. Abu El-Haj (2006) vorgeschlagene Konzept der relationalen Unterschiede an und untersuche, wie traditionelle Bildungssysteme angesichts von unterschiedlichen Ausführungen von Diversität mit dem Konzept der Inklusion kollidieren. Unterschiedliche Identitätsmarker, insbesondere Migrationshintergrund, Armut, kulturelles Kapital usw., wirken unterschiedlich stark darauf ein, inwiefern ein Kind seinen Anspruch auf Bildungschancen und Unterstützungspraktiken geltend machen kann. Darauf aufbauend arbeite ich mit dem intersektionalen, sozio-kulturellen Verständnis von Behinderung, das die Beseitigung von Beteiligungsbarrieren betont und nicht nur auf die individuellen Defizite oder Mängel von SchülerInnen fokussiert (Oliver, 1999, Varenne und McDermott, 1995). Aus diesen Annahmen leite ich die Schlüsselprinzipien inklusiver Bildung ab, das das Denken in Form von Defiziten ablehnt, Unterschiede in Bezug auf das System versteht und soziales Lernen hervorhebt.

Als "Fremde in drei Kontexten" konzentriere ich mich darauf, die Grundlagen meiner interkulturellen ethnografischen Forschung anhand von mehreren Bezugspunkten zu klären. Meine Unterrichtsforschung basiert auf der ethnographischen Methodologie, geprägt von George Marcus, Frederick Erickson sowie von George und Louise Spindler, Robert Biklen

und Sari K. Bogdan, Ellen Brantlinger und weiteren KollegInnen. In den folgenden drei Kapiteln stelle ich meine Forschung länderspezifisch vor. Die Ergebnisse der Policy Analyse dienen der Rahmung meiner Einsichten, die ich aus der Schulpraxis gewinne und in Form von Vignetten, die von "rhetorischer, analytischer und evidenzieller Funktion" sind, präsentiere (Erickson, 1986: 150).

In Österreich besuchen mehr Kinder, deren Muttersprache nicht Deutsch ist, sondern beispielsweise Türkisch, Bosnisch / Serbisch / Kroatisch keine gewöhnlichen Grundschulen, sondern die Sonderschule. Dies ist ein Hinweis darauf, wie das segregierende Bildungssystems Barrieren aufrecht erhält und soziale Mobilität einschränkt. In einer multikulturellen vierten Klasse einer Grundschule in Tirol beobachtete ich, wie das Versagen einer Schülerin bei Leistungsmessungen auf Sprachbarrieren anstatt auf Schwerhörigkeit zurückgeführt wurde, wobei sich hier die Identitätskategorien von Ethnizität und Behinderung erheblich überschnitten und nachteilig auf den Anspruch auf sonderpädagogischen Förderung auswirkten.

In Polen führt die Verwaltungspolitik der postkommunistischen Transformation zu einer missbräuchlichen Verwendung von Geldern, die der Inklusion von Kindern mit Behinderungen in öffentlichen Schulen dienen sollte. In einer fünften Klasse einer Grundschule erlebte ich, wie die Diagnosewerkzeuge der Sonderpädagogik dazu dienten, den Status eines/einer Schülers/Schülerin als "behindert" festzuschreiben. Durch die ‚inklusive' Maßnahme des individuellen Unterrichts zuhause, der wesentlich weniger Stunden umfasst als der Regelunterricht, wurde das Recht des Kindes auf Bildung stark eingeschränkt. In Deutschland untersuchte ich, wie sich Migrationserfahrung und Armut auf die Leistung von SchülerInnen auswirkte. In einer sechsten Klasse einer Grundschule, in der ausschließlich MigrantInnen unterrichtet werden, beobachtete ich die Herausforderungen, vor denen das Kollegium stand, um die Kluft zwischen Mehrheits-und Minderheitsgesellschaft, sowie intrareligiöse und kulturelle Auseinandersetzungen durch soziales Lernen und integrative Praktiken zu überwinden. In den Schlussfolgerungen präsentiere ich die Antworten auf meine Forschungsfragen und Empfehlungen an Politik und Praxis.

Bibliography

Abu El-Haj, Thea R. (2006): *Elusive Justice: Wrestling with Difference and Educational Equity in Everyday Practice.* New York: Routledge, p. 100.

Abu El-Haj, Thea R. (Nov. 16, 2018): Council on Anthropology & Education (CAE): Past President's Distinguished Lecture, American Anthropological Association 2018, San Jose, Calif.

Abu El-Haj, Thea Renda (2015): *Unsettled Belonging: Educating Palestinian American Youth after 9/11*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, p. 11.

Adams, D.L, and Everelles, Nirmala, (2016): Shadow Play: DisCrit, Dis/Respectability, and Carceral Logics. In: Annamma, Subini, Ferri, Beth and David Connor (Eds.): DisCrit: Disability Studies and Critical Race Theory in Education. New York: Teachers College Press.

Agar, Michael H. (2008): *The Professional Stranger: An Informal Introduction to Ethnography.* Second Edition. Emerald Group Publishing.

Ainscow, Mel (2001): Understanding the Development of Inclusive Schools: Some Notes and Further Reading., The University of Manchester, accessed from https://oas.org/cotep/GetAttach.aspx?lang=en&cId=492&aid=726, on Dec. 12, 2018.

Annamma, Subini Ancy (2018): *The Pedagogy of Pathologization: Dis/abled Girls of Color in the School-prison Nexus*. New York: Routledge.

Anderson, Perry (1989): *Considerations on Western Marxism*. Third Edition. London: Verso.

Appadurai, Arjun (1996): *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization.* Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Apple, Michael W. (2012): *Education and Power*. New York: Taylor and Francis.

Apple, Michael W. (2016): Power, policy and the realities of curriculum and teaching, CEPS Ljubljana, accessed from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YcPv0Pk7Uqs&t=646s, on Nov. 1, 2018.

Apple, Michael (2017): The Struggle for Democracy in Critical Education, accessed from http://dx.doi.org/10.23925/1809-3876.2017v15i4p894-926, on Nov. 1, 2018, p. 898.

Babicka-Wirkus, Anna (2015): *Uczen (nie) biega i (nie) krzyczy* (The student does (not) run and does (not) scream). Krakow: Impuls.

Baglieri, Susan (2016): Toward Unity in School Reform: What DisCrit Contributes. In: Connor, David J., Ferri, Beth A., Annamma, Subini A. (Eds.): *DisCrit: Disabiltiy Studies and Critical Race Theory in Education*. New York: Teachers College Press, pp. 167-182.

Balcer, Adam, Buras, Piotr, Gromadzki, Grzegorz, and Smolar, Eugeniusz (2016): Change in Poland, but what change? Assumptions of Law and Justice party foreign policy. *Stefan Batory Foundation.*

Barnes, Colin (2012): The Social Model of Disability: Valuable or Irrelevant? In: Watson, N., Roulstone, A, and Thomas, C. (Eds.): *The Routledge Handbook of Disability Studies*, pp. 12-29.

Beach, Dennis (2011): On Structure and Agency in Ethnographies of Education: examples from this special issue and more generally. In: *European Educational Research Journal*, 10: 4, pp. 572-582.

Beach, Dennis and Lahelma, Elina (2015): Introduction. In: Smeyers, Paul, Bridges, David, Burbules, Nicolas C., Griffiths, Morwenna (Eds.): *International Handbook of Interpretation in Educational Research*. New York: Springer, pp. 679-685.

Benvenisti, Meron (1995): *Intimate Enemies: Jews and Arabs in a Shared Land*. Oakland: University of California Press.

Bertelsmann Stiftung (2015): *Inklusion in Deutschland. Daten und Fakten*. (Inclusion in Germany. Data and Facts). Prof. Dr. phil. Klaus Klemm im Auftrag der Bertelsmann Stiftung.

Białecki, Ireneusz, Jakubowski, Maciej, and Wisniewski, Jerzy (2017): Education Policy in Poland: The impact of PISA (and other international studies). In: European Journal for Education, 52, 167-174.

Bildung in Deutschland: Ein indikatorengestützter Bericht mit einer Analyse zu Wirkungen und Erträgen von Bildung. (Education in Germany: An indicator-based report with an analysis on the effects and returns of education.) Autorengruppe Bildungsbereicht (Author team education report), pp. 1-377.

Bischof, Günther (2004): Victims? Perpetrators? "Punching Bags" of European Historical Memory? The Austrians and Their World War II Legacies. In: *German Studies Review*, 27:1, pp. 17-32.

Blanck, Jonna M. (2015): Die vielen Gesichter der Inklusion: Wie SchülerInnen mit Behinderung unterrrichtet werden, unterscheidet sich innerhalb Deutschlands stark (The many faces of inclusion: How students with disabilities are taught, strongly differs within Germany). In: *WZBrief Bildung* (Education), No. 30, Wissenschaftszentrum Berlin für Sozialforschung (WZB) (Berlin Social Science Center), Berlin, pp. 1-8.

Bogdan, Robert C. and Biklen, Sari Knopp (2007): *Qualitative Research for Education: An Introduction to Theories and Methods*, p. 76.

Booth, Anthony (2005): Keeping the Future Alive: Putting Inclusive Values into Education and Society? Paper presented at North – South Dialogue Conference, Delhi, accessed from https://www.eenet.org.uk/resources/docs/future_alive.doc, on Nov. 28, 2018.

Booth, Anthony, and Ainscow, Mel (2011): *Index for Inclusion: Developing Learning and Participation in Schools*. Third edition. Centre for Studies on Inclusive Education.

Borowska-Beszta, Beata (2014): A review of lights and shadows of Polish education integration. In: International Research Journal for Quality in Education, 1:2, pp. 23-30.

Bowen, Glenn A. (2009): Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method. In: *Qualitative Research Journal*, 9:2, pp. 27-40.

Brantlinger, Ellen (1997): Using Ideology: Cases of Nonrecognition of the Politics of Research and Practice in Special Education. In: *Review of Educational Research*, 67:4, pp. 425-459.

Brantlinger, Ellen, Jimenez, Robert, Pugach, Marleen, Richardson, Virginia (2005): Qualitative Studies in Special Education. In: *Exceptional Children*, 71:2, pp. 195-207.

Breit, Johannes (2017): *The Gestapo-Camp Innsbruck-Reichenau: History Reappraisal Memory*. Innsbruck: Tyrola publishing.

Broderick, Alicia A. and Zeus Leonardo (2016): What a Good Boy: The Deployment and Distribution of 'Goodness' as Ideological Property in Schools. In: Connor, David J., Ferri, Beth A. and Subini Annamma (Eds.): DisCrit: Disability Studies and Critical Race Theory in Education. New York: Teachers College Press.

Bruneforth, Michael, Lassnigg, Lorenz, Vogtenhuber, Stefan, Schreiner, Claudia, and Simone Breit (Eds.): *National Bildungsbericht Österreich 2015 Band 1, Das Schulsystem in Spiegel von Daten und Indikatoren* (The School System in the Mirror of Data and Indicators). Leykam.

Budde, Jürgen and Nora Weuster (2017): Class Council between Democracy Learning and Character Education. In: *Journal of Social Science Education*, 16:3, pp. 52-61.

Bundesagentur für Arbeit:Erlärung der Partner des Nationalen Paktes für Ausbildung und Fachkräftenachwuchs in Deutschland, der Bundesagentur für Arbeit, der Kultusministerkonferenz und der Beauftragten der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration (Statement of the Partner of the National Pact for

Tranining and Skilled Labor Trainees in Germany, the Federal Agency for Labor, the KMK and the Commissioner of the Federal Republic for Migration, Refugees and Integration) accessed from https://www.kmk.org/fileadmin/veroeffentlichungen_beschluesse/2009/2009_02_00-Potenziale-Integration.pdf , on Sept. 19, 2018.

Bundesministerium für Bildung und Frauen: Verbindliche Richtlinien zur Entwicklung von Inklusiven Modellregionen, accessed from https://bildung.bmbwf.gv.at/schulen/bw/abs/rl_inklusive_modell_2015.pdf?61edru, on Jan.5, 2018.

Bundesministerium für Arbeit und Soziales: Der Fünfte Armuts- und Reichtumsbericht der Bundesregierung: Lebenslagen in Deutschland, Armuts-und Reichtumsberichterstattung der Bundesregierung (Kurzfassung), pp. 1-48, accessed from http://www.bmas.de/SharedDocs/Downloads/DE/PDF-Pressemitteilungen/2017/5-arb-kurzfassung.pdf?__blob=publicationFile&v=2, on Sept. 12, 2018.

Bundesministerium für Arbeit, Soziales und Konsumentenschutz: Nationaler Aktionsplan Behinderung 2012-2020: Strategie der österreichischen Bundesregierung zur Umsetzung der UN-Behindertenrechtskonvention, accessed from: https://broschuerenservice.sozialministerium.at/Home/Download?publicationId=165, on Sept. 3, 2017.

Burgsthaler, Sheryl (2015): Universal Design of Instruction (UDI): Definition, Principles, Guidelines and Examples. In: *DO-IT*, pp. 1-4.

Carney, Stephen (2009): Negotiating Policy in an Age of Globalization: Exploring Educational "Policyscapes" in Denmark, Nepal, and China. In: *Comparative Education Review*, 53:1, pp. 63-88, p. 63.

Campbell, Fiona A.K. (2001): Inciting Legal Fictions: 'Disability's' Date With Ontology and the Ableist Body of the Law. In: *Griffith Law Review*, 10:1, pp. 42-62.

Central Intelligence Agency (CIA): The World Factbook Poland, accessed from https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/pl.html, on March 9, 2018.

Cervinkova, Hana (2016): Producing Homogeneity as a Historical Tradition. Neo-Conservatism, Precarity and Citizenship Education in Poland. In: *Journal for Critical Education Policy Studies*, 14:3, pp. 43-55.

Cervinkova, Hana (2018): Nauczanie i uczenie sie antropologii w edukacji nauczieli (Discursive Cultural Therapy Toward Inclusive Teacher Imaginaries: Anthropology and Teacher Education in Poland). In: Cervinkova, Hana (Ed.): *Antropologia i Edukacja* (Anthropology and Education). Wroclaw: Wydawnictwo Naukowe Dolnoslaskiej Szkoly Wyzszej, pp. 11-32.

Cervinkova, Hana and Pawl Rudnicki (forthcoming). Austerity Capitalism and Education in Poland. In: Hill, Dave, Chrysochou, P. (Eds.): *Immiseration Capitalism and Education Austerity, Resistance and Revolt*. Brighton: The Institute for Education Policy Studies.

Cervinkova, Hana (Ed.) (2018): *Antropologia i edukacja. Etnograficzne badania edukacyjne w tradycji amerykańskiej* (Anthropology and Education. North American Ethnographic Educational Research). Wroclaw: ULS Academic Press.

Charzynska, Katarzyna, Anczewska, Marta and Piotr Switaj (2012): A Brief Overview of the History of Education in Poland. In: *Comparative Education & History of Education*, pp. 92-98.

Code, Lorraine (2012): Taking Subjectivity into Account. In: C.W. Ruitenberg and D.C. Phillips (Eds.): Education, Culture and Epistemological Diversity. Mapping a Disputed Terrain. New York: Springer, pp. 85-100.

Connor, David J. and Ferri, Beth, A. (2007): The Conflict within: Resistance to Inclusion and other Paradoxes in Special Education. In: *Disability and Society*, 22:1, pp. 63-77.

Connor, David J., and Annamma, Subini A. (2014): The Art of Inclusive Teaching: Developing a Palette to Reach All Learners. In: Lawrence-Brown, Diana, and Sapon-Sevin, Mara (Eds.): *Condition Critical: Key Principles for Equitable and Inclusive Education*, pp. 133-152.

Connor, David J., Ferri, Beth A., Annamma, Subini A. (2016):Dis/Ability Critical Race Studies (DisCrit): Theorizinh at the Intersections of Race and Dis/Ability. In: Connor, David J., Ferri, Beth A., Annamma, Subini A. (Eds.): *DisCrit: Disability Studies and Critical Race Theory in Education.* New York: Teachers College Press, pp. 9-32.

Council Recommendation of May 22, 2018, on promoting common values, inclusive education, and the European dimension of teaching (2018/C 194/01). In: *Official Journal of the European Union* (June 7, 2018), p. C 195/3.

Crenshaw, Kimberlé (2016): Kimberlé Crenshaw on Intersectionality. Women of the World Festival. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-DW4HLgYPlA&t=10s, on Nov. 28, 2018.

Crenshaw, Kimberlé (1991): Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence against Women of Color. In: *Stanford Law Review*, Vol. 43, pp. 1241-1299.

Crowley, Una (2009): Genealogy, method. In: *International Encyclopedia of Human Geography*. Elsevier, 341-344, p. 4, accessed from http://eprints.maynoothuniversity.ie/3024/1/UC_Genealogy.pdf, on Sept. 4, 2018.

Czech, Herwig (2016): From the "Aktion T4" to "decentral euthanasia.":The lower Austrian healing and care institutions Gugging, Mauer-Öhling and Yibbs. In: Documentation archive of the Austrian resistance (Eds.): *Fanatics, Fulfillers of Duty, Resisters. Reichsgaue Niederdonau, Groß-Wien, Wien*, pp. 219-266.

Czerepaniak-Walczak, Maria (2015): Kultura Szkoly – O jej zlozonosci I wielowymiarowosci (School's Culture – About its complexity and multidimensionality). In: *Pedagogika Spoleczna*, 3:57, pp. 77-87.

Czerepaniak-Walczak, Maria (2018): Proces emancypacji kultury szkoły. Warsaw: Wolters Kluwer.

Davies, Norman (1984): Poland's Multicultural Heritage. In: *Acta Slavica Iaponica*, 4, pp. 79-87.

Disabled Peoples' International (2012), accessed from http://www.disabledpeoplesinternational.org/, on Dec. 7, 2018.

Donnellan, Anne (1984): The criterion of the least dangerous assumption. In: *Behavioral Disorders*, 9, pp. 141-150.

Dudley-Marling, Curt (2015): The Resilience of Deficit Thinking. In: *Journal of Teaching and Learning*, 10:1, pp. 1-12, p. 6.

Dzierzgowska, Anna and Laskowski, Piotr (August 6, 2017): Opinia o projekcie podstawy programowej z historii dla liceum ogólnokształcącego i technikum. Opinion of the Social Monitor of Education team on the draft core curriculum of history for high school and technical school. Spoleczny Monitor Edukacji. Social Education Monitor, accessed from https://www.monitor.edu.pl/analizy/opinia-o-projekcie-podstawy-programowej-z-historii-dla-liceum-ogolnoksztalcacego-i-technikum.html, on Aug. 1, 2018.

Edelstein, Benjamin, Veith, Hermann (2017): Schulgeschichte nach 1945: Von der Nachkriegszeit bis zur Gegenwart (School history after 1945: From the post-war years to the present). *Bundeszentrale für politische Bildung* (Federal Agency for Civic Engagement), accessed from http://www.bpb.de/gesellschaft/bildung/zukunft-bildung/229702/schulgeschichte-nach-1945, on Sept. 29, 2018.

Edelstein, Wolfgang (2011): Education for Democracy: reasons and strategies. In: *European Journal of Education*, 46:1, part II, pp. 127- 137, p. 128.

EDiTE Project, accessed from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BbD3kU07EEY, on Dec. 9, 2018, minutes 1:34-1:47.

Eisenhart, Margaret (2001): Changing Conceptions of Culture and Ethnographic Methodology: Recent Thematic Shifts and Their Implications for Research on Teaching. In: Richardson (Ed.): *Handbook of Research on Teaching*, 4 Edition. Washington, D.C.: American Educational Research Association, pp. 209-225, p. 209.

Ellger-Rüttgardt, Sieglind (2004): Sonderpädagogik – ein blinder Fleck der allgemeinen Pädagogik? Eine Replik auf den Aufsatz von Dagmar Hänsel (Special pedagogy – a blind spot of general pedagogy? A response to the essay by Dagmer Hänsel). In: *Zeitschrift für Pädagogik* (Journal for Pedagogy), 50: 3, pp. 416-429.

Ellger-Rüttgardt, Sieglind Luise (2008): *History of Special Pedagogy*. München: Ernst-Reinhardt GmbH & Co KG Publishing.

Emerson, Robert, Fretz, Rachel, and Linda Shaw (2011): Field notes in ethnographic research. In: *Writing ethnographic field notes*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, pp. 1-16.

Erickson, Frederick (1982): Taught Cognitive Learning in its Immediate Environments: A Neglected Topic in the Anthropology of Education. In: *Anthropology and Education Quarterly*, 13:2, pp. 149-180.

Erickson, Frederick (1984): What Makes School Ethnography, Ethnographic'? In: *Anthropology and Education Quarterly*, 15:1, pp. 51-66, p.10, accessed from http://www.indiana.edu/~educy520/sec5982/week_4/erickson84.pdf, on Sept. 4, 2018.

Erickson, Frederick (1986): Qualitative Methods in Research on Teaching. In: Wittrock, Merlin (Ed.): *Handbook of Research on Teaching*, Third edition, New York: MacMillan, pp. 119- 161.

Erickson, Frederick (2004): Demystifying Data Construction and Analysis. In: *Anthropology and Education Quarterly*, 35:4, pp. 486-493.

Erickson, Frederick (2010): Studying Side by Side: Collaborative Action Ethnography in Educational Research. In: Spindler, G. and L. Hammond (Eds.): *Innovations in Educational Ethnography: Theories, Methods, and Results*. New York: Psychology Press.

Eröss, Gabor (2012): Central Europe (Bulgaria, the Czech Republic, Hungary, Poland, Romania, Slovakia). In: Anderson-Levitt, Kathryn M. (Ed.): *Anthropologies of Education: A Global Guide to Ethnographic Studies of Learning and Schooling*. New York: Berghahn, pp. 167-192.

Euronews (September 8, 2017): Poland rips up school system in rapid reform, accessed from http://www.euronews.com/2017/09/08/poland-rips-up-school-system-in-rapid-reform, on March 26, 2018.

European Parliament, Principalate General for Internal Policies, Policy Department C: Citizens' Rights and Constitutional Affairs (2013): Country Report on Poland for the Study on Member States' Policies for Children with Disabilities, accessed from http://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/etudes/join/2013/474429/IPOL-LIBE_ET(2013)474429_EN.pdf, on Aug. 1, 2018.

European Union (2016): Education and Training Monitor – Country Analysis Poland 2016.

Erevelles, Nirmala (2000): Educating Unruly Bodies: Critical Pedagogy, Disability Studies, and the Politics of Schooling. In: *Educational Theory*, Vol. 50, Nr.1, 25-47.

Felten, Michael (July 31, 2018): Zurück zur Vernunft (Back to reasoning). In: Sueddeutsche Zeitung, accessed from https://www.sueddeutsche.de/bildung/inklusion-an-schulen-zurueck-zur-vernunft-1.4073255, on Sept. 27, 2018.

Flieger, Petra and Schönwiese, Volker (2014): Behindertenheime – Die Stiefkinder der Aufarbeitung von Missbrauch und Gewalt/ Homes for the Disabled – The Step children of Reappraisal of Abuse and Violence. In: Jarosch, Monika et al. (Eds.): *Gegenstimmen* (Counter Voices). Innsbruck: Studienverlag, pp. 144-150, accessed from bidok, on Dec. 1, 2018.

Florian, Lani (2015): Inclusive Pedagogy: A transformative approach to individual differences, but can it help reduce educational inequalities? In: *Scottish Educational Review*, 47:1, pp. 5-14.

Foucault, Michel (1982): The Subject and Power. In: *Critical Inquiry*, 8:4, pp. 777-795.

Foucault, Michel (1989): *The Archaeology of Knowledge*. London: Routledge.

Foucault, Michel (2016): *Abnormal: Lectures at the Collège de France 1974-1975*. London: Verso.

FPÖ party program, accessed from https://www.fpoe.at/themen/parteiprogramm/parteiprogramm-englisch/, on Sept. 5, 2017.

Freedom House: Poland, accessed from https://freedomhouse.org/report/freedom-world/2017/poland, on March 7, 2018.

Freire, Paolo (1970): *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. New York: Continuum.

Freire, Paolo (2005): *Teachers as Cultural Workers: Letters to Those Who Dare Teach*. Cambridge: Westview Press.

Friedlander, Henry (1995): *The Origins of Nazi Genocide: From Euthanasia to the Final Solution*. Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, p. 1.

Fries, Kenny (2017): The Nazis' First Victims Were the Disabled. In: *The New York Times*, accessed from https://www.nytimes.com/2017/09/13/opinion/nazis-holocaust-disabled.html, on Sept. 29, 2018.

Gazetta Wyborcza (Dec. 10, 2018): Nasz zawód to nie jest wolontariat. Nauczyciele pokazują paski z wynagrodzeniami i chcą dymisji Zalewskiej, accessed from http://szczecin.wyborcza.pl/szczecin/7,34939,24261811,nasz-zawod-to-nie-wolontariat-zwiazkowcy-z-solidarnosci-pokazuja.html, on Dec. 11, 2018.

Gebert, Konstanty (2016): Poland: The "Good Change." In: *notes internacionals CIDOB*, pp. 1-7.

Geertz, Clifford (1973): *The Interpretation of Cultures*. New York: Basic Books, Inc., Publishers.

Geertz, Clifford (1983): *Local Knowledge*. New York: Basic Books.

Gerald, Casey (Dec. 8, 2018): T.M. Landry and the Tragedy of Viral Success Stories: We focus on outliers and ignore systemic injustice. New York Times, accessed from https://www.nytimes.com/2018/12/08/opinion/sunday/tm-landry-louisiana-school-abuse.html, on Dec. 11, 2018.

Germann, Richard (2009): Austrian Soldiers and Generals in World War II. In: Plasser, Fritz (Ed.): *New Perspectives on Austrians and World War II*. New York: Routledge.

Gierlak, Maria (2000): Deutschunterricht im deutsch besetzten Polen in der Zeit des Zweiten Weltkriegs. German lessons in German-occupied Poland in the times of World War II. In: *Zeitschrift für Ostmitteleuropa Forschung*. (Journal for East-Central European Research), 49:2, pp. 194-220.

Gil, Malgorzata (2007): From Segregation to Equalization: The Polish Perspective on Educating Children With Intellectual Disabilities. In: *Journal of Contemporary Issues in Education*, 2:1, pp. 40-52.

Giroux, Henry (1992): *Border Crossings: Cultural Workers and the Politics of Education*. New York: Routledge.

Gogolin, Ingrid (1994): The 'monolingual habitus' as the common feature in teaching in the language of the majority in different countries, accessed from

http://perlinguam.journals.ac.za/pub/article/viewFile/187/298, on Oct. 6, 2018, pp. 38-49.

Gomolla, Mechtild (2013): Fördern und Fordern allein genügt nicht! Mechanismen institutioneller Diskriminierung von Migrantenkindern und –jugendlichen im deutschen Schulsystem. (Supporting and challenging is not enough! Mechanisms of institutional discrimination against migrant children and adolescents in the German school system). In: Auernheimer, Georg (Ed.): *Schieflagen im Bildungssystem:Die Benachteiligung der Migrantenkinder* (Imbalances in the education system: The disadvantage of migrant children). 5th Edition.Wiesbaden: Springer, pp. 87-102.

Gonzalez, Norma et alii (1995): Funds of Knowledge for Teaching in Latino Households. In: *Urban Education*, 29, pp. 443-470.

Goraus, Karolina, and Inchauste, Gabriela (August 2016): The Distributional Impact of Taxes and Transfers. World Bank Group: Poverty and Equity Global Practice Group, Policy Research Working Paper 7787.

Gottesmann, Isaac (2010): Sitting in the Waiting Room: Paolo Freire and the Critical Turn in the Field of Education. In: *Educational Studies*, 46:4, pp. 376-399.

Grudzinska Gross, Irena (2011): 1968 in Poland: Spoiled Children, Marxists and Jews. In: Vladimir Tismaneanu (Ed.): *Promises of 1968: Crisis, Illusion and Utopia*. Budapest: Central European University Press, pp. 43-53; Stola, Dariusz (2006): Anti-Zionism as a Multipurpose Policy Instrument: The Anti-Zionist Campaign in Poland, 1967–1968. In: *Journal of Israeli History*, 25:1, pp. 175-201.

Gutstein, Eric (2013): Critical Action Research With Urban Youth: Studying Social Reality Through Mathematics. In: *Forum Oswiatowe*, 3:50, 117-126.

Hamilton, Mary (1999): Ethnography for Classrooms: Constructing a Reflective Curriculum for Literacy. In: *Curriculum Studies*, 7:3, pp. 429-444.

Hannerz, Ulf (2003):): Being there… and there… and there…! : Reflections on Multi-Sited Ethnography. In: *Ethnography*, 4:2, pp. 201-216.

Hänsel, Dagmar (2003): Die Sonderschule ein blinder Fleck in der Schulsystemdforschung (The special school – a blind spot in school system research). In: *Zeitschrift für Pädagogik* (Journal for pedagogy), 48:4, pp. 591-609.

Hänsel, Dagmer (2012): Quellen zur NS-Zeit in der Geschichte der Sonderpädagogik (Sources of the National Socialist time in the history of special pedagogy). In: *Zeitschrift für Pädagogik* (Journal for pedagogy), 58:2, pp. 242-261.

Hänsel, Dagmar (2016): Special pedagogy in National Socialism. See: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5WCoWkNxh5U.

Hansen, Georg (2006): Schulpolitik im besetzten Polen 1939-1945. (School politics in occupied Poland 1939-1945). In: Elisabeth Zwick (Ed.): *Bildungsforschung*. Education research. Focus: War and Education, 3:1, pp. 1-16.

Harding, Luke (28.08.2015): Hungarian police arrest driver of lorry that had 71 migrants inside. *The Guardian*: accessed from https://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/aug/28/more-than-70-dead-austria-migrant-truck-tragedy, on Sep. 6, 2017.

Hayden, Dolores (1999): *The Power of Place: Urban Landscapes as Public History*. Cambridge: The MIT Press.

Heath, Shirley Brice (1982): Questioning at Home and At School: A Comparative Study. In: George Spindler (Ed.): *In Doing the Ethnography of Schooling: Educational Anthropology in Action*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, pp. 102-131.

Heintze, Isolde (2007): Social ecology, unemployment and growing up. The impact of socioecologic contextual factors on educational mobility of children in selected urban quarters of Dresden. In: *Diskurs Jugend- und Kindheitsforschung*, 2:1, pp. 39-51.

Himmelmann, Gerhard (2004): Demokratie-Lernen: Was? Warum? Wozu? (Democracy-Learning: What? Why? What for?). In: Edelstein, Wolfgang, Fauser, Peter (Eds.): *Beiträge zur Demokratiepädagogik. Eine Schriftenreihe des BLK-Programms "Demokratie lernen & leben,"*(Contributions to Democracy Pedagogy. A Series of the Federal-State-Programms "Democracy learning & living").

Hinz, Andreas (2008): Inklusive Pädagogik und Disability Studies – Gemeinsamkeiten und Spannungsfelder. Überlegungen in neun Thesen. (Inclusive Pedagogy and Disability Studies – Similarities and Fields of Tension. Considerations in nine theses). Vortrag im Rahmen der Ringvorlesung im Zentrum für Disability Studies der Universität Hamburg im Sommersemester 2008 (Presentation within the frame of circle lectures at the center for Disability Studies at the University of Hamburg, summer semester 2008).

Hollaus, Melanie and Heidi Schleich (Eds.) (2017): *Bocksiedlung. Ein Stück Innsbruck.* Innsbruck: Studienverlag.

Huainigg, Franz-Joseph (May 9, 2010): Integration – Die Sonderschule eine Menschenrechtsverletzung? (Integration – The Special School a Human Rights' Violation?). In: *Der Standard*, accessed from http://diepresse.com/home/bildung/universitaet/563981/Integration_Die-Sonderschule-eine-Menschenrechtsverletzung, on Sept. 7, 2017.

Huf, Christina, and Raggl, Andrea (2015): Social Orders and Interactions among Children in Age-mixed Classes in Primary Schools: New Perspectives from a Synthesis of Ethnographic Data. In: *Ethnography and Education*, 10:2, pp. 230-241.

Jakubowski, Maciej (2015): Opening up Opportunities: Education reforms in Poland. In: *IBS Policy Papers*, 1/2015, Instytut Badan Strukturalnych. (Institute for Structural Research).

Jorgensen, Cheryl (2005): The Least Dangerous Assumption: A Challenge to Create a New Paradigm. In: *Disability Solutions: A Publication of Creating Solutions, A Resource for Families and Others Interested in Down Syndrome and Developmental Disabilities*, 6:3, pp. 4-9.

Judt, Tony (2010): *Postwar: A History of Europe Since 1945*. London: Vintage Books.

Kemper, Franz-Josef (1997): Restructuring of Housing and Ethnic Segregation: Recent Developments in Berlin. In: *Urban Studies*, 35:10, pp. 1765-1789.

Kiesel, Doron (2006): Von der Ausländerpädagogik zur Interkulturellen Erziehung: Zur erziehungswissenschaftlichen Rezeption der Zuwanderung in die Bundesrepublik Deutschland (From foreigner pedagogy to intercultural education: On the education scientific reception of immigration into the Federal Republic of Germany). Vortrag (Presentation paper), accessed from https://www.lvr.de/media/wwwlvrde/jugend/beruns/politik_1/dokumente_53/20061129_11tejhk2vortragkiesel.pdf, on Sept. 20, 2018, pp. 1-12.

Kirby, Paul (February 18, 2015): Ukraine conflict: Why is east hit by conflict? *BBC News:* accessed from http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-28969784, on March 8, 2018.

KMK (Oct. 6, 2016): Erklärung der Kultusministerkonferenz zur Integration von jungen Geflüchteten durch Bildung. (Statement of the Standing Conference of the Ministers of Education and Cultural Affairs of the Länder in the Federal Republic of Germany on the integration of young refugees through education), pp. 1-4.

Kohn, Alfie (1996): *Beyond Discipline: From Compliance to Community. Alexandria: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development*.

Konar, Özlem, Kreienbrink, Axel and Anja Stichs (July 3, 2017): Zuwanderung und Integration. Aktuelle Zahlen, Entwicklungen, Maßnahmen. In: *Aus Politik und Zeitgeschichte*. Vol: 67, 27-29, pp. 13-20.

Kornmann, Reimer (2013): Die Überrepräsentation ausländischer Kinder und Jugendlicher in Sonderschulen mit dem Schwerpunkt Lernen (The overrepresentation of foreign children and teeanagers in special school with the focus on learning). In: Auernheimer, Georg (Ed.): *Schieflagen im Bildungssystem:Die Benachteiligung der Migrantenkinder* (Imbalances in the education system: The disadvantage of migrant children). 5th Edition.Wiesbaden: Springer, pp. 71-86.

Kossowska, Agnieszka (2016): *Duże Sprawy w Małych Głowach* (Big Matters in Small Heads). Opole: Stowarzyszenie Terapeutów Zależnych.

Kulczyk, Marcin (2016): Family rights and family policy in Poland. *European Center for Law and Justice*.

LA Times Columnist Steve Lopez on Child Poverty in LA (June 12, 2018), PBS accessed from https://www.pbs.org/wnet/amanpour-and-company/video/la-times-columnist-steve-lopez-on-child-poverty-in-la/, on Dec. 12, 2018.

Lang, Franzl (1983): Kufstein Lied, GMC Volkstümlicher Schlager, accessed from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=o0BRaUllRII, on August 2017.

Lawrence-Brown, Diana (2014): Critical Pedagogies, Inclusive Schooling and Social Justice. In: Lawrence-Brown-Diana, and Sapon-Sevin, Mara (Eds.): *Condition Critical: Key Principles for Equitable and Inclusive Education*. New York: Teachers College Press, pp. 1-16.

Lawrence-Brown, Diana (2014): Understanding Critical Perspective- Who Benefits? In: Lawrence-Brown-Diana, and Sapon-Sevin, Mara (Eds.): *Condition Critical: Key Principles for Equitable and Inclusive Education*. New York: Teachers College Press, pp. 33-50.

Levitas, Anthony, Golinowska, Stanislawa and Jan Herczynski (2001): *The Centre for Social and Economic Research: Improving Rural Education in Poland. Report prepared for the Warsaw Delegation of the European Commission by CASE Foundation*, pp. 1- 49.

Liasidou, Anastasia (2012): *Inclusive Education, Politics, and Policymaking: Contemporary Issues in Education Studies*. New York: Continuum.

Liasidou, Anastasia (2015): *Inclusive Education and the Issue of Change: Theory, Practice, and Pedagogy.* London: Palgrave.

Lingard, Bills and Mills, Martin (2007): Pedagogies Making a Difference: Issues of Social Justice and Inclusion. In: *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 11:3, pp. 233-244.

Lipman, Pauline (2013): Collaborative Research with Parents and Local Communities: Organizing Against Racism and Education Privatization. In: *Forum Oswiatowe*, 3:50, 127-136.

Lubin, Peter (1986): The Waldheim File: Complete and Unexpurgated. In: *The New Republic*, pp.20-24.

MacDowall, Andrew (May 13, 2015): Ukraine's refugees find solace in Poland, Europe's most homogenous society. *The Guardian:* accessed from https://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/may/13/ukraines-refugees-find-solace-in-poland-europes-most-homogenous-society, on Aug. 1, 2018.

Magda, Iga, Kielczewska, Aneta, and Brandt, Nicola (March 2018): *The "Family 500+" Child Allowance and Female Labor Supply in Poland*. Instytut Badan Strukturalnych, pp. 1-19.

Mahon-Reynolds, Claustina, Parker, Laurence (2016): The Overrepresentation of Students of Color with Learning Disabilties: How "Working Identity" Plays a Role in the School-to-Prison Pipeline. In: Connor, David J., Ferri, Beth A. and Subini A Annamma (Eds.): *DisCrit: Disability Studies and Critical Race Theory in Education*, pp. 145-153.

Marcus, George E. (1995): Ethnography In/Of the World System: The Emergence of Multi-Sited Ethnography. In: *Annual Review Anthropology*, 24, pp. 95-117.

Mazur, Dariusz and Zurek, Waldemar (2017): So called 'Good change' in the Polish system of the administration of justice, accessed from https://www.jura.uni-bonn.de/fileadmin/Fachbereich_Rechtswissenschaft/Einrichtungen/Lehrstuehle/Sanders/Dokumente/Good_change_-_7_October_2017_-_word.pdf, on Aug. 1, 2018.

McLaren, Peter (2015): *Life in Schools: An Introduction to Critical Pedagogy in the Foundations of Education*, 6 Edition. Boulder: Paradigm Publishers.

McWilliams, Mark and Mark Fancher (2010): Undiagnosed Students With Disabilities Trapped in the School-to-Prison Pipeline. In: *Disabilities and the Law*, pp. 28-33.

Meuser, Michael, Nagel, Ulrike (1991): Expertinneninterviews – vielfach erprobt, wenig bedacht. Ein Beitrag zur Methodendiskussion. (Expert interviews – many times practiced, less appreciated. A contribution to a methods discussion) In: Garz, Detlef, Kraimer, Klaus (Eds.): *Qualitativ-empirische Sozialforschung. Konzepte, Methoden, Analysen* (Qualitative-empirical social science. Concepts, Methods, Analyses). Opladen: Westdeutscher Verlag, pp. 441-471.

Ministry of Foreign Affairs Republic Poland: Poland and Poles in the Second World War, accessed from: https://ww2.pl/terror-the-extermination-of-polish-elites-by-both-occupiers/#, on Aug. 1, 2018.

Ministry for School and Education of the State North Rhein-Westphalia: Bildungsportal des Landes Nordrhein Westfalen (Education forum of the state North Rhein-Westphalia), accessed from https://www.schulministerium.nrw.de/docs/Schulsystem/Inklusion/index.html, on Sept. 27, 2018.

Minow, Martha (1990): On Neutrality, Equality, & Tolerance: New Forms of a Decade of Distinction. In: *Change: The Magazine of Higher Learning*, 22:1, pp. 17-25, p. 18.

Molitor, Andreas (2008): Sonderschulefreie Zone. In: *brand eins.*, accessed from: https://www.brandeins.de/magazine/brand-eins-wirtschaftsmagazin/2008/bildung/sonderschulfreie-zone, on Feb. 18, 2018.

Moser, Vera (2012): Gründungsmythen der Heilpädagogik (Founding myths of healing pedagogy). In: *Zeitschrift für Pädagogik* (Journal for pedagogy), 58:2, pp. 262-274.

National Ministry of Education/ Ministerstwo Edukacji Narodowej, accessed from https://men.gov.pl/ministerstwo/informacje/najczesciej-zadawane-pytania-i-odpowiedzi-dotyczace-wsparcia-dzieci-ze-specjalnymi-potrzebami-edukacyjnymi.html, on Feb. 2, 2018

Nganga, Lydiah, and Kambutu, John (2013): Michael Apple: A Modern-Day Critical Pedagogue. In: Kirylo, James D. (Ed.): *A Critical Pedagogy of Resistance: 34 Pedagogues we need to know.* Rotterdam: Sense Publishers, pp. 1-5, p. 2.

NIK (2017): Wspieranie kształcenia specjalnego uczniów z niepełnosprawnościami w ogólnodostępnych szkołach i przedszkolach lata szkolne 2014/2015-2016/; Supporting special education of students with disabilities in public schools and kindergartens school years 2014 / 2015-2016. Warsaw, pp.1-26.

Numanovic, Emir (July 1, 2016): Austria takes steps to control migration on Balkan route, *Deutsche Welle,* accessed from http://www.dw.com/en/austria-takes-steps-to-control-migration-on-balkan-route/a-19372251, on Sept. 6, 2017.

OCED (2016): Austria. In: *Education at a Glance 2016: OECD Indicators*. OECD Publishing, Paris, p. 4, accessed from http://www.keepeek.com/Digital-Asset-Management/oecd/education/education-at-a-glance-2016/austria_eag-2016-42-en, on: Feb. 13, 2018.

OECD (2012): Equity and Quality in Education: Supporting Disadvantaged Students and Schools, OECD Publishing, p. 56

OECD (2014): PISA 2012 Results in Focus: What 15-year-olds know and what they can do with what they know, accessed from: https://www.oecd.org/pisa/keyfindings/pisa-2012-results-overview.pdf, on Aug. 1, 2018, p. 4.

OECD (2015): Education Policy Outlook: Poland, accessed from http://www.oecd.org/education/POL-country-profile.pdf, on Aug. 1, 2018.

OECD (2016): *Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) Results 2015: Germany*, pp. 1-16.

Oliver, Michael (1999): Capitalism, disability and ideology: A materialist critique of the Normalization principle. In: Flynn, Robert J. and Raymond A. Lemay (Eds.): *A Quarter-Century of Normalization and Social Role Valorization: Evolution and Impact*. Internet publication URL:http://www.independentliving.org/docs3/oliver99.pdf, accessed on Dec. 10, 2018.

Oliver, Michael (1996): *Understanding Disability: From Theory to Practice*. New York: St. Martin's Press, p. 128.

Oltermann, Philip: Austria's far-right Freedom party invited to enter coalition talks (Oct. 24, 2017). *The Guardian*: accessed from https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/oct/24/austrias-far-right-reedom-party-invited-to-enter-coalition-talks-sebastian-kurz-ovp-fpo-europe, on Oct. 25, 2017.

Perl, Sondra (2005): *On Austrian Soil: Teaching Those I Was Taught to Hate*. New York: The University of New York Press, p. 84.

Pfahl and Powell (2011): Legitimating School Segregation: The Special Education Profession and the Discourse of Learning Disability in Germany 1908-2009. In: *Disability & Society*, 24:2, pp. 449-462, accessed from bidok: http://bidok.uibk.ac.at/library/pfahl-legitimating.html, on Sept. 4, 2018, p.3.

Pfahl, Lisa (2011): *Techniken der Behinderung. Der deutsche Lernbehinderungsdiskurs, die Sonderschule und ihre Auswirkungen auf Bildungsbiographien* (Techniques of disability. The German learning-disabled discourse, the special school and its effects on education biographies). Bielefeld: transcript.

Piesche, Peggy (2002): Black and German? East German adolescents before 1989: A retrospective view of a 'non-existent issue' in the GDR. In: Adelson, Leslie A. (Ed.): *The cultural afterlife of East Germany: New transnational perspectives.* American Institute for Contemporary German Studies Humanities, Vol. 13, pp. 37-59, pp. 42-43.

PISA: Success of Polish lower secondary school students. Global results from PISA 2012 survey (February 27, 2015), accessed from https://en.men.gov.pl/2015/02/27/success-of-polish-lower-secondary-school-students-global-results-from-pisa-2012-survey/ , on March 26, 2018.

Plangger, Sascha, Schönwiese, Volker (2010): Behindertenhilfe – Hilfe für behinderte Menschen? (Work with the Disabled – Helpf for disabled people?) In: Schreiber, Horst (Ed.): *Im Namen der Ordnung. Heimerziehung in Tirol* (In the Name of Order. Residential Education in Tyrol). Innsbruck: Studienverlag, pp. 317-346.

Pogodzinska, Patrycia (2013): *Country Report on Poland for the Study on Member States' Policies for Children with Disabilities*. Brussels: European Union.

Pongratz-Lippitt, Christa (June 10, 2016): Austria has a proud history of helping refugees – but for how much longer? *The Guardian*: accessed from https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2016/jun/10/austria-refugees-migration-crisis-eu, on Dec. 1, 2018.

Powell, Justin J. W. (2007): Behinderung in der Schule, behindert durch Schule? (Disability in school, disabled through school?). In: Waldschmidt, Anne (Ed.): *Disability Studies, Kultursoziologie und Soziologie der Behinderung* (Disability Studies, Cultural Sociology and Sociology of Disability). Bielefeld: Transcript, pp. 321-343.

Powell, Justin J.W., Edelstein, Benjamin and Jonna M. Blanck (2016): Awareness-raising, legitimation and backlash? Effects of the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities on education systems in Germany. In: *Globalisation, Societies and Education*, 14:2, pp. 227-250.

Prime Minister Beata Szydło: Polish schools need a change (November 9, 2016), accessed from https://www.premier.gov.pl/en/news/news/prime-minister-beata-szydlo-polish-schools-need-a-change.html, on March 26, 2018.

Prime Minister Mateusz Morawiecki: "We treat Poland as a great value, as our common good" (March 11, 2018), accessed from https://www.premier.gov.pl/en/news/news/prime-minister-mateusz-morawiecki-we-treat-poland-as-a-great-value-as-our-common-good.html, on March 26, 2018

Radio Poland (Dec. 15, 2016): Polish MPs approve education reforms, accessed from http://www.thenews.pl/1/9/Artykul/284655,Polish-MPs-approve-education-reforms, on March 26, 2018.

Radlinska, Iwona, M Bazydlo and B Karakiewicz (2014): The rights of persons with disabilities in Poland. In: *Journal of Public Health, Nursing and Medical Rescue*, 4, pp. 25-30, p. 26.

Ralser et al. (1999): Humanities as Pillars of the „Extermination of Invalid Life": Biopolitics and Fascism exemplified by the Race Hygiene Institute in Innsbruck. In: *Erziehung heute*, pp. 1-12, p. 10

Rockwell, Elsie, Anderson-Levitt, Kathryn (2017): Comparing Ethnographies Across the Americas: Queries and Lessons. In: Anderson-Levitt, Kathryn, Rockwell, Elsie (Eds.): *Comparing Ethnographies: Local Studies of Education Across the Americas*. Washington D.C.: American Educational Research Association, pp. 1-26.

Rothstein, Richard (2017): *The Color of Law: A forgotten history of how our government segregated America*. New York: Liveright Publishing Corporation.

Rubin, Beth C., and Cervinkova, Hana (2019): Challenging Silences: Historical Memory and Democratic Citizenship Education in Poland and Guatemala. In: *Anthropology and Education Quarterly* (forthcoming).

Rutheiser, Charles (1993): Mapping Contested Terrains: Schoolrooms and Streetcorners in Urban Belize. In: Rotenberg, Robert, McDonogh, Gary (Eds.): *The Cultural Meaning of Urban Space*. London: Betgin & Garvey, pp. 103-120.

Rzecznik tworzy zespół monitorujący (The Ombudsman Creates a Monitoring Team), Rzecznik Praw Dziecka, accessed from http://brpd.gov.pl/aktualnosci/rzecznik-tworzy-zespol-monitorujacy, April 4, 2018.

Ralser, Michaela et al. (1999): Humanities as Pillars of the „Extermination of Invalid Life": Biopolitics and Fascism exemplified by the Race Hygiene Institute in Innsbruck. In: *Erziehung heute*, pp. 1-12.

Salazar Perez, Michelle and Cynthia M. Saavedra (2017): A Call for Onto-Epistemological Diversity in Early Childhood Education and Care: Centering Global South Conceptualization of Childhood/s. In: *Review of Research in Education*, 41, pp. 1-29.

Salvador, Eva and Monika Windisch (2017): The Inclusive Model Region Tyrol. In: Svecnik, Erich, Petrovic, Angelika and Ulrike Sixt (Eds.): *The Implementation of Inclusive Model Regions in Austria: Case Studies to the Processes of Strategies in Carinthia, Styria and Tyrol*. Bundesinstitut für Bildungsforschung, Innovation und Entwickung des österreichischen Schulwesens.

Schädler, Johannes, and Dorrance, Carmen (2012): Barometer of Inclusive Education – Concept, Methodology and Preliminary Results in Selected European Countries. In: *Acta Technologica Dubnicae*, 2:1, pp. 17-26.

Schelling, Thomas C. (1971): Dynamic Models of Segregation. In: *Journal of Mathematical Sociology*, vol.1, pp. 143-186.

Schensul, Jean J., Borrero, Maria Gonzalez, Garcia, Roberto (1985): Applying Ethnography to Educational Change. In: *Anthropology and Education Quarterly*, 16, pp. 149-164.

Schratz, Michael (2014): The European teacher: transnational perspectives in teacher education policy and practice. In: *CEPS Journal*, 4:4, pp. 11-27.

Schratz, Michael, Schwarz, Johanna F., and Westfall-Greiter, Tanja (2013): Looking at Two Sides of the Same Coin: Phenomenologically Oriented Vignette Research and Its Implications for Teaching and Learning. In: *Studia Paedagogica*, 18:4, pp. 57-73.

Schultz, Katherine, Jones Walker, Cheryl E., Chikkatur, Anita P. (2008): Listening to Students, Negotiating Beliefs: Preparing Teachers for Urban Classrooms. In: *Curriculum Inquiry*, 38:2, pp. 155-187.

Schwarze, Till (February 2, 2017): "Flüchtlingsabkommen mit der Türkei", *Die Zeit*, accessed from http://www.zeit.de/politik/ausland/2017-02/fluechtlingsabkommen-tuerkei-eu-inhalt, on Sept. 9, 2017.

Scruggs, Thomas E., Mastropieri, Margo A. and Kimberly A. McDuffie (2007): Co-Teaching in Inclusive Classrooms: A Metasynthesis of Qualitative Research. In: Council for Exceptional Children, 73:4, pp. 392-416.

Sieradzka, Monika (April 26, 2018): Parents of disabled children occupy Poland's parliament. *Deutsche Welle*: accessed from https://www.dw.com/en/parents-of-disabled-children-occupy-polands-parliament/a-43555600, on July 4, 2018.

Skilton-Sylvester, Ellen and Graciela Slesaransky-Poe (2009): More than a Least Restrictive Environment: Living up to the Civil Covenant in Building Inclusive Schools. In: Perspectives on Urban Education, pp. 32-36, p. 32

Skoning, Stacey N. And Henn-Reinke, Kathryn (2014): Building Inclusive Communities. In: Lawrence-Brown, Diana, and Sapon-Sevin, Mara (Eds.): *Condition Critical: Key Principles for Equitable and Inclusive Education*, pp. 117-132, p. 127.

Smith, Robin M. (2014): Considering Behavior as Meaningful Communication. In: Lawrence-Brown. Diana, Sapon-Sevin, Mara (Eds.): *Condition Critical: Key Principles for Equitable and Inclusive Education*. New York: Teachers College Press, pp. 154-168.

Spindler, George and Louise Spindler (2000): Roger Harker and Schoenhausen: From Familiar to Strange and Back Again. In: Spindler (Eds.): *Fifty Years of Anthropology and Education 1950-2000*. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc. Press, pp. 201-226.

Statistics Austria (2011): Migration and Integration: Numbers, Data, Indicators.

Symeonidis, Vasileios (2018): Revisiting the European Teacher Education Area: The Transformation of Teacher Education Policies and Practices in Europe. In: *CEPS Journal*, 8:3, pp. 13-34.

Tagesschau (March 16, 2018): "Der Islam gehört nicht zu Deutschland." (Islam does not belong to Germany), accessed from https://www.tagesschau.de/inland/seehofer-islam-101.html, on Oct. 11, 2018.

Taylor, Matthew (November 12, 2017): 'White Europe': 60, 000 nationalists march on Poland's independence day, *The Guardian*, accessed from https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/nov/12/white-europe-60000-nationalists-march-on-polands-independence-day, on March 29, 2018.

Teachers protest against Polish school reforms (Nov. 19, 2016), *The News*: accessed from http://www.thenews.pl/1/9/Artykul/280692,Teachers-protest-against-Polish-school-reforms, on March 8, 2018.

The Monitoring Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities: Concluding Observations on the Initial Report of Austria adopted by the Committee at its Tenth Session 2-13 September, 2013, accessed from https://www.sozialministerium.at/cms/site/attachments/6/1/8/CH3434/CMS1450780852436/crpd_list_of_issues.pdf, on Dec. 6 2018, p. 6.

Theidon, Kimberly (2012): *Intimate Enemies: Violence and Reconciliation in Peru*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Tyrol Monitoring Committee for the Implementation of the UN Convention on the Rights of People with Disabilities (2015): Opinion on Inclusive Education in Tyrol.

2015 Paris Terrorist Attacks Fast Facts, CNN, accessed from https://edition.cnn.com/2015/12/08/europe/2015-paris-terror-attacks-fast-facts/index.html, on Sept. 8, 2018.

The UN Refugee Agency, UNHCR accessed from http://tracks.unhcr.org/2015/12/2015-the-year-of-europes-refugee-crisis/, on Sept. 9, 2017.

This American Life: Three Miles (March 13, 2015), accessed from https://www.thisamericanlife.org/radio-archives/episode/550/transcript, on Sept. 9, 2018.

Tiroler Kinder- und Jugendhilfe, accessed from: https://www.tirol.gv.at/innsbruck/referate/kinder-und-jugendhilfe/, accessed on July 28, 2017.

Tobin, Joseph J., Wu, David Y. H, and Dana H. Davidson (1989): *Pre-School in Three Cultures: Japan, China and the United States*. New Haven: Yale University Press.

Tomlinson, Sally (2017): *A Sociology of Special and Inclusive Education: Exploring the manufacture of inability*. London: Routledge.

Tremain, Shelley (2001): On the Government of Disability. In: *Social Theory and Practice*, 27:4, pp. 617-636.

U.S. Department of State: Diplomacy in Action Poland, accessed from https://www.state.gov/j/drl/rls/irf/2005/51573.htm, on July 2, 2018.

United Nations (2015): *United Nations Committee on the Rights of Persons With Disabilities: Concluding observations on the initial report of Germany*, pp. 1-11, p. 8.

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO) (1994): The Salamanca Statement and Framework for Action on Special Needs Education, accessed from http://www.unesco.org/education/pdf/SALAMA_E.PDF , on Nov. 28, 2018, p. viii.

United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, Washington, D.C., Holocaust Encyclopedia: Poland in 1945, accessed from https://www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10005599, on May 2, 2018.

United States Holocaust Memorial Museum: 1933-1938, accessed from https://www.ushmm.org/learn/timeline-of-events/1933-1938, on Oct. 5, 2018.

Universität Innsbruck: Heime in Tyrol und Voralberg (Residential Homes in Tyrol and Voralberg), accessed from https://www.uibk.ac.at/iezw/heimgeschichteforschung/heime-in-tirol-und-vorarlberg/bubenburg.html, Dec. 1, 2018.

UPIAS (1976): Fundamental Principles of Disability. London: Union of the Physically Impaired against Segregation. Retrieved from http://disability-studies.leeds.ac.uk, on August 14, 2018.

Varenne, Harvé and Ray McDermott (1995):Culture as Disability. In*: Anthropology and Education Quarterly*. 26:3, pp. 324-348.

Veith, Christian, Koehler, Martin, Monika Reiter (June, 2009): Standortfaktor Bildungsintegration: Bildungschancen von Schülern mit Migrationshintergrund entscheidend für Standort Deutschland. (Location Factor Educational Integration: Educational chances for students with a migrant background crucial for location factor Germany), The Boston Consulting Group, accessed from http://img-stg.bcg.com/Standortfaktor%20Bildungsintegration%20Bildungschancen%20von%20_tcm108-141129.pdf, on Sept. 11, 2018.

Vogtenhuber, Stefan, Lassnigg, Lorenz, Bruneforth, Michael, Edelhofer-Lielacher, Edith and Thilo Siegle (2015): Indicators B: Inputs – Personal and financial resources. In: Bruneforth, Michael et al. (Eds): *National Education Report Austria: The School System Mirrored by Data and Indicators*, Volume 1, pp.37 - 70, pp. 42-44.

Walczak, Maria (2015): School's Culture: About its complexity and multidimensionality. In: *Pedagogika Spoleczna* (Social Pedagogy), 3:57, pp. 77-87.

Waldheim, Kurt, in: *Shoah Resource Center*, Yad Vashem, accessed from http://www.yadvashem.org/odot_pdf/Microsoft%20Word%20-%206485.pdf, on Feb. 20, 2018.

Waldman, Ofer (Feb. 6, 2017): Der Feind meines Feindes ist ...mein Nachbar (The enemy of my enemy is...my neighbor). *Deutschlandfunk Kultur* (Germany radio culture), accessed from https://www.deutschlandfunkkultur.de/gentrifizierung-in-berlin-neukoelln-der-feind-meines.976.de.html?dram:article_id=378271, on. Oct. 2, 2018.

Waldschmidt Anne and Werner Schneider (2007): Disability Studies and Sociology of Disability. In: Anne Waldschmidt and Werner Schneider (Eds): *Disability Studies, Kultursoziologie und Soziologie der Behinderung: Erkundungen in einem neuen Forschungsfeld* (pp. 9-27). Bielefeld: Transcript Verlag.

Wanker, Brigitte (1982): Mauern überall. In: Forster, Rudolpf, Schönwiese, Volker (Eds.): *BEHINDERTENALLTAG – wie man behindert wird* (Everyday life of the disabled – how one becomes disabled). Wien: Jugend und Volk, pp. 21-34.

Wes, Marina (Dec. 8, 2015): Poland can do more to support the poor. World Bank Group, accessed from: http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/opinion/2015/12/08/poland-can-do-more-to-support-poor, on April 5, 2018.

Willis, Paul (1977): *Learning to Labor: How Working Class Kids Get Working Class Jobs*. New York: Columbia University Press. Willis, Paul (1977): *Learning to Labor: How*

Willis, Paul, and Trondman, Mats (2002): Manifesto for Ethnography. In: *Cultural Studies Critical Methodologies*, 2:3, pp. 394-402.

Wocken, Hans (1987): Integrationsklassen in Hambug (Integration classes in Hamburg). In: Wocken, Hans, Antor, Georg (Eds.): *Integrationsklassen in Hamburg: Erfahrungen – Untersuchungen – Anregungen* (Integration classes in Hamburg: Experiences – Analyses – Encouragement). Solms: Jarick Oberbiel, accessed from http://www.hans-wocken.de/Werk/werk22.pdf, on Oct. 5, 2018.

Wocken, Hans (n.a): *Demokratie lernen und leben im Klassenrat/ Learning and Living Democracy in the Class Council*, accessed from http://www.hans-wocken.de/Texte/HW-Klassenrat.pdf, Aug. 23, 2018.

Wocken, Hans (July 31, 2018): Inklusion an Schulen: Ein Etikettenschwindel? (Inclusion at schools: Labelling fraud). Die Süddeutsche Zeitung, accessed from https://www.sueddeutsche.de/bildung/bildung-inklusion-an-schulen-ein-etikettenschwindel-1. 4073257 , on Dec. 12, 2018.

Wohlhart, David, Böhm, Jan, Grillitsch, Maria, Oberwimmer, Konrad, Soukup-Altrichter, Katharina, Stanzel-Tischler, Elisabeth (2015): Die österreichische Volksschule./ The Austrian Primary School. In: *Nationaler Bildungsbericht Österreich*, Band 1, p. 30.

Wohlhart, David, Böhm, Jan, Grillitsch, Maria, Oberwimmer, Konrad, Soukup-Alrichter, Katharina and Elisabeth Stanzel-Tischler: Die österreichische Volksschule (The Austrian Primary School). In: Bruneforth, Michael et alii. (Eds.): Nationaler Bildungsbericht Österreich 2015 Band 2, Fokussierte Analysen bildungspolitischer Schwerpunktthemen (Focused Analyses of educational political key topics). Leykam.

Wolcott, Harry F. (1987): On ethnographic intent. In: George and Louise Spindler (Eds.): *Interpretive Ethnography of Education: At Home and Abroad.* Hillsdale, NJ: Erlbaum, pp. 37-51.

Womack, Helen (February 16, 2018): Polish city leads the way in solidarity with refugees,

UNHCR: accessed from http://www.unhcr.org/news/stories/2018/2/5a83febd4/polish-city-leads-way-solidarity-refugees.html, on March 29, 2018.

Wulf, Christoph (Ed.) (2010): *Gesten in Erziehung, Bildung, Sozialisation*. (The Berlin Ritual Study: Gestures in Upbrining, Education, Socialization. Wiesbaden: Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften.

Zimmermann, Nils: German Issues in a Nutshell: Hartz 4, *Deutsche Welle* (June 6, 2017), accessed from https://www.dw.com/en/german-issues-in-a-nutshell-hartz-iv/a-39061709, on Aug. 15, 2018.

Żołądź, Magdalena (17.05.2017): Agnieszka Kossowska: daję ministerstwu ogromny kredyt zaufania, Nowa Trybuna Opolska, accessed from: http://www.nto.pl/nto-tv/gosc-nto/a/agnieszka-kossowska-daje-ministerstwu-ogromny-kredyt-zaufania,12080716/, on March 21, 2018.

Legislation

15SchOG Novella, §8a, p. 3822

§ 40 SchOG Schulorganisationsgesetz: Aufnahmevoraussetzungen (School organisation law: requirements of admission), Recht.Schnell (Justice/Law.Quick) accessed from https://www.jusline.at/gesetz/schog/paragraf/40, on Dec. 6, 2018.

§ 9.1, Ordinance 1616; Journal of Law of the Republic of Poland, Warsaw, Aug. 29, 2017; Dziennik Ustaw Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej, Warszawa, dnia 29 sierpnia 2017 r. Poz. 1616, Rozporządzenie Ministra Edukacji Narodowej z dnia 9 sierpnia 2017 r.

§19.1.3, Ordinance 1643; Journal of Law of the Republic of Poland, Warsaw, Aug. 31, 2017; Dziennik Ustaw Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej, Warszawa, dnia 31 sierpnia 2017 r. Poz. 1643 Ministra Edukacji Narodowej 1)z dnia 28 sierpnia 2017 r.

§2, Ordinance 1616; Journal of Law of the Republic of Poland, Warsaw, August 29, 2017; Dziennik Ustaw Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej, Warszawa, dnia 29 sierpnia 2017 r. Poz. 1616, Rozporządzenie Ministra Edukacji Narodowej z dnia 9 sierpnia 2017 r.

§3.1, Ordinance 1643; Journal of Law of the Republic of Poland, Warsaw, August 31, 2017; Dziennik Ustaw Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej, Warszawa, dnia 31 sierpnia 2017 r. Poz. 1643 Ministra Edukacji Narodowej 1)z dnia 28 sierpnia 2017 r.

§5, Ordinance 1616; Journal of Law of the Republic of Poland, Warsaw, August 29, 2017; Dziennik Ustaw Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej, Warszawa, dnia 29 sierpnia 2017 r. Poz. 1616, Rozporządzenie Ministra Edukacji Narodowej z dnia 9 sierpnia 2017 r.

§8, Abs. 1, Schulpflichtgesetz [SchPflG]

Amendment to Ordinance 532, §7 in Ordinance 1643, 5) b) 1) and 2), Journal of Law of the Republic of Poland, Warsaw, August 31, 2017; Dziennik Ustaw Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej, Warszawa, dnia 31 sierpnia 2017 r. Poz. 1643 Ministra Edukacji Narodowej 1)z dnia 28 sierpnia 2017 r.

Dziennik Ustaw Rzeczypospolitej Polskiej, Warszawa, dnia 11 stycznia 2017 r. Poz. 59 USTAWA z dnia 14 grudnia 2016 r.; Journal of Law of the Republic of Poland, Warsaw, January 11, 2017. Pos. 59 of the Act dated Dec. 14, 2016.